DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 217 533 EA 014 659

AUTHOR Zerchykov, Ross
TITLE A Review of the Literature and an Annotated Bibliography on Managing Decline in School Systems.
INSTITUTION Institute for Responsive Education, Boston, Mass.
SPONS AGENCY National Inst. of Education (ED), Washington, DC.
REPORT NO ISBN-0-917754-17-4
PUB DATE Mar 82
CONTRACT 400-81-0016
NOTE 336p.

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC14 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Administrative Principles; Administrative Problems; Annotated Bibliographies; *Board of Education Policy; Community Involvement; Decision Making; *Declining Enrollment; Educational Administration; Elementary Secondary Education; *Financial Problems; Money Management; Organizational Effectiveness; Planning; Political Issues; *Problem Solving; Resource Allocation; *Retrenchment; School Closing; *School Districts
IDENTIFIERS Cutback Management

ABSTRACT

This review of the literature focuses on the effects of enrollment and fiscal decline on local school district management and also looks at the effects of local districts' policy responses to decline. The review's five sections include an overview of the kinds of literature available on decline; a summary of the main policy issues identified in the literature; a codification of the professional consensus on how best to manage decline; a review and summary of the research literature on local school systems' management of and adjustments to decline; and a discussion of the policy implications of those research findings, paying special attention to the trade-offs between the requirements of technical rationality and the political constraints facing declining school systems. The review is based on a comprehensive search of the literature in the ERIC system through July 1981 and serves as the first report in a 15-month project that will produce a handbook in August 1982 on the management of decline in school systems. An extensive annotated bibliography of 250 items, including 28 reports documenting local school districts' responses to decline, accompanies the review. (Author/PGD)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE AND AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON MANAGING DECLINE IN SCHOOL SYSTEMS

ED217533

EA 014 659

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official NIE position or policy.

ROSS ZERCHYKOV
with the assistance of OWEN HELEEN

W. TIMOTHY WEAVER, Principal Investigator

INSTITUTE FOR RESPONSIVE EDUCATION

A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE AND AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY ON MANAGING DECLINE IN SCHOOL SYSTEMS

by

Ross Zerchykov

with the assistance of

Owen Heleen

W. Timothy Weaver, Principal Investigator

With a Preface by Don Davies

Published by

THE INSTITUTE FOR RESPONSIVE EDUCATION

March 1982

The work upon which this publication is based was performed pursuant to Contract No. 400-81-0016 of the National Institute of Education. It does not, however, necessarily reflect the views of that agency.

ISBN: 0-917754-17-4

Cover photograph by Owen Heleen.

ABSTRACT

This review of the literature is the first report of a 15-month project to produce a handbook on managing decline, to be completed in August, 1982. Focus is on the effects not causes of enrollment and fiscal decline on local school district management, and on the effects of local districts' policy responses to decline. The review's five sections include: an overview of the kinds of literature written about decline, a summary of the main policy issues identified therein, a codification of the professional consensus on how to best manage decline, a review and summary of the research literature on local school systems' management and adjustments to decline, and a discussion of the policy implications of those research findings with a special focus on the trade-offs between the requirements of technical rationality and the political constraints facing declining school systems. The review is based on a comprehensive ERIC search of the literature current through July 1981. It is complemented by a 250 item annotated bibliography which includes 28 local school district reports documenting responses to decline.

CONTENTS

PREFACE vi

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY ix

A REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

1.0 INTRODUCTION 1

2.0 METHOD 4

3.0 OVERVIEW: A READERS' GUIDE TO THE LITERATURE 8

3.1 Issues-Analyses: Perspectives on Decline 10
3.1.1 Fluctuating Enrollments 10
3.1.2 Coincidence of Enrollment Decline and Fiscal Retrenchment 13
3.1.3 Contraction is Different From Expansion . . 14
3.1.4 Is Decline a Problem or an Opportunity? . . 22

3.2 Research 32

3.3 Resource 37
3.3.1 Patterns of Advice 38
3.3.2 Synthesis: Advice on School Closure and Community Involvement 38
3.3.3 Summary 70

3.4 Short Reading Lists on Selected Topics 73

4.0 THE EVIDENCE 89

4.1 Patterns of Investigation 95
4.1.1 Investigations of What is Happening in Declining Districts 95
4.1.2 Investigations of What is Different About Districts in Decline 112
4.1.3 Investigations of Retrenchment Decisionmaking 117
4.1.4 Investigations of the Impact of Retrenchment Decisions 125

4.2 Patterns of Evidence 130
4.2.1 General Observations 130
4.2.2 Patterns of Resource Allocations in Declining as Opposed to Growing Districts 131

CONTENTS (continued)

4.2.3 Patterns of Service Delivery 136
4.2.4 Decline: Opportunity or Problem . . . 137
4.2.5 Retrenchment Decisionmaking 142
4.2.6 Contextual Factors: District Size and District Type 150

5.0 TOWARDS AN INTEGRATION OF THEORY AND PRACTICE . . . 156

5.1 Equity 156
5.1.1 Special and Compensatory Education . . . 156
5.1.2 Desegregation 157
5.1.3 RIF and Affirmative Action 159

5.2 School Closure: A Final Look 160

5.3 Planning: Technical vs. Political Rationality 163
5.3.1 The Necessity of Rational Planning . . . 165
5.3.2 Limitations to Rational Planning Inherent in the Nature of Schools . . . 167
5.3.3 Special Limitations on Rational Planning Posed by Decline 171

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY 193

INDICES 251

ABOUT THE INSTITUTE FOR RESPONSIVE EDUCATION 273

RELATED PUBLICATIONS 274

OTHER PUBLICATIONS 275

PREFACE

This is the first publication in a 15-month project on managing decline in public schools. The project was initiated and is funded by the National Institute of Education as an effort to provide theoretical and practical help to school managers and policymakers as they face a condition of declining resources, enrollments, and political support. The Institute for Responsive Education (IRE), which was selected to carry out the project, believes that the project will be helpful to school board members, school administrators, and citizen leaders who want to understand the current problems faced by school systems and to devise solutions that are both politically feasible and educationally sound. We believe that this report will also be of use to state education policymakers, researchers, and leaders in organizations and agencies providing information and services to local public school officials and policymakers.

This first publication -- a detailed and comprehensive report on the literature and an annotated bibliography -- is an important building block for the project's final product, a handbook on managing decline in the public schools. Our project ends in July 1982 and the handbook will be available in the fall of 1982.

Consultation with potential users of the handbook -- administrators, school board members, citizens -- helped to shape the plans for the project and for this report. Prior to the literature search, we convened panels of potential users of the handbook, one in Boston, the other in Palo Alto. Full day discussions were held with each panel. (In total 28 men and women, including eleven school superintendents, four district-level administrative staff specialists, five school board members, five citizens task force members, and three principals from a sample of declining school districts throughout New England and the San Francisco Bay Area.) The results of those discussions provided us with criteria of relevance in conducting the search of the literature and in preparing this report.

The Institute for Responsive Education wishes to acknowledge the contributions made to this report by a number of individuals. Overall direction

for the project is provided by Dr. W. Timothy Weaver, the principal investigator. Weaver is an Associate Professor of Education at Boston University and is known to American educators for his research on the effects on teacher quality of declining enrollments and declining demand for teachers.

Ross Zerchykov, project director, was primarily responsible for planning and writing this report. Zerchykov, an ABD in Political Science at Boston University, serves as Senior Policy Analyst at the Institute for Responsive Education. He is also currently preparing a review and synthesis of the research on school board responsiveness to community interest group representation, pursuant to a grant from NIE.

Bibliographic research support was provided by project research assistant Owen Heleen. Heleen holds an M.A. in English from Boston University and prior to joining the Institute staff, he worked at the Johns Hopkins University Press and at that University's Center for Social Organization of Schools.

IRE office manager and secretary, Dana Rudolph, typed preliminary and final drafts of all materials in this report. We are also grateful for the guidance and assistance of our NIE Project Officer, Lauren Weisberg, of the Education Finance Group. Her support and her questioning led us down many fruitful paths which we would have otherwise not travelled.

Don Davies, President
Institute for Responsive Education

Declining enrollments and school mergers have become such familiar phrases that they now often produce yawns. Cookbooks for practitioners, on how to avoid disastrous community conflict, search out silver linings to gray clouds of consolidation, and find community uses for empty buildings, dominate the literature. The technical side of the genre spotlights cohort survival ratios, live births, and dozens of other means of refining enrollment projections. As a popular topic, shrinking enrollment is one of the most politically visible (and divisive) issues to face superintendents and school boards since desegregation. Yet the literature on the political impact of fewer students remains thin. What does exist offers a dreary list of injurious effects upon children, teachers, principals, school boards, superintendents and the community. The organizational impact, however, is more evident in what has been written, probably because such effects are visible, that is fired teachers, aging staff, unused buildings, and reduced budgets. But even here, seldom are direct consequences disentangled from indirect ones... Until the literature on declining enrollment and consolidation breaks away from either cookbooks giving recipes to administrators on how to avoid the lash of community anger or research on the technology of projections, little more about political impact will be uncovered. So many important questions remain: have school chiefs and boards exited in districts where consolidation occurred? Have budgets shrunk as a backlash from disgruntled voters in contracting districts? What was the impact of a community's socio-economic status upon the politics of consolidation? Were the merger decisions the product of rational, organizational bargaining or other modes of making choices?

-- Larry Cuban

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Decline as a phenomena is about a decade old. It has provided the occasion for a voluminous and growing body of literature. As is the case with any topic of wide interest and concern, the literature on decline consists of opinion, advice and evidence.

The "evidence," that is those works providing generalizable research data, include 68 of the 250 references reviewed herein. Categorizing the literature by genre, there is predominance of case-materials ranging from comparative and longitudinal studies informed by a theoretical perspective and a rich conceptual framework to detailed but descriptive case-histories (no less useful for practitioners) of unique responses to unique circumstances. Our search uncovered only six nationwide surveys on the impact of decline; including surveys focused on the impact of enrollment decline on supervisory practices, on the fiscal impact of declining enrollments, one comprehensive study of the impact of enrollment decline on school program, surveys of school closure nationwide, and one valiant attempt in the face of almost insuperable measurement problems to ascertain the impact of reduction in force on affirmative action gains. But there has yet to be a comprehensive nationwide study providing original data on the impact of decline and decisions made in response to decline on equity initiatives in education.

By topic, the literature is rich in data on the fiscal impact of decline, less rich in generalizable data on the programmatic impact of decline, and relatively limited (except for case-studies of varying generalizability on the processes of responding to decline, and the impact of those responses. In addition to information on school finance, there is an understandably heavy emphasis on school closure; ranging from nationwide surveys of school closure criteria, to statewide and local comparative case studies of school closure decisionmaking processes, to single case histories, to local impact studies of school closure and consolidation. The local impact studies, however, are not very generalizable with respect to either findings or, with one exception, to method.

"Opinion" continues to be divided on the question of whether decline is an opportunity or a problem. The "evidence" suggests that declining enrollments have not provided for any documented opportunities for creative, institutional renewal of American public schooling. Nor has decline preticipated any radical dismantling or deterioration of educational quality or opportunity, despite headline making retrenchment decisions such as school closings and reductions in force.

Studies of the fiscal impact of decline, for example, suggest that it is difficult to generalize, given the uneven incidence of enrollment decline. The picture which emerges is as follows:

- Certain categories of costs do go up, on a per-pupil basis with declining enrollment. These include: instructional and administrative staff and plant maintenance and fixed charges.
- But, declining enrollments per se then do not decrease costs until and unless they precipitate cut-backs in plant and staff. Whether such cut-backs are going to be made depends on the level of fiscal strain on a district introduced by enrollment decline. The level of strain depends, in part, on state aid formulas and on coincidental changes in district wealth, assuming assessments and tax rates remain constant. In short, despite a wealth of data on school financing, it is difficult to disentangle the fiscal effects of enrollment decline specifically from the effects of other correlative factors.

There is a similar difficulty in assessing the programmatic impact of decline, a difficulty compounded by the relative paucity of studies on curricular changes associated with decline. Available data shows that, at the secondary school level:

- Declining enrollments are associated with the reduction of course offerings in electives but not in the core curriculum.
- Only course offerings in foreign languages, agricultural education, and driver education were consistently jeopardized by declining enrollments and only then in districts which experienced a decline of 20 percent or more.
- Staff and faculty allocations followed these shifts in the range of course offerings.

There are persistent patterns of staff changes associated with districts in decline:

- Total staff decreases during decline tend to occur more slowly than total staff increases during a prior growth period.
- Classroom teacher positions tend to decrease more rapidly than administrator/non-classroom professional positions; thus, increases occur in percentage of non-classroom personnel.
- Staff age -- those districts with the greatest declines report median age increase in staff, whereas those increasing in enrollment report a decline in median age. Faculty age tends to increase as seniority determines layoffs.

We found no evidence in the decline literature, however, of any adverse impact of an aging teaching force on teacher effectiveness or program innovation.

There is also little evidence, again despite the newsmaking headlines, of any dramatic impact, either upon children's schooling experience or school community-relations, of retrenchment decisions, especially those leading to school closure:

- There is no documented long-term impact of school closure on children's cognitive or emotional-social development.
- The impact of school closings on neighborhood quality of life appear to defy objective measurement. Survey data on residents' perceptions of the impact of schooling is mixed.
- There is no general evidence of any negative perceptions leading to behavior -- lower levels of electoral support for school levies, or flight to private education, for example -- manifesting public disenchantment with the schools as a result of retrenchment decisions.

There is much discussion of equity issues in the literature and that discussion demonstrates a consensus of concern that retrenchment may jeopardize equity gains. There is, however, less clarity about the operational definition of equity, and no comprehensive nationwide study of the impact of decline and of decisions made in response to decline. This review defines "equity," operationally, as all those programs and policies, often mandated, which provide services and opportunities for populations hitherto underserviced and/or discriminated against. These refer to: school desegregation, affirmative action, special and compensatory education -- e.g., Title I, bilingual programs, and programs benefitting handicapped

and learning disabled persons. Data about equity issues comes primarily from surveys of the programmatic impact of decline, from case data on school closure decisionmaking, and from one nationwide effort to assess the effect of RIF on affirmative action gains. The evidence is as follows:

- Special and compensatory education gains have been held harmless despite decline.
- The spot data on desegregation and affirmative action is mixed. School districts do, as a matter of policy, but not always practice, take desegregation into account in their school closure decisions.
- Affirmative action gains appear to have been eroded in districts in decline.

Despite an overwhelming prescriptive consensus that RIF decisions take into account "merit" and affirmative action as well as seniority, the overwhelming reality is that seniority alone is often the guiding principle in RIF. Documented exceptions to this rule consist of districts undergoing court-ordered desegregation or districts in which collectively bargained provisions create dual seniority lists: one for majority personnel; the other for affirmative action personnel.

"Advice" is prominent in the literature. We have discovered the emergence of a definite professional consensus, a "craftlore" of writings about good practice in retrenching. This advice is typically found in professional association periodicals and is codified in handbooks, often sponsored by professional associations and/or state education agencies. While not typically based on generalizable research evidence, this literature is no less empirical in so far as much of it is written as observations, caveats, suggestions, and "memorablia" from the "firing line." It offers the following integrated body of maxims:

- One should be aware that the biggest danger lies in precipitous decisionmaking. Retrenchment decisions should be "pro-active" based on rational planning and not be "reactive" made in response to momentary political pressure.
- Decline manifests itself as a necessary response to rising school costs. And in responding to rising school costs, make cut-backs so as to preserve the integrity and quality of school program. Instead, realize cost-savings in the reduction of excess capacity, i.e., close schools before you cut program.

- In closing schools do not simply close those schools which have suffered the greatest enrollment loss. Instead, close schools whose closure will maximize cost savings and minimize the adverse impact on communities and on your educational program. To this end, school closure decisions must be integrated with a districtwide master plan, accompanied by accurate data about future enrollments, a stock of information about instructional space, and inventories of program and personnel.

- Recognize, however, that closing a school is a political as well as a technical process. Take your time and proceed with closure in two stages: first, achieve a community consensus on the necessity for closure; then and only then, can one proceed in deciding which specific school/s to close. In each stage, involve the community. Keep the public informed. Recognize the inevitability of community opposition and work towards building community-wide "ownership" of the problem for which school closure is the only reasonable solution. Such "ownership" can be engendered by establishing broadly representative districtwide school-community task forces and/or advisory committees with the responsibility of proposing policy criteria for closing schools. The existence of such task forces allows for community involvement without allowing the decisionmaking process to be held hostage by the momentary pressures of special interests.

- Any cut-back (whether in program or in facilities) may create the necessity to reduce staff. Try to use merit and equity criteria in RIF, but recognize the inevitability of relying on some sort of seniority-based criteria. Whenever possible, "share the problem" and arrive at collectively bargained RIF policies. Establish such policies before they are necessary, since such anticipatory planning allows for joint decisionmaking before interests become polarized and consensus more difficult to achieve.

- Recognize that any seniority-based RIF will create an older teaching force, one less likely to engage in innovative pedagogic practices. Therefore, accompany RIF with a more aggressive policy of providing in-service training.

- Recognize that managing retrenchment requires new leadership skills and styles. School leaders should be more politically adroit, more able to say "no." and more willing to share management problems with other constituencies. At the same time, they should also be ready to centralize decisionmaking as the organization contracts.

The foregoing advice prescribes rather than systematically describes practice. The advice and the evidence literature is not well-integrated. One result is that there are some contradictions between prescribed

practices and practices as revealed in the evidence, particularly that which comes from case-data on school closure decisionmaking. For example:

- While the advice urges that managers employ a multiplicity of criteria in school closure decisions, the evidence suggests that one or two criteria are decisive and school location, school age, and school size are determinant.
- While the advice stresses the indispensability of accurate local data, some evidence suggests that, especially in large urban bureaucratized school systems, lower level bureaucrats' (e.g., principals) definition of the situation colors the kind of data they supply to district level decisionmakers. This leads fact-finding and planning efforts to reflect rather than resolve intra-organizational conflicts of interest.
- While it is assumed that community involvement via task forces can lead to a transcendance of special interests and create a districtwide perspective on the necessity for cut-backs, some studies suggest that such involvement can actually lead to the articulation of special interest perspectives. That is, the very process of participation can lead constituency groups to a clearer understanding of their own special interest and to a more forceful mobilization to protect that interest from the adverse effects of possible retrenchment decisions.
- While the advice posits closing schools rather than cutting staff or program across the board as a rational and educationally sound trade-off, case-data on the politics of school closure suggests that it may be more politically rational to make diffuse, across-the-board cuts than more focused cuts such as closing schools.
- Evidence on the differential impact of retrenchment decisionmaking on the school politics of different kinds of communities suggests that it is precisely those types of communities whose values and decisionmaking styles are most congruent with (and reflective of) the rational, consensual policymaking style advocated by the advice literature, that are likely to experience more intense political conflict as a result of retrenchment decisions. The evidence also indicates that this higher level of conflict disrupts and delegitimizes the very process of rational, consensual decisionmaking presupposed by the craftlore on good management practice.

Nothing in the above invalidates, directly or completely, the craftlore about prescribed good practice in managing decline. Rather, the evidence only points out some difficulties -- some obvious and some not so obvious -- in applying such prescriptions. The craftlore recognizes the political dimension of decline management. The evidence to date, were it to be integrated into the craftlore, could only deepen and enrich practitioners' recognition of the politics of managing decline. All of the literature is integrated around a common understanding of the conflict among political expediency, political feasibility, and the educational soundness of various policy options, and of the recurring tension between technical and political rationality in implementing those options. Contemporary writing about decline recognizes that the management issues are more complicated than the relatively simple question of what to do with fewer pupils and surplus space.

1.0 INTRODUCTION

We approach the literature, contained in the annotated bibliography and reviewed in the pages below, as a body of knowledge about local school systems' adjustments to decline, where decline is defined as decreasing enrollments and/or decreases in the rate of growth in public expenditures for schools. In either case, the management and public policy problem is the same: how to adjust to organizational shrinkage whether the shrinkage is caused by enrollment decline or decline in funding, or, as is often the case, both. The focus is primarily on what the literature says and only secondarily on how it (the literature) says it. Any inferences and conclusions we make about school system adjustments to decline are inferences based on what a definitive body of literature says about those judgements. This may or may not provide for a complete and accurate picture of school districts' adjustments to decline. For example, practices highlighted in the popular or professional literature are biased by several ineliminable distortions including authors' stature in the professional community and publishers' and editors' judgements about the significance, newsworthiness and "interestingness" of the practices being written about. This creates a bias towards unusual, "highly promising," possibly abnormal practices. The research literature produces a similar bias. Many considerations govern the choice of research sites and researchable practices. These considerations include the decisionmaking interests of government agencies conducting or sponsoring studies of decline. In academic research, criteria stem most often from intra- or inter-disciplinary criteria of significance. Research sites are often chosen because the data they may yield can best test some hypothesis, solve some of the conceptual-theoretical puzzles which constitute what Thomas Kuhn has called "paradigms establishing different disciplined fields of inquiry,"[1] and/or extend, refine or overturn some established body of generalizations. In short, sites and practices chosen on the basis of theoretical significance may not describe

---

[1] Thomas Kuhn, The Structure of Scientific Revolutions. (University of Chicago Press, 1970.)

typical circumstances or practices at all.

Much additional data about school systems' adjustments to decline is also contained in comprehensive local school district reports and task force recommendations. Here, too, there is an inevitable bias. The process of producing, packaging, and disseminating (e.g., submitting to ERIC) such reports requires a certain level of effort, of management resources, and of sophistication on the part of a local school district. What one gets, therefore, is a picture of adjustments to decline in a certain kind of community; typically, a white-collar suburb, with a tradition of blue-ribbon civic involvement in objective fact-finding and rational planning, and with the management resources to devote time, money, and energy to such efforts.

With these limitations in mind, it is possible for readers to discover much that is interesting and useful in this body of literature. This report is organized so as to guide that process of discovery.

Section 2.0, "Method," describes how we defined, collected, and constructed that body of literature about which we report.

Section 3.0, "Overview," discusses the literature per se. It presents a classificatory scheme and provides a census of the literature by topic (what is being written about) and genre (how it is being written). The bulk of Section 3.0 is devoted to a readers' guide and summary of key types of literature and an account of the themes and topics which unite clusters of works. It is not possible (or useful) to provide a seriatim discussion of each of the 250 references in the literature (it is for that reason that an extended annotated bibliography accompanies this report). Consequently, a series of charts -- 3A through 3H -- provides readers with overviews, bibliographic guides, and compendia of selections from the literature. It is hoped that readers will appreciate the economies of space and language permitted by such an approach. The prose narrative of Section 3.0 provides an explication of the materials contained in those charts and syntheses of key themes with a focus on the most widely cited and significant references within each genre and topic area. Section 3.0 concludes with: (i) a brief "Readers' Guide" to information resources -- other bibliographies, handbooks and state and local task

force reports detailed and comprehensive enough to serve as functional equivalents to handbooks; and (ii) a "Short Reading List" of 71 references, designed for those who may not enjoy the advantages of time and funding support which made our extensive literature research and review possible.

Section 4.0, "The Evidence," takes a closer look at the research literature which is only overviewed in Section 3.0. That closer look consists of an overview of how decline has been studied ("Patterns of Investigation"), a summary of 20 key studies of school systems' adjustments to decline, and a composite summary of the evidence which begins to answer a cluster of typical and recurring policy questions about how one should go about responding to decline.

Section 5.0, "Towards An Integration of Theory and Practice," summarizes both the prescriptive ("how to/what-to-do") and analytical research works which cluster around three emergent foci in the literature: "Equity," "School Closure", and "Planning: Political vs. Technical Rationality," and in a concluding discussion, "The Fine Art of Muddling Through," we draw out implications for practice and for research of what the literature tells us about school systems' adjustments to decline. That discussion borrows from Charles Lindblom's classic depiction of "muddling through" by "incremental decisionmaking," a process typical of public organizations, especially those under stress,[2] and describes some practical and analytical implications of our resulting understanding of the "fine" art of muddling through.

---

[2] Charles Lindblom, "The Science of Muddling Through." Public Administration Review, Spring 1959, pp. 79-88.

2.0 METHOD

All 250 references listed in the annotated bibliography and referred to in this report were drawn, primarily, but not exclusively, from a comprehensive, computer-assisted ERIC (Educational Resources Information Center) search conducted in May 1981. The topics of that search were: "schools' adjustments (planned and unplanned responses) to declining enrollments" and "schools' adjustments to fiscal retrenchment" and "community involvement in school districts' planning and decisionmaking processes." The search was current from January 1976 to May 1981. The computer search was supplemented by an additional 40 works, many of them fugitive local school district reports, acquired earlier by the authors of this report and solicited as a result of our ongoing project on decline as described in the Preface, above.

All searches and acquisitions for purposes of this report and bibliography ceased July 1, 1981.

2.1 SCOPE

Of the 552 references gathered as a result of our literature searches, the final reading list of 250 items resulted from the application of the following criteria of selection.

One, we were governed by considerations of accessibility. All of the items listed in our bibliography, and a fortiori all of the works discussed in the text of our report, are either published and/or stocked in conventional libraries, available from ERIC (if only on microfiche), or available, at cost of reproduction, from the Institute for Responsive Education. The latter category applies to local school district reports (please see Section C2(b) of the annotated bibliography) submitted to us on the understanding that they would be disseminated.

Two, we were governed by the objectives of our project -- ultimately to produce a handbook on managing decline at the local public school district level -- and by our understanding of the decisionmaking situation

at the local level. Several corollaries follow from the application of these criteria:

(a) We excluded references on non-United States experiences, on non-public school experiences, on decline in post-secondary education, and on decline in courses of study except insofar as that decline was documented as part of a general enrollment decline.

(b) Focus was on the decisionmaking at the local level and hence on those factors over which local school districts have, at least in principle, some discretionary control. For that reason, we are interested in the effects, not the causes (demographic or political) of decline. We therefore excluded much of the literature on demography except insofar as it raised issues, or presented data, calling for a specific practical response by local decisionmakers. The same rule excluded references to the actions of state agencies and state policies.

(c) Our concerns are the educational consequences of decline and local school districts' responses to decline. This led us to exclude references dealing exclusively with the architectural and real estate issues involved in the disposition and/or non-educational use of excess school facilities. Once a school has been closed, the building ceases to be a school. Its mothballing and preservation is a plant engineering issue. Its disposition -- whom it is sold or leased to -- is a business issue. Children's educations are not affected by the fact that a closed school is sold to a condominium developer as opposed to a multi-service community agency. Similarly, leasing a building to a non-profit arts group vs. leasing it to a senior citizen program is of little educational consequence for the children in the remaining schools. (In either case, should school officials wish to reclaim such a building, the public relations problem -- i.e., evicting a group of elderly citizens or evicting a community theater, for example -- would be formidable. This is an issue not often raised in the voluminous literature on the alternative uses and disposition of excess school plants.)

Three, we were governed by pragmatic considerations. The topic of decline spills over into all areas of school management. For example, early retirement is an option often mentioned in the literature. It is

offered as an alternative to RIF and is justified by the claim that younger staff are likely to be more innovative and effective. Now, there is debate about that claim and a large body of literature, which requires its own separate review and analysis, on teacher effectiveness vis-a-vis teacher age. Similarly, school closure decisions raise considerations about class size and teacher overload, school size, and the developmental effects of different grade configurations. There is also a large body of literature, not reviewed here, on those topics.

Despite the exclusions mentioned above, we have included references which deal with the aforementioned topics, but only inasmuch as the works deal with topics we treat in detail. Sargent and Handy (1974), for example, is a classic resource on the disposition of surplus school plants. It is also an early and classic resource and stock of advice on closing schools. Readers with an interest in the excluded topics should, therefore, review the handbooks and bibliographies listed in Sections B1 and B2, respectively, of the annotated bibliography, and should consult the "Topical Index" which follows the bibliography.

2.2 FOCUS

As noted in the Preface, the above criteria and our assumptions about local decisionmaking situations were tested before two panels of potential users -- one in Boston, the other in Palo Alto -- with an eye to the utility of this report and the handbook that this project will produce. Discussions at those panel meetings (a copy of the record of those meetings, protecting the privacy and anonymity of participants, will be made available to all readers upon request to the Institute for Responsive Education) confirmed our initial assumptions about the local decisionmaking situation and, hence, validated and guided the criteria of inclusion and exclusion spelled out in Section 2.1, immediately above.

We also learned that decisionmakers had no dearth of information about what to do; instead, there was a great deal of interest in how to secure community and political support for what has to be done, whether the "what has to be done" is a matter of choice or necessity. This need

not only governed our selection of readings, but also our emphasis in the narrative of this report. Consequently, a special focus is on the works which describe, prescribe, and/or present data about processes of implementing and building community support. Our panel of potential users were united in their concern for answers to the question of, to quote one panelist, "how do you do the rational while accomodating the emotional?" Consequently, we give emphasis to works that directly or indirectly address this question and discuss the tension between technical vs. political rationality in retrenchment decisionmaking. Substantively, the greatest topics of interest to panelists were: retooling for the next demographic bulge to hit schools and what to do with high schools in the meantime, closing schools, and the uses and abuses of community involvement in the form of task forces and advisory committees. We found little in the literature about retooling or high schools; we did find much and do focus on school closure and community involvement, as will be seen below, but that focus is largely at the elementary level.[3]

---

[3] Since the completion of our literature search and acquisition on July 1, 1981, the following very useful handbook on decline at the high school level has come to our attention: E. Bussard and A.C. Green, Planning For Decline in Single High School Districts (New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories, April 1981).

3.0 OVERVIEW: A READERS' GUIDE TO THE LITERATURE

We begin by, first, categorizing the literature around what it discusses, i.e., into the topical categories which are listed across the top of Chart 3A, on the page immediately following. Since each topic may be discussed differently, these differences are reflected by the genre categories running down the left-hand column of Chart 3A. That is, some works are expressly designed to help someone do something (i.e., the "Resources") -- they prescribe, instruct, and direct readers to specific sources of information. Another category of works are defined, set apart, by their pedigree -- typically they are a collective effort of some government agency or decisionmaking body -- and by their occasion -- the need to gather facts in order to make a decision. This is typically the case with state and local reports, as identified in Chart 3A. Such reports typically contain a combination of data, advice, instruction, and analysis, very often quite painstaking, of the issues and problems associated with decline. Unintentionally, such reports can act as handbooks and therefore in our subsequent discussions we treat them as resources.

A fourth category of works contains the results of research studies on decline or give detailed descriptions of practices adopted in response to decline. These works provide the facts, whether the facts consist of descriptions of practices, findings from surveys and case-studies inspired by theoretical considerations, or the results of policy or impact studies. Such works are classified as research, by method -- survey and case -- and by scope -- national, interstate, and statewide -- in Chart 3A.

Finally, there are some works which do not prescribe or instruct, nor do they represent new data. Rather, a bibliographer would find that there is a definite category of works which present issues analyses -- identifications of problems and opportunities encountered and issues which need to be considered by decisionmakers responding to decline. This final category completes our classificatory scheme as depicted in the census contained in Chart 3A.

On that chart, the number within each cell refers to the number of items which fit into a given intersection of genre and topic categories.

CHART 3A: A CENSUS OF THE LITERATURE ON DECLINE IN SCHOOL: BY TOPIC AND BY GENRE

GENRE	SUBGENRE	TOPIC: PRIMARY AREA OF FOCUS										Sub-Total by Genre
		General and Comprehensive	Community Involvement	Enrollment Forecasting/ Demography	Equity	Facilities	Finance	Personnel	Program	RIF	School Closure	
Issues Analyses		21	2	1	-	-	-	-	4	7	1	35
Research	Survey: Nationwide	4	-	1	1	-	2	2	5	2	4	21
	Interstate	1	-	-	-	-	1	1	-	-	-	3
	Statewide	4	-	1	-	1	1	-	1	-	-	8
	Case-study: Single	2	2	-	1	-	-	-	-	1	8	14
	Comparative	-	-	1	-	-	-	-	-	-	3	4
	Anecdotal	4	2	-	-	2	-	1	1	3	5	18
Resource	Advice/How to, What to	4	1	10	-	13	3	4	3	8	17	63
	Handbooks	3	-	3	-	8	-	2	-	2	3	26
	Bibliographies	7	-	-	-	1	-	-	-	1	1	10
State Task Force Reports		8	1	3	-	-	-	2	-	2	-	16
Local School District Reports		7	4	2	-	-	1	-	2	-	13	29
SUBTOTAL BY TOPIC		70	12	22	2	24	8	12	16	27	57	250

The census tells us that, for example, out of 250 references, there are 57 works which focus on school closure. Of those, only one analyzes the problems with school closure; four provide national survey data on school closings; 16 provide case-study data; and 13 local school district reports focus on school closure.

The census and mapping as described above and as depicted on Chart 3A allows us to consider three clusters of literature: issues analyses; research; and resources, including the prescriptive advice literature.

3.1 ISSUES ANALYSES: PERSPECTIVES ON DECLINE

Our overview begins with those works which provide a general perspective on decline and raise issues and problems which provide a framework for understanding and interpreting the research and the prescriptive literature. Why is the decline in enrollments such a problem and why does it provide an occasion for so much writing? An uninformed response to that question may be: "Good, now we don't have to worry about overcrowding, we can reduce class size, and finally, do all of the innovative things we've been talking about."

Reading the issues analysis literature (as mapped out on Chart 3B, on pages 11 amd 12, below), leads to a different conclusion, however. There are four major problem areas when one considers the issue of decline: fluctuating rather than merely declining enrollments; the coincidence of enrollment decline and fiscal retrenchment; the difference between contraction and expansion, and the implication of that difference for management; and a lack of consensus on whether decline is a problem or opportunity.

3.1.1 Fluctuating Enrollments

From Davis and Lewis (1977), Dembowski and Gay (1980), and from Morrison (1976), it is clear that the lowest birthrates in this century (other than the Depression years) occurred in the early to mid 1970's, but that due to an increased number of women of childbearing age in the 1980's, K-8 enrollments will rise. At the same time, high school enrollment will fall. In other words, the demographic "shortfall" of the early

CHART 3B: A READERS' GUIDE TO ISSUES ANALYSES IN THE LITERATURE

ISSUES AND TOPICS			REFERENCES
Fluctuating Enrollments:	General Statements About		Abramowitz (1979); Bins and Townsel (1978); Dembowski and Gay (1980); Hickcox and Ryan (1979); Keough (1978a); Keough (1978b); Little (1980); Davis and Lewis (1976); Davis and Lewis (1977); Minnesota (1976); Morrison (1976).
	Coincidental Rise in Elementary and Decline in Secondary		Davis and Lewis (1977); Dembowski and Gay (1980); Morrison (1976).
	Special Implications for Urban Schooling		Bins and Townsel (1978); Hickcox and Ryan (1979); Davis and Lewis (1977).
	Impact on Decisionmaking		Abramowitz (1979); Davis and Lewis (1977).
	Impact on Political Support for Public Schooling		Davis and Lewis (1976); Keough (1978b); Minnesota (1976).
Difference Between Expansion and Contraction	General Statements About		Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Boulding (1974); Boyd (1979); Brubacher and Shibles (1979); Culbertson (1977); Davis and Lewis (1977); Dembowski (1979); Eisenberger (1979); Iannacone (1979); March (1974); Mueller (1977); Newitt and Kahn (1977); Nyquist (1976); Scott (1977); Stefonek (1979); Taylor (1980); Tymko (1979).
	Difference Defined		Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Dembowski (1979); Mazzoni and Mueller (1980); Mueller (1977).
	Impact:	On Leadership	Boulding (1974); Brubacher and Shibles (1979); Culbertson (1977); Iannacone (1979); March (1974); Nyquist (1976); Taylor (1980).
		On Personnel Management	Cuban (1979); Scott (1977).
		On Governance and Politics	Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Stefonek (1978); Tymko (1978).
		On Budgeting	Dembowski (1979); Hentschke (1977a; 1977b); Mazzoni and Mueller (1980); Mueller (1977).
		On Program	Davis and Lewis (1977).
Decline: Problem or Opportunity	General Statements of the Issue		Bellon (1977); Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Colton and Frelich (1979); Culbertson (1977); Dembowski and Gay (1980); Estes (1977); Keough (1978a; 1978b); Minnesota (1976); Stefonek (1979); Yeager (1979).
	Innovation:	Opportunities	Bellon (1977); Culbertson (1977).
		Problems/Limits	Boyd (1979); Dembowski and Gay (1980).

CHART 3B: A READERS' GUIDE TO ISSUES ANALYSES IN THE LITERATURE

ISSUES AND TOPICS			REFERENCES
Decline: Problem or Opportunity (cont'd.)	Efficiency:	Opportunities	Bellon (1977); Estes (1977).
		Problems/Limits	Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Keough (1978b); Minnesota (1976); Stefonek (1979).
	Institutional Change:	Opportunities	Culbertson (1977).
		Problems/Limits	Bellon (1977); Berman and McLaughlin (1978); Colton and Frelich (1979); Keough (1978b); Yeager (1979).

1970's moves up the grades, but is also accompanied by a mini-population boom at the elementary level. This puts school systems into a double bind: secondary levels will have excess capacity, while elementary schools will again be overcrowded (especially in school systems which have shut down facilities and cut staff to the bone during an early period of precipitous drop in enrollments), and excess resources allocated to the secondary level cannot be easily re-allocated to address growth at the elementary level because of such factors as building design and teacher certification (Davis and Lewis, 1976). As a result, some school systems will find themselves having to deal with growth and decline simultaneously (Abramowitz, 1979).

3.1.2 Coincidence of Enrollment Decline and Fiscal Retrenchment

One obvious reason why enrollment decline is a problem has to do with taxpayer sentiment: taxpayers are increasingly unwilling to support rising school budgets for a decreasing number of pupils. Coincident with the period of enrollment decline came a decade of slow, and even negative, economic growth, rising inflation and, as a consequence, a mood of taxpayer revolt.

This mood poses special problems for school systems caught in the web of fluctuating enrollment and thus forced to expand and contract at the same time. Davis and Lewis (1976:2 and 4), for example, have noted the special problems caused by what they term an "anti-growth mentality"; school administrators will have to communicate to boards of education and to the community the need for expanding services and providing resources for growth areas at the elementary level at the same time as secondary level enrollments are in decline (Abramowitz, 1979). This communication is made more difficult by what Davis and Lewis (1976:4) have termed the phenomenon of "age-specific self-interest." A State of Minnesota task force report (Minnesota, 1976:15) reiterates this concern and notes:

> An anticipated older age group structure and its particular interests may limit the possibility of passing educational referenda in the future. An older citizenry might influence an increase in the demand for educational cost efficiency or a reduction in financial support for the educational system.

3.1.3 Contraction is Different From Expansion

School systems' difficulties in managing both decline and growth, simultaneously, are compounded by what a cluster of the literature identifies as the qualitative differences between contraction and expansion.

The Difference Defined

Berman and McLaughlin (1978:313), writing from the perspective of the major Rand studies on schools' adoption of externally initiated innovations[4], argue that "...the process of contraction cannot be accomplished simply by reversing the process of expansion" and note that:

> District expansion was frequently accompanied by organizational growth in which new activities became part of the ongoing school operations. Some of these activities constituted a new level of organizational functioning that was added on to the system in ratchet-like fashion. District officials and policymakers risk a possible long-term erosion of the quality of educational delivery by assuming they can simply subtract-out that which was added-on during expansion. LEAs are constrained in what they can subtract-out. The costs of reversing decisions made during expansion may be hidden as well as high.

Some of these costs include increased levels of conflict (Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:317, n16):

> In the era of expansion, public pressures generally did not force districts to make trade-offs. In fact, the way districts handled community demands during this period tended to have just the opposite effect on district decisionmaking. School boards and district officials typically reacted to special interest groups by creating small (often symbolic) special interest projects that proliferated willy-nilly. This short-term strategy of mollification could be afforded by districts because of the slack available during the period of expansion. But the long-term organizational cost of doing so was seldom discovered. Districts often lost the opportunity to develop their staff, to build a capacity for managing change, and to implement significant reform.

Other costs include necessary but difficult changes in administrative leadership styles and personnel management and the impact of contraction on governance on finance.

---

[4] P. Berman and M.M. McLaughlin, Federal Programs Supporting Educational Change, Vol. I - VII, 1974-1977, Santa Monica: Rand, R-1589/1-HEW.

Impact on Administrative Styles

There is a consensus that the management of retrenchment calls for qualitatively different leadership skills. Boulding (1974) and March (1974) describe the need for a new generation of administrators who are skilled in the processes of adjusting to decline. Dembowski, et al. (1979:104), note that:

> Whereas educators have always operated on a "growth mentality" that must now change to one of "decline." Whereas educators typically take a reactive stance to problems and delay action until those problems reach crisis proportions, that too must change. The presence and persistence of declining enrollments will require that educational leaders increase their predictive abilities, that they become more proactive instead of reactive, that they attend to the causes and effects of the problems, and develop corrective programs in the early stages of problem formation instead of waiting until the problems become incurable and then treating only the symptoms to control rather than cure them. Thus, the principal challenge in the management of enrollment decreases is to begin a planning process before the problem becomes unmanageable or even before the onset of the actual decline itself.

Culbertson (1977:40) warns that the planning process and the planning situation are different under contraction:

> Built-in change processes brought about by expanding enrollments and other expansionary forces are no longer present in most school districts. Neither is the capacity to achieve organizational renewal through the avenues of new positions, new facilities and marked mobility of personnel. Those in administrative positions, having lost decision options associated with growth, find themselves in the unhappy situation of having to make more "no" and fewer "yes" decisions today than in previous decades.

Mazzoni and Mueller (1980:704) point out that "no" decisionmaking requires and is accompanied by the need to centralize decisionmaking. At the same time, Berman and McLaughlin (1978:301) and Dembowski, et al. (1979:105) argue that this planning for retrenchment has to be participatory; it should involve all "affected parties" and "use a shared decisionmaking format." The need for new planning skills is reiterated by Keough (1978b: 358), who notes that:

> ...in growth, the passage of time tends to balance errors of judgement in resource allocation; in decline, time compounds them. Growth holds out promise of career advancement; decline portends job consolidation. Growth encourages and

provides for multiple priorities; decline necessitates focus on only a few. In varied ways and for multiple reasons decline management will challenge the most able leader/administrator.

Nyquist (1977) summarizes this consensus on the need for a new style of management by using the term "decremental planning." But Morgan and Wofford (1977) in their detailed case-history of one school district's attempt to arrive at a cost reduction plan, point out that nothing in school administrators' background, training, or ethos prepares them to be "decremental" planners. For a whole generation, at least, leadership and success was assocaited with growth. A cut-back is felt (perhaps, even, unconsciously) as a failure to exercise leadership on behalf of whatever program gets cut.

These perspectives on decremental planning and retrenchment leadership can best be summarized in terms of the following inventory of necessary leadership skills and qualities.

SKILLS AND QUALITIES		REFERENCE
Skills:	Predictive abilities. Be proactive rather than reactive; attend to causes rather than effects of problems.	Dembowski, et al. (1979:104)
	More ability to engage in cooperative and competitive intergovernmental relations.	Nyquist (1977) and Mueller (1977)
	Ability to become political conflict managers and statesmen rather than managers.	Iannacone (1978) and Taylor (1980)
	Expertise in phased scheduling techniques in order to prescribe programs.	Keough (1978b:358)
Qualities:	Ability to say "no."	Culbertson (1977:40), and Mazzoni and Mueller (1980)
	"Courage to recognize and accept diversity...to be challenged rather than repelled by complex and ambiguous events, the capacity to face a variety of risks..."	Culbertson (1977:48)

SKILLS AND QUALITIES		REFERENCE
Qualities: (cont'd.)	"Keener sense of balance and proportion in the allocation of scarce resources..."	Keough (1978b:358)

Impact on Finance and Governance

Quite apart from school managers' repertoire of skills and personal qualities, contraction, it is said, depletes the managers' stock of political resources. For example, Dembowski et al (1979:18) warn that:

> Declining enrollments affect the economics of education in other unique ways. In the period of growth, money was fairly easily obtained and was often used by the school administrators to control the level of conflict among interest groups in the school district. Money was often used as the resource buffer between conflicting groups. As this buffer is eliminated administrators can no longer "buy" their way out of problems, but are becoming forced to use other alternatives to satisfy the needs of diverse pressure groups. The predictable result of the elimination of the "economic buffer" is that the level of conflict in school districts has risen.

Cuban (1979), describing his experiences as superintendent of a declining district (Arlington, Virginia), points out that enrollment declines and measures taken in response -- school closure and reductions of least senior staff -- will inevitably lead to increases in per pupil expenditures (even in constant dollars) although no new services are created. The public, Cuban writes, becomes suspicious ('Why are costs still rising even after we've made all those cuts') and the school system's organizational response is to prepare lengthy and detailed budget information materials in costly (because administrative resources are diverted) and protracted attempts to justify and make legitimate even the smallest spending decisions.

This legitimacy issue is addressed by Boyd (1979:331) in his study of the impact of school closings on community politics. Following Dembowski's analysis, Boyd also concludes that cut-back decisions are manifestly "redistributive," that is, they create clear-cut winners and

losers. He notes that:

> ...the concentrated costs of school closing upon particular neighborhoods which clearly are the losers in the policy-making game, ordinarily will produce a much more intense public participation and opposition, at least in those particular neighborhoods, than will the distributed costs of across the board cuts in teaching personnel throughout the school district.

Stefonek (1979:17) in reviewing the literature and evidence on "cut-back management" found that distributing the burdens of cutting back is a common practice and notes:

> Deadlocks and conflicts can often be avoided by allocating reductions across all programs and units, yet this may be far less productive and cause many more problems than if cuts were focused upon lowest priority areas of operations.

But Stefonek (1979:3) does recognize, like Boyd, the profoundly de-legitimizing affects of more focused cuts, especially school closings:

> The school administration and school board face a political if not a moral issue in making school closing decisions -- in the respect that those most adversely affected are usually vigorously opposed to the action while the rest of the community may hold a split opinion or show a lack of interest. Does a board then impose a negative decision upon some of its constituents over their strong protests when the remainder of the constituents are not actively calling for such specific action, nor perhaps even interested or supportive as long as it is occuring somewhere else? The physical establishment and continuous operation of a school establishes in effect a "social contract" with a citizen population in a specific geographic area. Even though this commitment is not highly formalized, or of a specific legal nature, area residents make important decisions based on a continuation of educational programs within the neighborhood school.

It is because the "social contract," no matter how symbolic, needs constant renewal and affirmation, that school systems are almost universally advised to "involve the community."[5] Berman and McLaughlin (1978:318) further argue that broad-based involvement can improve the rationality of the planning process, that is, participation is a technical as well as a political necessity. They urge school districts to:

---

[5] See the more detailed discussion in Section 3.3.2 below.

> ...conduct planning so as to generate broad-based support for the district's efforts to change its priorities and its allocation of resources. Support is required from all elements that comprise the local educational system -- the community, the local and state governments, and the staff. Though there is no assured way to gain community support, it seems clear that the old management style of "closing" the system off from the community -- and often from the board -- does not build the reservoir of trust and confidence necessary to implement hard choices. Greater genuine community participation is needed not only at or after a decision but during the planning process. [Emphasis in the original.]

On the other hand, Mazzoni and Mueller (1980) observe that the ability to say "no" is central to cut-back management and requires increased centralization of decisionmaking. Stefonek (1979:17) warns that:

> Bureaucracies especially public ones, have often practiced participatory decisionmaking as a way to promote change and gain acceptance of new goals and practices. Rational cutback strategies, however, often require and result in greater impact upon some people and programs than on others. Broad participation can result in protective behavior by those who perceive their operations to be in jeopardy and can inhibit hard decisions by management staff who don't want to antagonize their colleagues.

And, a Minnesota task force (Minnesota, 1976:24) on "fluctuating school enrollments" worries that:

> As more individuals or agencies become involved in the educational process, a fragmentation in the decision-making process may occur which may not always take into account the future impact of fluctuating enrollments. This fragmentation may create more rigidity in the Educational System rather than flexibility.

Within this last cluster of references, we can begin to discern some differences in perspective which suggest that school managers may be facing a trade-off when it comes to participation and community involvement.

Boyd (1979), Iannacone (1979), and Stefonek (1979) suggest that internal, intra-organizational (i.e., school systems' bureaucratic interest groups) and external community participation (or, at least,

mobilization and opposition) is unavoidable. Berman and McLaughlin (1978) and Dembowski, et al. (1979) suggest that participatory decision-making, both internal and external, is to be valued. They offer the argument that participation is necessary to enhance the ultimate implementation of cut-back decisions, an argument drawn from an analogy with school systems' experiences in implementing innovations. Dembowski implies that, since opposition will be inevitable, school managers would be well advised to seek either countervailing sources of support or to seek a joint ownership of the problems (none of which have easy solutions) involved in cut-back management. Stefonek (1979) points out the de-legitimating effects of cut-back decisions such as school closings, thereby implying that the making of such decisions should follow a process which re-affirms the implicit "social contract" between the school system and the community. He also points out the dysfunctions of participation, i.e., participatory decisionmaking can (i) "...inhibit hard decisions," and (ii) lead to reduction which may be "far less productive." Mazzoni and Mueller (1980) point to the need for centralizing decisionmaking, so that someone, somewhere can say "no." Minnesota (1976) stresses the importance of coordination and warns against the fragmentation which is associated with too many shared decisions.

This leaves a school manager with the following kinds of advice: Share responsibility because whatever decisions you make will be controversial (Boyd, Stefonek, and to a lesser extent, Dembowski) and they will further decrease your stock of leadership resources because any decision which hurts somebody calls into question your legitimacy, and because your decisions will not get implemented anyway unless affected interests are involved (Berman and McLaughlin). On the other hand, you have to say "no" (Culbertson) and to say "no" you may have to centralize responsibility and authority (Mazzoni and Mueller); and if you make the decision which offends the least number of people; you will (a) probably make cuts in the wrong areas, and (b) not satisfy everybody anyway (Stefonek); and, finally, you have got to coordinate in cut-back decisionmaking and coordination problems are made more difficult the more

decisionmakers there are (Minnesota).

Lurking behind this conflicting set of implicit advice are certain positions about participation/community involvement. These positions can be characterized as follows:

(a) Good or bad, you can't avoid participation (Boyd, Stefonek)

(b) You need participation because it defuses opposition and improves your chances of having your decisions implemented (Berman and McLaughlin, and to a lesser extent, Dembowski)

(c) You may not be able to avoid participation totally, but it does get in the way of coordinated, rational objective planning and decisionmaking which is at a premium in retrenchment situations (Mazzoni and Mueller, Minnesota, and to a lesser extent, Cuban)

For stylistic convenience (and not for purposes of criticism) we will describe these three orientations on participation as the "pluralistic," the "participationist," and the "managerialist"[6] positions, respectively. We will see later that these perspectives on participation and community involvement are not reflections of different values placed on "democracy" but, rather, reflect different images of schools as organizations in a community setting. These images inform different perspectives and understandings on decline, on its impact, and on its management. By way of a preview, the "pluralistic" orientation sees schools (and communities) as a polity, an uneasy configuration of interest groups, divided by material and sectional (e.g., neighborhood-specific) interests, none of which has a unique claim to truth, rationality or virtue. The members of this polity are united around their shifting common interests and their more or less constant attachment to the legitimating symbols of public schooling. They remain collectively uncertain about the ultimate ends of schooling and about the best means (i.e., "technologies") of realizing those ends.

The "participationalists" see the school as a social system. As a

---

6 It goes without saying that these terms -- pluralistic, participationalist, and managerialist -- are not ad hominem characterizations. They are only shorthand labels for ideas (not authors) as contained in the specific references cited.

social system, the school is made up of different social groups (e.g., role groups in the organizational hierarchy) with different interests and needs and definitions of the situation. As a social system, the school has certain functional needs embodied in the underlying practices and shared norms of its constituent role groups.

The "managerialist" orientation implies an image of schools as (ideally) rational, purposive, formal organizations, characterized by a rational division of labor and a focused allocation of resources towards clearly prescribed and objectively defined ends. Implicit in the managerialist image of the school as an efficient delivery system are one or more of the following propositions: (a) there are right and wrong decisions and their "rightness" and "wrongness" can be determined objectively; and/or (b) somebody (not an individual but some role-incumbent) has the right to decide what is right, by virtue of its position in the hierarchy and/or its certified possession of technical expertise; and/or (c) there are better or worse, i.e., more rational, ways of deciding what is the right thing to do.

These are, of course, ideal types. They do not apply to authors, or even to entire works. The labels only categorize ideas and statements contained in the works cited.

3.1.4 Is Decline a Problem or an Opportunity?

Readers of the literature described thus far will get the overwhelming impression that decline is best defined as a bundle of problems, of choices with painful trade-offs. There are, however, exceptions and there is a literature which sees opportunities in decline. The most eloquent and persuasive spokesman for this point of view is Culbertson (1977:42). He writes:

> Adversity establishes a climate which encourages change. Such a climate is generated in part by the dissatisfaction which adverse events create. As the consequences of decline become more visible, for example, the motivation to examine its origins and conditions and to define alternatives for change grows. Since adverse events have an unpleasant quality, aspirations to move behind less adverse states develop. This predisposition toward change, one can argue, is stronger in adverse than in salutory circumstances. Prosperity tends to make individuals

more satisfied than dissatisfied with the status quo. It follows, then, that less opportunity for fundamental change is inherent in more prosperous eras. Adversity, then, can abet and support leadership. Educational administrators today can capitalize upon adversity and put it to use by helping school personnel, community leaders and policy makers identify and realize desired change... Leaders in such circumstances, then, can use adversity to help clarify new purposes and prioritize issues... Every adverse condition has in it new opportunities. Adversity is a stimulus to identify and act upon those opportunities. The closing of a school, for example, may be viewed adversely by the citizens in the immediate community; but the school facilities which are vacated can be used for new purposes related to adult education, community service, recreation or other social functions... [Emphasis not in original.]

Culbertson (1977:43) also states:

> Behind every adverse condition or event, then, is a range of opportunities. One very important use of adversity is to identify and to use the opportunities which adversity generates. Every organization, particularly in prosperous times, develops inefficient operations. Since it is easier to assess resource use in times of adversity, the latter can be used to examine operations, and to make them more efficient. Thus, corporate enterprises in times of recession implement modes of self-assessment which help them become "leaner" and more efficient in the organization of work, personnel deployment, communication activities, energy consumption and other processes. Similarly, in school systems, examination can lead to new decision options which, if implemented, will lead to more efficient uses of human and financial resources. [Emphasis not in original.]

To which Bellon (1977:12 and 16) adds that while "adjusting to decline is especially difficult for those institutions which have been growth oriented" it is nevertheless possible that "programs can be strengthened in a period of decline."

Now consider the following passage from Keough, a former school superintendent (1978b:351-352), with extensive experience with decline:

> Districts caught in a financial crunch have only a few possible alternatives: reduce staff and cut program, consolidate facilities, raise local taxes, or operate under deficit budgets. When deficit budgeting is illegal under state law, or tax increases are just not possible, the alternatives are reduced to making trade-offs between program and facilities. Given these basic alternatives most administrators view facility contraction as the lesser of all evils. When districts do not plan ahead, however, they are forced into what many term "austerity

conditions," across-the-board cutbacks in program and personnel. And usually it is the very innovations that made the district a "lighthouse" that are the first to go. Cost reductions which leave the district at a "bare bones" state-mandated curriculum level are not uncommon... Perhaps the greatest threat to program comes not from a plan to cut program, but indirectly as a result of a district's thwarted effort to consolidate facilities. The district may launch a community information program and concentrate its efforts on closing under-utilized facilities. The emphasis, time-line, and planning focus on this alternative. Frequently, community opposition is strong enough to prevent the board from carrying out the plan to close schools. This deadend, when it happens, usually occurs late in the school year and well along in the budget process. The financial crunch is imminent, the facility plan is dead, a referendum not possible, and quick decisions must be made. Only program is left -- and here lies the real threat. Program cut decisions are made under pressure, quickly, and usually without a well-thought-out plan.

Notwithstanding the scenario presented by Keough, Scott (1977:20 and 22) argues that cut-backs and adversity can re-motivate school staff:

> ...while salaries and employee benefits and other general conditions of work are important to employees and keep them from being dissatisfied with the organization, the really important factors contributing to satisfaction on the job and to genuine motivation are related to the work itself...and if we can continue to provide fair and equitable levels of economic compensation, we can turn to the nature and content of work and pay more attention to the opportunities provided for recognition and esteem, without being constrained by the notion that all increased responsibility must be accompanied by a proportional increase in salary.

On the other hand, Cuban (1979:379), in commenting on his efforts as school superintendent to implement humane reduction in force policies and maintain fair and equitable levels of compensation, observes that:

> Finally, as a direct consequence of staff contraction, there are few advancement opportunities available to teachers and administrators. Whereas a decade ago numerous vacancies in helping-teacher, supervisory, and administrative slots gave ambitious individuals much hope for advancement, today few openings leave frustration and resentment in their wake for those who apply for the occasional vacancy and fail to get selected -- even when the policy is to hire from within the organization. Like the apochryphal tale of nineteenth century French bureaucracy, in which death or retirement were the only possibilities for promotion, shrinking school systems find themselves faced with the impotent aspirations of effective young teachers and administrators.

There are a number of issues lurking in the passages just quoted.

Those issues and the contrasting positions taken by a cluster of works (Berman and McLaughlin, 1978; Bellon, 1977; Cuban, 1979; Culbertson, 1977; Dembowski, et al., 1979; Freeman and Hannan, 1981; Keough, 1978b; Mueller, 1977; Scott, 1977; and Stefonek, 1979) which directly or indirectly address this issue, are depicted in Chart 3C, on pages 26-30, immediately below. That chart presents a summary of contrasting propositions about the putative opportunities and problems posed by decline as exhibited in selections from the literature listed above.

By way of a summary, the focal points of debate are the propositions that the adversity caused by decline offers opportunities to:

(1) Engage in long-range and creative planning and bring about desired institutional change.

(2) Strengthen programs and renew staff.

(3) Develop a leaner more efficient school organization.

With respect to the first proposition, Mueller (1977) points out that decline problems stem from forces outside of the school system and that this limits the exercise of pro-active rather than re-active leadership. Minnesota (1976) reiterates this point and notes some external constraints, e.g., teacher certification requirements, which place limits on the creative re-allocation of human resources. Berman and McLaughlin (1978) identify organizational barriers to the generation and use of the kind of information needed for the kind of organizational learning necessary for change and renewal (a similar point is made by Colton and Frelich, 1979). They, Berman and McLaughlin, further note that the normal school district budget-making process all but precludes the long-range planning and the making of creative choices.

Dembowski (1979) points out that: (i) decline in enrollments can lead to program innovation if and only if it is not accompanied by a fiscal decline, and (ii) that inasmuch as most reductions in force are by seniority, declining systems lose those teachers who are most likely to innovate. Keough (1978b) observes that in cut-back decisionmaking it is the innovative programs that are the first to go. In other words, there is a programmatic analogue to the principle of last hired, first fired.

With respect to efficiency, Berman and McLaughlin (1978) note that even if school district budgetmaking were to be rationalized (by adopting

CHART 3C: PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES OF DECLINE: A PROPOSITIONAL INVENTORY OF SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

OPPORTUNITY		COUNTERVAILING PROBLEM/S	
PROPOSITION	REFERENCE	PROPOSITION	REFERENCE
Decisionmaking can be pro-active rather than reactive, "...a major benefit of adversity is the effective addressing of problems in more than a piecemeal and time-bound fashion."	Culbertson, 1977: 44, (see also Bellon, 1977)	In decline, one key feature of the decisionmaking situation is that school managers have to deal with change caused by forces in society rather than forces within the educational system.	Mueller, 1977
"Adversity establishes a climate which encourages change...adversity, then, can abet and support leadership. Educational administrators today can capitalize upon adversity and put it to use by helping school personnel, community leaders and policymakers identify and realize desired change."	Culbertson, 1977: 42	"Districts caught in a financial crunch have only a few possible alternatives: reduce staff, cut programs, consolidate facilities, raise local taxes, or operate under deficit budgets."	Keough, 1978b:351
		Long-range planning requires unity of purpose.	Bellon, 1977:12
		Unity of purpose is difficult to achieve in public systems, especially school systems with ambiguous and shifting goals and uncertain technologies. The result is that "when resources are scarce and demand for services [i.e., enrollments] cannot be controlled, school districts become battlegrounds in which the form of education rather than its substance becomes the bone of contention."	Freeman and Hannan, 1981:30-31
		Schools' budgetary processes preclude long-range and comprehensive decisionmaking. "Typically the district budget is prepared by the district business manager in collaboration with the superintendent, and then put into final form by the school board. Other district personnel have input into this essentially closed process only by means of their division budget recommendations. Those recommendations typically inflate division needs and 'hide' controversial items. This form of budget preparation provides no forum for an informed discussion of trade-offs."	Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:22

CHART 3C (continued): PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES OF DECLINE: A PROPOSITIONAL INVENTORY OF SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

OPPORTUNITY		COUNTERVAILING PROBLEM/S	
PROPOSITION	REFERENCE	PROPOSITION	REFERENCE
"Every adverse condition has in it new opportunities. Adversity is a stimulus to identify and act upon those opportunities. The closing of a school, for example, may be viewed adversely by the citizens in the immediate community; but school facilities which are vacated can be used for new purposes..."	Culbertson, 1977: 42	Closing a school not only adversely affects the immediate community but also breaks the implicit "social contract" between schools and the citizenry.	Stefonek, 1979:6
Program renewal. "Programs can be strengthened in a period of decline."	Bellon, 1977:16	"...it's usually the very innovation that made the district a 'lighthouse' that are the first to go. Cost-reductions that leave the district at a 'bare bones' state-mandated curriculum are not uncommon."	Keough, 1978b: 351
		"The idea that declining enrollments may be used to increase the quality of the instructional program is true only to the extent that such improvements do not require additional financial expenditures."	Dembowski, et al., 1979:175
		Enrollment loss is often accompanied by funding loss. The loss of "this 'loose' source of funds is having a negative effect on education. Administrators often used 'bribes' of cash to induce teachers to experiment with innovative educational programs. In any organization there is a tendency to maintain the 'status quo' unless some change agent is present. With this 'cash' incentive for change gone, innovation and change through incremental additions has lessened."	Dembowski, et al., 1979:18
		"It is likely newer teachers are able to implement innovative practices. Because they [declining districts] cannot hire these new teachers, [such] school districts must either bear the cost of retraining older teachers or opt for status quo instructional programs instead of innovative ones."	Dembowski, et al., 1979:174

CHART 3C (continued): PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES OF DECLINE: A PROPOSITIONAL INVENTORY OF SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

OPPORTUNITY		COUNTERVAILING PROBLEM/S		
PROPOSITION	REFERENCE	PROPOSITION		REFERENCE
Decline and cut-backs can re-motivate staff: "While salaries, employee benefits, and other general conditions of work are important to employees and keep them from being dissatisfied with the organization, the really important factors contributing to satisfaction on the job and to genuine motivation are related to the work itself: ...if we can continue to provide equitable levels of compensation, we can turn attention to the nature and content of work and pay more attention to the opportunities provided for recognition and esteem, without being constrained by the notion that all increased responsibility must be accompanied by a proportional increase in salary."	Scott, 1977:20 and 22	"As a direct consequence of staff contraction, there are few advancement opportunities available to teachers and administrators... few[er] openings leave frustration and resentment in their wake...like the apochryphal tale of nineteenth century French bureaucracy, in which death or retirement were the only possibilities for promotion, shrinking school systems find themselves faced with the impotent aspirations of effective young teachers and administrators."		Cuban, 1979: 379
Increased efficiency: "Behind every adverse condition or event is a range of opportunities. One very important use of adversity is to identify and to use the opportunities which adversity generates. Every organization, particularly in prosperous times, develops inefficient operations... corporate enterprises in times of recession implement modes of self-assessment which help them to become 'leaner' and more efficient...similarly, in school systems, examination can lead to new decision options which, if implemented, will lead to more efficient use of human and financial resources."	Culbertson, 1977:43	There are structural barriers preventing schools from conducting and benefiting from self-assessment.	"...few districts have managed to coordinate evaluation procedures with decision-making cycles or established appropriate channels for dissemination and discussion of evaluation findings. Consequently, evaluation efforts are typically isolated and unrelated to district policy or practice."	Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:308

CHART 3C (continued): PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES OF DECLINE: A PROPOSITIONAL INVENTORY OF SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

OPPORTUNITY		COUNTERVAILING PROBLEM/S		
PROPOSITION	REFERENCE	PROPOSITION		REFERENCE
Opportunity to be more efficient (continued)	Culbertson, 1977:48 (cont'd.)	Structural barriers (cont'd.)	Bureaucratic arrangements, hierarchical divisions of labor, and intra-organizational interests make it difficult for large urban school districts to conduct self-assessments. With respect to school closure decisions, for example, "...principals -- far down in the hierarachy -- were able to manipulate data on building utilization. To them, excess space is an asset not a liability...decision rules are often made far down in the hierarchy [and] an important determinant of these rules is the lower level bureaucrats' definition of the situation."	Colton and Frelich, 1979:415
		Concepts of "leanness" and "efficiency" are themselves debatable and as such subject to political pressures.	A more rationalized budget process (such as PPBS) would not avoid the value conflicts inherent in public school systems.	Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:323
			"...because 'costly' is typically defined by political considerations, programs oriented toward upgrading the overall quality of educational delivery would be likely to succumb to pressures from special interests."	Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:322

CHART 3C (continued): PROBLEMS AND OPPORTUNITIES OF DECLINE: A PROPOSITIONAL INVENTORY OF SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

OPPORTUNITY		COUNTERVAILING PROBLEM/S		
PROPOSITION	REFERENCE	PROPOSITION		REFERENCE
Opportunity to be more efficient (cont'd.)	Culbertson, 1977:43 (cont'd.)	Efficiency and political pressures. (cont'd.)	"Rational cutback strategies ...often require and result in greater impact upon some people and programs than on others. Participation [in cutback decisionmaking] can result in protective behavior by those who perceive their operations to be in jeopardy and can inhibit hard decisions by management and staff who don't want to antagonize their colleagues. Deadlocks and conflicts can often be avoided by allocating reductions across all programs and units, yet this may be far less productive..."	Stefonek, 1979:17
		There are structural constraints to efficient and and creative re-allocations of human resources.	If growth or decline occurs across course offerings, it may not be possible to increase or reduce staff proportionately without increasing or decreasing the number of courses offered.	Minnesota, 1976:17
			Certification requirements (e.g., in vocational education) may restrict reduction of staff and use of alternative staffing patterns.	Minnesota, 1976:18

PPBS -- Planned Program Budget System -- for example) decisionmakers would still face conflicts about what counts as a cost, and what counts as a benefit. Stefonek (1979) notes that participatory styles of decision-making and ordinary human considerations of collegiality prevent decision-makers from making the kind of "hard" choices foreseen by those (like Culbertson, 1977) who see adversity as an opportunity to make schools more efficient.

Scott (1977) and Cuban (1979) differ in their implicit assumptions about human nature. Cuban sees ambition, and the prospect of realizing ambition, as a motivation for excellence and, hence, providing better service to children. Scott assumes that the practice of a craft is its own reward.

In considering our review of this literature several caveats are in order. First, Chart 3C depicts a debate. This is not quite literally true. The selections are not aimed at each other and some authors (Bellon, 1977; and Berman and McLaughlin, 1978, for example) note both opportunities and problems, as does Culbertson (1977). Second, in one sense, the selections, i.e., the opportunity vs. problem propositions, talk past one another. Culbertson and others are not blind to the organizational pathologies noted by Berman and McLaughlin (1978), Freeman and Hannan (1981), and Stefonek (1979). Rather, they argue that adversity causes enough disruption in established practices and organizational inertia for creative leadership and the improvement and rationalization of school management. The other side points out that decline and adversity only serve to exacerbate the bureaucratic pathologies of school systems.

There is, then, evidence of two differing perspectives. It would be useful if those differences were to be resolved by research evidence. But, as we shall see in Section 3.2, below, and again more fully in Section 4.0, such evidence is not available. In fact, it is difficult to see how the issue could be tested. Culbertson and others are making a counter-factual claim: if (and only if) leadership were exercised in the way they describe it, then decline and adversity provide opportunities for institutional renewal.

The whole debate, then, seems to turn on how one sees the limits of

educational leadership (and not individual leaders' skills, ingenuity and courage) in organizational settings. The last proviso is the all-important key to unpacking these different perspectives. The "optimists" (Culbertson and others) make some implicit propositions about organizational behavior: (i) that organizations have, or can be given, a unity of purpose; (ii) that strong leadership can create, or capitilize, on this unity; and (iii) translate it (the unity of purpose) into a coordinated set of operations. Behind these propositions are assumptions about leadership and followership in school settings. Readers will recognize these assumptions as constituting a particular image of the school as a "rational-purposive organization." This is, to use our earlier typology, a managerialist image of schools. The "pessimists (Hannan and Freeman, 1981, especially, and to a lesser extent, Berman and McLaughlin, 1978; and Stefonek, 1979) operate with a different image of the school, seeking it as an uneasy constellation of interest groups united by a consensus not to delve too deeply into the purposes of schooling (the school as a "polity") and by an adherence to established practices and norms which are disrupted and threatened by decline and its attendant adversities (the school as a "social system").

Once again, we see how differing images about the nature of schools as organizations inform differing perspectives on decline and its management.

3.2 RESEARCH

Research per se cannot settle all disputes arising out of different conceptions of the school (if only because there are few uninterpreted "facts." There are "findings" and findings are generated by methodologies which are, in turn, derived from different conceptual schemes.). Research can, however, provide data about the impact of decline on measurable operations of schools, about behaviors associated with declining school systems, and about the impact (again, measurable) of those behaviors on the schools and on communities.

The 33 references which provide such information are listed and classified on Chart 3D, on pages 33 - 35, immediately following. We will

CHART 3D: THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE AND INVENTORY

FACET OF DECLINE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		GENRE				
			SURVEY DATA			CASE DATA	
			NATIONWIDE	INTERSTATE	STATEWIDE	SINGLE	COMPARATIVE
IMPACT OF DECLINE:	On Administrative Practices		ASCD, 1980				
	On Governance Processes					CUBAN, 1979 EDLEFSON, 1977 MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	BOYD, 1979 BURLINGAME, 1979
	On Finances		LEPPERT AND ROUTH, 1978	ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978	HICKROD, 1976 RODEKOHR, 1976 WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978	MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	
	On Personnel		DEMBOWSKI, 1979	FREEMAN AND HANNAN, 1981 ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978	HICKROD, 1976 WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978		
	On Program:	Course Offerings	DEMBOWSKI, 1979		RODEKOHR, 1976 WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978		
		Quality	DEMBOWSKI, 1979		RODEKOHR, 1976 WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1976		
		Innovations	DEMBOWSKI, 1979		RODEKOHR, 1976		
RESPONSES TO DECLINE:	Planning:	Enrollment Forecasting			SHAW, 1980		BERNHARDT, 1980
		Community Involvement				EDLEFSON, 1977 HESS, 1979 NUTTALL, 1976 MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	

CHART 3D: THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE AND INVENTORY

FACET OF DECLINE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		GENRE				
			SURVEY DATA			CASE DATA	
			NATIONWIDE	INTERSTATE	STATEWIDE	SINGLE	COMPARATIVE
RESPONSES TO DECLINE: (continued)	Personnel:	Changes in Hiring Practices	DEMBOWSKI, 1979		RODEKOHR, 1979		
		Reduction in Force			HICKROD, 1976		
		Early Retirement	DEMBOWSKI, 1979		ELLSWORTH, 1977		
	Facilities:	Changes in Space Allocation by Program Area	DEMBOWSKI, 1979				
		Alternative Use of Excess Space	SARGENT AND HANDY, 1974		MITCHELL AND MILLER, 1980	EISMANN, 1976	
		Grade Reorganization				HESS, 1979a PIATT, 1975	
	School Closure:		ANDREWS, 1974			CUBAN, 1979 YEAGER, 1979	BORNSTEIN, 1979 BOYD, 1979 BURLINGAME, 1979 COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979
	Interdistrict Sharing:		DEMBOWSKI, 1980				
IMPACT OF RESPONSES TO DECLINE:	Reduction in Force: Impact on Affirmative Action		ROSENBERG AND VINCENT, 1978				
	School Closure: Impact on Governance Processes					CUBAN, 1979	BOYD, 1979 BURLINGAME, 1979

CHART 3D: THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE AND INVENTORY

FACET OF DECLINE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC	GENRE				
		SURVEY DATA			CASE DATA	
		NATIONWIDE	INTERSTATE	STATEWIDE	SINGLE	COMPARATIVE
IMPACT OF RESPONSES TO DECLINE: (continued)	School Closure: Impact on Community					AMLUNG, 1980 EISMANN, 1976
	School Closure: Impact on Pupils				PARKS, 1980 RICHARDS AND COHEN, 1981	
	School Closure: Impact on Desegregation				COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979 FLEMING, 1980 VALENCIA, 1980	

postpone a discussion and review of the evidence contained in those references until Section 4.0, below. For now, however, several general observations about the shape of the research literature can be offered.

- There is a preponderance of case-material ranging from comparative and longitudinal studies (e.g., Boyd, 1979) informed by a theoretical perspective and a rich conceptual framework to detailed case-histories (no less useful for practitioners) of unique responses to unique circumstances (e.g., Morgan and Wofford, 1977; Edlefson, 1977).
- The literature is rich in data on the fiscal impact of decline, less rich in generalizable data on the programmatic impact of decline (with the exception of Dembowski, et al., 1979), and relatively limited (except for case-studies of varied generalizability) on the processes of responding to decline, and the impact of those processes.
- In addition to information on school finance, there is an understandably heavy emphasis on school closure ranging from nationwide surveys of school closure criteria, descriptive (Sargent and Handy, 1974) and analytical (Andrews, 1974), to statewide (Bernstein, 1979) and local (Boyd, 1979; Burlingame, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979) comparative case studies of school closure decisionmaking processes, to single case histories (Cuban, 1979; Yeager, 1979), to local impact studies of school closure and consolidation (Amlung, 1980; Eismann, 1976; Parks, 1980; Richards and Cohen, 1981). The local impact studies are not very generalizable with respect to either findings or, with the exception of Richards and Cohen (1980), method.
- Our research found only six nationwide surveys on the impact of decline. These include: ASCD (1980) which focused on the impact of enrollment decline on supervisory practices; Leppert and Routh (1978) summarizing the fiscal impact of declining enrollments; Dembowski, et al. (1979), the most comprehensive extant study on the impact of enrollment declines on school program; Sargent and Handy (1974) and Andrews (1974) which surveyed school closures nationwide; and Rosenberg and Vincent (1978), a valiant attempt in the face of almost insuperable measurement problems to ascertain the impact of reductions in force on affirmative action gains.
- There has yet to be a comprehensive nationwide study providing[7]

---

[7] We discuss the available literature and evidence on equity in Section 5.1, below. We define "equity", operationally, as all those programs and policies, often mandated, which provide services and opportunities for populations hitherto underserviced and/or discriminated against. These refer to: school desegregation, affirmative action, special and compensatory education -- e.g., Title I, bilingual programs, and programs benefitting handicapped and learning disabled persons.

original data on the impact of decline and decisions made in response to decline on equity initiatives in education. In addition to Rosenberg and Vincent (1978), Dembowski, et al. (1979) and Wilken and Callahan (1978) provide survey data on the preservation of special education despite decline; Hickrod (1976) surveys the impact of state aid formulas on Title I; and Colton and Frelich (1979), Fleming (1980), and Valencia (1980) provide case data on the impact of school closure decisions on desegregation. The news with respect to special and compensatory education is heartening; gains have been held harmless despite decline. The spot data on desegregation and affirmative action is mixed. School districts do, as a matter of policy, but not always practice, take desegregation into account in their school closure decisions. Affirmative action gains appear to have been eroded in districts in decline.

In summary, the extant research does begin to give us some knowledge about patterns of school systems' adjustments, i.e., planned and unplanned responses to decline. But, apart from a handful of illuminating case studies, not much is known about school systems' decisionmaking processes in responding to, and managing decline.[8]

3.3 RESOURCES

This does not mean, however, that there is a scarcity of advice about how to respond to and manage decline. As noted in Section 3.0, above, the category "resources" includes not only handbooks and bibliographies, but also state and local task force reports which, by virtue of their detailed documentation of some actual planning processes, can serve as planning materials. Charts 3G and 3H, on pp. 75 and 80, at the conclusion of this subsection provide an inventory of the topics dealt with, and an inventory

---

[8] Please note. We are operating with a restrictive definition of research. It is applied only to those materials which present "hard data" subject to the principle of falsification (see K. Popper, Logic of Scientific Discovery, New York: Basic Books, 1959). There is a wealth of anecdotal materials on decisionmaking processes. We discuss those in Section 3.3.2 immediately below and include them under "advice" where advice refers to the literature which not only provides "how-to" instructions but also provides anecdotal descriptions of endorsed practices.

of the instruments and hands-on planning materials (see the columns under "Tools" on Chart 3G) contained in the "Resources" and "Bibliographies", respectively.[9]

3.3.1 Patterns of Advice

We also define as "resources" a vast occasional and periodical literature which offers advice to local school district decisionmakers. The genre, "advice," is characterized by its manifestly practical intent, its brevity, its avenues of dissemination (papers delivered at professional association meetings and articles in professional association journals, e.g., PDK, American School Board Journal, NASSP Bulletin, CEFP Journal, etc., and the prevalence of anecdotal documentation as supporting evidence. Chart 3E on the pages immediately following provides an overview of this advice literature.

Advice comes in many forms -- memorabilia from the "firing line", specific "how to" and "what you should do" hints distilled from experience and from the "craft-lore" of school administrators, and inspirational or cautionary anecdotes about what we/they did in District X or Y. Advice is also offered across a whole spectrum of management issues. A sample of that advice is offered in Chart 3F, on pp. 41-50, below. The literature cited is representative of the most widely cited, quoted, and agreed upon courses of action. As such, it represents an emerging professional consensus on managing decline.

3.3.2 Synthesis: Advice on School Closure And Community Involvement

We begin with Sargent and Handy's (1974) early and classic treatment of the subject. They advise that all school districts require a plan for school closure. Such a plan would have:

---

[9] We will not provide a review and discussion of the handbook literature as a category, apart from collecting them in separate sections (B1, B2) of our annotated bibliography and inventorying them in Chart 3G.

CHART 3E: A READERS' GUIDE TO THE "ADVICE" LITERATURE: SELECTED WORKS

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCES
Decisionmaking	Budgeting		Estes (1977); Hentschke (1977a and b); Mueller (1977); Morgan and Wofford (1977); Shannon (1980).
	Governance:	Board Decisionmaking	Eisenberger (1978); Tymko (1980).
	Planning:	Importance of	Bellon (1977); Divoky (1979); Fowler (1980); Mazzoni and Mueller (1980); New York (1976).
		Enrollment Forecasting	Brown and Servile (1979); Brunetti (1974); Engelhardt (1974); Keough (1974a; 1974b; 1978c); Fonstad (1979); Leggett (1973).
		Technical planning is not enough. Need to address the people problems of decline.	Hickcox and Ryan (1979); Bishop (1979); Eisenberger (1974); Keough (1978a); Piele and Wright (1976).
	Community Involvement		Custis (1978); Eisenberger (1976; 1977; 1978); Klas (1979); NSPRA (1976); Sieradski (1975); Katner (1974).
Closing Schools	Planning for:	Information Gathering	Crowe (1979); Eisenberger and Keough (1974); Frederickson (1978b); Leggett (1977; 1978); Morris (1977); Pasnick (1979).
	Involving the Community		Bornstein (1978); Keough (1978a); Eisenberger (1974; 1975); Eisenberger and Keough (1974); Peckenpaugh (1977); Pound (1976); Ross (1980); Sargent and Handy (1974); Thomas (1977).
	Mitigating the Impact of School Closure/ Merger		Brody (1976); Eismann (1976); Richards and Cohen (1981); Thompson (1979).
Reducing Staff	RIF:	General Discussions	Custis (1978a); Fowler (1974); Kelley (1978); Nolte (1976); Keough (1975; 1978); Wilken and Callahan (1978); Zusman (1978).
		Due Process and Law	Boyer and Nassau (1978); Ditzhazy (1977).
		Collective Bargaining	Booth (1980); Jascourt (1978); Nassau (1978a; 1978b); Nolte (1976); Shannon (1980).
		Seniority v. Merit	Haun (1978); New Jersey (1979); Nolte (1976); Siefert (1979).

CHART 3E: A READERS' GUIDE TO THE "ADVICE" LITERATURE: SELECTED WORKS

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCES
Reducing Staff (cont'd.)	Mitigating Practices: Job placement and inter-district sharing.		Thomas (1978).
	Alternatives:	Early Retirement	Divoky (1979); Ellsworth (1977); Keough (1978a); Illinois (1975; 1977); Seifert (1979); Wakefield and Donnelly (1978).
		Intra-district Job Sharing	Kalvelage (1978).
		Furloughs and Extended Leave	Divoky (1979); Illinois (1975).
Renewing Staff	Preservice		Dembowski (1979).
	Inservice		Dembowski (1979); Killick (1980); Relic (1980); Wofford (1978).
Renewing and Preserving Special Programs	Adult and Community Education		Anderson (1977); Wegmann (1980).
	Arts Program		Dace (1979).
	Computer Literacy		Wegmann (1980).
	Gifted and Talented		Carlson (1979).
	Using Excess Capacity for Special Education		Schomp (1980).

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
BUDGETMAKING	Use a Zero-based Budgeting System	"...the development of a school budget should be based on educational expectations or output rather than line items."	ESTES, 1977:30 see also HENTSCHKE, 1977b	55 70
	Use Program Budgets	Program budgets help to counter the intuitive judgement that to eliminate programs is to save money.	MORGAN and WOFFORD, 1977	106
	Keep Two Sets of Books	A school's budget has to be understood by the public in order to prevent a backlash against tough retrenchment decisions. Keep two sets of books, "...one for the state and the other for internal management decisionmaking and public information. The latter set should be designed to be understood by persons of reasonable intelligence without an extensive accounting background, and should provide narrative descriptions of categories of revenues and expenses...."	SHANNON, 1980: 244-45	148
BOARD DECISIONMAKING	Board Role Orientation	Local boards of education should see themselves as planning for social change in making retrenchment decisions.	TYMKO, 1980	160
	Internal Decisionmaking	Boards should not use the parliamentary approach, i.e., voting, in order to make decisions. Instead, boards should adopt a consensus based decisionmaking procedure. Once a consensus decision has been reached each board member should explain why he or she approves. This clarifies each member's point of view and "signals solidarity" as the board begins the work of "selling the plan to school personnel and the community."	EISENBERGER, 1978	51
PLANNING	Make Retrenchment Planning Routine	Planning for retrenchment should be integrated in schools' standard operating procedures and should be a year-round activity.	ESTES, 1977: 24	55
	Create A Special Organizational Structure for Retrenchment Planning	Make a Coordinator of Decline. Produce a carefully articulated decline response with phases each having its own timetable, purpose, methods and special concerns. A community task force could have its own salaried facilitator.	DIVOKY, 1979: 88	43
	Manage by Objectives	MBO (Management by Objectives) enable administrators to integrate their retrenchment decisions with reference to specific educational goals.	ESTES, 1977: 29	55

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
PLANNING (continued)	Pre-planning	Retrenchment planning needs to be based on reliable local data not only about enrollments but also about community needs and opinions, staff skills, facilities, programs, and school district organizations.	BISHOP, 1979 KEOUGH, 1978a BROWN AND SERVILE, 1979 BELLON, 1977	14 87 21 10
		Conduct a school facilities inventory "using systematic standards for estimating instructional space requirements." Formulate districtwide reorganizational alternatives so as to provide optional responses for boards and community groups.	BISHOP, 1979: 267	14
FORECASTING EQUIPMENT	Do Not Rely Exclusively on Cohort-Survival Methodologies	"The typical straight line cohort-survival technique used by administrators may not be sensitive enough to explain sufficiently certain aberrations or inconsistencies in grade-by-grade, year-by-year enrollments."	BISHOP, 1979: 288	14
		Use non-demographic indicators, e.g., high real estate values (which reduce number of young families with small children) to estimate future enrollments.	KEOUGH, 1974b	85
		Political sensitivity and understanding the effects that social and political pressure groups can have on how facts are interpreted are just as important as knowing the strengths and weaknesses of different forecasting techniques.	PIELE AND WRIGHT, 1976	131
COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT	Recognize Different Values and Interests	Technical planning and accurate data gathering is not enough. Beware of the fact that principals may not have the same perspective as district officials (e.g., closing a school is not the former's interest).	EISENBERGER, 1974: 34	47
		"The first factor for administrators and boards to deal with is the realization that there are no loyal district supporters, there are only loyal school supporters."	EISENBERGER, 1974: 33 see also MORGAN and WOFFORD, 1977	47 106
	Ways and Means of Institutionalizing Community Involvement	Community Polls "...it lets the community know that you want and need their involvement. Polling can be done through face to face interviews, mailed surveys, or telephone questionnaires." Small Group Coffee Hours "...when a school leader gets out into the community in small discussion groups, there is an opportunity to bring personal warmth into the situation."	EISENBERGER, 1977: 36	50

CHART 3F: A COMPENSIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT (continued)	Ways and Means of Institutionalizing Community Involvement (continued)	[Enlist the Support of Community Opinion Leaders] "...you need to convince 'Mrs. Jones,' PTA leader, that her influence, acceptance and reputation will not be lost, simply transferred to a new school setting."	EISENBERGER, 1977:36	50
		[Enlist support of community opinion leaders] ...in establishing a task force. "Enlist the help of key citizens... local civic leaders, town businessmen, service area people. The local gasoline station owner talks to literally dozens of community members each day."	EISENBERGER, 1977:37	50
		[Use existing community groups] "...shift PTA emphasis to a districtwide council and begin [their involvement in] planning activities districtwide instead of at the building level."		
		Establish a districtwide, broadly representative, task force to engage community leaders in helping to plan for decline.	EISENBERGER, 1977:37	50
		....and to reconcile "special interest pressures" and serve as "a link between the school board and the community."	SIERADSKI, 1975:12 and 19	151
USE AND ABUSE OF COMMUNITY TASK FORCES	Role	Do not let task force act as a "watchdog committee."	SIERADSKI, 1975:12	151
		"Give them a specific charge. Don't let task force flounder, studying nebulous areas. Provide them with information. If they have no source of reliable information, they will go through old board minutes dredging up all sorts of issues. They'll [the community task force] do what the media people euphemistically refer to as 'investigative reporting.'" (Emphasis not in original.)	EISENBERGER, 1977:37	50
	Functions	Should become thoroughly familiar with the methods and indicators used to predict future enrollments.	SIERADSKI, 1975:19-21	151
		The task force should visit each school and rate it against the others in terms of educational adequacy.		
		The task force should be responsible for establishing criteria for closing any school.		
		"[The task force should] enlist the help of key citizens, meet regularly, gather data, and report back to the superintendent."	EISENBERGER, 1977:37	50

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE; SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
USE AND ABUSE OF COMMUNITY TASK FORCES (continued)	Responsibility and Accountability	"The task force should always report to the superintendent -- not the board or community." (Emphasis not in original.)	EISENBERGER, 1977:37	50
	Internal Processes	If districts are just beginning to close schools then use the extended study committee which meets once or twice a month for nine months a year.		
		"If decisions are needed quickly, in-depth seminars, which meet 9-5 on weekends may be useful." "Seminars" are most successful in highly sophisticated, cosmopolitan communities.	EISENBERGER, 1976	49
	Staff Support	Consider having a salaried facilitator for community task forces on decline.	DIVOKY, 1979:88	43
SCHOOL CLOSURE	The Importance of Planning	"All districts, no matter what their unique issues, require a plan for school shrinkage. [Such] a plan must have: (1) goals and objectives; (2) a factual base, which should include enrollment preductions, data on school location, capacity and general adequacy [of school sites]; and data on community changes; (3) an analyses of the data; (4) a set of possible solutions; (5) a choice among alternatives. The latter should include a justification for the choice, a time sequence for its completion, and a cost analysis of all plans."	SARGENT and HANDY, 1974	193
		In closing schools, districts should develop a comprehensive master plan -- covering policy program, personnel, organization and physical plants -- and a closure plan.		
	Conduct Facilities Inventories	Begin by conducting a districtwide inventory of facilities using systematic standards for estimating instructional space requirements.	BISHOP, 1979:267	14
		A facilities inventory should be kept on file for each school. It should have the following items: (1) zoning, including possible changes in patterns of real estate values and investment of surrounding area; (2) acreage of entire site including playground description; (3) physical plant and construction --	PASNIK, 1979:65	125

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
SCHOOL CLOSURE (continued)	Conduct Facilities Inventories (continued)	type, age and condition of heating ventilation, air conditioning, electrical systems, and construction materials; (4) accessibility by private and public transportation; (5) architecture -- type, year and flexibility; and (6) room inventory -- size and type of classrooms, special rooms, service rooms, fixed furniture, cabinets, etc.		
	Do Not Over-estimate the True Costs of Keeping Small Schools Open	It is the high rate of "overhead" -- per pupil cost of instruction -- that makes small schools seem inefficient. Therefore "...make sure that your per pupil expenditure is being evaluated correctly. Many school system budgets have a built-in bias against small schools...some special costs, e.g., speech therapy teachers, are divided equally among schools rather than prorated on the time such teachers spend in each school."	LEGGETT, 1978:38-39	96
	Implementing the Closing Process: Recognize the Political Dimension	"The process of school closure is a political act. Two essential rules should guide it...[1] allow plenty of lead time, and [2] involve the community in planning for closings and selecting the choice to be made."	SARGENT and HANDY, 1974. See also all references to "KEOUGH" and to "EISENBERGER"	193
	Take Your Time	Follow a two-stage process. "Districts should first present their data as a whole for community discussion and acceptance, and only then should administrators talk about the specifics of closing individual schools."	SARGENT and HANDY, 1974.	193
	Share the Responsibility	A broadly representative community task force should visit each school and rate it against the others in terms of educational adequacy. Such a task force should be responsible for establishing the criteria for closing any school.	SIERADSKI, 1975:19-21. See also EISENBERGER, 1975 and 1973.	151
	Mitigate Adverse Community Reaction	Keep the public informed at all times, on each issue, at each stage of the process.	CROWE, 1979; EISENBERGER, 1975 and 1978; FREDERICKSON, 1978b; KEOUGH, 1978a; SARGENT and HANDY, 1974; THOMAS, 1978	31; 48, 51; 59; 87; 193; 156

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
SCHOOL CLOSURE (continued)	Mitigate Adverse Community Reaction (continued)	Maintain school board solidarity by adopting a consensus rather than a decisionmaking approach. A solid board has a better chance of "selling its plan" to the public.	EISENBERGER, 1978	51
		Enlist the support of community opinion leaders. Shift PTA emphasis by establishing a districtwide PTA council, thereby creating districtwide rather than school site loyalty.	EISENBERGER, 1977	50
		Create a representative school-community task force. Include on it key community leaders. Give it a specific charge. Make it a working group rather than a policy advisory group or a citizens' watchdog committee. Charge it with visiting each school and establishing criteria for closing any school.	EISENBERGER, 1977 SIERADSKI, 1975	50 151
		Secure the consensus about having to close some schools before talking about the specifics of which school/s should be closed.	SARGENT and HANDY, 1974	193
		In merging and reorganizing buildings, take advantage of the opportunity to promote program diversity and give parents a choice.	BRODY, 1976	19
		Provide opportunities for parents and pupils of a school being closed to see the facilities and meet the staff of the host school. Make student and staff reassignments (and make them public) before the final decision to close schools.	EISMANN, 1976:22	53
	Mitigate Adverse Impact on Children of Closed Schools	Give plenty of warning: "Children fear the 'unknown', programs designed to 'make the unknown known' help alleviate fears...with a planned and predictable change, it would be easier for parents to direct their energies toward program planning in the new school and support for the teaching staff. When change is inevitable, a positive outlook from parents may make the transition easier for a young child."	RICHARDS and COHEN, 1981:96 and 106	135

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
SCHOOL CLOSURE (continued)	Mitigate Adverse Impact on Children of Closed Schools	Pay careful attention when you merge school populations: • If a school is closed, it should not be merged with another school which might possibly close in the future (within the next five years) ...it is important that children, parents and teachers feel a sense of security once a move has taken place. • "...establish an even ratio of new to old children in the classrooms [of the school receiving children from a newly closed building]."	RICHARDS and COHEN, 1981:106 and 72, respectively	135
MANAGING PERSONNEL	Reducing Staff	Involve teachers in RIF policy formulation and let (in fact, encourage) collectively bargained agreements on RIF.	DOWNEY, 1976 NASSAU, 1978a NOLTE, 1976a	44 110 117
		Ease the pain by developing inter-district consortia for placement and sharing of excess staff.	SEIFERT, 1979 THOMAS, 1978	147 156
		Have an inventory of skills, training, certification and interests of all employees.	KELLEY, 1978:83	83
		Do it before you need to. Cut all other expenses to the bone so that "teachers and other employees will see that the board and superintendent are doing everything they can before they make broad staff cuts."	NOLTE, 1976a:27	117
	Merit v. Seniority in RIF Decisions	Have the following criteria in RIF policy. The following items, in this priority order, should be considered in RIF decisions. (1) Teaching assignments, educational preparation and training (2) Certification status (3) Seniority based upon (in this order) (a) years of service in the district (b) length of service in current assignment (c) number of years teaching in current area of certification	NOLTE, 1976a:45	117

CHART 3P: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
MANAGING PERSONNEL (continued)	Merit v. Seniority in RIF Decisions (continued)	(d) Total number of years teaching experience When all qualifications are equal, the tie-breaker is 3(a) -- time of starting employment in district.		
		Base RIF on teacher effectiveness determined primarily by student achievement (i.e., rate of pupil progress) data, and secondarily on such personal qualities as "firmness," "friendliness," and "fairness".	NOLTE, 1976b:26-27	118
	Seniority, Affirmative Action	Employee RIF roster is arranged on basis of seniority. But if a cut results in damaging affirmative action (defined as a given level of minority employees), construct a separate affirmative action seniority list. This shields those employees against any cuts which decrease a given proportion of minority employees in the district.	DOWNEY, 1976:36	44
	Summary of Issues to Consider in Any RIF Policy	"Some districts are bound by state law to excess staff on a seniority basis only; others may employ additional criteria such as: quality of service; experience in a special area; district based need; educational-preparation qualifications; certification; and others. If additional criteria are to be used, some form of evaluation measure and definition will be necessary. For example: • By whom, and with what weight will 'quality of service' be measured? • Must 'experience in a specific area' be in-district experience? With what level of competency? How many years ago? • If certification is held in more than one area, but teaching experience in another, would that individual have claim equal to an individual with both certification and experience?"	KEOUGH, 1978b:349-350	88
	Renewing Staff: Inservice and Preservice	NOTE: The "need" for inservice is cited in almost every reference. Here we list only a selection of the most concrete prescriptions addressed to this need.		

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
MANAGING PERSONNEL (continued)	Renewing Staff: Inservice and Preservice (continued)	"Mandate all pre-service and inservice teachers to receive some training in reading, and [in] educating the 'exceptional student' (e.g., handicapped, gifted and talented, bilingual... etc.) as a condition for gaining initial certification and renewal."	DEMBOWSKI, 1979:101	41
		Administrators, too, need in-service. Retrenchment decision-making requires new skills and attitudes.	WOFFORD, 1978	166
		"It also seems wise to encourage school administrators and curriculum coordinators to keep teacher certification updated and activated."	DEMBOWSKI, 1979:107	41
		"Increasingly school principals and assistant principals, counselors and curriculum coordinators may be called upon to assume some actual classroom instructional as well as supervisory and managerial responsibilities. This situation may become more and more of a necessity for curriculum coordinators in certain subjects (such as fine arts and foreign languages) as enrollments in those areas decline and the number of supervisors needed decreases proportionately."		
		"While many states allow administrators to maintain their tenure as instructional employees, their seniority as classroom teachers ceases to accumulate after leaving the classroom. Yet if an administrator may re-enter as a classroom teacher, he or she may be more inclined to accept the change of job status. Thus, there will be less incentives to protect administrators in Reduction In Force."	WILKEN and CALLAHAN 1978:300	65
RENEWING PROGRAMS	NOTE: Program and curricular issues have received comparatively little attention in the advice literature on decline. There are, however, a handful of works which do alert decisionmakers to what subject and curricular areas are most likely to shrink and/or grow (proportionately) as schools adjust to decline.			
	Shrinking Program Areas	Social Studies and Foreign Languages	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41
		Art	DACE, 1979	27

CHART 3F: A COMPENDIUM OF ADVICE TO SCHOOL MANAGERS AS THEY ADJUST TO DECLINE: SELECTIONS FROM THE LITERATURE

MANAGEMENT ISSUE	TOPIC OF ADVICE	ADVICE STATEMENTS	REFERENCE/S	ANNOTATION NUMBER
RENEWING PROGRAMS (continued)	Growing Program Areas:	Vocational Education	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41
		Special Education	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41
			SCHOMP, 1980	143
		Gifted and Talented	CARLSON, 1979	27
			DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41
		Computer Literacy	WEGMANN, 1980	163
		Adult and Community Education and Lifelong Learning	ANDERSON, 1977	4
			WEGMANN, 1980	163

(1) Goals and objectives.

(2) A factual base, which should include enrollment projections, data on school location, capacity and general adequacy, and data on community changes.

(3) An analysis of the data.

(4) A set of possible solutions.

(5) A choice among alternatives.

Sargent and Handy's plan would also remind the decisionmaker that:

(6) The process of closing a school is also a political act and administrators should involve the community in planning for closings and in selecting the choices to be made.

The advice points into two directions, or rather, it recognizes two dimensions: (i) the technical (e.g., identifying goals and objectives, developing and analyzing a factual base), and (ii) the "political." This does not mean, however, that the dimensions can be separated. In outlining the two cardinal rules of thumb for the politics of school closure, Sargent and Handy endorse the practice of adopting a two-stage process of closing schools. In stage one, school administrators should develop and present data for community discussion and thus, gain acceptance for the necessity of closing some schools. In stage two, decisionmaking should focus on the specifics of closing individual schools.

By logic and by political necessity, stage one should precede stage two. But what demonstrates the necessity for closing some schools? Such a demonstration would have to show that the closing decision is neither precipitous nor capricious. That is, all other options have been exhausted and closing <u>some</u> school makes fiscal and educational sense. To that end, Sargent and Handy (1974) urge that school districts considering school closure should develop both a comprehensive master plan -- covering program, personnel and facilities -- and a closure plan which emanates from and is integrated into the master plan.

This latter point is reiterated by Estes (1977:24), who urges that planning for retrenchment become part of a school system's standard operating procedures and should be a continuous activity. Then, and only then, will cut-back decisions, like school closings, be made on an educationally

sound basis and can be communicated to the community as such. However, this requires that there be standard operating procedures which tie resource allocations to educational objectives. One such recommended procedure is Management by Objectives (MBO) which enables school administrators to make plans with respect to specific educational objectives. Estes (1977:29-30), and to a lesser extent, Hentschke (1977b), recommend the adoption of zero-based budgeting, arguing that "the development of a school budget should be based on educational expectations, or output, rather than [the ritual preservation of] line items" (Estes, 1977:30). It is argued that zero-based budgeting, by requiring an output justification for each line-item of expenditure, forces school resource allocations to be tied to educational outputs rather than to the preservation of intra-organizational interests, or to the maintenance of a given level of operations as ends in and of themselves. Thinking in terms of outputs for expenditures leads to Program Budgeting which Morgan and Wofford (1977) endorse as a useful way to counter the intuitive judgement that to eliminate programs is to save money.

In summary, the advice suggests that: (i) school closure planning cannot be done outside of comprehensive, districtwide master planning; (ii) such planning if it is to answer the question -- "Is it educationally sound to close schools, and if so which ones?" -- must be specifically tied to educational objectives; and, (iii) such ties can be institutionalized by adopting management by objective, by zero-based budgeting, and by program budgeting.

But there is still one minor problem. State requirements impose a line-item format on school district budgeting. Shannon (1980:244) suggests therefore that school districts keep two sets of books: "...one for the state and the other for internal management decisionmaking and public information. The latter set should be designed to be understood by persons of reasonable intelligence without an extensive accounting background, and should provide narrative descriptions of categories of revenues and expenses..." It is easy to see how this could be taken a step further by using program budgeting for "internal management decisionmaking purposes."

Keeping two sets of books, if the second set of books are "capable of being understood by persons of reasonable intelligence" and show the

educational rationale for each category of expenses can also enable the district management and school board to arrive at stage one of the closure process: gaining communitywide acceptance and understanding of the necessity to close schools (Sargent and Handy, 1974; also Keough, 1978b). This necessity can be caused by many factors. Often, of course, it takes the form of a demographically-based rationale[10]: given existing (or anticipated) drop in enrollments, it will become untenable on instructional grounds (loss of the critical mass of students per building necessary to maintain a given range of programs, cf. Lexington, 1976) or on fiscal-instructional grounds (the dis-economies of maintaining under-utilized facilities jeopardizing the maintenance of instructional objectives).

Keough (1978b:352) warns that gaining community acceptance for the abstract proposition that some schools have to be closed is one matter, getting community acceptance for the concrete decision to close specific schools is another matter altogether:

> [A] district may launch a community information program and concentrate its effects on closing under-utilized facilities. The emphasis, timeline, and planning focus on this alternative. Frequently, community opposition is strong enough to prevent the board from carrying out the plan to close schools. This deadend, when it happens, usually occurs late in the school year and well along in the budget process. The financial crunch is imminent, the facility plan is dead, a referendum not possible, and quick decisions must be made. Only program is left -- and here lies the real threat. Program cut decisions are made under pressure, quickly and usually without a well thought out plan.

The lesson is clear. Ill-conceived school closure plans, or school closure plans not able to win community acceptance result in program cuts,

---

[10] We have purposefully set aside the demographic forecasting issue. On the one hand, few districts close schools just for the sake of closing schools. The catalyst is usually some unacceptable level of enrollment decline. But on the other hand, what counts as unacceptable cannot be inferred strictly from rates of enrollment decrease. Therefore, demographic data, or forecasts, do not provide, and do not seem to be used by school districts as automatic triggers for deciding to close schools. Boyd (1979) for example suggests that community values -- fiscal conservatism vs. liberalism -- may be a factor. Burlingame (1979) argues that community norms, we would say unchallenged precedents, about acceptable levels of class size, school size, and per pupil expenditure, are factored into decisions about when enrollment drop becomes defined as a problem of excess facilities.

exactly the one alternative that school closure is designed to avoid. This "deadend" can be avoided if, says the literature, school districts 'do the rational while accomodating the emotional.'

There is a well-defined consensus in the literature on what it takes to "do the rational" when it comes to deciding which schools to close. Bishop (1979:267) advises that decisionmakers begin by conducting a districtwide inventory of all facilities "using systematic instructional space requirements." Pasnik (1979:65) adds that a facilities inventory be kept on file for each school. It should consider (the enumeration is ours, not the author's):

(1) Zoning, including possible changes in patterns of real estate values and patterns of investment of the surrounding area.

(2) Acreage of entire site including playground description.

(3) Physical plan and construction -- including building type and age, condition of heating ventilation, air conditioning, electrical systems, and construction materials.

(4) Architecture -- type, year and flexibility.

(5) Room inventory -- size and type of classrooms, special rooms, service rooms, fixed furniture, and cabinets, etc.

Such ongoing inventory files provide a ready-made factual base and a set of criteria upon which to make school closure decisions. Other criteria found in the literature include:

(6) Minimal enrollment necessary to maintain a given range of programs (Lexington, 1977).

(7) Resegregation (Fleming, 1980; Colton and Frelich, 1979; Valencia, 1980; and many others).

(8) Walking distance for school children (Yeager, 1979).

(9) Distance from nearest school at the same grade level (Colton and Frelich, 1979).

(10) Building energy efficiency (Stefonek, 1979, citing a Madison, Wisconsin, Public Schools policy).

The references given for these additional factors are illustrative not exhaustive. We have found evidence in both the case-study literature (e.g.,

Bornstein, 1979; Boyd, 1979; Burlingame, 1979; Cuban, 1979; and Yeager, 1979) and the school district report literature (Lexington, 1976 and 1977; Montgomery County Public Schools, 1976; Birmingham, 1977; South Colonie, 1978) that some combination, version, or refinement of the above ten factors are reflected in the formal policies allowing for an infinite variety of local variations in criteria, if not always the actual practices, of school closure in those districts whose experiences are documented and/or cited in the literature. A good example is the comprehensive Madison (Wisconsin) policy on criteria for school closure as cited in Stefonek (1979:14-15). It bears quoting, not necessarily as an exemplar, but as a representative type. Madison collected data on the following factors in all 30 elementary schools in the district.

Neighborhood:	Child proximity count (density of student population in each school) attendance area;
	child proximity overlap (student population of surrounding area);
	parent student overlap (closeness of other attendance areas).
Buildings:	School building area in square feet; school building capacity;
	building age;
	classrooms in use vs. classrooms not in use;
	area divided by enrollment for current year;
	area divided by enrollment previous year.
Energy:	Fuel consumption (in BTUs);
	electricity consumption (KWH);
	building heating bill ($) per year;
	electricity bill ($) per year;
	heat bill, electricity bill, fuel consumption (BTU), each divided by capacity (i.e., number of students the building could hold) and by area in square feet.
Enrollment:	Current enrollment, previous year's enrollment;
	current enrollment divided by classrooms.
Minority:	Minority enrollment for current year;
	percent minority enrollment.

Dollars: Total expenditures (including salaries) divided by area of building.

Data about these factors produced a rank order list of elementary schools and this list was used in the first round of school closings. Our readers will notice that all but one of these factors (the exception is "Dollars") are but a refinement of the previous list of ten factors to be considered in school closings. The eleventh can be paraphrased as:

(11) Expenses: How much it costs to run one building as opposed to another.

It is at this point that Leggett (1978) notes that many school cost-accounting practices over-estimate the true costs of keeping smaller schools running. They seem to be more inefficient, on per-pupil cost basis, because, as he writes (1978:39):

> Many school system budgets have a built in bias against small schools...some special costs, e.g., speech therapy teachers, are divided equally among schools rather than prorated on the time such teachers spend in each school.

Nevertheless, quite apart from any ratios of total expenditures to building area, etc., school size per se is another criterion.

(12) School size. Cuban (1979:373), for example, cites an Arlington (Virginia) policy in which the standard was 1-1/2 classrooms per grade.

So far, all of the twelve factors point to physical characteristics -- architectural factors, location, size and capacity, enrollment, etc. This is understandable since physical factors are measurable, and that which can be measured can be objectively communicated, thereby addressing the political as well as the technical dimension of school closure decision-making. However, some endorsed school closure criteria include less tangible considerations such as:

(13) Community impact (Eugene Public Schools, 1976; Hamden, 1977).

(14) Academic excellence (Cuban, 1979; Keough, 1978b; Lexington, 1977; Hamden, 1977).

There are fewer operational criteria for community impact and no consensus on a measure of excellence, apart from the almost universal admonition in the advice literature and in the preambles to school district

policy statements that "academic excellence" and "educational quality" are paramount considerations and should be taken into account. Johnson (1978: 56-57), for example, reproduces a "Weighted Criteria for School Closings" adopted by a "Minnesota school district." Out of a maximum weight of 10, "educational program" was assigned a weight of 7. But the definition reads "the existing educational program is to be evaluated through a conference between the administration applying the criteria with each building principal and representative staff" (p. 57). Highline (Washington) Public Schools (1976) assigned a 20% (the highest weight possible per factor in their scale) to "educational adequacy" but adequacy is defined in quasi-architectural terms as the "ability of the facility to meet the requirements of a good [undefined] instructional program, including needs for capital improvement, capacity as related to program and availability of special purpose areas" (as cited by Johnson, 1978:57, emphasis not in original).

It seems, therefore, that readers will be on their own when it comes to considering the academic excellence/program quality of any schools which are potential candidates for closure. Advice is offered, however, about how to use these factors (or other items in any composite "laundry list" of criteria for assessing school sites for purposes of closure), once data for each factor has been obtained. The next suggested step is to make trade-offs between the factors and decide which are more important. This can be done by weighting each factor on a numerical scale; a percentage scale; or by value (somewhat important, important, very important) (Keough, 1978b:355). In any case, some objective "index" can be obtained and this index can then be used to rank-order schools in terms of their "suitability for closing" (Sargent and Handy, 1974:49).

The foregoing suggests that there can be a rational process and a rational set of criteria for deciding which school/s to close. But now consider Sargent and Handy's (1974) initial advice: the process of school closing is also a political act.

The fact that closing a school gets people (staff and parents) upset is a commonplace. It is Eisenberger (1974, 1977 and 1978) who provides the best introduction into the politics of the situation. She reminds managers that what is rational depends, in large part, on one's definition of the situation. Principals, for example may not have the same perspective as

district officials (e.g., closing their schools is not in their interest, and may be seen by them as irrational and educationally unsound). (Eisenberger, 1974:34.) The same point applies to parents: "the first factor for administrators and boards to deal with is the realization that there are no loyal district supporters, there are only loyal school supporters" (p. 33; see also Morgan and Wofford, 1977).

Much of Eisenberger's advice can be seen as suggestions for ways and means to transfer parents' school site loyalties to the district level, thereby defusing community opposition when it is their school that is to be closed, enlisting their ownership in the district's plan and in the problem -- some schools just have to be closed -- as defined from the district level.

To defuse (and identify) potential opposition, managers are urged to:

(i) conduct community polls -- this "...lets the community know that you want and need their involvement" (1977:36).[11]

(ii) hold small group coffee hours -- "when a school leader gets out into the community there is an opportunity to bring personal warmth into the situation" (1977:36).

(iii) win over the support of community opinion leaders -- "you need to convince 'Mrs. Jones', PTA leader, that her influence, acceptance and reputation will not be lost, simply transferred to a new school setting" (1977:36).

"Mrs. Jones" may not lose her reputation and influence, but "she" has a good chance of losing her position as head of a local school PTA, if the new school setting already has a PTA. Getting Mrs. Jones to accept this loss requires the institutionalizing of mechanisms to build districtwide loyalty (i.e., make loyal school supporters into loyal district supporters). To this end, Eisenberger urges that managers:

(iv) "Shift PTA emphasis to a districtwide council and begin [their involvement] in districtwide planning" (1977:37).

---

[11] Eisenberger adds that "polling can be done through face to face interviews, mailed surveys, or telephone questionnaires." Readers will no doubt note that many if not most of Eisenberger's recommendations are most applicable in suburban, or perhaps rural, contexts. This is typical of the "craftlore" about school closing and is no doubt reflective of the fact that it was the affluent inner ring suburbs which first experienced demographic decline. The literature is based on that early experience.

To further link districtwide managers' definitions of the problem with community definitions of the problem, the community should be involved in defining the problem. This can be accomplished by:

(v) Establishing a Task Force which "enlist[s] the help of key citizens to meet regularly, gather data and report back to the superintendent" (1977:37).

Sieradski (1979:19), another proponent of establishing representative task forces, adds that:

(vi) Task Forces should become integral to the planning (and hence, the problem-defining) processes of school closure.

Sieradski's Task Force is urged to become "thoroughly familiar" with the methods and indicators used to predict enrollments, to be responsible for establishing criteria for school closing, and to visit each school and rate it against the others in terms of educational adequacy (1979:21).

In calling for the use of community task forces/advisory committees, Eisenberger and Sieradski have lots of company. The need for task forces and for community involvement is universally acknowledged in the literature. Most often, however, the need is asserted as a given. Eisenberger and Sieradski provide the most lucid account of why such task forces are especially useful in decline issues. Eisenberger focuses on the task force as a vehicle of gaining community support by enlisting the help of key citizens, "...local civic leaders, town businessmen, service area people. The local gasoline dealer talks to literally dozens of community members each day" (1977:37). The last sentence, i.e., "talks to literally dozens of community members..." in the passage just quoted is indicative of a key function of task forces: they act as vehicles of communication, enlist the support of community opinion leaders (i.e., "key citizens"), and they get your message out to the community. Sieradski (1975:19) cites the importance of task forces as "links between the school board and the community" but adds that such groups can provide for community involvement even in the most technical (predicting enrollments) and substantive (rate the educational adequacy of each school) decisionmaking areas while also reconciling "special interest pressures" (1975:12).

Sieradski and Eisenberger also pay the most attention to the use and abuse of task forces. Both agree (again the literature reaches consensus

on this point as well) that the task force should be a working group not a deliberative, advisory, or policymaking body. Sieradski (1975:12) warns against their evolution into watchdog committees. Eisenberger (1977:37) states:

> Always give task forces a specific charge. Don't let the task force flounder, studying nebulous areas. Provide them with information. If they have no source of reliable information, they will go through old board minutes dredging up all sorts of issues. They'll do what the media people euphemistically refer to as "investigative reporting." [Emphasis not in original.]

She further adds that:

> The task force should always report to the superintendent - not the board or community." [Emphasis not in original.]

In any case, the final decision is up to the local school board. Keough (1978b:352), in a passage quoted earlier, on page 53, above, warned against the action of community interest groups whose pressures may veto a rationally planned school closure process. There is near-universal agreement in the literature on the importance of school board solidarity. Once again, it is Eisenberger (1978) who takes the general injunction one step further and suggests that in order to clarify each board member's point of view and signal board solidarity, boards should not use the parliamentary approach, i.e., voting, in order to make decisions. Instead, they should adopt a consensus-based decisionmaking procedure which (in outline) consists of the following stages. One, a list of the separate parts of a proposed plan is made. Those upon which everyone agrees are set aside. The rest are listed with a record of pros and cons for each. Two, discussion is focused on securing agreement on the pros and cons for each of the contested parts of the plan. These contests are resolved and consensus is reached by repeating this process of narrowing down the differences. Three, once consensus is reached and the plan is reassembled each board member should explain why he or she approves of the plan.

But, assume, for a moment, that a local school board has decided which schools to close, and the decision is solid and final. The support of a community task force, which was involved in all the planning stages leading to this decision, further adds to the legitimacy and solidity of the board's decision. The immediate political problem is past. But school

closure has other consequences, not necessarily political.

One inevitable consequence is disruption, especially for elementary school children. Richards and Cohen (1981:106) urge that:

> If a school is closed, it should not be merged with another school which might possibly close in the future (within the next five years). A school closing is an experience that typically has a negative effect on a child, requiring a long period of adjustment. It is important that children, parents, and teachers feel a sense of security once a move has taken place.

They go on to suggest that the implementation be delayed, for at least one school year. Children fear change, especially when it brings unknown elements into their daily life. And, therefore:

> Given that parents' attitudes may influence their children, it is especially important for school administrators to minimize, as much as possible, the negative feelings that parents might have. With a planned and predictable change, it would be easier for parents to direct their energies toward program planning in the new school and support for the teaching staff. When change is inevitable, a positive outlook from the parents may make the transition easier for a young child.

Ways of allaying parental fears are suggested by Eismann, et al. (1976:22). These include:

- Assuring that special programs offered to students at one school will be continued at the receiving school.
- Informing parents and students about the receiving schools, providing opportunities to meet the principal and teaching staff, planning teacher-student exchanges in receiving school classrooms for transferring students and parents, and facilitating personal parental contacts by principals of both receiving and transferring schools.
- Honoring requests by receiving and closure school staff members for transfers to another school in so far as possible, so that an accepting environment is maintained.
- Making receiving school personnel assignments as soon as possible after a closure decision to reduce parent, student and staff apprehensions.

Richards and Cohen (1981), after noting that merging young school children without any negative developmental effects is not merely a matter of placing bodies into rooms, suggest that "if a merger [the development of friendships and feelings of security] is the desired end result, it seems necessary to establish a somewhat even ratio of new to old children

in the classrooms."[12]

Another, almost inevitable[13], consequence of school closings is the need to reduce staff. Much has been written about RIF. Out of the 250 references in our bibliography, 43 focus exclusively on RIF and many of the remaining references mention RIF as an issue. By way of a summary, some of the most common concerns are that RIF by seniority alone will:

- increase the age and experience of the remaining staff thereby eating up some of the cost-reductions made possible by school closure (e.g., Hickrod, 1976; Killick, 1980; Odden and Vincent, 1978; Wilken and Callahan, 1978);
- inhibit innovation because the teaching force is older (e.g., Dembowski, et al., 1979; Ellsworth, 1977; Illinois, 1978);
- demoralize existing staff by eliminating or freezing administrative promotions (Cuban, 1979);
- jeopardize affirmative action gains (e.g., Downey, 1976; Rosenberg and Vincent, 1978; Johnson, 1978); and
- restrict school managers' discretion and lessen their ability to get rid of deadwood and use decline as an opportunity to rejuvenate and upgrade the quality of school teaching staff (e.g., Haun, 1978; New Jersey, 1979; Nolte, 1976a and b; and Seifert, 1979).

---

12 Our interest here is on the impact of school closure upon children and on staff and finances, not buildings. Readers with an interest on that topic should consult the topical index to our annotated bibliography and find the references collected under the headings, "Facilities: alternative use of; joint occupancy of; and sharing." Although, as noted in Section 2.1, above, our references will not be comprehensive on this topic, excellent materials on those topics are available from the Council of Educational Facilities Planners (CEFP) of Columbus, Ohio, and by the Educational Facilities Laboratory (EFL) of New York City. For materials offering advice about and descriptions of the logistics of school closure, merger and consolidation, readers are urged to consult our topical index to the bibliography under the headings "grade-reorganization," "library, moving a" and "school closure, procedures." Once again, our listings on that topic are not exhaustive.

13 We say "almost inevitable" because the whole notion of "excess", whether it be predicated of staff or physical plant is relative. Excess is determined by district ability or willingness to pay the price of such excess. As is the case with enrollment decline, there is no automatic, objective, signal which says, "now we're in an excess situation."

There is, in short, no lack of problems in the literature. There is also no shortage of information on policy options. Useful compendia of local RIF policies can be found in ERS (1973), Kelley (1978), Powell and Stemnock (1975), and Zirkel and Bergerstock (1980). But these compendia do not contain implementation or impact data.

The anecdotal, promising and endorsed practices literature (e.g., Nolte, 1976a; Downey, 1976a; Divoky, 1979; Thomas, 1978) also contains little about implementation. The same is especially true of the literature describing or citing local practices which provide alternatives to RIF, or mitigate the adverse impact of RIF on staff morale and teaching careeers. Early retirement incentive programs in Pasadena, California, and in Chicago are featured in Divoky (1979:89), and for Chicago, in Ellsworth (1977), and in Illinois (1975). Divoky (1979:89) cites a Levittown (New York) case in which 1200 employees were ordered to go on unpaid furlough for five days in 1976. This saved the jobs of 50 teachers. But, from that citation we do not know whether (a) the practice can be repeated, and (b) whether the practice can have the same job saving effect when used repeatedly. Thomas (1978) describes a Salt Lake City program (also cited in I/D/E/A, 1975) wherein teachers laid-off in the city schools are placed, sometimes permanently, sometimes temporarily, in surrounding suburbs with expanding enrollments. Such an interdistrict staffing consortium has the advantage of allowing contiguous school districts to adjust to fluctuating enrollments.

Downey (1976) describes a Bremerton, Washington (also cited in Johnson, 1978:44) policy which reconciles the classic conflict between RIF following seniority and affirmative action gains. In Bremerton, RIF follows seniority until the next cut threatens affirmative action. At that point, all affirmative action staff are put on a separate seniority list and all subsequent cuts are made in such a way as to maintain a given proportion of affirmative action staff. Affirmative action staff includes: minorities, female administrators, male elementary teachers, and female high school teachers (Downey, 1976:35).

There is no dearth of ideas and innovative practices on RIF and the anecdotal dissemination no doubt contributes to the development of an

invisible college of school administrators (Boulding, 1974) learning together how to cope with decline. But some key questions remain unanswered. The pressure to reduce staff comes from cost-cutting considerations. RIF is unpleasant and practices which provide an alternative or else in some way mitigate the pain have a prima facie attractiveness, but how much do these alternatives cost? Ellsworth (1977) and Illinois (1977) begin to fill in this information gap and contain detailed discussion and accounting of the increases in districts' pension fund contributions necessary to make early retirement a real incentive to retire earlier (thus reducing higher paid senior staff and saving the jobs of younger teachers). The implication of that accounting is that early retirement incentive programs are not a panacea; they do not reduce costs enough to alleviate the fiscal pressure to RIF in declining districts.

Advice on the issue of RIF is quite restrained and restricted. That is, there isn't as much "how-to" material in the literature as there is, for example, on school closure. This is no doubt due to the limited range of options open to school managers, given the constraints of state law, case and constitutional law governing due process, and local collective bargaining agreements.

Let us again summarize the most prevalent types of advice on personnel reduction, management, and renewal.[14] Imagine that one is just at the point at which a school or schools are being closed. Reducing "n" number of classrooms creates "n" number of classroom teachers without classrooms in which to teach. This much is simple logic. But whether these "n" teachers constitute "excess" is a matter of managerial, or rather political definition. Are these teachers needed somewhere else? Can we afford to keep them and use them elsewhere, or rather, will the community -- the taxpayers -- let us get away with the same number of instructional staff as

---

[14] As we shall see, the three issues are inseparable. In fact, all are but different stages in the same decision stream. Note: we began our narrative with the issue of school closure which led to planning and budgeting issues, and by the inexorable logic of the situation, to our present concern with RIF, i.e., solving the problem of "excess" capacity, creates the problem of "excess" staff.

four years ago, even though today we have fewer pupils and fewer school classrooms? Typically, the answer is no, or is perceived to be no[15], and hence, a district is faced with the "necessity" of reducing excess staff. In setting and/or ratifying district policies on staff retrenchment, the typical advice is to do the following.

(1) Anticipate and Plan:[16] Planning for staff reduction should begin early, as part of a district's comprehensive approach to retrenchment. Nolte (1976a) suggests that you devise a RIF policy "before you have to" but not until after all other administrative costs have been cut to the bone. Illinois (1975), Kalvelage (1978), and Divoky (1979) bid our readers to exhaust all possible alternatives to RIF citing such practices as job sharing (Kalvelage), furloughs and extended leaves of absence (Divoky), and early retirement (Illinois). But should these options be unavailable on the basis of cost considerations, our school board member will find that Custis (1978a), Kelley (1978), Keough (1978b), and Powell and Stemnock (1975) provide useful inventories of factors to be considered in formulating RIF policies (Powell and Stemnock raise 70 policy questions to be resolved before proceeding with RIF). Kelley (1978) goes one step further and suggests that some key issues are not just a matter of decision but also of planning and more local data gathering. He asks (1978:83-89, passim):

- Has the school district adopted a set of priorities for educational operations which identifies mandated essential, important and auxiliary services? Does the plan include identification or reduction in services which will be made if necessary to meet legal or fiscal constraints?

---

[15] Otherwise there would be no problem of "decline." Excess is almost always a function of cost-efficiency criteria. And those criteria, in turn, are based on value judgements as filtered through the political process (Berman and McLaughlin, 1978). There are some exceptions in which decline in enrollments is defined in terms of lack of enough pupils, per building, to provide a high quality range of programs (see Lexington, 1977; Cuban, 1979; and Morgan and Wofford, 1977).

[16] The enumeration and labelling is for purposes of summarizing this advice topic. We do not mean to imply that these constitute a necessary sequence of decisions; nor do we offer these as "five magical steps" to a foolproof RIF.

- Does the district have an inventory of the skills, training, certification, and interests of its employees?
- Has this inventory been used as the basis for a long-range staffing plan which considers subplans for recruitment and selection of staff supervision of staff planned inservice and plans for replacement costs?

(2) Get Legal Advice and Recognize the Limits of Your Options. All the planning and data gathering will come to naught if, for example, state law requires that dismissal of all tenured staff follow strict seniority. Good discussions of the legal issues, obvious and not so obvious, can be found in Boyer and Nassau (1978), Carr (1980), Ditzhazy (1977), Phay (1980), and Zirkel and Bargerstock (1980). The latter contains the most comprehensive and updated discussion of statute and case law governing dismissal. Carr's (1980) short paper provides a good summary of the management implications of current law about dismissal with a special emphasis on constitutional and due process precedents. All writers on this topic agree with Boyer and Nassau (1978) that RIF policymaking should have the benefit of professional legal advice.

(3) Use RIF As Opportunity to Upgrade the Quality of Staff. New Jersey School Boards Association (1979) suggests that districts could, via an ongoing staff evaluation program, introduce merit criteria into their RIF policies while staying within the constraints established by that state's tenure and dismissal laws. A similar recommendation addressed to school districts nationwide can be found in Haun (1978). Keough (1978b: 349-350), however, asks some tough questions -- for which there are few answers in the literature -- about merit criteria in dismissal policies:

> Each district should develop a RIF policy. Of particular import is the order of and criteria for excessing staff. Some districts will be bound by state law to excess staff on a seniority-only basis...others may employ such additional criteria as: quality of service, experience in a specific area, district-based need, educational-preparation qualifications, certification, and others. If additional criteria are to be used, some form of evaluation measure and definition will be necessary. For example: by whom, how, and with what weight will "quality of service" be measured? Must "experience in a specific area" be in-district experience? With what level of competency? How many years ago? If certification is held in more than one area, but teaching experience in only one, would that individual have a claim equal to an individual with both certification and experience? These

are difficult questions but should be addressed before reductions are made.

Nolte (1976b) provides some partial answers, one of which clarifies the issue, the others introduce further complications. Nolte argues that reductions should be based, ideally, on teacher effectiveness as determined primarily by student achievement (p. 28), and secondarily by the qualities of "firmness," "friendliness," and "fairness" (pp. 29-30). In following these criteria:

> School boards currently have a triple-crowned opportunity to exercise their public authority in a way that is unassailably beneficial to their communities.

The three "F's" are defined but no measures are offered.

(4) Use Collectively Bargained Approaches to RIF. While collectively bargained contracts exercise a constraint on district management policies, Downey (1976), Jascourt (1978), Nassau (1978a and b), Nolte (1976a), and Spenla, et al. (1978) see the collective bargaining process as an opportunity to: (i) reduce tensions and build consensus around a necessary but unpleasant course of action (Nassau, 1978a); (ii) build staff-wide commitment to an affirmative action policy (Downey, 1976); and (iii) insinuate some merit criteria for dismissal into the final policy through the normal give and take of the collective bargaining process (Nolte, 1976a). The Bremerton, Washington, affirmative action protection policy on RIF (Downey, 1976) was a collectively bargained agreement, and not, as is usually the case (Carr, 1980), the result of a court-ordered desegregation.[17] Nolte (1976:45) quotes collectively bargained RIF language from Adams County, Colorado, which does introduce merit criteria, although merit is defined in terms of teacher qualifications rather than teacher effectiveness in terms of outcome. In paraphrase, the Adams County policy lists the following criteria, in priority order:

---

[17] Carr's (1980:4) review of the statute, case and constitutional law applicable to RIF shows that courts make frequent use of the criteria detailed in Singleton v. Jackson Municipal Separate School District. According to the criteria, school districts under court-ordered desegregation are obligated to develop objective nondiscriminating standards prior to making staff reductions.

(a) Teaching assignments, educational preparation and training

(b) Certification status

(c) Seniority based upon (in this order):

(i) years of service in the district

(ii) length of service in current assignment

(iii) number of years teaching in current area of certification

(iv) total number of years teaching experience

When all qualifications are equal, the tie-breaker is (i) -- time of starting employment in district.

(5) Accept the Inevitability of Seniority RIF and Prepare Yourself for the Consequences. Although increased and more refined staff evaluation, and reductions by merit are seen as one set of hoped for consequences of decline, in most cases RIF is by seniority.

Our review of the literature also leads us to expect the following cycle of consequences. As staff is reduced (by some version of seniority), payroll costs do not decrease proportionately, the teaching force becomes older (Hickrod, 1976; Odden and Vincent, 1978; Wilken and Callahan, 1978; Killick, 1980), and administrative staff are not cut proportionately to teaching staff (Freeman and Hannan, 1981; also Hickrod, Odden and Vincent, Wilken and Callahan, ob. cit.). An aging teaching force means the typical district is spending more per teacher (and ultimately spending more per pupil); is less likely to see innovative teaching practices (Dembowski and Gay, 1980:174); may see a decrease in teacher effectiveness, since there is some evidence, reviewed in Illinois (1977) that teaching effectiveness decreases with length of service; and since administrative positions are not (cannot be, up to a point) reduced proportionately with the reduction of teaching positions, intra-district occupational mobility is frozen (Cuban, 1979) with the result that the district could end up with a more expensive (on a per capita basis), an older, less innovative, and demoralized teaching force (Cuban, 1979:379).

If maintaining a quality program is the goal (schools were closed as an alternative to cutting programs; and school closure created excess staff

which had to reduce[18]), then something has to be done with the resulting staff situation. The almost universal advice is that in-service training be provided as a way of renewing the remaining staff (e.g., Dembowski, et al., 1979; Killick, 1980; Relic, 1980; Wofford, 1978). But where is the staff's motivation for entering into in-service? An aging, already highly credentialed teaching force reaching the top of the pay scale has fewer financial incentives to upgrade their professional skills through tuition-charging graduate and post-graduate programs. And, as Cuban (1979:379) observes, districts undergoing RIF, or districts with a no-growth personnel policy are not going to provide avenues for rising through the ranks.

Incentives for in-service could be created.[19] The salary scale could be adjusted to make it attractive for highly credentialed teachers to pursue professional development. Or, where such pursuits require tuition-charging courses of study, the district could grant stipends. Or, the district could mount its own, mandatory, on-the-job, during school hours in-service program.

Each of these incentive strategies, singly or in combination, would cost something. But as a result of school closure and the subsequent RIF, our typical district may be already spending more per pupil (in constant dollars) than before. But the fact that the school district now has fewer students, fewer buildings, and fewer staff will create community pressure against such higher expenditures. And, politically, it is the fact of rising per pupil costs, rather than the absolute level of costs that feeds back and creates more pressure for cuts. (See Cuban, 1979:380-381 passim.) At this point, assuming that the school district is "leaner" and "more

---

[18] The scenario could run differently. To cut costs (cutting costs is ultimately what it's all about -- no organization shrinks as an end in and of itself) programs could be cut. Cutting programs, especially at the secondary level, less so at the elementary level (where many non-classroom "specialists" serve mandated programs) would lead to a cost reduction if accompanied by staff cuts. This leads back to RIF.

[19] It is interesting to note that we could find no discussion in the literature of the costs and benefits, from the perspectives of the recipient teachers, of in-service training.

efficient" with no excess capacity -- every building is as full as it could be, there is no more room for facilities consolidation, all grade-reorganization options have been exhausted, there are only as many administrators as needed to manage buildings and staff -- the only way to cut costs is to cut program.

This is precisely the situation which now faces many school superintendents: doing exactly that which he and his school district originally wished to avoid -- cutting programs, because there is nothing else to cut.

3.3.3 Summary

Throughout the foregoing review of the advice literature, we have attempted to highlight the interconnectedness of the issues involved in responding to decline. We began with the issue of school closure. Following the advice on that topic led to other topics: planning, budgeting and community involvement. The "craftlore" literature which we have just reviewed also recognizes the impossibility, and the undesirability, of separating the political/emotional from the technical/rational dimensions of the problem. Community involvement, it was suggested, is not only necessary for "selling" the solution -- creating community acceptance for any cut-back decisions taken -- but, rather, is necessary so that the community is involved in defining the problem and in arriving at the conclusion that some things have to be cut back. Each decision (e.g., to close a school or schools, to RIF by some version of seniority, a non-choice in most cases) set in motion consequences which led to making other choices. Hence, considering closing schools led into planning and into community involvement. Closing a school may lead to RIF, and RIF may lead to considering in-service and other mitigating actions which, in turn, lead to further expenses, which create renewed community pressure to make more cuts, i.e., cuts in program. At each stage in the decision-stream, school managers are driven by (a) the logic of the situation (closing down a building gets rid of "excess" plant but creates "excess" staff, if not exactly in direct proportion; reducing by seniority does, under given conditions, lead to an older, more expensive teaching force), and (b) by the advice contained in the literature (close schools in order to save programs, involve the community in closure

decisionmaking and let them see that some closures are necessary and inevitable on cost-efficiency considerations, and mitigate the impact of RIF by more aggressive initiatives in in-service training).

This scenario had an unhappy ending. Let us consider, for a moment, how the plot could be changed so as to produce a "happier ending." Costs might have been kept in line (again on a per pupil basis) if: (i) enrollment had begun to increase, or (ii) if administrative positions (not individual administrators) had been reduced in proportion as the teaching force is reduced (which almost never happens, see Freeman and Hannan, 1981; Dembowski, et al., 1979; Hickrod, 1976; Odden and Vincent, 1978; Wilken and Callahan, 1978), or (iii) there was no professional consensus that a senior teaching force somehow constituted "a problem" to be addressed by in-service and, (iv) if in-service didn't cost anything, that is, if human nature was such that the provision of incentives was not necessary (in that case, there would be no educational-pedagogical problems in having an "aging" teacher force); and/or (v) if RIF were not governed by seniority.

RIF might not be necessary if (i) no schools were closed, or (ii) closure was not decided (and, more importantly, justified) on cost-efficiency grounds. Our reasoning is as follows: schools had to be closed because there was "excess" capacity, where "excess" was defined against some norm which merely hypostasized a prior level of capacity. For example, in 1973, there were "n" number of pupils and the district was "at capacity" in that any increase would have led to overcrowding. It is now 1981, and the district has n minus x students, therefore, by definition it has "excess capacity" which is said to be inefficient.

Some school districts (e.g., see Cuban, 1979; Lexington, 1976 and 1977) explicitly and by policy choose to justify school closings, and even more importantly, choose which schools to close on educational rather than cost-efficiency grounds. It is tempting to speculate (nothing in the literature supports or refutes us) that school districts which close schools on the basis of education first, and cost-efficiency criteria second, are more immune to the infinite regression of pressures to cut costs for the sake of cutting costs alone, as depicted in our scenario above. In other words, school districts may be in a position to make some critical choices

early on in their process of retrenchment. A policy of defining the problem in terms of threats to program excellence and integrity may establish a precedent for further decisionmaking.[20]

To reiterate, enrollment decline is a problem because: (i) it literally removes a minimum number of pupils needed to continue with a program (because of declining enrollments, only five high school students elect to take Latin each year, one can't have a Latin program); or (ii) it produces diseconomies of scale which make it more costly, on a per pupil basis, to continue to provide a program (enrollments in Latin courses drop from 55 to 35, the program becomes more costly on a per pupil basis). Let's take the second instance and ask: Is the Latin program now more inefficient? And is it so inefficient that it should be eliminated? Minus the yearly salary increments of those Latin teachers continuing to teach 35 rather than 55 students, the Latin program may be no more costly than it was at 55 students. What then can make it seem inefficient? The problem is one of justification, of politics, rather than of cost accounting. If a school district cannot convince its community that it should continue to spend tax dollars supporting a Latin program with 35 rather than 55 pupils, then it does have a problem with declining enrollment.[21] The problem is not with enrollments per se but with a community's willingness or ability to pay.

In saying this we don't mean to imply that demographics do not matter. In some cases a decline in enrollment brings an automatic decrease in state

---

[20] Lest this sound utopian, it is important to ask, once again: Why is declining enrollment a problem? There is nothing inherently 'problem-causing' about having "fewer pupils and more space." At what point does "more space" begin to be a problem? There are two sorts of answers to this question. One, the community will not stand by and allow schools to spend tax dollars on the same number of square feet (and same number of staff), in order to serve fewer clients. Or, two, fewer pupils threatens the "critical mass" necessary to continue with some programs. The first answer refers to cost-efficiency criteria which have a political basis.

[21] The same principle will, of course, apply to an elementary school building. What is it that makes the same building inherently efficient when it held 500 pupils and not efficient when it holds 300 pupils?

aid. Decline also brings a similarly automatic and simultaneous increase in per pupil expenditures. Fewer pupils also means fewer parents which translates into a smaller constituency with a direct interest in supporting school spending.

But, none of the aforementioned become a problem until the point is reached at which increased per pupil expenditures become defined as intolerable. This, in turn, happens if: (i) there is a sudden decline in monies available to be spent because of an externally imposed tax or spending caps or inflation; and/or (ii) community norms as mediated through political pressure[22] defines a given level of resource allocation as inefficient and intolerable. The impact of demography, therefore, is always mediated through these political considerations and is always a matter of choice by communities as a whole. (School district managers, of course, often find themselves in a no-choice, no-win situation.) Quite simply, it is money (the polite term is "resources"), not demography that is at the root of the problem of decline.

Our argument would be different if the world were different, i.e., if, somehow, school systems had an inexhaustible amount of money; or, if human beings were not driven by self-interest. But then there would be no problem with, and no literature about, decline.

3.4 SHORT READING LISTS ON SELECTED TOPICS

Readers who have followed us this far will have noticed some repetition of references. This suggests that a preliminary understanding of the topic and of the literature about this topic can be obtained by compiling a condensed reading list culled from the 250 items listed in our more exhaustive annotated bibliography.

---

[22] There are no norms "out there" in the community unless and until they are either anticipated by school managers (or articulated by them) or embodied in political pressures upon the school administration or school board. This is but another way of making our earlier point about cost-efficiency.

General Overview and Introductions

Three works contain the most useful introductions to and overview of the topic. Abramowitz and Rosenfeld, 1978; and Bailey, 1977, are two edited anthologies which contain articles providing readers with a taste of the issues included in the management of decline. Good overviews of the problems and opportunities associated with decline are also contained in Bellon, 1977; Culbertson, 1977; Berman and McLaughlin, 1978; and Keough, 1978a and b.

State Task Force Reports

An invaluable, but not always easily accessible, set of references consists of state and local task force reports, and handbooks, often produced by either state education agencies for intra-state dissemination or by professional associations for dissemination to their members. This literature is inventoried along with the available annotated bibliographies in Charts 3G and 3H, respectively, immediately below. State task force reports provide an especially useful introduction to the range and complexity of the issues facing school districts in decline. Particularly useful, comprehensive task force reports include: Hickrod, 1976 (for Illinois), and Minnesota, 1976 and 1977.

General Handbooks

General handbooks that we found to be particularly useful as introductions to the topic include: Eisenberger and Keough, 1974; Johnson, 1978; Minnesota, 1976; New York, 1976; Wendel, 1979; and Wakefield and Donnelly, 1978.

Bibliographies

Two good comprehensive and reasonably up-to-date bibliographies are: Corman, 1979; and Moll, 1980. A good general bibliography can also be found in Wendel, 1979. Bornstein, 1978 and Fleming, 1980, contain comprehensive bibliographies on school closure and Stefonek, 1979, contains a bibliography on retrenchment budgeting.

Demography and School Councils

Davis and Lewis, 1976 and 1977, provide a discussion of demographic trends as they affect local decisionmaking, while Keough, 1974a and 1978b,

CHART 3G: A READERS' GUIDE TO RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND STATE AND LOCAL TASK FORCE REPORTS

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	TOPICAL INVENTORY						INVENTORY OF TOOLS				
		Budgeting	Community Involvement	School Closure/ Merger/ Consolidation	Facilities	Personnel Reduction in Force	Personnel Early Retirement	Forecasting Enrollments	Community Surveys and Questionnaires	Facilities Inventories	Staff Inventories	Program Inventories
ALASKA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	206		X									
ARIZONA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	207		X	X	X	X						
BOOTH, et al. (1980)	172	X										
BORNSTEIN (1978)	173		X	X	X					X		
BUSSARD (1978)	174		X		X							
BUSSARD (1979a)	175				X							
BUSSARD (1979b)	176				X							
BUSSARD (1979c)	177				X							
FREMONT (CALIFORNIA) UNION HIGH SCHOOL DISTRICT (1981)	238			X				X		X		
SAN JOSE (CALIFORNIA) UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT (1979)	239		X	X								
SEQUOIA (CALIFORNIA) UNION HIGH SCHOOL DISTRICT (1981)	240		X							X		X
CHO and SENIER (1977)	209							X				
CHURCH, et al. (1980)	223		X						X	X		

CHART 3G: A READERS' GUIDE TO RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND STATE AND LOCAL TASK FORCE REPORTS

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	TOPICAL INVENTORY						INVENTORY OF TOOLS				
		Budgeting	Community Involvement	School Closure/ Merger/ Consolidation	Facilities	Personnel Reduction in Force	Personnel Early Retirement	Forecasting Enrollments	Community Surveys and Questionnaires	Facilities Inventories	Staff Inventories	Program Inventories
HAMDEN (CONNECTICUT) TASK FORCE ON DECLINING ENROLLMENT (1977a) (1977b)	225, 226			X								
COUNCIL OF EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES PLANNERS (1978)	178				X							
DAVIS and TRIMBLE (1977)	210					X						
EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES LABORATORIES (1976a)	179				X							
EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES LABORATORIES (1976b)	180		X		X							
EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH SERVICE (1973)	181					X						
EISENBERGER and KEOUGH (1974)	182			X								
ELLSWORTH (1977)	211						X					
FLEMING (1980)	227		X	X								
FONSTAD (1979)	183							X				
GEIGER and TORGE (1977)	228				X							
HICKROD, et al. (1976)	212					X						
ILLINOIS STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION (1977)	213						X					

CHART 3G: A READERS' GUIDE TO RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND STATE AND LOCAL TASK FORCE REPORTS

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	TOPICAL INVENTORY						INVENTORY OF TOOLS				
		Budgeting	Community Involvement	School Closure/ Merger/ Consolidation	Facilities	Personnel Reduction in Force	Personnel Early Retirement	Forecasting Enrollments	Community Surveys and Questionnaires	Facilities Inventories	Staff Inventories	Program Inventories
ILLINOIS STATE OFFICE OF EDUCATION (1975)	214			X		X	X					
EAST MAINE (ILLINOIS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1979)	241		X						X			
NILES TOWNSHIP (ILLINOIS) HIGH SCHOOLS (1975)	242			X								
SOUTH COLONIE (ILLINOIS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1978)	243			X						X		
JOHNSON (1978)	184		X			X		X		X	X	
McCLOUD (1978)	230				X							
MONTGOMERY COUNTY (MARYLAND) SCHOOLS (1976)	244		X		X					X		
BROCKTON (MASSACHUSETTS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1977)	245							X		X		
LEXINGTON (MASSACHUSETTS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1977)	247			X								
MAZZARELLA and BARBER (1978)	231				X	X						
MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	185	X		X		X		X			X	
BIRMINGHAM (MICHIGAN) DECLINING ENROLLMENT STUDY COMMITTEE (1979)	248		X	X								

77

CHART 3G: A READERS' GUIDE TO RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND STATE AND LOCAL TASK FORCE REPORTS

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	TOPICAL INVENTORY						INVENTORY OF TOOLS				
		Budgeting	Community Involvement	School Closure/ Merger/ Consolidation	Facilities	Personnel Reduction in Force	Personnel Early Retirement	Forecasting Enrollments	Community Surveys and Questionnaires	Facilities Inventories	Staff Inventories	Program Inventories
BIRMINGHAM (MICHIGAN) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1980)	249			X								
MINNESOTA STATE ADVISORY COUNCIL ON FLUCTUATING ENROLLMENTS (1977)	218				X							
MINNESOTA STATE PLANNING AGENCY (1976)	186		X	X	X	X		X		X	X	
NATIONAL SCHOOL BOARDS ASSOCIATION (1978)	187		X	X								
NATIONAL SCHOOL PUBLIC RELATIONS ASSOCIATION (1976)	188		X					X				
NEW ENGLAND SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL (1972)	189							X				
NEW JERSEY STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1976)	219				X							
WESTFIELD (NEW JERSEY) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1979)	250			X								
ALBUQUERQUE (NEW MEXICO) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1975)	232							X				
NEW YORK STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1976)	191									X		
NOLAN (1978)	234									X		

CHART 3G: A READERS' GUIDE TO RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND STATE AND LOCAL TASK FORCE REPORTS

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	TOPICAL INVENTORY						INVENTORY OF TOOLS				
		Budgeting	Community Involvement	School Closure/ Merger/ Consolidation	Facilities	Personnel Reduction in Force	Personnel Early Retirement	Forecasting Enrollments	Community Surveys and Questionnaires	Facilities Inventories	Staff Inventories	Program Inventories
OLSEN (1980)	235			X								
OREGON STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	220					X					X	
EUGENE (OREGON) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1976)	236		X	X								
PHI DELTA KAPPA COMMISSION ON DECLINING ENROLLMENTS (1973)	192		X									
SARGENT and HANDY (1974)	193		X	X	X							
SOUTH CAROLINA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	221			X								
WAKEFIELD and DONNELLY (1978)	194			X		X	X					
HIGHLINE (WASHINGTON) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1976)	237		X									

CHART 3H: A READERS' GUIDE TO BIBLIOGRAPHIES

REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	SUBJECT MATTER						
		General/ Comprehen-sive	Budgeting	Early Retirement	Enrollment Forecasting	Facilities	Reduction In Force	School Closure
BORNSTEIN (1978)	173							X
BRUBACHER and SHIBLES (1979)	22	X						
BUSSARD (1979d)	196					X		
CORMAN (1979)	197	X						
ERIC (1975)	198	X						
ERIC (1977)	199	X						
ERIC (1978)	200						X	
ERIC (1979a)	201	X						
ERIC (1979b)	202							X
ERIC (1981)	203	X						
ILLINOIS STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION (1977)	213			X				
JOHNSON (1978)	184	X						
MERRIMACK EDUCATION CENTER (1977)	204	X						
MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION (1977)	185	X						
MOLL (1980)	205	X						
NEW YORK STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (1976)	191	X						
EUGENE (OREGON) PUBLIC SCHOOLS (1976)	236	X						
PIELE and WRIGHT (1976)	131				X			
STEFONEK (1979)	154		X					
WENDEL (1979)	195	X						

describes non-demographic early warning signals of an impending decline in enrollment.

Budgeting

Almost every handbook listed in Section B1 of our annotated bibliography contains a section on budgeting. Additional sources include: Estes, 1977; Hentschke, 1977a and b; and Mueller, 1977.

Data on School Adjustments to Decline

Rodekohr, 1978, represents an early and pioneering effort at conducting a comprehensive survey of the impact of decline on schools. His study, however, was limited to the state of Colorado. Other state-specific surveys include: Hickrod, 1976 (for Illinois); Minnesota, 1977; and Wilken and Callahan, 1978 (for Iowa). Freeman and Hannan, 1981, contains data for New York and California; Odden and Vincent, 1978, contains data for Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington.

ASCD, 1980, reports on a national survey of the impact of decline on supervisory practices.

The most comprehensive survey of the impact on school program is Dembowski, et al., 1981. This study's major findings are also summarized in Dembowski, 1980; and Dembowski and Gay, 1980.

School Closure

Three classic resources on school closing are: Bornstein, 1978; Eisenberger and Keough, 1974; and Sargent and Handy, 1974. Andrews, 1974, contains the result of a nationwide survey of school closure decisions.

Case studies of school closure decisionmaking can be found in Bornstein, 1978; Boyd, 1979; Burlingame, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979; Cuban, 1979; and Yeager, 1979. Local school district reports which are especially detailed in their documentation of school closure decisionmaking include: Eugene (Oregon), 1976; Fleming, 1980 (for Cleveland); Hamden (Connecticut), 1977a; and Lexington (Massachusetts), 1977. Local data on the impact of school closure on neighborhoods can be found in: Amlung, 1980; and Eismann, et al., 1976. The impact of closure on elementary school children is discussed in Richards and Cohen, 1981, while the impact on high school students is treated in Parks, 1980.

Community Involvement

There is a great deal of overlap between the literature on planning, on school closure and on community involvement. Cuban, 1979; Edlefson, 1977; and Morgan and Wofford, 1977 provide detailed case histories of participatory planning in school districts facing or anticipating decline. Eisenberger, 1979, 1975, 1977a and 1977b, provides good discussions of community involvement in school closure processes. The use and abuse of community task forces and citizens advisory committees is dealt with in Eisenberger, 1976, and in Sieradski, 1975. Nuttall, 1976, also reports on a case study of one such task force in action.

Reduction in Force

This topic is second only to school closure in the amount of attention it receives in the literature.

General discussions of the policy issues, as well as sample RIF policies, can be found in: Kelley, 1978; Mastoraki, 1978; Oregon, 1977; and Nolte, 1976a and b. Summaries of the legal, due process, and constitutional issues involved in RIF also receive heavy emphasis. The summary of the main legal issues of RIF that is most accessible to general laypersons can be found in Carr, 1980. Zirkel and Bargerstock, 1980, contains the most comprehensive and current survey of the law on RIF. (For a listing of sample local RIF policies please see Chart 3G, above.) Nassau, 1978a and b, discuss collectively bargained approaches to RIF.

Equity Issues

Much is written at the general and conceptual level about the conflict between RIF and affirmative action. Rosenberg and Vincent, 1978, represent the best attempt yet to study the impact of retrenchment and RIF on women and minorities in education. Downey, 1976, describes one district's (Bremerton, Washington) RIF policy which balances the claims of seniority while it protects affirmative action gains. Case data about the impact of school closings on desegregation are presented in: Colton and Prelich, 1979; Fleming, 1980; San Jose, 1979; and Valencia, 1980. Data about the impact of decline on special education can be found in Dembowski, et al., 1979; and Wilken and Callahan, 1978. Hickrod, 1976, contains a good discussion of the implication of patterns of uneven enrollment decline on

Title I.

Miscellaneous and Special Topics

Decline and its meaning for secondary schools is discussed in four informative case histories and documents describing local district planning efforts. These include: Geiger and Torge, 1977; Hosler and Weldy, 1977; Morgan and Wofford, 1977; and Sequoia Union High School District, 1981.

Illinois State Board of Education, 1977, contains a detailed cost-benefit analysis of early retirement incentive programs; Ellsworth, 1977, describes the early retirement policy of the Chicago Public Schools; and Dembowski, et al., 1979, provides data on the extent to which declining districts have adopted early retirement plans. Dembowski, op. cit., also found little inter-district sharing among declining districts. Olsen, 1980, provides a detailed description of inter-district sharing of facilities and staff among two Iowa school districts impacted by decline.

Chart 3I, on the pages immediately following, provides a summary of these short reading lists on the topics described above.

CHART 3I: SHORT READING LISTS ON SCHOOL DISTRICTS' MANAGEMENT OF DECLINE, BY TOPIC AND BY CATEGORY

CATEGORY AND TOPIC		NUMBER	GENRE	REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER
Overview and Introductions		-	Edited Anthology	ABRAMOWITZ and ROSENFELD, 1978	2
		-	Edited Anthology	BAILEY, 1977	8
		-	Special Edition of Education and Urban Studies, May 1979		-
Problems and Opportunities Posed by Decline		1	Issues Analysis	BERMAN and McLAUGHLIN, 1978	11
		2	Issues Analysis	BELLON, 1977	10
		3	Issues Analysis	CULBERTSON, 1977	33
		4	Issues Analysis	KEOUGH, 1978a	87
		5	Issues Analysis	KEOUGH, 1978b	88
Handbooks		6	----------	EISENBERGER AND KEOUGH, 1974	182
		7	----------	JOHNSON, 1978	184
		8	----------	MINNESOTA, 1976	186
		9	----------	NEW YORK, 1976	191
		10	----------	WAKEFIELD and DONNELLY, 1978	194
		11	----------	WENDEL, 1979	195
Bibliographies:	General	12	----------	CORMAN, 1979	197
		13	----------	MOLL, 1980	205
		*	Handbook	WENDEL, 1976	195
	Budgeting	14	Review of the Literature	STEFONEK, 1978	154
	School Closure	15	Handbook	BORNSTEIN, 1978	173
		16	Local School District Report	FLEMING, 1980	227

* Repeated reference

CHART 31: SHORT READING LISTS ON SCHOOL DISTRICTS' MANAGEMENT OF DECLINE, BY TOPIC AND BY CATEGORY (continued)

CATEGORY AND TOPIC	NUMBER	GENRE	REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER
Demography and School Enrollments	17	Issues Analysis	DAVIS and LEWIS, 1976	37
	18	Issues Analysis	DAVIS and LWEIS, 1977	38
	19	Advice	KEOUGH, 1979a	84
	20	Advice	KEOUGH, 1978c	89
Budgeting	21	Advice	HENTSCHKE, 1977a	69
	22	Advice	HENTSCHKE, 1977b	70
	23	Advice	MUELLER, 1977	109
Survey Data on School Districts' Adjustments to Decline	24	Research, Survey	ASCD, 1980	7
	25	Research, Survey	DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979	41
	26	Research, Survey	FREEMAN and HANNAN, 1981	61
	27	Research, Survey	ODDEN and VINCENT, 1978	122
	28	Research, Survey	RODEKOHR, 1976	138
	29	Research, Survey	WILKEN and CALLAHAN, 1978	165
	30	State Report: Illinois	HICKROD, 1976	212
	31	State Report	MINNESOTA, 1977	218
School Closure: Handbooks and Advice	*	Handbook	BORNSTEIN, 1978	173
	*	Handbook	EISENBERGER and KEOUGH, 1974	182
	32	Handbook	SARGENT and HANDY, 1974	193
Research About	33	Nationwide Survey	ANDREWS, 1974	5
	34	Case Studies	BORNSTEIN, 1978a	15
	35	Case Studies	BOYD, 1979	17
	36	Case Studies	BURLINGAME, 1979	25
	37	Case Studies	COLTON and FRELICH, 1979	29
	38	Case Studies	YEAGER, 1979	167

* Repeated reference.

CHART 3I: SHORT READING LISTS ON SCHOOL DISTRICTS' MANAGEMENT OF DECLINE, BY TOPIC AND BY CATEGORY (continued)

CATEGORY AND TOPIC		NUMBER	GENRE		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER
School Closure:	Research About	39	Impact of:	On Community	AMLUNG, 1980	3
				On Community	EISMANN, et al., 1976	53
				On Elementary School Children	RICHARDS and COHEN, 1981	135
				On Secondary School Students	PARKS, 1980	124
	Local School District Reports	43	----------		EUGENE (OREGON), 1976	236
		*	----------		FLEMING, 1980	227
		44	----------		HAMDEN (CONNECICUT), 1977a and b	225-226
		45	----------		LEXINGTON (MASSACHUSETTS) 1976 and 1977	246-247
Community Involvement:	And School Closure	46	Case History		CUBAN, 1979	32
		47	Advice		EISENBERGER, 1974	47
		48	Advice		EISENBERGER, 1975	48
		49	Advice		EISENBERGER, 1976	50
	On Task Forces	50	Advice		EISENBERGER, 1976	49
		51	Review of the Literature		SIERADSKI, 1975	151
		52	Research: Case Study		NUTTALL, 1976	120
	Planning	53	Case History		EDLEFSON, et al., 1977	45
		54	Case History		MORGAN and WOFFORD, 1977	106

* Repeated reference.

CHART 31: SHORT READING LISTS ON SCHOOL DISTRICTS' MANAGEMENT OF DECLINE, BY TOPIC AND BY CATEGORY (continued)

CATEGORY AND TOPIC		NUMBER	GENRE	REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER
Reductions in Force:	General, Policies and Practices	55	Compendia of Policies	KELLEY, 1978	83
		56	Case History, Descriptive	MASTORAKI, 1978	102
		57	State Report	OREGON, 1977	220
		58	Advice	NOLTE, 1976a and b	117-118
	Legal Issues and Due Process	59	Advice	CARR, 1980	28
		60	Compendia of Law	ZIRKEL and BARGERSTOCK, 1980	170
	Collective Bargaining	61	Advice	NASSAU, 1978a and b	110-111
Equity Issues:	Special Education	*	Survey, Nationwide	DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979	41
		*	Survey, Statewide: Iowa	WILKEN and CALLAHAN, 1978	165
	Title I	*	Survey, Statewide: Illinois	HICKROD, 1976	212
	School Closure and Desegregation	*	Case Study	COLTON and FRELICH, 1979	29
		*	Local School District Report	FLEMING, 1980	227
		62	Local School District Report	SAN JOSE, 1979	239
		63	Case Study	VALENCIA, 1980	181
	RIF and Affirmative Action	64	Case Study, Descriptive	DOWNEY, 1976	44
		65	Survey, Nationwide	ROSENBERG and VINCENT, 1978	139
Special Topics	Early Retirement	66	State Report	ELLSWORTH, 1977	211
		67	State Report	ILLINOIS, STATE BOARD, 1977	213

* Repeated reference.

CHART 3I: SHORT READING LISTS ON SCHOOL DISTRICTS' MANAGEMENT OF DECLINE, BY TOPIC AND BY CATEGORY (continued)

CATEGORY AND TOPIC		NUMBER	GENRE	REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER
Special Topics (continued)	Retrenchment at the High School Level	*	Survey, Nationwide Sample	DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979	41
		68	Local School District Report	GEIGER and TORGE, 1977	228
		69	Case Study, Descriptive	HOSLER and WELDY, 1977	74
		*	Case History	MORGAN and WOFFORD, 1977	106
		70	Local School District Report	SEQUOIA UNION HIGH SCHOOL, 1981	240
	Inter-District Sharing	*	Survey, Nationwide Sample	DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979	41
		71	Local School District Report	OLSEN, 1980	235

* Repeated reference.

4.0 THE EVIDENCE

Chart 4A, on the pages immediately following, provides a bibliographic guide to all references which provide empirical information on what is "happening" in school districts affected by declining enrollments. "What is happening" is documented in the literature in a variety of ways: fact-finding task force reports, anecdotal and descriptive case studies, local impact studies, and research efforts which rely on case and survey data of varying scope and generalizability.

The references contained in this chart provide the reader with a kaleidoscopic view of what is happening in response to decline. This view does not add up to any unitary picture, however, largely because of the biases mentioned in Section 1.0, i.e., those introduced by the contingencies of publishing semi-popular anecdotal works and by the fact that it is only certain types of school districts that produce and make available task force reports documenting experiences which may not be representative of all school districts with declining enrollments.[23]

For the above reasons our focus here will be limited to the works which provide information about what is/may be happening, generally. That is, we limit our review to broad-scale surveys of the "impact" of decline and of responses to decline; to the more formal academic case studies informed by a theoretical perspective through which the case data acquire significance

---

[23] We define "decline" as organizational contraction irrespective of whether said contraction is precipitated by enrollment drops or fiscal austerity. But much of the research literature looks specifically at enrollment decline and it is dangerous to assume that the effects of enrollment decline are always going to be the same as the effects of fiscal decline. For example, enrollment decline at the high school level may have an impact on the student population levels of different courses of study. Fiscal decline, if unaccompanied by enrollment decline, would not have this effect. On the other hand, data about the processes or the effects of certain cut-back decisions, e.g. school closings, do increase our understanding of fiscal decline. The impact of a school closure on costs, on community, on school politics, and on children is the same irregardless of whether the school was closed for demographic or fiscal reasons.

CHART 4A: AN INVENTORY OF THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE TO STUDIES AND REPORTS DOCUMENTING SCHOOL SYSTEMS' ADJUSTMENTS TO DECLINE

ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	STUDY IDENTIFICATION		
					GENRE	METHOD	SCOPE
Impact of decline:	On Administrative Practices		ASCD, 1980	7	Survey	Questionnaire	16 school districts nationwide
	On Governance		BOYD, 1979	17	Case-study	Comparative, longitudinal	8 suburban school districts (Chicago area) as they went from growth to decline, 1969-1979
			CUBAN, 1979	32	Case-history	Descriptive	Arlington, Virginia, 1974-1977
			MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	106	Case-history	- - -	Lincoln-Sudbury, Massachusetts
	On Finances		HICKROD, 1976	212	— State task force report —		Illinois
			LEPPERT AND ROUTH, 1978	97	Survey	Statistical	Nationwide, all 37 states reporting enrollment decline, 1970-1975
			MINNESOTA, 1977	218	— State task force report —		Minnesota
			ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978	122	Survey	Statistical	Iowa, Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington (1970-71 and 1974-75)
			RODEKOHR, 1976	138	Survey	Questionnaire	73 Colorado school districts
			WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978	165	Survey	Statistical	Iowa, 1974-1975, statewide
	On Personnel;	Staff Composition Changes	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			FREEMAN AND HANNAN, 1981	61	Survey	Statistical	823 school districts in California; 849 in New York; 1970-1979
			HICKROD, 1976	212	— State task force report —		Illinois, statewide
			ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978	122	Survey	Statistical	Iowa, Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington (1970-71 and 1974-75)
			WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978	165	Survey	Statistical	Iowa, 1974-75, statewide
	On Program;	Course Offerings and Changes in Enrollments	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			RODEKOHR, 1976	138	Survey	Questionnaire	73 Colorado school districts
			WILKEN & CALLAHAN, 1978	165	Survey	Questionnaire	55 Iowa school districts, 1975

CHART 4A: AN INVENTORY OF THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE TO STUDIES AND REPORTS DOCUMENTING SCHOOL SYSTEMS' ADJUSTMENTS TO DECLINE

ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	STUDY IDENTIFICATION		
					GENRE	METHOD	SCOPE
Impact (cont'd.)	On Program Quality	As Perceived	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978	165	Survey	Questionnaire	55 Iowa school districts, 1975
		As Measured by Achievement Data	RODEKOHR, 1976	138	Survey	Questionnaire	73 Colorado school districts
	On Program Innovations		DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			RODEKOHR, 1976	138	Survey	Questionnaire	73 Colorado school districts
Responses to Decline	Planning:	Enrollment Forecasting (studies of forecasting methods)	BERNHARDT, 1980	12	Case-study	Comparative	4 "large cities"
			SHAW, 1980	149	Survey	Statistical time series	42 Missouri school districts, 1970-1979
		Community Involvement In	EDLEFSON, 1977	45	Case-history	Documents "Project Design"	Palo Alto, California
			HESS, 1979	72	Case-history	- - -	East Syracuse, New York
			MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	106	Case-history	- - -	Lincoln-Sudbury, Massachusetts schools
			NUTTALL, 1976	120	Case-study	Attitude survey and behavioral data	"Mid-size city", upper middle class
			ZENKE AND McCLOUD, 1978	169	Case-study	Descriptive	Tulsa, Oklahoma
	Personnel Policies:	Changes in Hiring Practices	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			RODEKOHR, 1976	138	Survey	Questionnaire	73 Colorado school districts
		RIF: Policies and Practices	CARR, 1980	28	Case-study	Descriptive	Phoenix, Arizona
			ERS, 1973	181	Compendium of policies		16 nationwide, circa 1972-1973
			KELLEY, 1978	83	Compendium of state policies		Nationwide
			PHAY, 1980	127	Compendium of legal doctrine		- - -
			POWELL & STEMNOCK, 1975	133	Compendium of legal doctrine		- - -

CHART 4A: AN INVENTORY OF THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE TO STUDIES AND REPORTS DOCUMENTING SCHOOL SYSTEMS' ADJUSTMENTS TO DECLINE

ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	STUDY IDENTIFICATION		
					GENRE	METHOD	SCOPE
Responses (continued)	Personnel Policies:	RIF: Policies and Practices (cont'd.)	SPENLA, 1978	153	Review of court cases and decisions		New York and New Jersey
			ZIRKEL AND BARGERSTOCK, 1980	170	Review of legislation and litigation		Nationwide
		Furloughs (as an alternative to RIF)	DIVOKY, 1979	43	Case-data	Descriptive	Levittown, New York
		Inter-district Job Placement of Laid-off Staff	I/D/E/A, 1973	77	Case-data	Descriptive	Salt Lake City
		Early Retirement	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			DIVOKY, 1979	43	Case-data	Descriptions of early retirement policies in Chicago, state of Michigan, and Pasadena, California	
			ELLSWORTH, 1977	211	Case-data	Descriptive	36 Illinois school districts that have adopted early retirement plans
	Facilities:	Change in Space Allocation by Program Area	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
		Alternative Use of Surplus Space	EISMANN, 1976	53	Case-data	Local impact study	Seattle, Washington
			MITCHELL AND MILLER, 1980	105	Survey	Questionnaire	14 Arizona school districts
			SARGENT AND HANDY, 1974	103	Survey	Questionnaire	100 school districts, nationwide
		Grade Reorganization	HESS, 1979a	71	Case-history	Descriptive	Syracuse, New York
			PIATT, 1975	129	Case-history	Descriptive	South Allegheny Schools, Pennsylvania
	School Closure:	Research; Survey	ANDREWS, 1974	5	Survey	Questionnaire	60 school districts, nationwide

CHART 4A: AN INVENTORY OF THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE TO STUDIES AND REPORTS DOCUMENTING SCHOOL SYSTEMS' ADJUSTMENTS TO DECLINE

ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	STUDY IDENTIFICATION		
					GENRE	METHOD	SCOPE
Responses (continued)	School Closure:	Research; Case-studies	BORNSTEIN, 1979	15	Case-study	Comparative	12 New Jersey school districts
			BOYD, 1979	17	Case-study	Comparative, longitudinal	8 suburban (Chicago) school districts as they went from growth to decline (1969 - 1979)
			BURLINGAME, 1979	25	Case-study	Comparative	8 rural Illinois school districts
			COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979	29	Case-study	Comparative, quantitative	37 school closings in St. Louis, Missouri, 1969 - 1978
			CUBAN, 1979	32	Case-history	Descriptive chronology	Arlington, Virginia (1974-77)
			YEAGER, 1979	167	Case-history	Descriptive	Champaign, Illinois
		Descriptive-Anecdotal Reports	CROWE, 1979	31	- - -	- - -	Quincy and Jacksonville, Illinois
			GREEN, 1980	66	- - -	- - -	Richmond, Virginia
			HOSLER AND WELDY, 1977 WELDY, 1978	74 164	- - -	- - -	Skokie, Illinois
		School District Reports	EUGENE PUBLIC SCHOOLS, 1976	236	- - -	- - -	Eugene, Oregon
			HAMDEN, 1977	225	- - -	- - -	Hamden, Connecticut
			LEXINGTON, 1976	246	- - -	- - -	Lexington, Massachusetts
			LEXINGTON, 1977	247	- - -	- - -	Lexington, Massachusetts
			MONTGOMERY COUNTY SCHOOLS, 1976	244	- - -	- - -	Montgomery County, Maryland
			BIRMINGHAM, 1977	248	- - -	- - -	Birmingham, Michigan
			SOUTH COLONIE, 1978	243	- - -	- - -	South Colonie, Illinois
	Alternative Practices:	Interdistrict Sharing	DEMBOWSKI, 1979	41	Survey	Questionnaire	94 school districts, nationwide
			OLSEN, 1980	235	Case-history	Descriptive	2 small Iowa school districts, Belle Plaine and HLV
		Flexible Scheduling	NOWAKOWSKI, 1980	119	Case-study	Descriptive	2 suburban Chicago school districts Leyden Township 212 and Ridgewood 234

CHART 4A: AN INVENTORY OF THE EVIDENCE: A READERS' GUIDE TO STUDIES AND REPORTS DOCUMENTING SCHOOL SYSTEMS' ADJUSTMENTS TO DECLINE

ISSUE	TOPIC AND SUBTOPIC		REFERENCE	ANNOTATION NUMBER	STUDY IDENTIFICATION		
					GENRE	METHOD	SCOPE
Impact of Responses to Decline	Reductions in Force:	On Morale and Program	CUBAN, 1979	32	Case-history	Descriptive	Arlington, Virginia
	NOTE: See also reference in "Impact: Finance", above, and "Chart 4D -- Implications of Decline for Equity", below.						
	School Closure:	General Surveys of Impact	SKIERA, 1978	152	Review of the published and fugitive literature, circa 1977		
		Impact on Community	AMLUNG, 1980	3	Local impact study	- - -	6 New York City schools
			EISMANN, 1976	53	Local impact study: before and after measures of community impact		8 Seattle neighborhoods
		Impact on Pupils: Elementary	RICHARDS AND COHEN, 1981	135	Case-study	Interview, survey and socioeconomic data	143 elementary school students, grades 2-5, in 3 schools in Ithaca, New York
		Impact on Pupils: Secondary	PARKS, 1980	124	Case-study	Interviews with 13 high school drop-outs after a high school closure and consolidation case in Aurora County, West Virginia	
		Impact on Desegregation	COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979	29	Case-study	Quantitative	37 school closings in St. Louis (1969 - 1978)
			FLEMING, 1980	227	Local district task force report		Cleveland, Ohio
			VALENCIA, 1980	161	Case-history	Chronological	Santa Barbara, California

in extending, refining or overturning existing generalizations about school system behavior, normally, and in decline; and to a select number of local impact studies whose findings may be of limited generalizability but of much practical significance as caveats and/or cautionary tales.

The above criteria of comprehensiveness, rigor and significance lead us to focus our discussion in this section on the knowledge contained in 20 key studies, selected out of our 250 item bibliography. A summary of each of these key studies, in alphabetical order by reference, is contained in Chart 4B, on the pages immediately following. Section 4.1, below, provides a discussion of those studies and of their means of gaining knowledge about decline. Section 4.2 focuses on the content of those studies and summarizes the practical, policymaking significance of the knowledge contained therein.[24]

4.1 PATTERNS OF INVESTIGATION

A possible way to categorize and discuss these 20 major studies is to consider some of their differences and similarities in intent, scope and method. These differences and similarities can be summarized as follows.

4.1.1 Investigations of What is Happening in Declining Districts

Some studies set out to investigate what is happening to and in districts experiencing declining enrollment. ASCD (1980), for example, represents a nationwide survey conducted to ascertain whether districts in decline -- demographic and fiscal -- made any changes in their administrative practices. More specifically, it attempted to assess the impact of declining enrollments, declining budgets and collective bargaining on the following supervisory

---

[24] The focus on practical significance leads us to downplay some issues, i.e., factors over which local policymakers have no control and knowledge of which would not inform their decisionmaking. It also leads us to highlight findings and data which may not be central to the research objectives of the studies under discussion.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
ANDREWS, 1974	What criteria are used in school closing decisions? Respondents were asked which of the following criteria were definitive: • Impact on neighborhood • Desegregation • Crime rate • Property values • Enrollment decline • Age of building • Congruence with city planning • Proximity to other schools • Safety of school children • Safety of building • Impact on educational programs	Three most oft-cited criteria were: "Enrollment Decline," "Age of Building," and "Desegregation." 73 percent cited "Enrollment Decline". 47 percent cited "Age of Building". "Impact on Educational Programs" was mentioned by only 5 percent.	Survey of school officials nationwide N = 60.
	Do school managers invoke a number of criteria in their decisions to close schools?	A majority -- 66 percent -- used only one or two criteria; 75 percent only used three or four criteria.	
	What is school managers' consensus on the optimum size of schools?	Optimum size per school was perceived to be 300 - 500. School size of below 200, or above 700, was not considered desirable.	
ASSOCIATION FOR SUPERVISION AND CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT, 1980	What has been the effect of decline on supervisory practices?	Found no effect. That is supervisory structures and practices remained unchanged, or rather, interview and survey respondents did not perceive or report any changes.	Stratified sample of 16 school systems nationwide (urban, suburban and medium sized city). Questionnaires and on-site interviews with district and building administrators, teachers and teacher organization leaders. Design did not allow for cross-sectional or longitudinal comparisons.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
BORNSTEIN, 1979	What criteria are used in school closure decisions? More specifically to what extent are closure decisions based on "KEMEC" criteria which include: • Academic excellence • Rate of enrollment decline • Socioeconomic, ethnic, racial balance • Safety • Recyclability (of building) • Capital outlay/operational costs • Educational flexibility of faculty • Transportation costs	Of 12 school districts studied, nine closed schools on the basis of "KEMEC" type "efficiency criteria," three made closure decisions on "political" considerations. Neighborhoods with the least political clout -- low voter turnout in school board elections -- tend to lose their schools in closure decisions. Elected board members involved in contested school closure decisions tend not to be re-elected. Where ongoing community information programs regarding closure exist, the conflict surrounding final closure decisions is dampened, especially when the process is extended over a period of three years.	Comparative case study of 12 school districts in New Jersey.
BOYD, 1979	What is the impact on local school policymaking of the change from growth to decline? How do upper vs. lower status communities differ in terms of the impact of decline upon their respective governance and policymaking processes?	Depends on the type of community (upper vs. lower SES) and community political culture. High status communities suffer from higher levels of conflict, and thus, are more "impacted" by decline. Decisionmaking in high status communities becomes more "political" as a result of decline. The definitions of "rational" criteria for making retrenchment decisions become subject to political debate and interest group contests.	Comparative longitudinal case studies of 8 suburban school districts in the Chicago area (1969-79) as they moved from growth to decline. Sample includes white collar and blue collar communities. Study is ongoing. It draws before and after comparisons (growth-decline), cross-sectional comparisons (high vs. low

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
BOYD, 1979 (continued)			status communities), and compares levels of community conflict vis-a-vis rate of decline and community type.
		The "rational-consensual" ("public-regarding") policymaking orientation which tends to be prevalent in higher status districts may be less well suited for dealing with redistributive issues -- seeking and striking compromises -- than the more "political" ("private-regarding") policymaking orientation prevalent in lower status districts.	
	How do school district authorities decide when to close a school and which schools to close? How much of the answer to the first part of the question may be safely inferred simply from enrollment trend data?	Enrollment decline rates do not "predict" which school will be closed.	
		"Rational" and "political" criteria tend to get intertwined -- rational criteria, e.g., "program quality", become subject to political debate.	
		School location per se (quite apart from transportation and "walking distance" issues) is an important informal criterion of school closure. The location of a school can override its vulnerability (to closure) due to low enrollment and save it from being closed. Value and political considerations create areas with special claims to the maintenance of their schools which school boards wish to respect or believe they must respect.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
BURLINGAME, 1979	How do local community values affect school district problem-solving in response to decline?	Local community values -- rather than cost or technical rational criteria -- are most often invoked in policy debates about school closure and consolidation.	Comparative case studies of retrenchment decision-making in nine rural, east Illinois school districts.
COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979	What criteria govern school closure decisionmaking -- do policymakers base their school closure decisions upon efficiency critera such as student-classroom ratio and unit cost of operation?	Careful economic planning did not characterize school closure decisions. School location and school size were the operative criteria. Location: Level of utilization in adjacent school building sites was a factor. Many underutilized buildings were kept open because there was no adjacent school which had space for pupils. This stemmed from a policy commitment to the concept of neighborhood schools. Size: ceteris paribus -- i.e., location, age of building, degree of excess space, etc. -- the smaller the school the more likely it was to be closed.	Quantitative case study of 37 school closings in St. Louis, 1969-1978. Compared characteristics of closed schools with the characteristics of schools not closed. Tabulated data revealed regularities in the characteristics of closed schools. Such regularities were the basis for inference about closure decisionmaking criteria. The inferences were checked against testimony and exhibits from the St. Louis desegregation case Liddel v. City of St. Louis.
	Are school closure decisions accompanied by citizen participation and public information campaigns?	No citizen participation and no public information initiatives. This was due, it is argued, to the districts' commitment to the neighborhood school.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
COLTON AND FRELICH, 1979 (continued)	Do school officials in large cities adhere to a growing body of professional lore about "good practice" in closing schools?	Officials in this study did not. Lore about good practice is based on suburban contexts. This may be inapplicable to large city school systems because higher degrees of bureaucratization impose higher information costs on big school districts. Intra-organizational distortion in information flows makes rational planning more difficult.	
DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979	What is the effect of decline on school instructional programs?	As overall school enrollments decline, so do student enrollments in various courses of study. Language arts, social studies, fine arts seem particularly susceptible to enrollment loss.	Most comprehensive extant study of the impact of decline.
	Does decline adversely affect equity initiatives in instructional programs?	No, special education, compensatory education (and vocational education) are increasing both within and across school districts irrespective of enrollment decline.	A nationwide survey of a sample of 320 school districts broken down by size, region and percent student population change. Survey questionnaire.
	How does decline affect the range of courses being offered?	Course-offerings are not reduced in proportion as staff is reduced. But, decline did reduce the number of courses actually taught in any term.	Received a 31 percent response rate -- 94 school districts.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979 (continued)	Is decline an opportunity or a problem -- what is the impact on program quality and on innovation?	Quality: A greater percentage of declining districts reported that program quality had increased or decreased. But districts with greatest rates of enrollment decline reported that the quality of their educational program had deteriorated. Decline districts showed an increase in the dropout rate; growing districts showed a decrease. Innovation: A greater percentage use alternative education. A greater percentage of declining districts use computer assisted instruction, however, a majority of both growing and declining districts do not use computer assisted instruction. In the majority of districts with declining enrollments, the length of the materials replacement cycle either remained the same or lengthened while it shortened in districts with increasing enrollment.	Survey response data allowed for cross-sectional comparisons between growing, stable, and declining school districts.
	To what extent are school districts sharing resources and does decline lead to interdistrict sharing and other joint ventures?	A higher percentage of declining (as opposed to growing) districts do not cooperate with other educational agencies to provide school services. Joint ventures and interdistrict sharing was most common for special education and vocational education.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
DEMBOWSKI, et al., 1979 (continued)	What is the effect of decline on school personnel and personnel policies?	Staff composition: In high decline districts, staff reductions are greatest in foreign languages and agricultural education, while staff additions are in special education. Higher percentage of declining districts have faced an increase in the median age of teaching staff. Growing districts showed a decrease. Hiring practices: All districts, regardless of enrollment trends, have increased use of part-time staff. No difference between growing and declining districts in the amount of inservice training. Much larger percentage of declining districts are requiring teachers to have state teaching certifications in more than one subject area. Early retirement: Majority of all districts -- growing, stable or declining -- did not make changes in their retirement policies. Of those that did indicate a change, more declining districts had adopted an early retirement option. Of those districts, more large districts than small districts instituted early retirement.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
EISMANN, et al., 1976	School closure, impact of. Study sought to identify the impact of school closure on the community. Found that neighborhood residents perceive that school closure would adversely affect the community. More specific questions and findings are as follows:		Longitudinal local impact study. Survey of homes and businesses in four Seattle (Washington) neighborhoods which had their schools closed and four demographically matched neighborhoods which had not. Survey responses measured perceptions of the impact of school closure on quality of life and gathered physical data on other impact measures. Causal inferences were based on comparisons of data -- survey and physical -- before and after closure.
	Is the quality of a neighborhood adversely affected by school closure?	Survey found little evidence that the neighborhood had been adversely affected but survey respondents felt that neighborhood would change, for the worse, as a result of school closure.	
		Only 10 percent of survey respondents said their primary reason for choosing to live in the area was the proximity of the school.	
		Higher turnover of residential property after school closure.	
	What is the economic impact of school closure?	Business sales volume decreased since closure; sale value of homes dropped; increase in housing vacancy rate for areas within three blocks of the closed school.	
	Does school closure affect quality of education available to students in the closure neighborhood?	Respondents thought it did but test scores in reading and math showed no impact on the educational progress of pupils affected by school closure.	
	Does school closure affect school levy support?	No.	
	Does school closure change the pattern and frequency of community use of school buildings?	Closure resulted in an increase in the total number of community uses.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
FREEMAN AND HANNAN, 1981	How do schools as complex formal organizations react to decline as opposed to growth? How are staffing patterns different in decline as opposed to growth?	Districts respond faster to changes in enrollment when enrollment is growing than when it is declining. "Number of administrators" responds to changes in enrollment -- i.e., more pupils, more administrators -- in period of growth, but to changes in funding in periods of decline. The ratio of administrators to teachers increases as districts are in decline.	Survey of 832 school districts in California and 845 in New York. Data on staffing patterns for those districts 1970-79. Compared patterns of growing and declining districts. Study was designed to test a mathematical model of intra-organizational interest group politics.
MORGAN AND WOFFORD, 1977	How is participatory planning under conditions of decline different from planning in in growth conditions?	Difficult to get community involvement -- i.e., ownership in -- a retrenchment rather than a growth process. It is difficult to get people (and school-community interest groups) to become concerned about reducing future costs. Rational planning by consensus led to the necessity for considering and reconciling constituency interests. In the end this led to the addition rather than the reduction of programs and costs. School leaders' professional norms, i.e., internalized criteria of "success" and "strong leadership," were defined in terms of growth-expansion rather than retrenchment-cost reduction.	Case history of a planning effort to address enrollment decline in the Lincoln-Sudbury (Mass.) regional high school district.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
NUTTALL, 1976	Do citizens advisory committees/ task forces reconcile potential conflicts concerning decline and retrenchment?	Yes, and no. Nuttall ascertained the value positions of committee members and then traced their effects on committee process and outcomes. He found that: • Value positions reflected group and constituency interests and did not change as a result of group process. • Value positions were a good predictor of members voting behavior. • Committee process did lead to coalition building and hence to the bridging of some constituency interests. • Committee process may have crystalized and articulated community interests. Committees' recommendations were followed by a hotly contested school board election resulting in an unprecedented turnover of incumbents. Issues and issue-conflicts in that election mirrored value positions/conflicts identified in the advisory committee.	Case history of the decisionmaking process of a "citizens advisory committee on declining enrollments" in one upper middle class community.
ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978	What effects has decline had on local school district expenditures?	Per pupil operating expenditures in highest decline districts exceed statewide averages. Expenditures per pupil for two categories of expenditure -- "maintenance" and "operation of plant" -- are significantly higher in decline districts and are most strongly associated with decline.	Statistical survey of school finances in Michigan, Missouri, Iowa, South Dakota and Washington (1970-1971 and 1974-1975).

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
ODDEN AND VINCENT, 1978 (continued)		No strong pattern of correlation between transportation expenditures and declining enrollments.	
	What are the effects on personnel of enrollment decline?	Pupil-teacher ratios are lower in declining districts.	
		Pupil-teacher ratios are decreasing most rapidly in declining districts.	
		Average teacher salary in declining districts is not significantly above statewide average.	
		The increase in administrative expenditures per pupil, on percent-increase basis, significantly exceed those for instructional expenditures per pupil.	
PARKS, 1980	What is the impact of high school closure and consolidation on student dropout rate?	Drop-out rate among high school students whose school was closed increased by 26 percent in the two years immediately following school closure and consolidation.	Interview with 13 high school dropouts in Aurora County, West Virginia.
		Most frequently cited reason, among interviewees, was attendance at distant, consolidated high school; factors included "long bus ride," "increased class size," and "worse student-teacher relations."	
RICHARDS AND COHEN, 1981	How are elementary school children affected by school closure and merger?	Children respond to anticipated or actual closing of their school negatively, but there is little long-term effect. This reaction is related to the immediacy of the situation: children anticipating a	Impact study of 143 elementary school children -- second through fifth grades -- affected by two school closings in Ithaca, New York.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
RICHARDS AND COHEN, 1981 (continued)		closure and merger are most negative (80 percent); children attending the school that hosted the new students were least negative (35 percent); while those children whose school closed nine months earlier fell somewhere in between (70 percent).	Included children anticipating a school closing in the near future, children whose school had closed nine months earlier, and children whose school hosted the students from the school that closed.
	Are some children better able to adjust to school closure and merger? What makes the difference?	Child's education is not significantly related to sex, popularity, how well child likes school, or how well the child does in school academically, socially, or emotionally.	Data consisted of individual interviews with children, interviewer ratings, sociometric measures, parent questionnaires, and teacher evaluations.
		Age makes a difference: second and third graders remained friends almost exclusively with children from their original school. Second graders have the least number of cross-school friendships, fifth graders the most.	
		Presence of siblings in the new, "host" schools made no difference as far as negative-positive feelings to merger.	
	Are children's attitudes merely a reflection of parents' attitudes towards closure/merger?	Attitudes not caused by parents. Questionnaire results show parents were unable to judge their feelings about closure/merger independently of their child's feelings.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
RICHARDS AND COHEN, 1981 (continued)	What closure/merger practices can lessen the adverse impact on children?	Balance in merging school populations: children whose classrooms had an uneven mix of children from the two schools made fewer cross-school friendships. Should try to establish even ratios of "new" to "old" children in the classrooms. Children's greatest fear was of the "unknown" and programs designed to "make the unknown, known" may alleviate children's fears.	
RODEKOHR, 1975	Are patterns of resource allocation different in districts in decline?	Costs are increased, per pupil, in decline districts. Pupil-teacher ratios are lower. Decline districts hire fewer teachers capable of teaching in more than one subject area.	Survey of Colorado school districts. Survey questionnaire mailed out to superintendents of 73 school districts experiencing decline (percent change in ADA from 1961-62 to 1969-70). Five districts -- a "typical district", a high rate of decline district, a non-agricultural district, and a district in which the superintendent did know that his enrollments had declined -- were selected for more in-depth data gathering by interview.
	Does size of district make a difference for its adjustments to decline?	Large school districts are more successful in adapting to decline than small school districts. Small districts cannot realize minimal economies of scale.	
	Do levels of student achievement and attainment differ with rates of decline?	Lower dropout rates and higher achievement scores are positively associated with decline. Note: Author hypothesizes that this may be due to two factors: lower pupil-teacher ratios and the fact that districts most in decline are rural and socially stable and homogeneous.	

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
RODEKOHR, 1975	Are districts in decline less likely to engage in program innovation?	Yes, and no. Large districts have used decline as an opportunity for program innovation. Small districts on the other hand have difficulty in maintaining a comprehensive program.	Survey included data about staffing, school district finances, community-type and SES, and dropout rates and achievement scores as output measures.
WILKEN AND CALLAHAN, 1978	What is the impact of decline on school finances?	Nationally, states with declining enrollment exhibited virtually the same percentage increase in per-pupil expenditure as states with rising enrollments (this holds if states are used as the unit of observation). In Iowa, the impact has been minimal. Districts with the largest decline do exhibit higher educational expenditures but they are also wealthier and have lower tax rates.	Survey, statewide in Iowa. Finance data from public records 1972-7[illegible]. Program impact data from interviews with school officials in 55 Iowa school districts which experienced decline.
	What is the impact of decline on school programs as perceived by school officials?	53 percent felt that the impact was minimal (interview data from 55 Iowa school districts in decline); 15 percent thought decline led to improvement; 13 percent -- mostly classroom teachers -- thought it was harmful.	
YEAGER, 1979	How do school systems use technical data in planning for school closure? How does the availability of computer-generated predictive data affect those deliberations?	Final decisions was not governed by computer-generated data (via a simulation) of the impact of alternative school closings. Schools actually closed were not those "recommended" by the simulation.	Case history by participant/observer of school closure deliberation in Champaign, Illinois, 1976-77.

CHART 4B: SUMMARY OF MAJOR RESEARCH STUDIES ON DECLINE IN SCHOOLS (continued)

REFERENCE	RESEARCH QUESTIONS	MAJOR FINDINGS/CONCLUSIONS	METHOD AND SCOPE
YEAGER, 1979 (continued)		Data did help decisionmakers see some counter-intuitive effects of different policy options. Data also helped to set aside some conflicts over the facts and focused community debate over values, i.e., the school closure criteria themselves. Author concludes that "hard data create more issues than they resolve."	

practices: the provision of in-service, teacher evaluation, curriculum improvement, and instructional supervision. Questionnaires and on-site interview data -- from teachers, teacher organization officers, curriculum supervisors, principals, assistant superintendents and superintendents -- were gathered from a nationwide sample of sixteen school districts (urban, suburban, and medium-sized cities). The study found no perceived impact, as reported by questionnaire and interview respondents, of decline in supervisory practices.

Rodekohr (1976) studied how Colorado school districts adjusted to enrollment decline. A statistical comparison between growing and declining districts statewide showed consistent and systematic differences in patterns of financing and staffing. That these differences were associated with enrollment decline, was tested in a survey questionnaire administered to superintendents in 73 Colorado school districts which had shown a decline in ADA (Average Daily Attenance) between the school year 1961-62 and 1969-70. (Data gathering was conducted in 1973.) Survey data (based on a 65 percent response rate) consisted of self-reported perceptions of the impacts and problems of decline for finances, staffing, and program. The survey was supplemented by yet a third level of analysis in which Rodekohr conducted in-depth interviews with superintendents in five school districts: a "typical" decline district, a high rate of decline district, a low rate of decline district, a non-agricultural decline district, and a district in which "the superintendent thought enrollment had increased when actually it declined" (p. 45). (Ten percent of all responding superintendents did not realize that their enrollments had dropped, p. 34.) Rodekohr found that: (i) patterns of resource allocation were different in declining districts -- per pupil costs increased and pupil teacher ratios are lower; (ii) these differences were believed by respondents to be the result of having to adjust to decline; and (iii) while declining districts had higher achievement scores and lower drop-out rates, declining district managers reported an inability to continue to maintain innovative and comprehensive programs. However, Rodekohr's conclusions (as noted by Dembowski, et al., 1979:25) are confounded by the uneven incidence of decline in Colorado in 1970-71 (predominantly in small rural school

districts) which biased his sample. Thus, Rodekohr himself, concedes that "some of the problems that this study found to be associated with decline are actually problems associated with decline in rural areas" (p. 54).

The confounding effect of uneven incidences of enrollment decline is highlighted in Wilken and Callahan's (1978) statistical survey of school finance data in Iowa, 1972-1975. Iowa school districts in decline do exhibit higher per pupil expenditures but they are also wealthier and have lower tax rates than the state average.

4.1.2 Investigations of What is Different About Districts in Decline

Survey data from officials in declining districts may reveal (i) what is happening in those districts, and (ii) officials' perceptions whether what is happening is, or is not, caused by declining enrollments. But from this data alone, it is dangerous to conclude anything about the impact of decline. One way to begin to assess the impact is to draw cross-sectional comparisons between declining and growing districts and to isolate what is different about the latter. Four studies -- Dembowski, et al., 1979; Freeman and Hannan, 1981; Odden and Vincent, 1978; and Wilken and Callahan, 1978 -- provide such cross-sectional comparisons.

The necessity for such comparisons is vividly demonstrated in Wilken and Callahan's survey of the impact of decline on Iowa school districts, 1972-75. In addition to identifying systematic differences in school financing between growing and declining districts,[25] Wilken and Callahan also conducted on-site interviews with school administrators and teaching staff in 55 Iowa school districts (no sample breakdown data is provided in the reference listed), both declining and growing, in 1975. They report that (p. 293):

> In our interviews with school officials and staff in declining enrollment districts, we asked: "How would you rate the impact

---

[25] The same question was asked and similar methodology was employed by Odden and Vincent (1978) in their analysis of the fiscal impacts of decline in Michigan, Missouri, Iowa, South Dakota and Washington. As is the case with all studies discussed here, specific findings will be presented in Section 4.2, below.

of the decline on the quality of your program overall?" Somewhat surprisingly, 53 percent said "inconsequential" and 15 percent said either "somewhat helpful" or "generally helpful." About 20 percent said "somewhat harmful" and 13 percent -- disproportionately classroom teachers -- said "generally harmful."

When these responses were compared to results from districts with increasing enrollment, Wilken and Callahan (1978:295) found that perceptions about what specific school services have deteriorated "are very similar in decreasing and increasing enrollment school districts." [Emphasis in original.] They conclude that "...many of the suggested woes resulting from declining enrollment are likely to be the product of other trends" and, that "declining enrollment can result in the erosion of service quality, but not nearly to the degree that some believe."

But once again, the uneven incidence of enrollment decline, and based on Wilken and Callahan's own data, the contingent fact that in Iowa, for 1972-75, "enrollment drops tended to concentrate in high wealth districts" (p. 277) needs to be considered in making any conclusion about the "woes" of enrollment decline. It is sensible to compare districts in growth with districts in decline and isolate what is different about the latter, and then to draw conclusions about the impact of decline based on those differences. But, in order to make any inferences about the actual (as opposed to perceived) impacts of decline, declining enrollments have to be isolated as the difference. Otherwise one gets the confounding effects of "rurality" (Rodekohr), or "high property wealth" (Wilken and Callahan). The isolation of decline and rates of decline as the difference requires a larger universe for sampling.

Such a universe is provided in Dembowski, et al. (1979), a nationwide survey of the effects of declining enrollments on instructional programs and supervisory practices. Dembowski's is the most comprehensive survey of school districts in decline and one of the few studies to provide data on the instructional effects of enrollment decline as measured by responses to a questionnaire mailed out to a sample of 320 school districts, nationwide. The sample was stratified according to district size, HEW region of the United States, and percent pupil population change from 1970 to 1977, ranging from a greater than 5 percent increase, to a greater than 20 percent

decrease. The survey instrument contained 120 items dealing with staffing patterns, instructional technology changes, and course offerings. Respondents were asked to limit their reported effects of enrollment decline to changes that occurred from 1970 to 1977. Ninety-two districts, with representation in all cells of the stratified sample, returned the survey questionnaire. Patterns of responses were correlated with percentage of pupil population change and with district size.

Dembowski's design did consider district wealth but there were no statistically significant differences in responses to decline among districts of varying property wealth (as measured in assessed evaluation) although decreasing enrollment districts did tend to have lower median incomes and a greater proportion of minority population. (Hence, in Dembowski's sample, it is the "poorer" districts which have declining enrollment.) Dembowski's design not only provided data about what is happening in declining districts but also allowed for comparison between self-reported practices in declining vs. growing districts, in districts declining at different rates, and in districts of varying size with equal rates of enrollment decline.

Dembowski found that declining districts are distinguished by:

- Having a narrower, more restricted range of course offerings.
- Less innovation and longer materials replacement cycles.
- Less cooperation and inter-district sharing except for the smallest districts and for special and vocational education.
- A greater propensity (in large districts) to institute early retirement.
- A general emphasis on requiring teachers to have state certification in more than one subject area.
- A greater perception of change in program quality. A greater percentage of declining districts reported that quality had either increased or decreased. But reports of program quality deterioration increased in direct proportion to the rate of enrollment decline.

Notwithstanding, the above contributions to knowledge about the difference between school district practices when enrollments are declining,

Dembowski's study has several, self-admitted, generic limitations.

Association does not establish causality, even when, as in Dembowski's survey instrument, respondents recorded what they perceived to be the causes of changes in their practices, e.g., Item II:1 reads, "How has your teacher retirement policy been affected by student population changes?" (p. 114, emphasis not in original), or, Item III:5 reads, "Have student population changes affected the number and types of administrative positions in your district?" (p. 115). It is possible that these and other practices reported in questionnaire items (the majority of items do not illicit information about causation) which do not make suppositions about causes may be due to other factors. In commenting on the decrease, among declining districts, course offerings in advanced mathematics, science, foreign languages and fine arts, Dembowski concludes (1979:96):

> ...a plausible explanation is that school districts are minimizing their educational services and instructional options to the academically talented student. It is increasingly difficult in times of high cost, cost-effective analysis and of educational productivity, and reduced revenues, to justify maintenance and staffing of courses with low enrollments...similar responses are probably occuring in other "frill, nonrequired" courses....

But, Dembowski goes on to note that the apparent decline in a standard, required subject area like social studies is somewhat more difficult to explain. He asks (pp. 96-97):

> Is this situation more a function of factors other than declining enrollment per se? ...it may very well be that declining enrollments are occuring at the same time state and local school districts are reducing and/or redefining the number of social studies units required for graduation. These reductions may be a function of the general tenor and tone of the national educational community. These are not the times when top priority is given to the kind of human issues which constitute the content typical of the social studies curriculum.

Noting the current spirit of "vocationalism" and current "minimum competency preoccupations," Dembowski goes on to speculate that:

> Undoubtedly, these "climate conditions" also partially explain why social studies subjects are declining... [and that] these factors, combined with declining enrollments in general, may help to explain why academic areas in school curricula are declining.

Survey data permitting cross-sectional comparisons can show, as they do in Dembowski's study, that certain practices are found more often in declining districts than in growing ones and that the prevalence of those practices increases as the rate of decline increases. But, from this observation it is not yet possible to conclude that these practices are an impact of decline and of decline alone. Recognizing this, Dembowski (p. 107) urges that:

> ...future research...concentrate on identifying the specific details of the declining and increasing subject area trends. For example, school districts might be employed to explain the exact nature of the decline within an instructional area relative to percentage of student enrollment changes over time, which particular subjects and courses have been added and dropped with[in] given instructional areas, and why these changes have occurred. [Emphasis not in original.]

In short, what is needed is more study of school districts adjusting (rather than school districts' adjustments) to declining enrollments.

Program changes are not the only "impacts" of declining enrollment which need to be illuminated by more studies which look at how school districts change their practices over time as enrollments decline. Freeman and Hannan's work (1981) is designed to build and validate a mathematical model of "organizational demography" by examining change in staffing patterns over time, i.e., changes in the proportion of administrative, teaching, pupil services, and other classified employee positions. To do this, Freeman and Hannan gathered staff composition data on these four components from a sample (no sample breakdown data are offered in the reference cited) of 823 California and 849 New York school districts from 1970 to 1976. The sample was divided into "growers" (10 percent or more increase in ADA over the period 1970 to 1976) and "decliners" (10 percent or more decrease in ADA). Cross-sectional comparisons between "growers" and "decliners" revealed that: (i) districts respond faster to changes in enrollment growth than to enrollment decline, i.e., more staff in all components are hired in growth than are "fired" in comparable rates of decline; (ii) the number of administrators increases when enrollments grow, but decreases when and if enrollment decline is accompanied by a budgetary decline, i.e., adminstrators are let go if there is a fiscal crunch as well as a decline in enrollments per se; and

(iii) as staff shrinks, the teaching force shrinks more than the administrative force. (The latter is consistent with similar findings by Hickrod, 1976, Odden and Vincent, 1978; and Wilken and Callahan, 1978.)

As a result of the surveys summarized above, it is fair to conclude that: (i) decline leads to rising per pupil cost but that whether this creates an intolerable burden and adversely affects program depends on district wealth (Wilken and Callahan, 1978) and/or state aid formulas (Odden and Vincent, 1978); and/or possibly other factors coincidental with but not directly related to enrollment decline (Dembowski); but (ii) that, generally, however, declining districts are less likely to engage in program innovation (Rodekohr, Dembowski); and (iii) are likely to reduce staff at a slower rate than districts which are growing in enrollments increase their staff (Freeman and Hannan); and (iv) reduce teaching staff much more than they reduce administrative staff (Freeman and Hannan, Odden and Vincent, Wilken and Callahan); and, finally, (v) despite a common perception on the part of school leaders that decline creates a unique set of problems and jeopardizes program quality (Dembowski, Rodekohr, Wilken and Callahan), declining districts do not report any changes in supervisory practices (ASCD, 1980).

4.1.2 Investigations of Retrenchment Decisionmaking

We found no studies which explain, or document, how the decline in enrollments translates into the management decisions reflected in the survey data about changes in staff composition and program offerings typical of declining districts.

Community Involvement in Retrenchment Decisionmaking

Morgan and Wofford (1977) do document, in great detail, one district's planning effort to reduce costs at the high school level, a cost reduction made necessary by an anticipated sharp drop in the high school district's enrollment and a desire to avoid the accompanying diseconomies of scale. Since theirs was a small single high school district, the cost reduction planning inevitably focused on program. Morgan and Wofford, however, document an unfinished story. Their focus was on the planning process and, more

specifically, on the attempt to implement a participatory planning model which recognizes value pluralism but transcends the tug-of-war of constituency interest group bargaining. The latter ambition was ultimately unsuccessful. Interests emerged, and, in fact, became articulated in the process of planning. As a conflict resolution device (unplanned) the committee resorted to a species of "pork-barrel politics" (our term, not Morgan and Wofford's) with the ironic result that the local school board showed an "additive response" (pp. 156-157) and initiated special programs (an intensive studies program and college credit courses) which ended up costing the district more money, not less.

Another irony of participatory planning is revealed in Nuttall's (1976) small but very interesting case-study of a district-wide community advisory committee charged with producing recommendations with respect to school closure. Consistent with the consensus in the advice literature reviewed in Section 3.3.2, above, the committee was broadly representative and so constituted so as to be a working group laboring to recommend a policy for school closure decisionmaking and not specifically recommending which schools to close. Nuttall surveyed the "value positions" vis-a-vis school closure of committee members, and found these positions to be: (i) a good predictor of members' voting and coalition joining/building behavior, and (ii) quite closely correlated with, if not totally reflective, of members' consituency group membership (e.g., a Taxpayers' Association member subscribed to the "cost-effectiveness criteria" of school closing; PTA people from those schools with most excess capacity were strong holders of the value of "neighborhood schools;" teacher association members subscribed to the value of "minimal staff disruption"). The committee group process did not lead to a transcending of group interests. Coalitions were struck and decisions made but the process was more akin to normal legislative politics than the conversion from parochial (private interest) to districtwide (public interest) perspectives which some of the advice literature assumes that community task forces can and should achieve. By way of a postscript, Nuttall notes that coincident with the completion of the advisory committee's work, there was a hotly contested school board election, fought along the same lines of interest cleavage that characterized the committee's "values positions",

in which an unprecedented number of incumbents lost.

School Closure

Nuttall's focus is typical of the literature investigating retrenchment decisionmaking in that the politics of school closure is a common theme of a whole cluster of, primarily, case-study literature. One exception is an early survey by Andrews (1974) of school officials in 60 school districts nationwide. Respondents were asked which of the following criteria:

- Impact on neighborhoods
- Desegregation
- Crime rate
- Property values
- Enrollment decline
- Age of building
- Congruence with city planning
- Proximity to other schools
- Impact on educational programs
- Safety of school children
- Safety of building

were decisive in their district's decisions to close schools. A majority, 66 percent, cited only one or two criteria as decisive; 75 percent cited less than four criteria. The three criteria cited most often were enrollment decline (78 percent) and age of building (47 percent); and desegregation (34 percent). Impact on education program was mentioned by only 5 percent.

Andrews' data provide some self-reported reasons for school closure decisions. More recent case study data include: Bornstein (1978); Boyd (1979); Burlingame (1979); Colton and Frelich (1979); and Yeager (1979). A summary of the main findings will be presented in Section 4.2, below, and a more detailed discussion of these studies will be provided in Section 5.2. For now, our focus is on the common features which characterize the approach taken by this cluster of case studies on school closure. All are animated by a manifest intent to get at the "real reasons" for why some schools rather than others are closed, the implicit assumption being that the decision is apt to be so controversial that the real reasons are not publicly articulated.

The investigations proceed in two general directions. The first is typified by documentation of who is involved in school closure decisions,

how and what values are articulated, and what values are dominant in the decisionmaking. This approach, analogous to Nuttall's (1976) dissection of the interest articulation and aggregation on the community advisory committee, is taken by Burlingame (1979) and Yeager (1979). Burlingame reports on an exploratory analysis of retrenchment decisionmaking in nine rural east Illinois school districts and describes the arguments involved and interests marshalled in school closure and consolidation controversies. He describes a proto-typical process of "miasma" -- a systemic inability to cut through deadlocks created by irreconcilable value positions and entrenched interests and to gain support for technical-rational criteria which would transcend the deadlock. This deadlocking leads to ad-hoc decisions that satisfy no criteria.

Yeager describes an interesting attempt by the Champaign, Illinois, school district to use a computer simulation model to determine the likely impact on the district's formally stated policy objectives of different scenarios of school closure. The attempt failed. One of the schools finally closed was one which the simulation showed to have the most adverse impact on one of the simulation's criteria -- "minimal walking distance." Beginning his study with the question of "how the availability of predictive data affects those [the school closure] deliberations" (p. 297), Yeager concluded that "hard data create more issues than they resolve" (p. 311).

The other approach utilizes a comparative case method in which the individual school closing is the unit of analysis. Typically, this consists of: (i) comparing schools which are closed with ones that aren't, thereby getting at the common characteristics of the closed schools; and (ii) comparing what's different about the closed schools with (a) either the research site districts' formal policy criteria for choosing which schools to close, or (b) the suggested criteria governing school closure as offered in what we have earlier called the "advice" literature (see Section 3.3.2, above).

Bornstein (1978), for example, examined twelve school closures in twelve suburban New Jersey school districts in 1975. He compared the characteristics of schools which were closed against "KEMEC", a New Jersey State Department endorsed set of criteria for objectively choosing which

school to close. The three closure decisions which "violated" KEMEC were subjected to more in-depth investigation to get at the politics of the situation. One deviant case was totally sui generis; the other two revealed that lack of "neighborhood political clout" (i.e., low SES, low voter-turnout, and low turnout at school board meetings) was associated with the schools being closed.

Colton and Frelich (1979) examined 37 school closings in St. Louis between 1969 and 1978 in order to ascertain whether the "craftlore" about the right way to close schools is (i) practiced by, or (ii) applicable to urban settings. In so doing, they investigated what informal, operative criteria were used in the 37 school closure decisions. Their procedure was as follows (p. 401):

> First, we analyzed the school closing process by comparing the characteristics of closed schools with the characteristics of schools not closed. These comparisons permitted inferences about criteria used in school closings. Second, we sought more direct information about the school closing process from testimony and exhibits connected with the desegregation litigation. [Liddell et al v. Board of Education of the City of St. Louis, et al.]

Data about the characteristics of closed schools was based on (p. 401):

> ...a roster consisting of every elementary school building operated in St. Louis between 1968 (when enrollment peaked) and 1977. This roster was supplemented with information about school age, location, ownership, capacity, enrollment, and student racial and socio-economic characteristics... We tabulated these data in a variety of ways to see what we might detect in the way of regularities in school closings.

The "regularities" revealed that, contrary to formal district policy, building cost-efficiency criteria were not operative in school closure decisions; instead, the decisive factors were school location and size. Location: the level of utilization of nearest adjacent building (described in district policy terms as the "walking distance" criterion) was a key distinguishing characteristic. Many underutilized buildings were kept open because there was no adjacent school with space for pupils. This stemmed, say Colton and Frelich (p. 414), from district policy commitment to the concept of the neighborhood school.[26] Size: ceteris paribus -- i.e.,

---

[26] Both Colton and Frelich, and Burlingame (1979) suggest ways in which

location, building age, degree of excess space -- the smaller the school, the more likely it was to be closed. The districts' adherence to the concept of neighborhood schools served to depress community involvement and defuse opposition and to keep manifestly inefficient schools open, while still disestablishing small branch schools serving low-income and minority neighborhoods.

Boyd (1979) presents a preliminary report on an on-going, open-ended and in-depth comparative case study of eight suburban Chicago school districts (evenly split between upper and lower SES) as they moved from growth to decline. The larger purpose of Boyd's study is to investigate the impact of scarcity (of pupils and dollars) on levels of community conflict and on political processes of conflict resolution. Boyd's study seeks to discover how districts decide to close schools and what impact this has on levels of conflict and on governance processes. He asks (p. 355):

> How do school district authorities decide when to close schools and which schools to close? [H]ow much of the answer to the first part of the question might be able to infer simply from the enrollment trend data?

Boyd concludes (p. 55):

> Not very much as it turns out, for the factors involved are much more complex -- and interesting -- than such gross data can suggest.

Boyd's approach to the research question is also more "interesting" and "complex" than the above quotes suggest. The approach recognizes, first, (as we have suggested at the conclusion of Section 3.3.2, above) that the impact of enrollment decline is mediated by the fiscal shortfall which accompanies it. Boyd, then, uses a (p. 354):

> ...cost volume model devised by Hentschke (1977) [see annotation number 69 in our bibliography] which permits

---

both the urban and the rural contexts may be different from the suburban when it comes to the politics of school closure. In urban areas the "neighborhood" school has a symbolic and emotional significance which is more intense than in suburban areas. In rural districts, the same significance is attached to the community's high school. It seems, therefore, that Eisenberger's (1974:33) "there are no loyal district supporters, only loyal school supporters" applies a fortiori in urban and rural settings.

both a projection of school districts' operating costs and an analysis of the factors interacting with enrollment trends to influence these costs. From these data it will be possible to develop a standardized annual index of fiscal strain reflecting the discrepancy between a district's net projected income and net projected expenditures.

A fiscal strain index could then show the hypothetically rational point at which enrollments have declined enough to necessitate school closure (an answer to the "when" question). The index would also show which school could be closed to bring the greatest relief from fiscal strain (an answer to the "which school" question). School districts' actual closure decisions could then be compared to the hypothetically rational criteria revealed by the index of fiscal strain.

At the time of the reference cited (1979), Boyd had not yet developed the fiscal indicators necessary to employ the strain index, and the incidence of school closure in his sample of districts was not great enough to draw the kind of cross-sectional comparisons (between the characteristics of closed vs. non-closed schools) possible in Colton and Frelich's study of school closings in St. Louis. However, Boyd's preliminary interviews with superintendents and board members in his sample of districts revealed that from their definition of the situation the following types of factors (Boyd defines them, quite rightly, as "categories of constraints") enter into discussions and decisions about school closure (pp. 354-355):

(1) Enrollment constraints -- the rate and distribution of growth or decline within the district.

(2) Fiscal contraints -- including such factors as amount of state level and other aid, local tax rates, assessed valuation per pupil, and so on.

(3) Fiscal management attitudes -- extent to which conservative or liberal fiscal attitudes prevail on the school board and in the community.

(4) Educational program preferences -- including degree of complexity and specialization of educational program, grade organization, and so on.

(5) Facility constraints -- including size, age, condition, flexibility for use, and location of buildings, plus alternative utilization possibilities.

(6) Teacher contract/union constraints -- provisions affecting reduction in force and such.

(7) Faculty/professional staff constraints -- age of staff, distribution in salary schedule, rate of attrition through retirement and mobility, and so on.

(8) Environmental and subcommunity constraints -- considerations related to the socioeconomic, racial, ethnic, and religious population distribution and mixture within the district; geographic features affecting attendance boundaries; extent of existence of areas with special claims to the maintenance of their neighborhood schools which school boards wish to respect or believe they must respect.

In looking at the few instances of school closure which had occurred, Boyd concludes tentatively that factor 8, above, seemed decisive (p. 361):

> ...the location of a school can override its vulnerability due to low enrollment and save it from being closed, or at least long delay such a decision. One common way this occurs is when a school is located in a physically isolated or peculiarly distinct area of a school district. The latter may occur when a district includes bits and pieces of several communities or when there is some kind of ethnic, racial, or religious ghetto area. Such considerations create areas with special claims to the maintenance of their schools. Typically, what seems to happen is that such schools are eliminated at the outset from the list of schools to be scrutinized for candidates for closing.

This finding, though it is preliminary, is consistent with Colton and Frelich's discovery about the importance of location and with Bornstein's (1978) use of "neighborhood political clout" as an explanation for those school closure decisions that were inexplicable on cost-efficiency criteria.

Here lies another common thread uniting this cluster of studies. The search for the "real story" behind school closings is guided by a practical intent. In all of the studies reviewed above, there is at least an implicit "null hypothesis" to the effect that: "school closure decisions are based on technical-rational criteria." The important discovery is not that technical-rational criteria may not be operative, but rather "why" they are not operative. What is it about school managers' decisionmaking situation that inhibits rational decisionmaking as prescribed in the advice literature reviewed in Section 3.3.2, above?

Although the advice literature codifies personal experience and the professional consensus on school closings, it is not informed by or integrated with the research data. This is, in part, due to timing -- advice could not wait for the results of research. The data-producing studies, on the other hand, are integrated, sometimes explicitly, with the advice literature. For example, Colton and Frelich (1979:396) ask:

> Do school officials in large cities adhere to a growing body of professional lore about "good practice" in closing schools ... That is, do they base their school closing decisions upon efficiency criteria such as student-classroom ratios and unit cost of operation? Do they initiate comprehensive citizen participation and public information programs in order to secure at least minimal support for closings?

And, Boyd introduces his study with (p. 335):

> In view of recent events in public school districts faced with declining enrollments and funds, one can scarcely dispute Wilson's (1973) comments that "the politics of scarcity is the politics of conflict." ...The changeover from growth to decline has posed unfamiliar and difficult problems for educational leaders and has increased the importance of the conflict management function of government... Yet despite the obvious importance of these problems there still is little systematic knowledge about the dynamics and political and organization impacts of declining enrollments and school closings.

Similar introductions can also be found in Burlingame (1979) and in Yeager (1979).

4.1.4 Investigations of the Impact of Retrenchment Decisions

Much is known about the gross effects of enrollment decline on school finance, but our searches produced no studies of the impact of specific cost-reduction measures on program in concrete settings. Although the local school district report literature (see Section C2 of the annotated bibliography) is replete with projections of cost-savings and/or discussions of the programmatic impacts of varous local policy options, few districts study the impact of the policy option finally adopted. Practitioners' trade-off decisionmaking is, therefore, hampered by a lack of specific data about the likely impact of doing "X" rather than "Y" in responding to the problems

of decline.[27]

We have, however, found a handful of accessible local impact studies of varying degrees of generalizability and methodological sophistication and replicability. Not surprisingly, they focus on the impact of school closure. Their common approach, as one would expect in impact studies, is to assess the "before" and the "after" along some set of indicators whose measures include both "soft" perceptual data and "hard" behavioral/physical data. This mixture of hard and soft data creates problems for interpretation and inference. For purposes of logic and stylistic convenience, our summary of these studies will separate out the two categories of findings and employ the labels "feelings" (for perceptual data) and "facts" (for behavioral/physical data).

Parks (1980) focuses on the impact of high school closure and consolidation in Preston County, West Virginia. The drop-out rate for students coming from the closed school increased by 26 percent in the two years immediately following closure and consolidation. In-depth interviews with a representative sample of 13 of those drop-outs -- all had dropped out at age 16, seven had since passed a Graduate Equivalency exam, four others planned to, two did not; eight were regularly employed, one was now in college, four (all married women) were unemployed and not seeking work -- revealed that feelings of alienation from the host school ("teachers there don't care about us") and the "long bus ride" were factors in the decision to drop out.

A more extensive, and methodologically subtle, study of the impact of school closure on elementary school children can be found in Richards and

---

27 This statement is made about the literature focusing on decline. There is, for example, much talk about early retirement but the only comprehensive review of the evidence on the correlation of teacher age and effectiveness is contained in Illinois State Board of Education (1977). School size is often mentioned but there is little review of the emerging research n size vis-a-vis instructional effectiveness. Interestingly, the evidence on class size, teacher load and the instructional effects thereof is only reviewed systematically in Thompson (1978). There is much discussion of different grade configurations but only Piatt (1975) contains a systematic review of the research evidence on the developmental effects of different grade configurations. Our general point is that decisionmakers will have to go outside of the decline literature in order to discover what education research can offer in the way of evidence about the likely impact of retrenchment policy.

Cohen (1981). They studied the behavior and feelings of 143 children in grades 2 - 5 in Ithaca, New York. The sub-samples included: children anticipating a school closing in the near future; children whose school closed nine months before; and children whose school hosted the students from the school that closed. Impact inferences were drawn from a comparison of children in the first sub-sample (anticipating a school closure, controlled for grade level) with children in the second sub-sample (those whose school had already closed). This comparison provided for an approximation of a "before and after design" (p. 10). Impact measures were drawn from indicators of feeling -- individual interviews with children rated so as to take into account both verbal and nonverbal cues, homeroom teachers were asked to rate their perceptions of each child's adjustment, and parents responded to a questionnaire eliciting their perception of their child's adjustment and their feelings about merger and consolidation -- and from indicators of fact -- sociometric data about children's friendship and interaction behaviors; pupil background data including academic achievement and grade level; and classroom ratios (the proportion of "old" to "new" children). The data revealed that:

- Children did react negatively to the prospect of school closing, but that this negative reaction faded once merger was completed.
- There was no long-term adverse effect on children's academic performance, nor was the level of achievement any predictor of how well children adapted to closure and merger.
- Children's adaptation was not significantly related to sex or to popularity prior to school closure.
- Age does make a difference: second and third graders remained friends almost exclusively with children from their original school; second graders have the least number of cross school relationships, fifth graders the most.
- Classroom ratios of new to old children also make a difference: children whose classrooms had an uneven mix of children from the two schools made fewer cross school friendships.

Eismann, et al. (1976), represents an even more comprehensive and ambitious attempt to assess the impact of school closure on communities. Its experimental design led to data gathering on selected measures of community perceptions, community economic development, and community use of school

facilities before and after closure in four Seattle neighborhoods. Each of these four neighborhoods were matched with four control group neighborhoods similar in all other respects except for the absence of school closure. The data base consisted of measures of feelings -- interviews in homes and businesses in each of the eight (four closure, four control) neighborhoods which elicited survey data about perceptions of neighborhood quality of life and quality of education -- and measures of facts -- statistics about real estate values and investment, business volume, academic achievement of students affected by closure, frequency and volume of school building use for community purposes, and voting in school levy election. Impact inferences were drawn from longitudinal comparisons of factual measures (with additional cross-sectional comparisons with control neighborhood) and from cross-sectional comparisons of perceptual data.

Eismann's study is quite complicated. The interview survey, for example, utilized different sample sizes in closure and control neighborhoods (see pp. 32-34). Eismann's findings are also confounded by almost insurmountable measurement problems.[28] He did find, however, that although residents think their neighborhoods will change as a result of closings (and while opinions may become self-fulfilling prophecies, there is little evidence to date of actual change). In only one case was there significant loss of school-age children following closure. No consistent pattern of crimes against property was found to be related to school closing. Businesses in the closed neighborhoods believe sales were affected negatively, although no sales data were analyzed. There was some evidence of higher property turnover in closed school neighborhoods but assessment values were apparently unaffected. No evidence was found of increased vandalism in school properties following closure. In one case, vandalism dropped dramatically. Residents tended not to be less satisfied with neighborhoods, businessmen tend to be more dissatisfied, after closure. Surprising few (10%) of the residents with school

---

[28] Eismann details these problems and the methodological appendix, pp. 31-37, is required reading for anyone who underestimates the difficulty of defining, let alone measuring, the impact of school closure on "neighborhood quality of life."

age children reported that the primary reasons for choosing their current location is the proximity to an elementary school. There was some evidence that closed school neighborhoods were becoming less attractive to families with primary age children (as determined by enrollments generated by those neighborhoods). Support of school levies also seemed to be unaffected by closure.

Eismann warns, however, that these findings cannot even be generalized to "all Seattle school closures" (p. 36). One insurmountable problem was that the schools were not all closed at the same time. Eismann notes that (p. 35):

> The primary weakness of the survey is that it was undertaken from five to eleven years after the fact of closure. Because of this, perceived impacts of school closures were probably lost. This is due to two reasons: 1) people adjust over time to changed circumstances, and having adjusted, it is likely that many residents will not recall clearly what actually happened immediately after the closure; and 2) residents who reacted most strongly to closure may have moved out of the neighborhood. Only about half of the sample interviewed lived in the neighborhoods at the time of closure. These limitations probably constitute a bias on the perceptions of the impact of closure. As such, it is possible that the impact was at least as great as that reported in this study and possibly greater.

Matching control and closure neighborhoods also presented difficulties -- one of the closure neighborhoods was in the downtown business district, presenting a sui generis situation.

Compounding the problem of measurement is the correlative problem of interpretation. Disinvestment in housing and increased investment in business may indicate either: (i) the abandonment of a neighborhood by families due to school closure; (ii) an abandonment of a neighborhood by families because of some other factors including, possibly, rising real estate values, enabling owners to realize a resale profit and move on to more desirable neighborhoods; or (iii) an urban renaissance in which growing businesses displace a stagnant housing stock. Facts rarely determine values. The case of the impact of school closure on community is no exception -- not only do facts not determine values, in this case the facts themselves are

difficult to ascertain.[29]

4.2 PATTERNS OF EVIDENCE

In this subsection we shift our attention from the ways of gaining knowledge about school districts' management of decline to the content of that knowledge. That content is reviewed by means of a question and answer format which allows for codification of what is known.[30]

4.2.1 General Observations

From the survey of the major studies in Section 4.1, above, one can draw these general impressions:

- The impact of decline is neither as beneficial or as woeful as some have expected.
- The uneven incidence of decline and the confounding effects of that unevenness (some districts can absorb whatever diseconomies of scale are introduced by decline; others may not be able to; and some that can will not because of political realities) makes it extremely difficult to generalize about the impact of decline.
- The processes of responding to decline are even more profoundly political, especially in school closure decisions, than has been suggested in the advice literature. /31

---

29 It could be argued that, for policymakers in a democratic polity, the important facts about the impact of an action are the citizens' perceptions of that impact. But Eismann's data do show that these negative perceptions do not translate into political action, e.g., citizens in closure neighborhoods did not vote "yes" in school levy elections less often than did citizens districtwide.

30 As is evident from the preceeding overview in Section 4.1, much of the evidence will consist of statistically significant correlations drawn from survey data. Our intent is to make the results accessible to the lay reader. As such we will provide percentage breakdowns when they are given in the references cited, otherwise we will simply provide prose paraphrases of the listed authors' major findings and conclusions as paraphrased from the works.

31 We will delve more deeply into the notions of "political" in Section 5.3, below.

- There do not seem to be any long lasting adverse effects on children's cognitive and emotional development as a result of school closure.
- The community impact of school closure is extremely difficult to assess.
- Care must be taken so as not to attribute to enrollment decline the effects of a whole series of correlative trends including: inflation; increasing fiscal conservatism; shifts in curricular priorities and other changes in the pedagogical climate; rising per pupil staff costs due to such factors as collective bargaining and a teaching force which is becoming older and more experienced even without seniority-based RIF because of fluctuations in levels of hiring -- i.e., a lot of young teachers were hired in the late 1960's and now they are tenured senior staff approaching the top of their salary and credentials scales.

4.2.2 Patterns of Resource Allocation in Declining as Opposed to Growing Districts

Summarized here are data on rates of change in resource allocation, finances, and personnel in declining districts.

What Differences are There Between Expansion and Contraction?

We found no longitudinal studies of districts' resource allocations during growth and then during decline. Hence, there is little before and after data except for self-reported changes which survey respondents usually attribute to changes in pupil population (e.g., Dembowski, et al., 1979). However, if staff size is taken as a surrogate measure for organization size, then Freeman and Hannan's (1981) cross-sectional comparison suggests that schools shrink slower than they grow in response to equal rates of change. That is, "plus X" number of students causes a school system to grow faster than "minus X" number of students causes it to scale down.

How Are Declining Districts Different From Growing Districts In Their Patterns of Costs?[32]

---

[32] We ask the question "How are declining districts different?" rather than using the more common expression, "What is the impact of decline?" advisedly. The discussion in Section 4.1 suggests that it is dangerous to talk of "impacts" with its inevitable connotation of cause and effect.

Much has been written about the fiscal impact of decline. In some ways we already know more than is needed, from the practical standpoint of local district managers, about the putative fiscal impacts of decline.[33] The gross effects of decline are clear and well documented. (In addition to Odden and Vincent, 1978, and Wilken and Callahan, 1978, almost every state task force report listed in Section C1 of our bibliography and a majority of the local district reports in Section C2 contain data on the fiscal implications of decline.) But the data on these effects does not "add up" to any possible generalizations about the impact of declining enrollment per se on a particular district's level of fiscal health and patterns of expenditure. Consider the following:

(a) Whether decline creates a problem or not depends, in part, upon the level of state contribution to a district's finances and upon whether that contribution is pegged solely to ADA or provides some kind of cushion, intentional or unintentional, against revenue loss due to decline in enrollment (Iowa provides such a cushion, Wilken and Callahan, 1978; Virginia does not, Cuban, 1979).

(b) Whether decline is a problem or not also depends on the district's property wealth and the community's willingness to tax its wealth at a constant rate even though enrollment has declined (Berman and McLaughlin, 1978:311, n. 19).

(c) The confounding effect of these, and other, factors can be seen by sampling some of the findings on this issue.

- Cost per student in declining areas is far higher than in growing areas (Rodekohr, 1976; Odden and Vincent, 1978).

---

33 "Fiscal impacts" and "demography" are two topics which dominate the empirical literature on decline. At the aggregate level, neither set of data are of immediate relevance to local practitioners. For example, it is difficult to imagine a school superintendent convincing his/her board and community that because Series II projections anticipate an upsurge in the number of 9, 8, 7, 6 and 5 year olds by the mid-1980's, that their community should not close down its schools with excess capacity. It is local not national data which has meaning for local decisions.

- Declining districts have lower tax rates than growing districts (Rodekohr, 1976; Wilken and Callahan, 1978).
- Declining districts do spend more per pupil but they also have higher total revenues per pupil and lower tax rates (Wilken and Callahan, 1978).

Rodekohr's data is for Colorado; Wilken and Callahan's is for Iowa; Odden and Vincent surveyed four states -- Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington. Nationwide, Wilken and Callahan report the impact of decline on school finance seems to be minimal (1978:259):

> Between 1972 and 1976, public school enrollment fell about 4.5 percent. Public school expenditures, in contrast, went up 56.0 percent when measured on a total dollar basis and by 62.4 percent when normed by average daily attendance. Using states as the unit of observation, the association between changes in enrollment and changes in expenditures is next to nil. States with declining enrollment exhibited virtually the same percentage increase in per student expenditures as states with rising enrollment. While frustrating to some, the lack of a one-to-one correspondence between changes in enrollment and the movement of school expenditures has been the result of at least four influences: rising prices; rising professional employment; fixed charges; and service delivery methods.

Certain categories of costs do go up, on a per pupil basis, with declining enrollment. These include: instructional and administrative staff (Hickrod, 1976; Odden and Vincent, 1978) and plant maintenance and fixed charges (Odden and Vincent, 1978). Declining enrollments per se then do not decrease costs until and unless they precipitate cut-backs in plant and staff. Whether such cut-backs are going to be made depends on the level of fiscal strain on a district introduced by enrollment decline. The level of strain depends, in part, on state aid formulas and on coincidental changes in district wealth, assuming assessments and tax rates remain constant. In short, despite a wealth of data, it is difficult to disentangle the fiscal effects of enrollment decline, specifically from the effects of other correlative factors.

How Are Declining Districts Different From Growing Districts in Their Organizational Demography?

We borrow the term "organizational demography" from Freeman and Hannan (1981). It refers to staff composition characteristics including, in our use of the term, the following: median age of staff; average salary per district; teacher pupil ratios; and administrator-teacher ratios.

(a) Median Age. Dembowski (1979:40) found that in his nationwide sample a greater proportion of declining districts report that the median age of the staff has increased. Similar findings at the state level were found in Hickrod (1976) for Illinois, and Rodekohr (1976) for Colorado.

(b) Average Teacher Salary. In Illinois, Hickrod (1976) found that, even when district wealth was controlled, declining enrollment districts which had reduced staff had higher average salary levels than did growing or stable districts. On the other hand, Odden and Vincent (1978) found that for Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington, average teacher salary in declining districts was not above statewide averages.

(c) Pupil-Teacher Ratios. As would be expected, pupil-teacher ratios are lower in declining districts and lowest in those districts declining most rapidly (Hickrod, 1976; Odden and Vincent, 1978; Rodekohr, 1976).

(d) Ratio of Teachers to Administrators. There is consistent evidence that as staff is reduced a greater proportion of teachers than administrators are let go; lower teacher to administrator ratios seem to distinguish declining from growing districts. Freeman and Hannan (1981) found this to be the case for New York and California, while Hickrod (1976) found a similar pattern in Illinois and noted that, while the teaching force has been reduced in declining and stable enrollment suburban school districts, the absolute number of administrators actually increased in each of those types of community (p. 19). Odden and Vincent's (1978) four-state -- Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington -- survey found that (p. 229):

> [Due to decline] ...the increase in administrative expenditures per pupil, on a percent-increase basis, significantly exceed those for instructional expenditures per pupil. Thus while expenditures per pupil on teachers and instructional resources have increased in those declining enrollment districts, the increases have been even more pronounced, on a percentage basis, for administrative expenses... Data were not available to determine why administrative expenditure increases were greater than instruction expenditure increases.

Wilken and Callahan (1978), using Iowa data, report (p. 290):

> Between 1971 and 1975, Iowa school districts increased their employment of educational professionals from 40,808 to 41,277, a growth rate of slightly over 1 percent. And more striking, they expanded their employment of non-professional staff from 13,718 to 14,302, an increase of more than 4 percent. These employment trends, coupled with the state's declining enrollment, have brought about a significant improvement in school district staffing ratios. Staffing ratios for classroom teachers, however, have improved much less than staffing ratios for administrators, non-classroom professionals, and clerical staff... Between 1971 and 1975, for example, the statewide staffing ratio for classroom teachers improved by 5.5 percent while the staffing ratios for clerical personnel and administrators improved by 12.2 percent and 16.2 percent, respectively. Staffing ratios for classroom teachers have improved most in the Iowa school districts with the greatest enrollment loss.

Since, typically, there is data about staff reductions, but no studies (that we have found) about the processes of reducing staff, we don't know precisely why and how this change in staffing ratios is happening. The literature offers three sorts of explanations. For example, Hickrod (1976:38) writes:

> We have no strong a priori reason for believing that districts should reduce their administrators proportionately as teachers are reduced. A good case can be made that the reduction of administrators should be lagged. After all, closing schools and reducing staffs are administrative tasks, painful tasks, but, nevertheless, administrative tasks. [Emphasis in original.] /34

Wilken and Callahan (1978:300) note that:

> Enrollment decline is now being addressed in several states. While many states allow administrators to maintain their tenure as instructional employees, their seniority as classroom teachers ceases to accumulate after leaving the classroom. Yet, some observers now feel that if an administrator may re-enter as a senior classroom teacher, he or she may be more inclined to accept the change of job status. Thus, there will be less incentive to specifically protect administrators in a reduction in force.

---

[34] It would be tempting to speculate that if districts were to follow all of the recommendations about planning that are contained in the advice literature reviewed in Section 3.3.2, above, their administrative component would have to grow even as the teaching force is being reduced.

Freeman and Hannan (1981) recognize that (p. 8):

> Institutional constraints too apply alike to growing and dwindling operations. Rules that require the presence of specialized staff in school districts (for example, budget officers, affirmative action specialists) do not exempt districts whose enrollments are declining.

but then note (p. 16):

> If one component [the teaching as opposed to the administrative force] adjusts faster [to declining enrollment] than others, it is probably because organizations have developed ways of easily manipulating the size of the population involved.

And, hence, consequently (p. 16 also):

> Ease of manipulation may have more to do with the fortunes of such a component than its role in the organization's technology. So when armies experience budget cuts, they frequently cut combat units rather than staff units. The combat units are standardized and therefore simple to rebuild. The same is true of classroom teachers.

4.2.3 Patterns of Service Delivery

What Differences are There Between Growing and Declining Districts in Their Range of Programs?

There is some evidence that declining enrollment districts are distinguished from growing districts by student enrollment in a narrower range of programs, especially at the high school level (Dembowski, et al., 1979) and by a reported inability, especially in rural areas, to operate a "comprehensive and quality program" (Rodekohr, 1976).[35] Dembowski found that as overall school enrollments decline, so do enrollments in particular courses of study, especially foreign languages, the arts and social studies. But, the same general pattern was true of all districts in his sample. The safest generalizations that can be offered are these:

- Declining enrollments are associated with the reduction of course offerings in electives but not in the core

---

[35] The effect of enrollment declines on a single high district's ability to maintain its range of programs is also documented in the case study by Morgan and Wofford (1977).

curriculum.

- Only course offerings in foreign languages, agricultural education, and driver education were consistently jeopardized by declining enrollments and only then in districts which experienced a decline of 20 percent or more.
- Staff and faculty allocations followed these shifts in the range of course offerings.

It is not clear whether these courses were dropped because: (i) teachers assigned to it lost their jobs; (ii) the courses were underenrolled due to a general decline in enrollment or due to changes in the educational climate or pupils; or (iii) courses were dropped in order to achieve a cost-reduction motivated by enrollment decline or some other source of fiscal strain.

Despite the overall lack of definite evidence in the literature, Dembowski (and Wilken and Callahan) did find that special and compensatory education services were not decreased in declining enrollment districts.

4.2.4 Decline: Opportunity or Problem

Some of the literature reviewed in Section 3.2, above, anticipated that declining enrollments may induce school districts to be more cost-effective if they were to adopt creative management practices. The fiscal impact evidence summarized in Section 4.2.2, above, showed that while enrollment decline is not universally debilitating, no district has managed to decrease its per-pupil expenditure in the face of enrollment decline. That is not the issue which concerns us here. Instead, what follows is a summary of the evidence about whether declining districts are more or less likely to engage in some of the management practices which are said to provide opportunities for either mitigating the effects of decline or turning it around as a force for institutional renewal and improvement. These include: changes in supervisory practices, change in hiring practices, early retirement, in-service training, program innovations, and interdistrict sharing and pooling of resources.

Are Declining Districts Different From Other Districts In Their Supervisory and Personnel Management Practices?

The short, but far from simple, answer is "not much different."

(a) Supervisory Practices in General. As is often the case, there is no objective baseline data against which (the exception being the fiscal impact studies) any putative effects of enrollment decline can be measured. ASCD's (1980) interviews with school leaders in 16 districts nationwide found no changes in the supervisory practices of declining districts.

(b) Personnel Management and Hiring Practices. Once again, Dembowski, et al. (1979), provides the best clues on this topic. There appears to be no difference between growing and declining districts with respect to in-service; a majority of both are providing such training. All school districts regardless of enrollment trends have increased the use of part-time staffing. A higher percentage of declining districts hire teachers with certification in two or more subject areas, but a majority of both growing and declining districts have made no changes in the type of certification required. (Rodekohr, 1976, however, found just the opposite for his sample of Colorado school districts.)

(c) Early Retirement. Spot data about early retirement practices can be found throughout the literature (please see the topical index to our annotated bibliography). Dembowski, once again, provides the only attempt to correlate the incidence of early retirement policies with levels of enrollment. He found that the majority of school districts, whether growing or declining, indicated no change in their retirement policy. Of those that did indicate a change, a significantly greater proportion of declining as opposed to growing districts adopted early retirement.

Are Declining Districts Different From Other Districts in Their Program Innovation Practices?

This is a "hot" issue in the literature. The "optimists" see decline as an opportunity (or a spur) to innovate. The "pessimists" fear that it is the newest, most innovative programs which are likely to get cut. Some support for the latter is given in Dembowski's data about the effect of enrollment decline on electives offered in the fine arts, foreign languages, and science. Inferentially, it is assumed that: (i) as districts lose discretionary monies they lose the material means (and material incentive) to innovate; and (ii) as a result of hiring freezes, or RIF by seniority, schools

become filled with an aging teaching force and that this will mean less innovation. Much of this debate remains inconclusive, in part, because what is "innovative" remains operationally undefined.

But, there are certain practices which, on their face, are commonly acknowledged to be innovative, even though the meaning of innovation is not exhausted by a mere laundry list of such practices. In any case, such practices include: alternative education, computer-assisted instruction, individualized instruction, replacement of materials, and team teaching. The primary, indeed the only, nationwide data on these practices as correlated to enrollment trends is Dembowski, et al. (1979). Therefore, unless otherwise noted, all data cited come from that source. The findings are as follows.

(a) Team Teaching. A majority, over 60 percent of all of Dembowski's 94 school districts, report using team teaching. No difference was discovered between growing and declining districts.

(b) Individualized Instruction. Most districts, growing and declining, report use of individualized instruction. But compared to the sample of districts as a whole, a slightly higher percentage (still a minority) of declining districts do not use individualized instruction.

(c) Alternative Education. Although used by over half the districts, declining districts are more likely (71 percent) than growing districts (57 percent) to have alternative education programs. Districts with the severest declines show the highest likelihood of using alternative education.

(d) Computer Assisted Instruction (CAI). Most do not use CAI, however a significantly greater proportion of declining districts report use of computer assisted instruction.

(e) Materials Replacement Cycles. This is an interesting and subtle measure of not only degree of innovation (using new texts and materials is part of what could be called innovation), but also of the fiscal impact of enrollment decline. Although Dembowski did not explicitly treat it as such, replacement cycle can be used as a surrogate measure of fiscal impact -- a better measure, we believe, than gross data about per pupil expenditures because it focuses on the behavioral consequences (ordering or postponing the ordering of new materials) of declining enrollment. On this indicator,

Dembowski identified significant differences between growing and declining districts: 63 percent of the increasing enrollment districts responded that they have shortened their materials replacement cycle, while only 32 percent of the declining districts have shortened their cycle.

Has Program Quality Deteriorated in Declining School Districts?

There are three sorts of answers to this question. One, do school officials in declining districts feel that their program has deteriorated? Rodekohr's (1976) respondents answered, "yes, it has" (again, Rodekohr's study was limited to 73 Colorado districts), although large (a minority of the sample) declining districts felt it had not. Wilken and Callahan's (1978) survey of 55 Iowa school districts revealed that a slight majority (53 percent) felt that enrollment decline had a minimal impact on program quality.

A second approach to this question compares respondents' perceptions of program quality in growing and declining districts. Such comparisons are offered in Wilken and Callahan (1978), and in Dembowski, et al. (1979). The former surveyed both growing and declining Iowa school districts and asked respondents to identify what programs and services had deteriorated as a result of enrollment change (increase or decrease), and conclude (pp. 293-295):

> ...perceptions about the impact of enrollment change on the quality of specific services are very similar in decreasing and increasing enrollment school districts. Respondents in school districts with increasing enrollment think that educational services have been deteriorating most rapidly in the same areas cited by respondents in school districts with decreasing enrollment. [Emphasis in original.]

Dembowski, operating with a larger nationwide sample and finer distinctions of rate of enrollment decline, did, however, find interesting differences in perception of program quality change. His findings can be summarized as follows (pp. 43-44):

(a) A majority of both growing (71 percent) and declining (52 percent) districts reported no change in program quality.

(b) Of those districts, both growing and declining, which

did report a change in program quality (29 percent and 45 percent recpectively), a majority in each case report an increase in quality (29 and 38 percent respectively).

(c) More declining (45 percent) than growing (29 percent) districts reported some change in program quality either for the better or worse.

(d) A higher percentage of declining (38 percent) than growing (26 percent) districts report an increase in program quality.

(e) A slightly higher percentage of declining districts (7 percent) than growing districts (3 percent) report a decrease in program quality.

(f) The greater the rate of decline, the more likely it is that a district will report a decrease in program quality.

In short, severe enrollment decline is accompanied by perceptions of deteriorating program quality. In a later commentary on and summary of these findings (Dembowski and Gay, 1980:179), the authors conclude:

> The districts that were greatly affected by enrollment declines reported that the quality of their educational program deteriorated the most. Our evidence suggests that if school districts experience slight declines in student enrollment, the quality of the educational program may be increased because it is not necessary to reduce teacher staff or sell buildings. In fact, the enrollment declines offer opportunities to lower pupil-teacher ratio, and allocate extra space to worthy programs. However, as the pinch of declining enrollments is felt financially through reductions in state aid, which is based on the number of pupils, more stringent measures become necessary.

A third approach to the quality of the program issue is to look at objective output data rather than self-reported perceptions of quality change. Two objective, albeit crude, output indicators are pupil achievement data and pupil attainment data. Rodekohr (1976:24), using Colorado data for the early 1970's, found that declining districts had significantly lower drop-out rates and higher achievement scores. Dembowski did not survey achievement data, but did find that: the drop-out rate had increased for a greater percentage of the declining districts (26 percent) than for growing

districts; 42 percent of growing districts reported a decrease in the number of drop-outs while 28 percent of declining districts reported an increase in drop-outs; and 42 percent of growing districts and 47 percent of declining districts reported no change in their drop-out ratio.

4.2.5 Retrenchment Decisionmaking

The evidence summarized below comes primarily, but not exclusively, from case data. As such, it does not lend itself to any comparative inferences about what is different about declining districts (such "differences" providing clues as to what needs to be explained rather than firm conclusions about the putative impact of enrollment decline[35]). This literature on retrenchment decisionmaking is characterized not only by a dominance by one genre -- the case study -- but also by a predominant topical focus on school closure, especially the politics and impact of closure, and with community involvement in this issue. We will begin with the latter.

Do Task Forces and Citizens' Advisory Committees Build Districtwide Loyalty and Thereby Ease the Pain of Retrenchment?

This is a loaded question. It is derived from the advice literature which is united in urging school leaders who are faced with retrenchment "not to do it alone." And, as we saw in the case of Sieradski (1975) and Eisenberger (1977), the literature has placed great emphasis on the utility of community task forces, when properly constituted, as vehicles through which the community not only becomes involved but transcends its parochial, special interests.

---

[35] As noted previously, we found no comparable survey of the impact of fiscal decline. In fact, the concept of fiscal decline presents some problems of measurement. Does fiscal decline mean an absolute decrease in revenues in nominal dollars, in real constant dollars; or does it mean a decrease in the rate of growth of school revenues either in nominal or real dollars; or can it mean school leaders' anticipation that the level of community support for additional expenditures is decreasing. The latter, via the "law of anticipated reactions" can, phenomenologically speaking, create fiscal constraints, i.e., cut-back decisions such as RIF and school closure which are as real as and are indistinguishable from the impacts of enrollment declines and spending caps.

This claim has never been subjected to an empirical test in the decline literature, or elsewhere.[36] Indirect inferences, however, can be drawn from Nuttall's (1976) study of value conflicts and coalition building processes in one citizens committee dealing with school closure and from Morgan and Wofford's (1977) case history of participatory planning in one single high school district. In both cases, the practical conclusions are similar: participants do not leave their special interests at the door; the group process does lead to coalition building (and hence towards consensus) but participants coalesce around shared and concrete rather than transcendent interests; and, it may be that the very process of participating leads participants to see their separate interests more clearly and assert them more vigorously.

These have to be taken as speculative conclusions. And, whether this is a problem depends on one's notion of community involvement. That notion, in turn, depends in part on one's reading of democracy. On some accounts, the process of interest articulation, even though it creates rather than resolves conflict (and gets messy), is healthy and is in fact a necessary stage through which public policy decisions, especially painful retrenchment decisions, are legitimated through the democratic process. Whether all of this "messiness" is functional for retrenchment planning and decisionmaking depends, in turn, upon one's image of the school: is it simply a rational-purposive organization whose delivery of services, and hence its decisionmaking, is governed by technical-rational criteria; or is the school seen as a "polity", a community of separate interests in which what is

---

[36] A fair amount of literature on advisory committees and task forces exists apart from the topic of decline. Much of it has been reviewed in several reports published by the Institute for Responsive Education, which has also produced this report. Readers are directed to Davies and Zerchykov, Citizen Participation in Education: An Annotated Bibliography (1978), Sections 10 and 77 (an updated bibliography is An Annotated Bibliography of the Literature on Citizens' Advisory Councils and Committees, Rurban Education Development Laboratory, University of Illinois at Urbana, 1979), and Zerchykov, et al., Leading the Way: A Study of State Mandates for School Councils (1980). A large portion of the literature is anecdotal, inspirational, or narrowly focused on either the internal group processes of councils or the extent to which such groups fulfill their mandated functions.

"rational" is itself subject to interest group and value contests. This is the issue first raised in Section 3.1.4 "Is Decline an Opportunity or a Problem?" above. We will return to it in Section 5.3, below.

What Criteria Govern School Closure Decisions?

Whether a school system is simply a "rational-purposive" organization or a "polity" is, in part, a meta-empirical question. (Implicit is the value question of what a school should be.) Case-data about school systems' behaviors in closing schools, however, provide some fragmentary clues about the political (as opposed to technical) nature of school closure decision-making.

In brief, the very tentative answers to the question which provides the sub-heading of this section ("What criteria govern school closure decisions?") are:

- Closure decisions are based on a trade-off between technical and political criteria (Bornstein, 1978; Boyd, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979);
- By decisionmaking processes not yet fully documented in the literature, the final decision is apt to be based on very few criteria (Andrews, 1974; Boyd, 1979; Cuban, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979; Lexington, 1977) despite the very long lists offered for consideration in the advice literature and reflected in local district task force reports recommending board policies on school closure;
- One commonly involved and decisive criterion is school "location" whether location is defined in terms of walking distance to the nearest receiving school (Colton and Frelich, 1979; Yeager, 1979), or preservation of the neighborhood school concept (Colton and Frelich, 1979), or the existence of political weaknesses in neighborhoods (Bornstein, 1978; Colton and Frelich, 1979) or neighborhood political strength (Boyd, 1979); and
- In addition to these geographic considerations other key criteria are size -- the smaller the school the more likely it is to be closed, and age -- the older the building the

more likely it is to be closed.

What is the Impact of School Closure on Students?

Minimizing disruption for pupils (as opposed to "quality of educational program") is rarely cited (please see Section 3.2.2, above) as a suggested specific or weighted factor in lists of criteria for school closings. From what little data there is, there may be good reasons for this omission. Richards and Cohen (1981) and Eismann (1976) found no adverse effects of school closure on pupil achievement. Richards and Cohen (1981) did find that closure produced anxiety in elementary school children, but this anxiety was short-lived. Parks (1980) found that high school closure may have precipitated adolescents' decisions to drop-out, but the design and sample do not warrant any generalization of that finding.

What is the Impact of School Closure on Communities?

This remains an unanswered and perhaps unanswerable question. Of all of the literature reviewed, only Eismann, et al. (1976), attempted to systematically guage the community impact of school closing. His difficulty in measuring the impact of closure and inability to draw conclusions generalizable even to school closures in Seattle, the site of the study, suggests that the fear of adverse community impact may be unfounded.

Notwithstanding this difficulty and the spotty data about community impact, "what is known" on this topic may be summarized as follows:

EVIDENCE	SITE	REFERENCE
Residents think that neighborhoods will decline as a result of school closure. Businessmen are more convinced than residents that neighborhoods will decline.	Seattle, 4 schools closed.	Eismann, et al., (1976).
10 percent of neighborhood residents with school age children cite proximity of school as a primary reason for their choice of residence.		
Crimes against property did not increase after closure.		
There was evidence of higher property turnover in closure neighborhoods but assessed real estate values were unaffected. Turnover rate change was		

EVIDENCE (continued)	SITE	REFERENCE
limited to three blocks from the closed school.	Seattle, 4 schools closed.	Eismann, et al., (1976).
In all four closure cases there was no increase in vandalism against school property; in one case vandalism decreased.		
Vandalism was significantly less and neighborhood quality of life was perceived to be higher when closed schools are used by other public and private agencies.	New York City, 6 closed schools.	Amlung (1980)
Voters in closure neighborhoods did not differ in school levy election support from voters in non-closure neighborhoods.	Seattle, 4 closed schools.	Eismann, et al., (1976)
Parents in closed school neighborhoods were not more likely to send their children to private schools, after closure, than were parents in other neighborhoods.	Arlington, Virginia, 4 closed schools.	Cuban, (1979)

What Is the Political Fallout of Retrenchment Decisions?

Once again, the data is sparse. And, some kinds of retrenchment decisions -- RIF and program cuts -- have not been studied as decisionmaking processes. Once again, it is the case literature on school closure which provides clues as to the political fallout of decisions made in response to decline.[37]

A "test" of the assumption that cut-back decisions heighten levels of

---

[37] On this, as on many other topics, what is not known is perhaps more interesting and significant than what is known. For example: is there any connection between rates of enrollment decline and superintendent and school board turnover? Is the latter due to election loss or "retirement"? Is there any correlation between enrollment decline and school levy election support and/or turnout rates? These and other questions need to be answered before one can say, with confidence, that as enrollment drops, community support for school spending decreases leading to fiscal strain which necessitates cut-back decisions whose consequences "feed-back" into either (i) community rallying to save education, or (ii) further alienation leading to lower levels of support leading to additional fiscal strain.

conflict should be forthcoming from Boyd's (1979) ongoing case study of eight suburban Chicago school districts. That data may also illuminate Stefonek's (1979) suggestion that school closure, in particular, is profoundly de-legitimating, breaking an implicit "social contract" between the school board and the parents/taxpayers in the school attendance area. Boyd makes a similar claim. Citing Wilson's aphorism that "the politics of scarcity is the politics of conflict," [38] he suggests that (p. 331):

> ...the important point...is whether policies are perceived to involve clear winners and losers...the concentrated costs of school closing upon particular neighborhoods which clearly are the losers in the policymaking game, ordinarily will produce a much more intense public participation and opposition, at least in those particular neighborhoods, than will the distributed costs of across-the-board cuts in teaching personnel throughout the school district.

In further comparing across-the-board benefits (and cuts) with specific benefits, Boyd predicts (p. 351):

> Public education is a collective good (although parents have more an interest in it than nonparents) and its provision is possible only through compulsory taxation. A standard class size across a school district also has the characteristic of a collective good and is not likely to motivate specific groups of citizens to take political action (though it will be of keen interest to teachers). But whether to operate a specific neighborhood school is an issue involving a separable good with clear incentives for the political mobilization of specific groups.

Considering that Boyd's is a study-in-progress, the above statements have to be treated as working hypotheses rather than conclusions.

In the meantime, however, the little evidence that does exist can best be summarized (since it does not really "add up") in the following inventory of findings, inferences, and working hypotheses.

FINDINGS	SITE/DATA BASE	REFERENCE
Parental satisfaction, as shown in an opinion poll, did not change after school closure. If anything,	Arlington, Virginia	Cuban, 1979

[38] John Q. Wilson, Political Organizations (New York: Basic Books, 1973).

FINDINGS	SITE/DATA BASE	REFERENCES
there was a slight decrease in satisfaction.	Arlington, Virginia (cont'd.)	Cuban, 1979
The percentage of the community holding the opinion that educational quality has declined is higher in school closure neighborhoods than in non-closure neighborhoods.	Seattle, Washington	Eismann, et al., 1976
School levy election results showed no increase in community negative voting after closure of that community's school.	Seattle, Washington	Eismann, et al., 1976
School board members involved in contested school closure decisions tend not to be re-elected.	12 suburban New Jersey school districts	Bornstein, 1978

INFERENCES	SITE/DATA BASE	REFERENCES
Focus on "educational quality" as opposed to cost-efficiency and/or physical plant characteristics criteria, leads to more, rather than less, conflict.	9 rural Illinois school districts	Burlingame, 1978
	8 suburban Chicago school districts	Boyd, 1979
	Champaign, Illinois	Yeager, 1979
In school closure, an explicit policy and practice of preserving the sanctity of the neighborhood school defuses opposition and obviates the need for community involvement.	St. Louis, 37 school closure decisions.	Colton and Frelich, 1979
Participatory planning mechanisms do not transcend special interests.	Single case, Lincoln-Sudbury, Massachusetts	Morgan and Wofford, 1977
	Single case, unidentified	Nuttall, 1976
Process of participation may, in fact, crystallize special interest perspectives (i.e., such mechanisms as task forces, planning committees, <u>if</u> broadly representative, may serve to "articulate" rather than "aggregate" interests).	Single case, unidentified	Nuttall, 1976
	Single case	Morgan and Wofford, 1976

INFERENCES (continued)	SITE/DATA BASE	REFERENCES
The goal of reducing specific costs does not mobilize community support, interests or consensus (opposed to the more abstract goal of cutting costs per se).	Opinion poll, Lincoln-Sudbury	Morgan and Wofford, 1976

WORKING HYPOTHESES	SITE/DATA BASE	REFERENCES
Closing schools will mobilize more community opposition than will decisions to RIF or cut programs across-the-board.	8 suburban Chicago school districts	Boyd, 1979
Retrenchment decisionmaking will result in more conflict in affluent white-collar communities, with an ethos of public interested community involvement and a high value on rational policymaking, than it will in less affluent communities with a partisan-patronage political culture.[39]	" "	" "
Conflict over retrenchment decisions, serves to de-legitimize the technical rationality of school management and leads to a decreased "trust in experts and the symbols of their knowledge."	----------	" "

As we have said before in other circumstances, the literature reviewed above could be more aptly described as a kaleidoscope of information than a pattern of evidence on this topic. Data so far only confirms the aphorism that "all politics is local politics."[40] There is also evidence that contextual factors

---

[39] We will discuss the warrant for this particular hypothesis more fully in Section 5.2, below.

[40] This is especially true since the findings, inferences, and hypothesis just offered do in some cases contradict the professional consensus on how to manage the politics of retrenchment. And, yet, that consensus, the "craft-lore" also has an empirical basis -- it should be stressed that the "craft-lore" has not been created out of whole cloth, but is based on personal experience.

-- district size and type -- produce differential effects when enrollment decline does occur. These contextual factors also limit, in obvious and not so obvious ways, the range of options available to managers of decline.

4.2.6 Contextual Factors

District type and district size have obvious and testable implications for district behavior. Our interest in these "background variables" in this section, however, is limited to evidence which: (i) qualifies the generalizable differences, discovered in the survey data, between growing and declining districts, and (ii) shows how district characteristics limit school managers' ability to act upon some of the advice offered in the craftlore literature. Our summary review of that kind of evidence focuses on the "effects" of: district size (large vs. small, as defined in the references cited); rural vs. urban; and district SES and correlative indicators such as high vs. low property wealth. These are, of course, gross categories and in some cases (Boyd (1979), for example) district SES is described impressionistically in the reference cited.

What is the Difference Between Large and Small Districts' Experience with Decline?

In Section 4.2.1, above, we saw the general differences between growing and declining districts. But, what, if any, differences are there between declining small districts and declining large districts? Rodekohr (1976) found that large districts are more likely to have more innovative programs than small districts. Dembowski, et al. (1979), compared large (N = 49) and small districts (N = 46) and found that the latter are less likely to institute early retirement, are less likely to use alternative education and computer assisted instruction, and are more likely to have lengthened their materials replacement cycle. But these comparisons were made for both growing and declining districts. Twenty of Dembowski's 46 small districts were growing or stable; 23 of his large districts (10,000 pupils and over) were growing or stable (p. 31). Dembowski's data, therefore, does not tell us about the differential impact of decline on different size districts.

Do Different Types of Districts Respond Differently to Decline?

"Type" as we are using it here refers to two dimensions: urban vs. rural vs. suburban; and SES, whether defined in assessed property wealth, median income, or more impressionistically, as predominantly either white-collar or blue-collar.

Urban vs. Rural vs. Suburban. For the practical purposes of our report, this difference is interesting only insofar as much of the craftlore advice is derived from and may only be applicable to the suburban experience. Hence (for example) Rodekohr's (1976) finding that rural declining districts are less likely to have innovative programs and are facing reported difficulties in maintaining a comprehensive program is "interesting" in that local district managers can draw few practical implications from that conclusion. (State education managers can, of course, conclude that this conclusion demonstrates the need for more district consolidation.)

Eisenberger (1974), it will be remembered, urged school managers to recognize that "there are no loyal districtwide supporters, only loyal school supporters." Colton and Frelich (1979) and Burlingame (1979) suggest (there are no hard, generalizable data about the differential attachments to school vs. districts in different types of communities) that Eisenberger's dictum hold a fortiori in urban and rural contexts. In both cases, the neighborhood school or the "town" or township high school, respectively, holds a symbolic importance unmatched in suburban contexts.

Colton and Frelich (1979) suggest an even more important feature of urban school districts: the dysfunctions produced by large-scale bureaucratic structures. The advice literature repeatedly stresses the importance of accurate information in local district planning. Colton and Frelich, however, point out that of necessity, large urban school districts are apt to be more bureaucratic and then suggest (1979:397):

> Several features of bureaucracy merit note. One is specialization. Unless there is a special inter-office arrangement for school closings, it seems probably that the building department, the curriculum and instruction department, the finance department, the management department, and the transportation department may approach the problem of closings differently. And they may not know it. A second feature is rules. In the case of school

> closings, rules pertaining to pupil/teacher ratios, building capacity, attendance areas, and special programming may be particularly pertinent -- whether functional or not. Third, there is hierarchy. Information will flow up and down the hierarchy, and responsibility may be lodged at one point, many points, or no point at all within the hierarchy.

Where a district's retrenchment decisions require that "accurate" data about school site conditions (in the St. Louis case -- excess capacity) be forthcoming from the lower ranks of the hierarchy, these bureaucratic distortions come into full play. In St. Louis, Colton and Frelich (1979:415) found that:

> ...Principals...far down in the hierarchy were able to manipulate data on building utilization. To them excess space is an asset not a liability...decision rules are often made far down in the hierarchy and an important determinant of these rules is the lower level bureaucrats' definition of the situation.

Socio-Economic Status. It stands to reason that community SES will affect school system ability to absorb whatever diseconomies of decreased scale are accompanied by enrollment decline. Wilken and Callahan (1978) found that those Iowa districts which had declining enrollments also had lower tax rates and higher total school revenue than the state average, suggesting that there was no fiscal strain accompanying decline. This was, no doubt, due to the fact that those same districts were "property wealthy." Hickrod's (1976:36) survey of Illinois school districts found that (for declining districts) an inverse relationship exists between the percentage of families residing in those districts with incomes over $15,000 and numbers of RIF'd teachers. That is, given equal rates of decline, wealthier districts lay off fewer staff.

None of this is surprising. It lends support to our earlier argument, as yet admittedly speculative, that the problem of enrollment decline is really "simply" a problem of money, and rich and poor districts are likely to have different threshholds at which the money problems force action in order to reduce excess capacity.

What is surprising, however, is Boyd's (1979:362) working hypothesis that "...conflict levels associated with decline and especially school closing, will be as high and perhaps higher in higher status districts than they

will be in lower status districts." Politically, therefore, if Boyd proves to be correct, higher status districts, irrespective of their wealth, will have a much more difficult time in making retrenchment decisions as they adjust to decline.

Boyd arrives at this hypothesis via two arguments. One, lower-status districts are more used to scarcity (when they were growing; growth produced a greater fiscal strain upon them). Two, he found a correlation between decisionmaking styles and community SES. High status communities placed greater value on professional expertise, on objective, technically rational bases for policymaking, and on non-partisan, consensual methods of decision-making. Lower status communities, even though school board elections were nominally non-partisan, were likely to subject school policies to the rough and tumble of interest group politics. The latter represents a "private regarding" political ethos; the former a "public regarding" political ethos.[41] Boyd (1979:346-347) draws the distinction as follows:

> ...the public regarding political culture emphasizes [such values] as "good government," efficiency, and the disinterested support of the broad public interest. By contrast, the private regarding which is associated with "machine" politics, seeks personal benefits and favors from the political system and identifies with the ward or neighborhood rather than the community as a whole. While the private regarding culture recognizes the legitimacy of competition and conflict between groups concerned with narrow and special interests, the public regarding culture takes the view that politics, rather than being a struggle among partial and private interests, is (or at any rate ought to be) a disinterested effort to discover what is best for the community as a whole.

Three, Boyd then suggests that much retrenchment decisionmaking, while done in the name of the public interest, will inevitably affect some of the public's interests more adversely than others and that this strains the political system of high status, "public regarding" communities more than it does the lower status, "private regarding" communities (where conflict and competition and bargaining between "special" interests is taken to be normal). This leads Boyd to suggest, as a working hypotheses, that (1979:263):

---

[41] These classic terms were first coined by E. Banfeld and J. Q. Wilson, City Politics (New York: Vintage, 1963).

The rational-consensual (public regarding) policymaking orientation, which tends to be prevalent in higher status districts may be less well suited for dealing with redistributive issues, for example, in seeking and striking compromises, than the more "political" (private regarding) policymaking orientation prevalent in lower status districts.

We will discuss the steps in Boyd's argument in more detail in Section 5.0, below, when we return to a final discussion of the recurring tension between technical rationality and politics. For now, however, the argument can be summarized as follows:

HIGH-STATUS COMMUNITIES	LOW-STATUS COMMUNITIES
Public-regarding political ethos	Private-regarding political ethos
Policymaking is a rational consensual process consisting of disinterested efforts to discover what is best for the community as a whole.	Policymaking is politics, and politics is a conflict and competition between groups concerned with narrow and special interests.
Special interest group politics is "illegitimate" and is to be avoided.	Special interest politics is what policymaking is all about and is a game to be played rather than avoided.
Identification is with the district as a whole.	Identification is with the interests of the neighborhood.
Policy proposals are advanced in terms of what is most rational and what is best for the district as a whole.	Policy positions advanced by groups are seldom substantially developed or symbolically advanced in terms of "what's best" for the whole community.
Decisionmaking is by consensus.	Decisionmaking is by bargaining and compromise. School board members expect and receive requests for special treatment of special interests. Board members grant these requests in an effort to increase their political support.
Primary value is placed on educational program excellence districtwide.	Primary value is placed on the neighborhood school.
There is more deference to professional expertise.	There is less deference to professional expertise.
Superintendents are expected to be above the fray and play the role of expert and educational statesmen.	Superintendents act as bureaucratic interest group leaders, as politicians, and their expertise is but one of many political resources.

Boyd's claim is that public-regarding ethos (the pattern identified in the left-hand column) is more likely to be strained by decline and that communities with such an ethos will experience higher levels of conflict. When we return to a more detailed discussion of this thesis, in Section 5.3, below, we will draw out its implications vis-a-vis the professional consensus on how best to manage decline. As we shall see, that consensus presupposes the existence of a public-regarding political ethos.

5.0 TOWARDS AN INTEGRATION OF THEORY AND PRACTICE

After looking at the literature on decline from a number of angles, it seems that three topics -- equity, school closure, and political vs. technical rationality -- can best serve as integrative foci around which it may be possible to summarize the body of literature which, as we have seen, all but defies summary.

5.1 EQUITY

We have purposefully postponed our discussion of equity until now. This is not because the literature does not discuss equity issues. It does. Equity considerations -- special and compensatory education, desegregation, and affirmative action -- are recurring themes. Much has been written about the potentially adverse impact of decline upon equity initiatives. Exhortation to preserve such initiatives are especially prevalent. Our intent here is not to catalog all of these concerns. Rather, we will present a summary of the evidence, spotty as it is, on the impact of decline on special and compensatory education, school desegregation, and affirmative action. (As noted previously, there is yet to be a comprehensive study, comparable to Dembowski, et al., 1979, on the impact of decline on equity, the exception being Rosenberg and Vincent's (1978) effort to guage the impact of RIF on affirmative action.)

5.1.1 Special and Compensatory Education

Our literature searches turned up no studies particularly focused on this topic. However, data about the status of special and compensatory education in declining districts was gathered by Dembowski, et al. (1979), Hickrod (1976), and Wilken and Callahan (1978). In each case, there is good news: gains seem to have been held harmless even in the face of decline. Dembowski (p. 100) found that "while academic and arts curriculum courses are decreasing in declining enrollment districts, vocational, compensatory and special education are on the incline." Wilken and Callahan's

(1978) survey of 55 Iowa school districts found a similar pattern (p. 293):

> On the face of things, these data suggest that most schools adjust their services to declining enrollment in about the same way. Initial or deepest cuts are concentrated in services related to the maintenance, operation, and development of the capital plant. Secondary cuts occur in "auxiliary services" such as libraries, guidance, health programs, and community outreach. When economies are exhausted in this area, the next set of cuts home in on classroom instruction. Interestingly, however, most respondents view declining enrollment as causing a greater decline in the quality of classroom instruction overall than in the quality of most specific components. Finally, the last items to suffer from declining enrollment are psychological services and pupil transportation. We suspect, however, that the relative invulnerability of psychological is primarily a product of Iowa's efforts to make substantial improvement in special education and related services. [Emphasis not in original.]

Both Dembowski and Wilken and Callahan add that special pupil services capture a proportionately larger share of school districts' resources, as enrollments decline. Hickrod's (1976) survey of Illinois districts found that even districts with enrollment declines and reductions in general staff, found it necessary to add special education teachers and support staff (p. 14). Hickrod also found that as school districts, particularly urban school districts, lose enrollment and consolidate facilities, the concentrations of Title I "eligibles" have increased thereby enabling those declining districts to avail themselves of more Title I monies and services (pp. 37-38).

5.1.2 Desegregation

Demographers tell us that racial differences in fertility rates will mean that black and minority enrollments will be growing relative to white enrollments in urban school systems in which there is a coincidental decline in general enrollments and that this holds true even without further white out-migration from these areas (Davis and Lewis, 1977:3-4; Hickcox and Ryan, 1979:309). Many cities are involved in the coincidental processes of desegregation and facilities consolidation; e.g., St. Louis (Colton and Frelich, 1979); Cleveland (Fleming, 1980); San Jose (San Jose Schools, 1980); and Santa Barbara (Valencia, 1980). In formal policy, districts under court-ordered desegregation have to have their closure plans subject to

desegregation criteria. But what little data we have about the practice of consolidation paints a different picture.

Colton and Frelich's (1979) analysis of St. Louis school closures, over a nine-year period in which desegregation suits were in the courts (but before the court order was handed down), suggests the following (1979: 404-408 passim):

- Small branch schools, regardless of condition, were the first to be closed. Students were reassigned, by and large, to the nearest main sites -- in all cases larger, and older.
- The main sites closed were predominantly those attended by poor and minority students.
- Reassignment tended to produce no net gain in desegregation.
- The neighborhoods were characterized as being "abandoned."

Whether or not school closing accelerated abandonment is unstudied, either in the short term or long term, but the process, as described, was one of closing the schools behind fleeing black and poor families. Colton and Frelich are led to conclude this practice may not have been racially motivated. Instead what St. Louis presents is a classic case of the racially discriminatory consequences of seemingly racially neutral decision criteria. One key factor in St. Louis' policy on school closing was "walking distance" to the nearest school with the grade-level organization and the capacity to absorb students affected by school closure. Colton and Frelich note (1979: 407-408):

> That consideration helps explain why small facilities are closed, even though they may be new, such closings place less pressure on contiguous attendance zones... A further effect of the contiguous reassignment policy is that contiguous schools which are relatively far apart may not be closed -- even if utilization is low -- if distances that children would have to walk would be great... In St. Louis, the neighborhoods where schools are close together are the ones where schools were built in the 1950's and 1960's to house the sudden influx of poor (and often black) children. Thus, we can see why the older buildings in these areas are particularly susceptible to school closings and why so many of the closings affect poor and black neighborhoods.

Valencia's (1980) case study of a school closure controversy (the court case was Angeles et al. v. Santa Barbara School District et al.) argues that

when high school facilities were consolidated, the predominantly Anglo elementary schools, which were losing enrollment and had excess capacity, remained open while comparatively crowded, predominantly Hispanic schools were closed.

5.1.3 RIF and Affirmative Action

Much has been written on this topic yet little is known for sure. There is but one extant attempt to get measure of the impact of RIF on affirmative action gains and this attempt is described in two references (ECS, 1977; and Rosenberg and Vincent, 1978). The effort was thwarted by all but insuperable problems of measurement. Rosenberg and Vincent (1978: 380-381) note:

> It is difficult to get a clear picture of how retrenchment is expected to affect women and minorities. Data on teachers who are terminated or laid off are hard to obtain. National and statewide statistics are scanty, and terminological differences from state to state make comparisons difficult. In some cases, failure to renew the contracts of probationary or non-tenured teaching personnel is not labeled a termination or layoff, nor is failure to fill a position vacated by natural attrition. Termination is a term generally reserved for tenure teaching personnel. As a result, data on termination and layoffs represent only a fragment of total retrenchment in education employment. Efforts to determine who is bearing the burden of retrenchment by surveying state departments of education and state agencies of higher education have been unsuccessful. Most agencies do not break down retrenchment data by sex and race. Such information is politically and socially sensitive, and many agencies may be avoiding a volatile issue.

The available spot data is not encouraging. Hickrod's (1976) survey of Illinois school districts found that (p. 35):

> The best predictor of percentage reduction of teachers is the percentage of minority population present in the district population. The larger the minority population, the greater the reduction of teachers. This finding is hardly going to thrill civil rights groups. The second best predictor of percentage reduction of teachers is the property valuation of the districts.

New York City provides the most persuasive evidence that minorities in K-12 positions may be severely hurt by retrenchment. Between 1970-71 and 1973-74, the number of minority teachers increased 33.2%. However, now after retrenchment, minorities are 13% of the total teaching staff and comprise

40% of the teachers terminated and 27% of the regular substitutes not re-assigned (ECS, 1977:24). However, the literature, we have reviewed, cites three school districts which have, independent of any court order,[42] tempered the last hired/first fired RIF by seniority rule with provisions for holding-harmless (not extending) any affirmative action gains made in prior periods of growth. Such provisions typically provide for parallel seniority lists for majority and minority staff whereby reductions in force "hold harmless" a previous established level of affirmative action gains (Ann Arbor, Michigan, ECS, 1977:34; Bremerton, Washington, Downey, 1976:35; and also Johnson, 1978: 44) or maintain a level comparable to the percentage of minority persons in the student population (Lansing, Michigan, ECS, 1977:34). The Ann Arbor and Bremerton policies are collectively bargained agreements and as such are most likely to become a "norm" for non-court ordered reconciliations of seniority with the values of affirmative action.

5.2 SCHOOL CLOSURE: A FINAL LOOK

By way of a final review, we summarize and synthesize what "is suggested" with "what is known" about closing schools in Chart 5A, below. That chart contrasts statements from the advice literature with the available evidence. To repeat, the evidence is spotty. The contradictions between what school districts are advised to do are subject to a number of possible interpretations. That is, from the fact that there is case data evidence showing that some school districts do not follow suggested practice in school closure decisionmaking, it is not possible to say, with any confidence, whether: (i) the advice is faulty, or (ii) is not followed generally and/or cannot be followed, or (iii) whether these exceptions -- the case data about closure

---

[42] As noted in Section 3.3.2, above, Carr's (1980:4) review of the statute, case and constitutional law applicable to RIF shows that courts make frequent use of the criteria detailed in Singleton v. Jackson Municipal Seperate School District. According to the "Singleton" criteria, school districts under court-ordered desegregation are obligated to develop objective, non-discriminating standards prior to making staff reductions.

CHART 5A: SCHOOL CLOSURE: A SUMMARY OVERVIEW OF THEORY AND PRACTICE

HOW TO CLOSE SCHOOLS

ADVICE	EVIDENCE
Begin by conducting a districtwide facilities inventory using systematic standards of instructional space requirements. (Bishop, 1979:267; Pasnik, 1979:65)	Bureaucratic arrangements, hierarchical division of labor, and intra-organizational interests make it difficult for large urban school districts to get accurate facilities use data. "Principals were able to manipulate data on building utilization. To them excess space is an asset not a liability ...decision rules are often made far down in the hierarchy [and] an important determinant of these rules is the lower level bureaucrats' definition of the situation." (Colton and Frelich, 1979:415)
The process of school closure is a political act. "Two essential rules should guide it...[1] allow plenty of time, and [2] involve the community in planning for closings and in selecting choices to be made. Follow a two stage process, get support and acceptance for the necessity of closing schools and then discuss the specifics of which schools to close." (Sargent and Handy, 1974)	Local school district report literature reflects this advice in the policy proposal stage. Little data on implementation, however. Bornstein (1978), however, found that only 2 out of the 12 school closures studied, followed a protracted, two-stage process. Those that did, however, experienced less conflict.
Do not do it alone. Involve the community. Set up a broadly representative community task force which allows for community involvement which allows the public to achieve a districtwide perspective and transcend narrow special interests. (Eisenberger, 1977; Sieradski, 1975)	Once again formalized community involvement is reflected in the local school district reports, many of which are the products of the kinds of task forces proposed by the advice literature. Nuttall's (1976) data suggests that the task force/advisory committee experience does not lead to a transcendence of special interests. In fact, it may favor the articulation of such interests. A districtwide perspective does not come easily in retrenchment decisionmaking, in fact the opposite seems to happen. Even theoretical discussions of possible items to cut back create constituencies with a special interest in those threatened items. (Morgan and Wofford, 1977; Boyd, 1979)

CHART 5A: SCHOOL CLOSURE: A SUMMARY OVERVIEW OF THEORY AND PRACTICE (continued)

WHICH SCHOOLS TO CLOSE

ADVICE		EVIDENCE
Prepare a planned response, using a multiplicity of criteria. This advice is universally offered in the professional periodical and in the handbook literature.		Local district report literature reflects this advice. Nationwide survey data of 60 school districts showed that 66 percent used only one or two criteria; 75 percent only used three or four criteria. (Andrews, 1974)
In closing schools consider the following factors (this is a composite list, see Section 3.3.2, above).		Criteria actually used. Nationwide survey data: Andrews, 1974.
Location:	Neighborhood factors, changes in real estate values and patterns of investment. Walking distance and proximity to nearest school.	Most oft-cited criterion was "level of enrollment decrease" (74 percent). This was followed by "age of building" (47 percent). "Impact on educational programs" was mentioned by only 5 percent.
Building Characteristics:	School size School age Flexibility of physical plant Energy efficiency	School size makes a difference. There is a professional consensus on optimal size for elementary schools, 300 - 500 pupils.
		Criteria Actually Used: Case Data
Enrollment:	Rate of decrease in a given school Level of excess capacity Minimum enrollment necessary to provide a given range of services	"Level of enrollment decline" was often overridden by: "neighborhood" and "proximity to nearest school" factors (Colton and Frelich, 1979); school size and age (Colton and Frelich, 1979; Boyd, 1979; Cuban, 1979); and neighborhood political strength (Bornstein, 1978; Boyd, 1979).
Desegregation		The smaller and older schools tend to get closed (Colton and Frelich, 1979; Cuban, 1979), unless overridden by geo-political factors, i.e., neighborhood political strength (Boyd, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979).
Educational Program		Location: Schools tend to get closed in older decaying neighborhoods (Colton and Frelich, 1979). Geo-political considerations: Lack of neighborhood political strength (Bornstein, 1978) was associated with the closure of some schools which should have been kept open on comparative cost-efficiency criteria; neighborhood political strength (Boyd, 1979) and neighborhood SES (Colton and Frelich, 1979) kept open schools which would have been closed if level of enrollment decline was the determinant criterion.

decisionmaking practices -- establish or overturn the professional "rules" about good practice in closing schools. All that can be said is the following:

(a) School district decisionmakers seem to be consistently making trade-offs between political and technical considerations in school closure decisions.

(b) Final decisions seem to come down to one or two key factors, the most "key" factor often being school location.

(c) In formal policy, school location considerations take the form of "walking distance" measures and "proximity to nearest school." Researchers, however, have also found associations between school location and neighborhood SES and neighborhood political clout.

(d) When school location factors cancel each other out (all possible closure schools are equally distant from nearest other school, SES is comparable, neither neighborhood has any special political status), then school size and building age seem to be determinant. Therefore, all other things being equal, the older the school, and the smaller the school, the more likely it is to be closed.

5.3 PLANNING: TECHNICAL VS. POLITICAL RATIONALITY

The conflict between political and technical rationality looms large in discussions of decline and the issue is introduced at a number of levels. The cluster of works, discussed in Section 3.1.4, above, which deal with the question, "Is decline a problem or an opportunity?", all make assumptions about the necessity and the possibility of school districts engaging in rational planning as they respond to decline. We suggested that the debate between those who see an opportunity in decline and those less sanguine about the benefits of adversity rests on some deeper presuppositions about the nature of schools as complex formal organizations. Are schools best seen

as rational-purposive organizations in which decisionmaking responds to creative leadership and follows objective-technical processes? Or, are schools best seen as "polities," -- coalitions of internal and external interest groups -- whose decisionmaking procedures more closely approximate processes of interest group bargaining rather than objective fact-finding?

The two questions are posed sharply for analytical purposes. In point of fact, school decisionmaking processes are no doubt constituted by both objective fact-finding and interest group bargaining. This reality is recognized in that advice literature which reminds decisionmakers (most notably Sargent and Handy, 1974; Keough, 1978b; and Eisenberger, 1977) that dealing with decline is a "people problem" as well as a technical problem. The resolution of decline related issues, it is said, requires the involvement of people whose interests are to be affected by any retrenchment decision. Such involvement should, it is said, bring support for any such decision thereby maximizing its chances of implementation (Berman and McLaughlin, 1978; Dembowski, et al., 1979). Evidence on community involvement (Morgan and Wofford, 1977; Nuttall, 1976; and Yeager, 1979) suggests, however, that involvement does not necessarily bring support (Morgan and Wofford), does not necessarily reduce the level of conflict (Nuttall), and does not bring about a consensus on the facts even when a given district combines sophisticated fact-finding with broad participation (Yeager, see also Lexington, 1976).

The case data on school closure decisionmaking also suggests that schools' decision processes are an ineliminable mix of the political and the "rational." Trade-offs are made between technical, cost-efficiency and political criteria. The "facts" themselves, become subject to political debate (Boyd, 1979; Lexington, 1976; Yeager, 1979). Given high information costs, school district decisionmakers are more apt to "satisfice" rather than "optimize"[43] in their decisions about which schools to close (Colton and Frelich, 1979).

---

[43] The distinction between "satisficing" and "optimizing" decisionmaking behavior, was first made in: H.A. Simon, Models of Man (New York: Wiley, 1957).

The really interesting (and practical) question, therefore, is not "Do schools decide policy issues technically and objectively or politically?" but rather "What are the limits of technical-rational planning?" and "What is the implication of those limits for school districts' management of decline?"

Consideration of these two questions provides an integrative focus for one last summary discussion of the literature on managing decline. That summary will proceed as follows. First, we will review the major themes in the literature which stress the importance of technical-rational planning. Second, we will consider some limitations, inherent in the organizational structure of schooling, on the school's ability to engage in technical-rational planning. Third, we will review the arguments and the evidence for the claim that decline exacerbates those conditions which make it difficult for schools to plan and decide rationally. In so doing, we will pay special attention to Boyd's (1979) intriguing thesis that, when decline occurs, it is precisely those school districts which have the resources and the decisionmaking culture to engage in technical-rational planning who experience the most difficulty and the highest level of conflict in their responses to decline. Finally, we will put Boyd's thesis to work and use it as an interpretative framework for a closer look at one school district's decisionmaking processes as recorded in Morgan and Wofford (1977). That district's experiences, and more importantly, Morgan and Wofford's reflections on the experience (Morgan and Wofford were key participants in the processes they describe) provide a paradigmatic example of the management dilemmas involved in retrenchment decisionmaking.

5.3.1 The Necessity of Rational Planning

Running all through the professional literature on managing decline is a caveat against precipitous decisionmaking. This warning and its consequences is most poignantly expressed by Keough (1978b:351-352). His scenario bears repeating:

> Districts caught in a financial crunch have only a few possible alternatives: reduce staff and cut program, consolidate facilities, raise local taxes, or operate under deficit budgets. When

> deficit budgeting is illegal under state law, or tax increases are just not possible, the alternatives are reduced to making trade-offs between program and facilities. Given these basic alternatives most administrators view facility contraction as the lesser of all evils. When districts do not plan ahead, however, they are forced into what many term "austerity conditions," across-the-board cut-backs in program and personnel. And usually it is the very innovations that made the district a "lighthouse" that are the first to go. Cost reductions which leave the district at a "bare bones" state-mandated curriculum level are not uncommon... Perhaps the greatest threat to program comes not from a plan to cut program, but indirectly as a result of a district's thwarted effort to consolidate facilities. The district may launch a community information program and concentrate its efforts on closing under-utilized facilities. The emphasis, timeline, and planning focus on this alternative. Frequently, community opposition is strong enough to prevent the board from carrying out the plan to close schools. This deadend, when it happens, usually occurs late in the school year and well along in the budget process. The financial crunch is imminent, the facility plan is dead, a referendum not possible, and quick decisions must be made. Only program is left -- and here lies the real threat. Program cut decisions are made under pressure, quickly, and usually without a well-thought-out plan.

Unplanned cuts, therefore, are apt to be ill-advised cuts made in response to momentary political contingencies.

The conflict (and contrast) between politics and rationality is drawn most sharply and clearly by Bellon (1977:12):

> When institutions are faced with serious problems, at least two approaches can be taken. First, they can respond to various interest groups and attempt to resolve the problems by reacting to the forces that are brought to bear. Or, the institutional leaders can anticipate the problems to be solved and give direction to the solution of these problems. If the latter approach is taken, the leaders are being proactive rather than reactive. The process of problem solving requires a systematic approach to the resolution of the problem.

The systematic approach is described further in terms of the essentials of "sound management" (p. 14):

> Sound management of a school district is dependent upon clarity of organizational responsibility, authority, and expectations. When this clarity has been accomplished, unity of purpose can be achieved. When there is unity of purpose, it is much easier to focus on and allocate resources to the high priority goals.

Towards the end of achieving unity of purpose, readers of the professional

literature on decline will find a chorus of advice about the importance of fact-finding and accurate data. Towards the goal of "focusing and allocating resources to the high priority goals" readers will find suggestions for "Management by Objectives" (Estes, 1977), program budgeting (Estes, op cit; Morgan and Wofford, 1977), and zero-based budgeting (Estes, 1977).

This is not the place to reiterate in any detail the planning practices and techniques which school districts have been urged to undertake (see Section 3.3.2, above). We only note these major themes underlying the advice: unity and clarity of purpose; accurate and objective information; and rationalized cost-accounting procedures. All three are interrelated.

5.3.2 Limitations to Rational Planning Inherent in the Nature of Schools

It has been suggested (see Freeman and Hannan, 1981), that schools are characterized by ambiguous goals and uncertain technologies. This condition, it is argued, leaves school decisionmakers without an objective "criterion-referenced" test of the rationality, and of the "correctness" of their policy decisions.

Empirical warrant for this view is provided by some of the case study literature we have reviewed in this report. Morgan and Wofford (1977) suggest that, ultimately, the goals, the purposes of schooling, are constituted by different constituencies' interests in specific aspects of a school's program in concrete situations. Boyd (1979) found systematic incongruence in values between school professionals and the public, especially the public in blue-collar communities. He notes (pp. 359-360):

> ...professional educators place more emphasis on the quality of the educational program than on the importance of neighborhood schools. Lay citizens and parents generally do not find this such an easy trade-off to make. School board members, however, tend to become socialized to the professional norms on such matters... Smaller schools appeared to be viewed more favorably in the lower status districts...in the lower status districts the value placed on the maintenance of neighborhood schools is less likely to be challenged, than in the higher status by considerations of the quality of the educational program. This may be so because it appears that the lower status populace do not demand or expect as complex or sophisticated an educational program as do higher status populaces.

One result of this incongruence is that the whole notion of rational trade-offs becomes "clouded." Again, Boyd (1979:363) writes:

> Indeed interviews with superintendents and school board members pointed up the vagueness which clouds attempts to calculate the trade-offs between "educational" considerations and "cost" or "budgetary" considerations in retrenchment decisions. This, of course, is not surprising given the high degree of ambiguity which surrounds the ends and means of education. One board member summed up the problem when he commented that he would like to know "What is the educational program that the staff assured us is being preserved within, or weakened by, proposed cuts."

If such trade-offs cannot even be defined clearly, their calculation is even more difficult. This calls into question whether rationalized accounting procedures -- program budgeting, zero-based budgeting, etc. -- are either possible or useful in school districts' retrenchment decisionmaking. Berman and McLaughlin (1978:323) point to two risks in school districts' adoption of more rationalized budgeting and cost-accounting procedures.

> First, there is the danger of the technological assumption that such systems as PPBS could be automatically installed without being adapted to and integrated with the bureaucratic and political patterns that constitute the institutional reality of school district... Second, it could wrongly be assumed that a more rationalized budget process could avoid the value choices and conflicts inherent in public school systems. On the contrary, an objective of new budgetary procedures might be to expose hard choices; i.e., to reveal how much is being "sacrificed" in one area to meet needs or demands in another area. To cope with an increase in potential conflicts caused by exposing hard choices, the entire process should aim to generate support by institutionalizing broad-based participation.

But institutionalizing broad-based participation carries the risk of exposing schools' lack of unity of purposes.

Can the facts, i.e., an agreement on what is, as opposed to what should be, bring schools closer to a 'unity of purpose' and 'clarity of goals?' There is some evidence that schools qua bureaucracies share the typical bureaucratic problem of inability to generate and aggregate accurate information. Consider Colton and Frelich's (1979) analysis and findings on school closure decisionmaking in St. Louis. They begin by noting that "high levels of bureaucratization are a prominent feature of urban school systems and particularly of the central offices which must initiate and implement school

closure decisions" (p. 397). They go on to note several special features of bureaucracy: specialization, rules, and hierarchy. With respect to specialization and hierarchy (p. 397):

> Unless there is a special interoffice arrangement for school closings, it seems probable that the building department, the curriculum and instruction department, the finance department, and the transportation department may approach the problem of closings differently. And, they may not know it.
>
> Information will flow up and down the hierarchy and responsibility may be lodged at one point, many points, or none at all within the hierarchy.

In St. Louis, at least, information upon which authoritative decisions were to be based flowed up the hierarchy (p. 409):

> The Board of Education receives recommendations from the superintendent, who receives them from the associate superintendent for operations, who gathers information from five area superintendents, who in turn gather data from principals. Somewhere along the line, cost considerations and instructional considerations are supposed to be merged.

As it turned out in St. Louis, however, the two -- cost considerations and instructional considerations -- were never merged and accurate data about cost-considerations (defined in terms of excess space as identified by building principals) were not forthcoming.

Fragmentation of authority and of lines of information exacerbated intra-organizational conflicts of interests and allowed sub-organizational interests to dominate, or at least, manipulate the final outcome. Eisenberger (1974: 34), warned decisionmakers not to assume that principals, for example, share the same perspective as district level decisionmakers. Colton and Frelich (1979:414) underscore this point when they conclude:

> Our examination of school closings also has led to several insights into the decisionmaking process in bureaucratic educational organizations. Principals -- far down in the hierarchy -- were able to manipulate data on building utilization. To them, the availability of excess space is an asset, not a liability. Given that view, and further given the absence of a sophisticated data-gathering system at the top, principals can hide surplus space.

Such manipulation may not necessarily be conscious. Different roles within the organization produce different definitions of the situation. These different definitions enter into even good faith efforts to fulfill an administrative mandate to inventory space and identify excess capacity. Where

perspectives are different and where power is fragmented and responsibility divided, intra-organizational fact-finding reflects rather than resolves the conflict between different interests.

The same phenomena occurs when extra-organizational (i.e., community) interests and groups are involved in retrenchment decisionmaking. Yeager's (1979) study of one district's use of computer simulation as a decision-making tool in a participatory process of deciding which schools to close concluded that "hard data create more questions than they resolve." Lexington (1976), another case history of school closure decisionmaking, also shows that the results of fact-finding themselves become contested.

We have what appears to be the makings of a vicious circle. Retrenchment decisions are by definition controversial. They harm some concrete interests, while often benefiting only a general, abstract, and un-embodied interest in greater cost-efficiency. The professional consensus (i.e., what we have termed the "advice literature") recognizes this fact and urges decisionmakers to avoid political expediency and instead plan so as to achieve unity of purpose and clarity of goals (see Bellon, 1977) while it still recognizes that these achievements include human relations as well as technical-rational planning and objective fact-finding (see Eisenberger, 1974). At the same time, schools as organizations, even in non-decline, are not characterized by a unity of purpose and clarity of goals (Freeman and Hannan, 1981) and efforts to rationalize decisionmaking and cost-accounting procedures (see Estes, 1977) can only work if there is a unity of purposes (i.e., a non-contested definition of "cost" and of "benefit", see Berman and McLaughlin, 1978). Furthermore, efforts at fact-finding directed at achieving an empirical basis for unity -- at least an agreement on the facts -- are thwarted by the existence of intra- and sub-organizational differences in perspective (see Colton and Frelich, 1979) and by the phenomenon in which the meaning of the facts themselves become subject to contest (see Lexington, 1976; Yeager, 1977). The circle is vicious because the very processes by which the necessary unity of purpose and clarity of goals are to be created (community involvement and objective fact-finding) are themselves confounded by the lack of a prior unity of purpose.

5.3.3 Special Limitations on Rational Decisionmaking Posed by Decline

Some argue that the phenomenon of decline makes the circle even more vicious. These arguments echo the proverbial dictum that the "politics of scarcity are the politics of conflict."

For example, Stefonek (1979), after reviewing the literature on cut-back management in public organizations, notes that the necessity of retrenchment heightens, in fact mobilizes, perceptions of sub-organizational interests. That is, those whose programs, or positions, are threatened by potential cut-backs "discover" that they have a common interest separate from the interest of an organization as a whole. And, as Colton and Frelich (1979) have shown these threatened sub-organizational interests (in their case, building principals) may include precisely those individuals with the responsibility for providing information necessary for the organizations to make rational cut-back decisions. Stefonek (1979:17) further points that the protective behavior of sub-organizational interests (quite rational from their point of view) results in retrenchment decisions which are non-rational from the point of view of the organization as a whole.

> ...protective behavior by those who perceive their operations to be in jeopardy can inhibit hard decisions by management staff who don't want to antagonize their colleagues. Deadlocks and conflicts can often be avoided by allocating reductions across all programs and units, yet this may be far less productive and cause many more problems than if cuts were focused upon lowest priority areas of operations.

But the professional advice literature is united in urging school managers not to make across-the-board cuts. Boyd (1979), however, suggests that across-the-board cuts may be more "politically" rational. Contrary to Keough (1978b), (who we saw earlier suggesting that closing schools is a way to retrench while still preserving public and fiscal support for programs) Boyd notes that (p. 331):

> ...the concentrated costs of school closing upon particular neighborhoods which clearly are the losers in the policymaking game, ordinarily will produce a much more intense public participation and opposition, at least in those particular neighborhoods, than will the distributed costs of across-the-board cuts in teaching personnel throughout the school district.

The above statement is not merely an ad-hoc observation, it concludes an illuminating analysis of how decline affects, perhaps in far-reaching ways, school districts' policymaking procedures. That analysis bears a closer and more detailed look.

Boyd's Thesis: The Politics of Decline --
Distributive vs. Redistributive Goods

Boyd's analysis rests on the following points: (i) that retrenchment decisions are different in kind than growth decisions; (ii) that there are systematic differences in educational values between "producers" (professional educators) and "consumers" (the public); (iii) that in normal times the public defers to professionals' definition of what is educationally valuable; but (iv) that under conditions of retrenchment decisionmaking, the ensuing level of conflict dissolves this deference, with (v) the result that, in decline, school leaders are not only short on material resources but also become short on symbolic political resources, namely public faith in expertise and public assent to decisions arrived at and/or legitimated by the application of technical-rational (a.k.a. "professional") criteria and processes of decisionmaking. Unpacking each of these points further illuminates Boyd's thesis that decline places additional limits on school districts' capacity to engage in technical-rational decisionmaking of the kind prescribed in the advice literature.

Decisionmaking: Distributive vs. Redistributive
Issues or, Contraction vs. Expansion Revisited

Boyd's dichotomy allows us to, once again, review some key differences between expansion and contraction (see Section 3.1.3, above).

At the simplest level, expansion decisionmaking means adding -- programs, services, personnel, benefits. Contraction, by definition, means cutting something back. The professional consensus teaches that cut-backs should be focused; items to be cut are to be justified on grounds of cost-efficiency and educational soundness. Across-the-board cuts rarely meet these criteria, it is suggested. Boyd's analysis suggests that from the political standpoint focused cuts may be irrational, and depending on the districts' susceptibility to interest group pressures, impossible. That analysis proceeds

by drawing distinctions between policy issues in terms of their costs and benefits to particular groups in the community.

One such distinction is between "distributive" and "redistributive" policy issues. Distributive policies involve the "dispensing of values and and resources (such as public works and 'pork barrel' programs) which can be parcelled out" in such a way that everybody gets something; everyone wins partially (p. 350). Dembowski, et al. (1979:18) and Berman and McLaughlin (1978:317) note that distributive policies are typical of growing organizations and serve to resolve conflict. Berman and McLaughlin (1978:317) and Morgan and Wofford (1977:29) suggest that the creation of new programs was a way of reconciling diverse and conflicting pressures upon schools. That is, a claim that schools should be doing "x" rather than "y" could be typically resolved by setting up a special, additional program embodying some features of "x" while still allowing schools to continue to do "y". Dembowski (p. 18) notes that in periods of growth:

> ...money was often used as the resource buffer between conflicting groups. As this buffer is eliminated administrators can no longer buy their way out of problems, but are becoming forced to use other alternatives to satisfy needs of diverse pressures. The predictable result is that the level of conflict in school districts has risen.

Conflict has risen because cut-back decisions are redistributive decisions; that is, "x" gets cut in order to preserve "y". Those favoring "x" lose, those favoring "y" gain.

Collective vs. Separable Goods

Whether redistributive decisions create conflict and are politically destabilizing depends, to pursue our earlier example, on the nature of the "y" which is protected by cutting "x". That nature is defined by who benefits from "y" as opposed to "x", and whether those benefits are of the kind which lead to the mobilization of political support. Boyd's distinction between collective and separable goods becomes concrete by considering once again the professional consensus on the general pattern of cut-backs. That consensus suggests: enhance cost-efficiency and preserve the integrity/ excellence of the core school program ("y") by getting rid of excess capacity ("x"), i.e., typically, by closing a school. Program integrity and

cost-efficiency are values which benefit everyone generally. To use Boyd's terms they are a "collective good" like (p. 351):

> ...clean air which has the property that when it is provided to one member of a community it is simultaneously provided to all members of that community -- there is no incentive for the rational self-interested individual to contribute to the provision of the good. Instead, it is to his advantage to take a free ride, if possible, and enjoy the benefits of the collective good without sharing the costs.

In short, by protecting cost-efficiency and program integrity school managers are "out on a limb" by themselves; their stand benefits everyone but no one is motivated to mobilize in political support of that benefit. Boyd gives another example (p. 351):

> A standard class size across a school district also has the characteristic of a collective good and is not likely to motivate specific groups of citizens to take political action (though it will be of keen interest to teachers). But whether to operate a specific neighborhood school is an issue involving a separable good with clear incentives for the political mobilization of specific groups.

The operation of a specific neighborhood school (or by extension, a specific program such as one for the "gifted") is a "separable good." What distinguishes a "good" as separable is the concentration of its benefits and the concentration of its costs, should it be eliminated, from the point of view of those who bear the costs or enjoy the benefits. To put the same point differently, there are some interests which unite a whole community ("we all want efficiency and a good program") and there are some interests which divide a community ("'we' have an interest in our neighborhood school, 'they' have an interest in theirs"). The former are collective interests; the latter are separable interests. The latter provide reasons for citizens to mobilize and organize politically; the former -- the common, public interests -- are overridden by separate interests, and because of the "free-rider" problem (e.g., the "good" of clean air) do not provide incentives for political mobilization.

Retrenchment, Conflict and the De-Legitimization of Professional Expertise

If school managers follow the professional advice they will make focused rather than across-the-board cut-backs. If they make focused cut-backs, they

may be perceived as acting in the general public interest, but will, to follow Boyd's analysis, be faced with intense, organized political opposition but no countervailing organized political support. In facing the opposition of those mobilized constituencies protecting their "separable goods," managers expose themselves to the articulation of hitherto submerged differences in values between professionals and the lay public. As summarized by Boyd (pp. 359-360), these differences are as follows: professionals place a higher value on program than preservation of schools: the public likes smaller schools; professionals tend to see small schools as inefficient or inadequate for a quality program (see also, Andrews, 1974; Cuban, 1979; Colton and Frelich, 1979; Lexington, 1976). Once these value conflicts come to the surface, the neutrality and the technical necessity of specific retrenchment decisions come into question (p. 336):

> ...trust in experts and the symbols of their knowledge may be crucial components of the tranquil management of organizations, such as educational institutions, which are characterized by ambiguous goals and technologies... But how is conflict to be managed when this trust begins to break down, or when the available expertise appears irrelevant or inadequate as may be the case in dealing with problems of decline?

Should Boyd's preliminary findings be confirmed, and should they be generalizable, the larger question becomes: of what political use are objective, technical-rational planning processes if they produce policy choices which mobilize community opposition of the kind which calls into question the very "objectivity" of the technical-rational process?[44]

Political vs. Technical Rationality: Three Ironies

Three ironies emerge from Boyd's analysis. One, policy decisions which make their stand firmly on the basis of the general, public interest (the "collective good") are the most likely to generate specific public opposition and are the least likely to benefit from organized general public

---

[44] This does not mean, however, that: (i) opposition will always occur and that it will always occur and that it will always win out; or (ii) that technical-rational planning is of no use whatsoever. Rather, the only implication drawn is that, for school systems in decline, it is increasingly more difficult to involve technical-rational criteria to legitimate policy decisions.

support. Two, technical-rational criteria for making cut-backs are most likely to result in policy decisions which create the political conditions for de-legitimizing the very process of technical-rational decisionmaking by exposing value incongruence between the lay public and professional educators thus lessening deference to professionalism and its symbols of expertise. (Note: this devalues the conflict-management function of technical-rational planning. It does not suggest that such planning is unnecessary, or impossible, or dysfunctional for internal decisionmaking processes.) Three, it is precisely in those communities whose political culture is more sympathetic to the "good government" ethos (to non-partisan, apolitical management of schooling) that retrenchment decisionmaking leads to more conflict and to a greater de-legitimizing of those very values (good government, technical-rational planning, decisionmaking by rational consensus) which constitute that ethos and make it congruent with the professional advice on "good" management of decline. This third point will be discussed in more detail below.

Decline and Policymaking Styles: The "Public Regarding" vs. the "Private Regarding" Political Cultures

Since the municipal reform movement of the earlier part of the 20th century, the norm (if not always the practice) has been apolitical governance of school systems. Boyd is not the first to note that while the norm has remained constant, practice has been variable. There are also systematic variations in the extent to which school districts' practices have lived up to that norm. Generally, lower-status communities have more partisan, more political systems of school governance while higher-status communities adhere more closely to the rational-technical model.

Boyd's sample of eight school districts was split between lower and higher socio-economic status. The stratification was initially designed to "test" the effects of a community's stock of "management resources" on its ability to handle the levels of conflict attendant upon its transition from growth to decline. Management resources are defined as (p. 342) "...the aggregate organizational and management skills and associated attitudes derived from the level of education and the kinds of occupations of a given populace." These include "...skills in such areas as communication,

negation, persuasion, division of labor, and delegation of function." These are typically white-collar skills, and almost by definition, higher status communities have higher levels of "management resources." Previous research on suburban school and community politics had established that higher levels of management resources were associated with lower levels of community conflict. Boyd (1979:342-343) writes:

> ...the greater the posession of management resources...by higher rather than lower status districts promoted deference to expertise (that is, deference to professional administrators) in the former districts and tended to lead to a controlling and channeling of the educational decisionmaking process (especially by means of the use of nominating caucuses for the selection of school board candidates) in such a way as to minimize conflict. Conversely, Minar argued that the paucity of management resources in lower status districts is likely to (1) reduce deference to expertise; (2) increase school board and citizen interference in essentially administrative as opposed to policy matters; and (3) reduce the community's ability to contain and control conflict.[45]

Boyd, however, found that as school districts experienced decline, the higher status districts experienced more conflict even though they should have been "protected" by their higher levels of management resources. Instead (Boyd, 1979:346):

> ...the political traditions and values of or "political culture" of the districts was equally important as their possession of management resources and, indeed, was more significant in explaining much of the variance in conflict levels, especially since it tended to determine <u>how</u> management resources were used (that is to mobilize or minimize conflict). Thus, the fundamental difference between the blue-collar and white-collar districts lies in their different norms and values regarding conflict and the proper conduct of politics.

Again, the fundamental difference was between a "public-regarding" political culture (high status, white-collar districts) and a private-regarding culture (lower status, blue-collar districts). The latter sustained less conflict than the former.

We have already touched upon the difference between public and private regarding cultures, in an earlier discussion of Boyd's findings (see <u>Section</u>

---

[45] Boyd's reference is to D. W. Minar, "The Community Basis of Conflict in School System Politics," <u>American Sociological Review</u>, Vol. 31 (1966), pp. 822-834.

4.2.5, above). A discussion of the full dimensions of those differences had to be postponed until now since their significance in explaining differential responses to decline is tied to Boyd's distinction between distributive vs. redistributive policy issues, and correspondingly, between collective vs. separable goods. The differences between the two cultures are arrayed on Chart 5B, on the pages immediately following. The difference can be captured, roughly, by aligning the public-regarding culture with civics textbook notions of "good, clean government" or apolitical public administration, and the private-regarding culture to popular images of patronage or "machine politics." This view is partially misleading, however, becuase it suggests that the former is "clean" and good, while the latter is "dirty" and bad. The fundamental difference lies in the two cultures' different assumptions about how public policy is or should be made. The "public" culture stresses rational consensus and aims at a transcendence of special interests; the "private" stresses bargaining and compromise and recognizes all interests as "special." These attitudes are best summarized in Boyd's (1979:347-348) contrast between different rules by which the policymaking game is played (Note: in each case substitute "public-regarding" for "white-collar", and "private-regarding" for "blue-collar"):

- ...in the white collar districts politics in its broadest sense was shunned as unseemly and tended to be viewed as unnecessary and improper because it was believed that a common interest could and should be defined, in the blue collar districts competing interests and points of view tended to be an accepted fact of life.
- ...in the blue collar districts positions taken by groups on issues were seldom substantially developed or symbolically advanced in terms of "what's best for the whole community."
- ...unlike their counterparts in the white collar districts, board members in the blue collar districts tended both to expect and received requests for favoritism...and some board members tried to grant these requests in an effort to increase their political support.

Boyd goes on to offer three explanations for why the "blue-collar" game is more adapted to school districts in decline (pp. 362-363). All three make reference to the redistributive nature of retrenchment decisions.

(1) Since school closings are such strongly redistributive issues, that is, inflict such concentrated costs, they

CHART 5B: A SUMMARY OF TWO POLICYMAKING CULTURES: THE "PUBLIC" AND THE "PRIVATE-REGARDING"*

DIMENSIONS OF DIFFERENCE	"PUBLIC-REGARDING" CULTURE	"PRIVATE-REGARDING" CULTURE
Community Socio-Economic Status	High, predominantly white-collar.	Low, predominantly blue-collar.
Primary Values and Orientation	Attachment to the community as a whole. Higher value on quality of education program than on the preservation of neighborhood school.	Primary attachment is to the neighborhood. Higher value placed on preservation of the neighborhood school.
Orientation to Policymaking		
• "Extent to which competition and politics are viewed as legitimate."	"In white collar districts politics in its broadest sense was shunned as unseemly and tended to be viewed as unnecessary and improper because it was assumed that a common interest could and should be defined."	"...competing interests and points of view tended to be an accepted part of life."
• "Extent to which the public interest is defined in terms of the whole community."	The public regarding political culture emphasizes such values as "good government" and the disinterested pursuit of the public interest.	"...positions taken by groups on issues were seldom substantially developed or symbolically advanced in terms of 'what's best for the whole community'."
• "Extent to which honesty, impartiality and disinterested participation are expected."	"...politics rather than being a struggle among partial and private interests is (or at any rate ought to be) a disinterested effort to discover what is best for the community as a whole."	"...seeks personal favors from the political system" and "recognizes the legitimacy of competition and conflict between groups concerned with narrow and special interests."
• "Extent to which efficiency and expertise are valued."	High value and deference to professional expertise and to the symbols of that expertise in educational decisionmaking (Note: deference is to expertise, not necessarily experts as individuals).	Lower level of deference to expertise and the symbols thereof. More likelihood of "lay interference" in "purely administrative" matters.

* Adapted from Boyd (1979). Boyd's schema is, in turn, based on E. Banfield and J.Q. Wilson, City Politics (New York: Vintage, 1963).

CHART 5B: A SUMMARY OF TWO POLICYMAKING CULTURES: THE "PUBLIC" AND THE "PRIVATE-REGARDING" (Continued)*

DIMENSIONS OF DIFFERENCE	"PUBLIC-REGARDING" CULTURE	"PRIVATE-REGARDING" CULTURE
Patterns of Community Involvement	More highly institutionalized. More on-going, given to task forces/study groups of the kind often prescribed in the "advice" literature (see Section 3.3.2, above), with broad but "virtual" rather than "delegated" representation.	More episodic. More likely to be individual. If collective, more likely to be based on "special" neighborhood or constituency interests.
School Board Role Orientation	De-jure and de-facto nonpartisan. A "trustee" or pro-active, public spirited orientation. Prevalence of nominating caucuses dominated by civic elites.	De-facto partisan. Political broker role orientation, "...unlike their counter-parts in the white collar districts, board members in the blue-collar districts tended both to expect and received requests for favoritism...and some board members tried to grant these requests in an effort to increase their political support."
Implications for Role of Superintendent	Maximizes "the effectiveness of the role of superintendent as an 'educational statesman'."	"...superintendents were pressed to adopt the role of a 'political' strategist."
How Decisions Are, or Should, Be Made	By rational consensus, after objective fact-finding, with disinterested participation of all affected constituencies.	Compromise and bargaining among organized constituency and special interest groups.
Normal Sources of Conflict	Rival interpretations of the "meaning" of objective technical knowledge.	Clashes between the material interests of competing groups.
Levels of Conflict Engendered by Retrenchment Decisionmaking	"The rational consensual (public-regarding) policymaking orientation, which tends to be prevalent in higher status districts may be less well suited for dealing with redistributive issues, for example, in seeking and striking compromises, than the more 'political' (private regarding) policymaking orientation prevalent in lower status districts."	

* Adapted from Boyd (1979). Boyd's schema is, in turn, based on E. Banfield and J.Q. Wilson, City Politics (New York: Vintage, 1963).

will prompt the use of some of the abundant management resources in higher status districts to mobilize rather than minimize conflict.

(2) Credibility gaps seem to develop more quickly regarding whether school boards have already made up their minds about which schools to close. This suspicion tends to undercut much of the value of conflict management techniques and extensive public deliberation and community involvement schemes which higher status districts are inclined to employ.

Suspicion leads to loss of faith, deference to reliance on professional expertise. And, in higher status, public-regarding communities, the symbols of expertise and technical rationality were instrumental in holding down the levels of conflict. In lower status communities, such deference was never that crucial. Finally, the type of policy issues engendered by decline are more likely to involve separable goods and thus:

(3) The rational-consensual ("public-regarding") policymaking orientation, which tends to be prevalent in higher status districts, may be less well suited for dealing with redistributive issues, for example, in seeking and striking compromises, than the more "political" ("private-regarding") policymaking orientation prevalent in lower status districts.

The lore says: involve the community but do so in ways that transcend special interests (Sieradski, 1975) and build districtwide loyalty and perspectives (Eisenberger, 1977). Disinterested participation and an orientation to the general community interest is the essence of the public-regarding orientation to school policymaking.

But Boyd's finding implies that the kind of policy decisions necessary under retrenchment make disinterested participation highly unlikely and place a premium on political interest group trading as a conflict management and resolution device.[46] Private-regarding attitudes are more functional for conflict management and policymaking under conditions of decline. And, as public-regarding communities experience decline, <u>their</u> policymaking comes closer to the style exhibited by private-regarding

---

[46] Please note that this reference is only to conflict management. There is is no claim here that political bargaining or compromise leads to "better," or more "efficient," or more educationally sound decisions.

communities (the latter is our inference, not Boyd's).

Limits of the Public-Regarding Political Culture:
The Case of Lincoln-Sudbury

Indirect support for Boyd's conclusion and our correlative inference comes from Morgan and Wofford's (1977) case history of one school system's -- the Lincoln-Sudbury high school district in Massachusetts -- attempt to implement a participatory planning process for reducing school costs in the face of declining enrollments.

Boyd's preliminary finding suggests that it is precisely those districts (the "public-regarding" communities) which are most likely to have policy-making styles congruent with the tenor of the professional lore about good practice in retrenchment decisionmaking that are most likely to experience conflict as they proceed with retrenchment. And, by implication, because it is those features of such communities -- their public-regarding ethos -- which cause higher levels of conflict, this raises doubts about the applicability of the professional lore about good practice.

Note the congruence between the lore about good practice and the fundamental assumptions of the public-regarding ethos. The "lore" says: do not engage in political interest group bargaining (Bellon, 1977:12). The public-regarding culture sees that kind of trade-off as illegitimate.

Lincoln-Sudbury represents a textbook case of applying the professional lore about good practice in retrenchment decisions. One, theirs was an effort at planning for cost-reductions long before such reductions were absolutely necessary. In a classic sense, Morgan and Wofford's (they were the authors and key participants, both being school board members) effort was pro-active rather than reactive.

Two, theirs was not an ad-hoc approach. Their intent was comprehensive. Accepting the premise that (p. 10):

> ...the imposition of constraints on education can be constructive, forced choices can be salutary...

they began with the conviction that (p. 30):

> ...only some structural changes in schools' strategy could produce cost-savings of a significant order of magnitude. We realized that we had to question the educational product and try to re-establish in our own minds exactly what can be called

education. We needed to redefine a strategy for declining education, scrutinizing all parts of the educational process for those which could be excluded. The issue before us could not be addressed by administrative paring or reorganization. It required thinking through the basic concepts of a high school education.

Third, theirs was not a haphazard approach. They recognized the inadequacy of line-item budgeting. They write that that method (p. 2):

> ...took up large amounts of time and was unsatisfying inasmuch as line items locked up the program and personnel in place, encouraging questions of a nitpicking but not fundamental sort...

and, generally did not promote the kind of rational cost accounting necessary for cost-reduction planning (p. 4):

> Administrative staff did not have time or data [under line-item budgeting] to undertake a range of analyses necessary for responding to fundamental questions like -- how would the costs compare of serving the same size populations in a traditional program with an egg crate schedule versus a highly diversified program in a 20 module day?

Furthermore, the need for accurate information and objective fact-finding was not forgotten by Morgan and Wofford. Their planning effort engaged in no less than five local research efforts including a search of the literature on productivity measures, an analysis of credits earned by the high school class of 1974, an externally commissioned systems dynamics model simulating the effects of alternative cost reduction measures, and the development of a program budget and productivity measures (p. 19).

Four, pains were taken to avoid the kind of bureaucratic impediments which Colton and Frelich (1979) found to be frustrating St. Louis' efforts to gather local data. Morgan and Wofford's effort included the establishment of a coordinating committee with representation from all administrative levels of not only the high school district whose costs were to be reduced, but also from the two feeder elementary school districts.

Five, Morgan and Wofford saw clearly that, to paraphrase Sargent and Handy (1979), and Eisenberger (1974), the management of decline is "a people problem" not just a technical problem. They were convinced, right from the beginning, that (pp. 10-11):

> Corporate management won't help us to define the ends of education. Cost benefit analysis cannot decide who pays for educational

> opportunity -- that's a question of public policy, of social justice.

And, furthermore (p. 10), "increased efficiency [alone], we felt, would only yield marginal cost-savings and [bring about] fewer evaluations of fundamental practices." Recognizing the human dimension of the decline problem, Morgan and Wofford followed the script for community involvement. They went to lengths to develop a districtwide orientation (p. 154):

> We thought that, if we were sufficiently skillful in demonstrating the complexity of the school as a system, then citizens could agree to give up some favorite components in the interests of the more effective working of the whole.

They followed the consensus of advice recommending that problems can be solved if those affected develop "ownership" of the problem (p. 13):

> ...we wanted to (1) involve citizens in a serious way, (2) present them with developed alternatives on which they could make judgements, and (3) involve representatives of citizen groups and faculty early in the development of the alternatives so that they could build in their views and feel some ownership of the alternatives.

They also set up a task force, a 26 member "working committee" consisting of six school board members, two administrators, four members of the faculty, ten citizens (appointed on an at-large basis) and four students. This committee spearheaded the planning effort. It commissioned and coordinated the aforementioned local research efforts, developed and refined alternative cost reduction strategies (from an initial list of five down to three), and presented the alternatives in a series of open meetings attended by over 800 residents of the district. The open meetings were designed to elicit citizen response to the alternative cost reduction plans, both informally via an open hearing process, and more formally via small group discussions followed by questionnaire responses. These responses provided one of the key findings of Morgan and Wofford's action research project.

Clearly, their effort "followed the book" and then some, in terms of applying good practice to retrenchment planning. And yet, on its <u>own</u> terms the project failed. From the initial aim of radically rethinking the entire basis of a high school education, the working committee (pp. 31-32):

> ...retreated from drastic change. What the working committee did end up with was proposing two models: (1) continuation of the status quo with necessary minor adjustments or fine tuning

> which might reduce costs by (at most) 10% per pupil, and (2) two versions of the current education program, but truncated, one in length, the other in breadth. Neither of these can be considered a radical change in educational strategy.

After holding the open hearings, on the three watered-down alternatives described above, and finding no constituency for cost reduction, Morgan and Wofford report (pp. 156-157):

> ...we recapitulated the traditional forms of response: we added programs. We gave something to everybody. We instituted the Intensive Studies Program for those who wanted more structure, we added college credit courses for those who wanted more challenge. We started a service component program for those who felt students should contribute, and we cracked down on the attendance for those who wanted consistency. And all this ended up costing more money not less.

What went wrong? Morgan and Wofford provide plenty of answers. Theirs is an unusually intellectually honest, soul-searching document, and for that very reason, one of the most instructive practitioner-produced reports that we have encountered in the literature. The analysis they offer, the answers they come up with, read as if they could have been scripted by Boyd (1979). What we see in the Lincoln-Sudbury effort is a breakdown of the conceptual framework underlying the public-regarding political culture. Its record of "failure" (we use failure in quotes because Morgan and Wofford report on an unfinished story, and the report itself is far from a failure in terms of informing future practice) reads like a Greek tragedy, a community's loss of civic innocence as it began to grapple with decline.

Morgan and Wofford conclude that what went fundamentally wrong, was that their assumptions were incorrect (p. 153):

> Our major learning of the past three years is that these assumptions have not held true in the ways we had envisioned. All of them sprang out of a context of abundance. They may have been useful ways of responding to the world when resources could be viewed as unlimited, but they no longer appear appropriate to a time of scarce resources. Therefore, in some ways, our three year effort can be viewed as paradoxical attempt to combat the issue of retrenchment but from the conceptual framework of growth.

Their assumptions, as explicitly stated on page 152, read:

[1] Problems can be solved.

[2] Ownership in problem definition facilitates implementation of solutions.

[3] Rational decisionmaking on a broad public scale is possible.

[4] Citizens can make difficult choices even when the choices adversely affect their own self-interest.

[5] Impending crises can be confronted early and responded to by studying issues piece-meal in manageable chunks.

[6] School Committee could respond to articulated citizens views by effectively cutting the budget.

Their additional assumptions, implicit in two of their five project objectives (stated as "action research" questions) read (pp. 8-9):

[7] Can a volunteer part-time and elected group of six individuals perform in a pro-active mode so as to confront the impending crisis over rising educational costs and lead a process of rational decisionmaking involving broad participation of multiple constituencies?

[8] Given an appropriate format for the presentation of alternative solutions including their advantages and disadvantages, can local communities make better informed and more satisfying choices with respect to their schools and how to pay for them?

Assumptions numbers 3 - 5 and 7 - 8 articulate the central premises of the public-regarding political culture, i.e., rational decisionmaking, disinterested participation, objectivity, etc. Morgan and Wofford report that those premises did not hold (pp. 92-93):

> ...some key assumptions of the Principal Investigators [Morgan and Wofford] were not fully met. The project aimed (1) to harness the assumedly urgent financial concerns of school people and citizens, (2) to educate these groups to take a system-wide perspective rather than that of their specific groups, and (3) from this perspective to participate in rational problem solving rather than political negotiation in reducing (at least the rate of growth of) school costs.

Morgan and Wofford's findings conform to the scenario outlined by Boyd. Boyd suggests that retrenchment raises redistributive policy issues, and mobilizes constituencies around "separable" goods, at the same time as decisionmakers find themselves without a constituency for the "collective" good of cost-

efficiency. Morgan and Wofford report (pp. 154-155):

> We thought...citizens could come to see the overall interrelationship of elements and could agree to give up favorite components in the interests of the more effective working of the whole. What we learned is that citizens did not see the system in the same way and could not agree on what parts to cut. We learned that we could not locate a consensus for retrenchment. It did not exist out there waiting for us to discover and understand it.

What Morgan and Wofford did discover was the existence of separate constituency interests. For example, questionnaire data from the open meetings attended by over 800 citizens and faculty and students showed some persistent cleavages (pp. 83-108 passim). Despite an overall lack of a constituency to cut costs, the propensity to cut back was associated with a negative assessment of the school program "as is". Negative assessment was associated, albeit weakly, with lower SES, lower levels of education, and lower family aspirations for schooling. Questionnaire data also showed a predictable cleavage between school people and the community. The former were more satisfied with the school program as is, and were more pedagogically "progressive." The latter were less likely to be satisfied and more likely to be pedagogically "conservative." Faculty who were also town residents were differentiated from non-resident faculty in having views closer to those of the townspeople in general, although still, they (the resident faculty) were closer to the faculty position than to that of the townspeople.

In distinguishing between "collective" and "separable" goods, Boyd suggested that the latter are defined, in part, by the intensity of commitment to each kind of good on the part of their beneficiaries (and hence by propensity for political organizations).

Morgan and Wofford's survey responses did capture a measure of intensity of views about the school program and cutting costs. Predictably, faculty, having a "separable" interest (a sense of concentrated, "private" costs and benefits inherent in any change from the status quo) expressed more intensely held views, leading Morgan and Wofford to ask (p. 86):

> How should the weak preferences of the citizens (who pay for the schools) be balanced against strong opposing preferences of the faculty and students (who make up the school)?

Boyd noted that efforts to engage in rational trade-off analysis between cost considerations and educational considerations are clouded by ambiguities in the definitions of quality education and in the uncertainty about the goals of schooling. In the case of Lincoln-Sudbury, the strongest lines of cleavage were between maintaining the program as is, opening it up, or making it more structured and "basic." Views on this issue were most intensely held and were correlated to more weakly held positions on cost cutting. It is dangerous to speculate too much from this survey data, but one plausible inference is that attitudes towards program in general (rather than cost-consideration based attitudes towards the programmatic options provided by Morgan and Wofford's "Working Committee" on cost-reduction) determined attitudes toward cost-reduction. And, furthermore, attitudes towards program may have been ideological reflections of more basic attitudes, not founded on productivity measures, towards an "open" versus "structured" education, the latter being an historic cleavage in Lincoln-Sudbury (p. 93).

Finally, we had inferred, based on Boyd's analysis, that as communities grapple with the redistributive issues raised by decline and as this grappling creates organized interest-group cleavages around "separable" goods, public-regarding communities may take on the practices (if not the values and symbols) of private-regarding politics, i.e., give and take, constituency building via the distribution of "private" benefits. Something like this may have happened in Lincoln-Sudbury (the final process was not documented) as Morgan and Wofford admit their final resort to the "additive approach" (p. 156). That is, from an initial intent to involve consituency interests and "to educate these groups to take a systemwide perspective rather than that of their specific groups, and from this perspective to participate in rational problem-solving rather than political negotiation" (p. 93), they were led into political negotiation "...we recapitulated the traditional forms of response: we added programs. We gave something to everybody...and all this ended up in costing more money, not less" (pp. 156-157).

The Fine Art of "Muddling Through"

The unanticipated and unintended resort to the above mentioned "additive strategy" led Morgan and Wofford to a new understanding of organizational

change. In reflecting on the gap between their intent and practice ("why is that we resorted to such minor variations of the existing product when our aims had been so sweeping?" p. 32), they endorse Lindblom's classic articulation of the management strategy of "muddling through" and his defense of incremental change. Morgan and Wofford quote Lindblom (p. 32):

> ...given the limits in knowledge within which policymakers are confined, simplifying by limiting the focus to small variations from present policy makes the most of available knowledge. Because policies considered are like present and past policies, the administrator can obtain information and claim insight. Non-incremental policy proposals are therefore typically not only politically irrelevant but also unpredictable in their consequences. [47]

Morgan and Wofford draw several lessons from their after-the-fact adoption of Lindbloom's perspective. The first concerns new assumptions about the pace of institutional change (p. 35):

> ...changes can only be made incrementally. Small changes made and tested against the reactions and values of those affected. If a change is made and accepted, then other changes can be made in an incremental fashion. This incremental policy change is in drastic contrast to the concept of rational policy change which involves thinking through the whole problem, deciding what the right answer is and then going full speed ahead with the solution.

Incrementalism, as described by Lindblom, is made necessary not only by the unpredictability of large scale institutional change and by incomplete information, but also by the moral ambiguity of the public policymakers' situation. Non-incremental decisions are "politically irrelevant" because they are politically impossible. In solving problems, the policymaker is not engaged in mathematical problemsolving in which there is one uniquely rational solution, rather he is, to use Lindblom's terms, engaged in "successive processes of mutual partisan adjustment." Incremental decisionmaking is the result of such adjustments. It is incremental because only a course of action which represents "a small variation from past or present policy" can secure the support of those constituencies who have

---

47 The source is: E. E. Lindblom, "The Science of Muddling Through," Public Administration Review 19 (Spring 1959), pp. 79-88.

already assented to, and have a vested interest in, those past or present policies. In other words, those existing policies are the norm for future policies. This is because there is often no consensus apart from the consent, explicit or de-facto, given to those "past or present policies."

In short, incrementalism is necessary because of high information costs and because of the plurality of values, embodied in partisan interest groups, which policymakers must adjust in relation to each other in order to secure support for institutional change.

In adopting Lindblom's perspective, Morgan and Wofford state a renewed appreciation for "value-pluralism" and its irreducibility to resolution by logic, persuasion, or objective fact-finding. They learned that:

> ...one person's "wrong thing" is another person's "right thing" (p. 39).
>
> ...logical and rational minds...wanted to think through what was ideally needed [and] could only conceptualize through their own value system. When that was tested against the value system of others and found to be in conflict, it was necessary to retreat and compromise until the project ended up with three moderate alternatives (p. 33).

The recognition of value-pluralism tempered their view of organizations generally (p. 35):

> ...where a balanced or compromise organizational strategy exists, it is very difficult to make drastic changes in direction. To do that may satisfy the values of some specific group which wants the direction changed in a certain way, but it may in fact upset an equal or greater number of people who like the present balance.

and of schools in particular, as constituted by the different values people have about schooling (p. 155):

> ...citizens view the school through the differing lenses of their particular interests, needs, past experience, definitions of quality education, and children; and no two groups of people appear to see the school in the same way.

The school is no longer seen as simply a rational-purposive, instrumental institution whose basic strategies may be rethought and whose services can be reprogrammed. Instead, Morgan and Wofford offer a more historical view of the school as a polity manifesting successive compromises among differing community values about schooling (pp. 32-33):

> The mandate of the Lincoln-Sudbury school system is to meet the needs of students and families with widely varied interests, expectations, and hopes, and concepts of education. It is safe to say that the program as it exists is not 100% satisfactory to everyone. It has evolved over the years by compromise and accomodation to special interests, into a truly comprehensive high school which with limited funds could meet the needs of as many students as possible.

Finally, the above image of the school as a community of interests leads Morgan and Wofford to offer one of the simplest but most pointed depictions of the issues posed by decline and retrenchment (p. 155).

> ...schools have built a consensus for expansion by responding to varied special interests through adding a variety of programs. A metaphor of a stone wall is useful here. The wall got built stone by stone in response to differing needs and interests. People tend to see the wall differently depending on their focus on particular parts of the wall. If then we say, "which stones shall we remove?" the initial response is, "save mine, take his."

ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

The following 250-item bibliography was compiled from three sources: materials on decline already available in the Institute's Clearinghouse, a systematic search and review of ERIC (Educational Resources Information Center) files from 1966 on (although, understandably, most of the works on decline date from 1974), and additional materials offered to us by school districts who responded to our solicitation for site-specific practitioner produced materials and field-tested materials. Additional materials of this kind came from school districts represented by our 23-member clients review panels, whose insights helped to guide our approach and our selection of materials. Such school district materials are not always available to ERIC. They are available for dissemination, at cost, from the Institute for Responsive Education's Clearinghouse. We are fortunate in having received such materials, they represent accumulated experience by trial and error and a codification of "craft knowledge." These materials are listed, alphabetically, by school district name, in Section C2(b).

The bibliography is organized so as to be of most use to readers with a particular information need (see charts in Sections 2, 3 and 4 in the Review of the Literature, above). Section A, which represents the major portion of our bibliography, lists published articles, papers, books, reports as well as materials stored in ERIC. Section B lists "Resources", handbooks/manuals and bibliographies. Section C1 lists state education agency publications and task force reports, alphabetically by name of state. Section C2(a) contains local school district reports which are listed in ERIC; Section C2(b) lists the aforementioned fugitive school district documents.

The entire annotated bibliography is indexed according to author, topic, genre, and place name. Each index (indices begin on p. 257) is arranged by citation number.

The author index follows the conventional form, alphabetical by author, individual or institutional (including state governments and local school districts).

The topic, genre and place-name indices are different from the kind of indices ordinarily found in literary works. The topic index does not cover every item in our bibliography. Many are general works, which cover many topics. Such works provide an overview of the subject and, as such, are interesting. But our topic index is intended for the use of a busy reader with a practical need for concrete and detailed information on a specific topic, "RIF", for instance. Our topic descriptors, therefore, are at a very specific level. Instead of referring to general categories, our indices draw finer distinctions. Instead of referring to the large category of "Personnel", for example, our descriptors refer to such topics as "RIF", "Staff Evaluation", "Affirmative Action", etc. It is at this specific level that practitioners have information needs. Their needs arise out of a particular decision situation and not

a general academic interest in "personnel issues."

Our genre index is best seen as an analytic table of contents, of the kind found in many almanacs. The genre descriptors collect works according to the typical kinds of uses. The "Data" descriptors and sub-descriptors collect all of the research works listed in our bibliography. The "Tools" categories refer to these works, many of them handbooks (but also other materials) which contain detailed "how-to" procedures, complete instruments and techniques. Many of these tools are contained in appendices of publications which may otherwise deal more generally with a wide range of issues. Although our annotated bibliography contains a separate section listing other annotated bibliographies on the subject of decline (see p. 241), some publications -- handbooks and research reports -- contained annotated bibliographies in their appendices. These publications are indexed under the descriptor "Bibliographies" in the genre index.

The place-name index collects citations which are produced by "places" -- i.e., local school districts, and states. The place-name index also collects citations which describe, in some detail, the practices and experiences of the places named. Place names are listed alphabetically, state first, then locality. There is a networking function that we hope will be served by our place name index. It is our hope that in using it readers will be able to use this network and thus build their own networks of what Kenneth Boulding (1974) called "invisible colleges of school administrators exchanging information about how to cope with decline."

A: DATA AND ANALYSIS

1. ABRAMOWITZ, S. (1979). "The Dilemma of Decline." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Association of State Boards of Education in Williamsburg, Virginia. 13 pp. ED 184 233.

   Abramowitz reviews the features of decline and concludes that, while many districts are still experiencing decline, growth might yet occur. In other words, "growth and decline are occurring simultaneously" and this points up the need for sophisticated educational management, especially planning. Also describes some forms which state assistance to LEA's could take, including: forecasting, technical assistance, special services, staffing policies, and public relations.

2. ABRAMOWITZ, S., and ROSENFELD, S. (1978), (ed.) Declining Enrollments: Challenge of the Coming Decade. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. 466 pp. ED 150 708.

Edited anthology of 11 articles, all analytical, many presenting original data, on the policy-relevant aspects of enrollment decline and fiscal retrenchment. Uniting all contributions is a focus on the implications for state policy and Federally-sponsored research and technical assistance. Topics include: organization and management implications of decline, impact of and upon school costs and state finance schema; latest (circa 1977) available data on enrollment, affirmative action vis-a-vis reductions in force, and the special problems of big city schools. Contains an annotated bibliography. (See citations 11, 13, 88, 97, 122, 139 and 165.)

3. AMLUNG, S. (1980). When a School is Closed. New York: Educational Priorities Panel. 59 pp. ED 188 315.

   A report on the consequences for the immediate neighborhood when a school is closed. Six closed schools in New York City are studied: three vacant, two used by private organizations, and one by the board of education. Concludes that when alternative uses were found, neighborhoods retained their character; when schools stood vacant, the neighborhood was damaged.

4. ANDERSON, R.E. (1977). "New Competition For an Old Market." Lifelong Learning: The Adult Years. (September) pp. 19-21.

   Noting the projected decline in high school enrollments between 1977 and 1984, the author discusses the implications of that decline for adult education programs.

5. ANDREWS, R.L., et al. (1974). The Environmental Impact of School Closures. n.d. 45 pp. ED 112 521.

   A survey of school officials in 60 school districts nationwide. Conducted in order to assess the impact of school closing, the survey elicited data on four topics: criteria used in school closure decisions; optimum size of elementary schools; disposition of closed buildings; and impact on surrounding buildings.

6. ARVESON, R.G. (1974). "Implications of Decreasing Student Enrollments." Paper presented at American Association of School Administrators Annual Convention in Atlantic City, New Jersey. 4 pp. ED 087 120.

   After a general exploration of the issues associated with decline, author analyzes the process of closing a school in response to decline in enrollments.

7. ASSOCIATION FOR SUPERVISION AND CURRICULUM DEVELOPMENT. (1980). Organizing Schools for Supervision/Instructional Improvement. Overview of the Study. Alexandria, Virginia:

Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development. 200 pp. ED 193 786.

A substantial discussion of a study designed to assess the state of supervisory practice and measure the impact of several factors on supervision, among them: declining enrollments, declining budgets, collective bargaining, management efficiency studies, time demands on principals, and decentralization. The study derives several suggestions to improve supervisory practice from the data, including: decentralization, increased involvement by principals in supervision, eliminating evaluation from supervision, and increasing the opportunities for teachers to receive supervision.

8. BAILEY, J.D. (1977). (ed.) Declining Enrollments and School Closings. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education. 64 pp. ED 143 099.

This monograph collects papers from a Midwest Regional Conference on "Enrollment Decline and School Closings" (1976). Most of the papers discuss the more general issues of contraction-retrenchment, with a particular focus on different styles of leadership, increased technical planning capacity, and better relations with the public as schools face decline. (See citations 10, 33, 50, 55 and 107.)

9. BECK, W.W. (1976). "Everybody Got into the Act When Blackwell Closed a School." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 35, 46.

Beck, superintendent of Blackwell, Oklahoma Schools, describes his district's decision to reorganize and convert one elementary school into a districtwide kindergarten and special education center. Key ingredients in the reorganization plan were extensive community involvement (in the shape of a task force) and school board support and cooperation.

10. BELLON, J.J. (1977). "Strengthening the Educational Program in a Period of Decline," in Declining Enrollments and School Closings, edited by J.D. Bailey. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education. pp. 12-16. ED 143 099.

Focuses on developing "organizational problem solving capacities" in school systems undergoing decline. Outlines six planning and management steps to be taken.

11. BERMAN, P., and MCLAUGHLIN, M.W. (1978). "The Management of Decline: Problems, Opportunities, Research Questions," in Declining Enrollments: Challenge of the Decade, edited

by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 305-330. ED 150 708.

Analysis of what decline means for schools' organizational practices, formal and informal. Discusses the difference between contraction and expansion and shows how the former is not merely the reverse of the latter. Points out how we can better understand schools' responses to decline by benefitting from existing research on school adaptation to externally initiated change and innovation.

12. BERNHARDT, V.L. (1980). Projecting Student Enrollments: A Basic Step in Comprehensive School District Planning for Declining Enrollment. Eugene, Oregon: Oregon State Division of Research, Development and Evaluation. 166 pp. ED 187 020.

Four case studies describing enrollment projection methods presently in use in four different metropolitan areas. This book also describes projection methodologies that utilize data other than past enrollment trends: land use adjustment and the balancing factor.

13. BINS, M., and TOWNSEL, A.H. (1978). "Changing Declining Enrollments in Large City School Systems," in Declining Enrollment: Challenge of the Coming Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 129-186. ED 150 708.

Documents the special problems that big city school systems face in dealing with decline, fiscal and demographic. Notes that school systems suffer financially from the relative isolation (institutional separation) of school district governance from the activities and plans of the general city government.

14. BISHOP, L. (1979). "Dealing with Declining School Enrollments." Education and Urban Society (May) pp. 185-195.

Discussion of the social and political, as opposed to the technical issues, raised by declining school enrollments.

15. BORNSTEIN, L. (1978). "The Politics of Enrollment Decline." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the New Jersey School Board Association in Hightstown, New Jersey. 9 pp. ED 165 279.

Describes the conditions of enrollment decline in New Jersey and contends that because decline involves decisions that are not politically expedient, districts need to develop procedures to deal with it in as technical a

manner as possible.

16. BOULDING, K.E. (1974). "The Management of Decline." Address to the Regents Convocation of the University of the State of New York, Albany. 21 pp.

    Reviews the features of decline in American society at large. Boulding's speech also points out that as a larger and larger proportion of society experiences decline, the problem of transfer from declining to growing industries may grow acute. One of the first priorities facing education should be to create "a new generation of administrators who are skilled in the process of adjusting to decline." Boulding also calls for the establishment of "invisible colleges" of school administrators exchanging information about how to cope with decline.

17. BOYD, W.L. (1979). "Education Policymaking in Declining Suburban School Districts: Some Preliminary Findings." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 333-366.

    Data from a study of eight suburban Chicago school districts are used to assess the impact that decline has had on policymaking structures and practices. The article's focus is on the politics of school closure and Boyd develops a framework for understanding such politics based on prior research on suburban school conflict and politics.

18. BOYER, T.L., and NASSAU, S.M. (1978). "Legal Aspects of Declining Enrollment" in School Law Update -- 1977, edited by M.A. McGhehey. Topeka, Kansas: National Organization on Legal Problems of Education. 7 pp. ED 169 649.

    The greatest legal problems associated with declining enrollments are those that occur in conjunction with reductions in force. The authors suggest that school administrators and boards familiarize themselves with state tenure laws or have access to legal counsel who specialize in that area of the law. Administrators should make staffing decisions based on good estimates of enrollment and finances and not overlook the common sense approach -- fewer students means fewer staff.

19. BRODY, J.A. (1976). "How to Close a School and Not Tear Your Community Apart in the Process." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 31-35.

    Brody reviews some of the literature on decline and school closing and cites some examples of innovative district action. She concludes that even the best planning does not guarantee success, but that the easiest way to overcome

community resistance is to involve the community extensively in planning and decisionmaking. Closing a school will never be an easy process, but both sides must realize the emotional depth of the issue and act accordingly.

20. BROOKS, A. (1979). "Sharing: A Solution to Excess Space." Teacher. (February) pp. 59-60.

    Argues for allowing community agencies and groups to share vacant elementary classrooms during the regular school day. Contains a balanced discussion of the opportunities and problems presented by such an approach.

21. BROWN, J.W., and SERVILE, A.L. (1979). "Enrollment Decline and Institutional Size: Using Management Information to Ask The Right Questions." Cause/Effect. (September) pp. 22-25.

    Discusses the importance of local data bases in order to improve management and planning capacity. Provides enrollment projection examples to illustrate this point.

22. BRUBACHER, J.W., and SHIBLES, M.R. (1979). "Organizational Decline: Implications for Research." Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the Northeastern Educational Research Association in Boston. 20 pp. ED 179 017.

    Previous assumptions may no longer be valid as organizations are confronted by problems of retrenchment and decline. This paper presents a review of the literature on decline in order to form new hypotheses. The authors state that there is little conceptual literature on decline and almost none in educational administration journals. The paper goes on to: provide a historical background on the development of decline as a major force influencing public and private institutions, outline some of the causes of decline, describe some of the implications of decline, and suggest new directions for research.

23. BRUNETTI, F. (1974). "Enrollment Decline." Council of Education Facilities Planners Journal. (August) pp. 10-12.

    Brief description of factors precipitating decline and indicators which enable school managers to anticipate a decline in enrollments.

24. BULAT, D.D. (1977). "Facility Challenges in Retrospect and Prospect." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (September-October) pp. 4 - 8.

    First person account by the facilities planners of Duval County Schools in Jacksonville, Florida.

25. BURLINGAME, M. (1979). "Declining Enrollments and Small Rural Cities and Districts: An Exploratory Analysis." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 313-332.

Discussion of the effect of community values on school district problem-solving in response to enrollment decline. Based on case studies of decline and school closing in nine rural, east Illinois school districts.

26. BYRON, R.E. (1978). "Equalization of Education Opportunity in Indiana." Journal of Education Finance. (Spring) pp. 432-442.

Notes the impact of declining enrollment on allocation of state aid. Unintentionally, existing formulas in the context of decline compound the inequities produced by differences in school district wealth.

27. CARLSON, K.E. (1979). "Planning for Gifted/Talented During Declining Enrollment." Roeper Review. (September) pp. 14-15.

Suggests methods of preserving and enriching gifted and talented programs during periods of declining enrollment.

28. CARR, M.K. (1980). "Reduction in Force -- Is Your Board Prepared?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National School Boards Association in San Francisco. 19 pp. ED 192 433.

This paper reviews the legal implications of reduction in force actions for school boards. Litigation developing out of RIF falls into three general categories: constitutional, statutory, and contract questions. Constitutional challenges arise when a termination results in infringement of procedural or substantive constitutional rights. In cases involving racial discrimination, the courts make frequent use of the Singleton criteria. These are discussed. Statutory issues include seniority and tenure, legal qualifications, hearing rights, sufficiency of evidence, and call-back rights. Boards should also foresee the need for RIF and include provisions in negotiated contracts. The provisions in the Phoenix (Arizona) Union High School contract are offered as examples.

29. COLTON, D., and FRELICH, A. (1979). "Enrollment Decline and School Closings in a Large City." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 396-417.

Compares the folklore about the "best way to close schools" with data about 37 school closings in St. Louis between 1968-1977. Finds that the recipes are not applicable to large cities with highly bureaucratized school administrations.

30. ———— (1979). "Utilization of Surplus School Buildings." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (July-August) pp. 10-11.

Discussed the advantages and disadvantages of five alternate uses of surplus school space.

31. CROWE, R.L. (1979). "Can Logical Decisionmaking Work on School Closings and Other Hot Issues? Sure." The Executive Educator. (March) pp. 19-21.

A step-by-step explanation of a method used by superintendents to close schools in Quincy and Jacksonville, Illinois.

32. CUBAN, L. (1979). "Shrinking Enrollment and Consolidation: Political and Organizational Impacts in Arlington, Virginia 1973-1978." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 367-395.

Article describes Arlington, Virginia's experience with decline and consolidation, analyzes the political and organizational effects of that experience, and, on the basis of that analysis, looks at the literature on declining enrollments and school mergers. Concludes with an identification of the difficulties with existing research and suggests some directions to pursue. Case study is qualitative and historical-descriptive. Based on personal experience of author as superintendent of Arlington public schools.

33. CULBERTSON, J. (1977). "Educational Leadership: The Uses of Adversity," in Declining Enrollments and School Closings edited by J.D. Bailey. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education, pp. 39-49. ED 143 099.

Focuses on new leadership styles and attitudes required of educators in conditions of retrenchment. Argues that adversity can be an opportunity and that contraction can promote change.

34. CUSTIS, J. (1978a). "Staff Cuts: Maybe They're Inevitable but They Don't Have To Be Bloody." Updating School Board Policies. (March) pp. 1-4.

Describes basic policy questions in reduction in force and six traps to be avoided.

35. CUSTIS, J. (1978b). "Don't Shut Out the Community When You Shut Down a School." Updating School Board Policies. (June) pp. 1-3.

Gives advice on involving the community in school closure procedures.

36. DACE, D. (1979). "The Arts are Alive and Well Through Reorganization." Art Education. (September) pp. 28-30.

First hand account of how an art program was saved in the face of declining enrollments.

37. DAVIS, R.G., and LEWIS, G.M. (1976). The Demographic Background to Changing Enrollments and School Needs. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Center for the Study of Public Policy. 53 pp. ED 122 415.

Analysis of both the short and long-range implications of fluctuating enrollments in schools.

38. DAVIS, R.G., and LEWIS, G.M. (1977). "Coping With Declining Enrollments." NASSP Bulletin. (March) pp. 1-7.

Discusses the impact of declining enrollments on school programs and on curriculum and teaching.

39. DEMBOWSKI, F.L. (1980). "The Effects of Declining Enrollment on the Instructional Programs of Public Elementary and Secondary Schools." Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the American Educational Research Association in Boston. 24 pp. ED 184 208.

The study this paper is based on had three sections:

(1) A review of the literature to assess the causes, patterns, and effects of declining enrollments.

(2) An analysis of studies and histories of school districts with declining enrollment to ascertain findings, conclusions, and recommendations.

(3) A nationwide survey of 95 school districts was used to:

a. Assess the current effects of declining enrollments on instructional and supervisory programs

b. Determine how school administrators are coping with the problem.

This paper provides an extensive discussion of Part 3 of the study, the survey of school districts.

40. DEMBOWSKI, F.L., and GAY, G. (1980). "Instructional Effects of Declining Enrollments." Educational Leadership. (November) pp. 173-175.

Summary report of a nationwide survey of 95 school districts' responses to enrollment decline. Special focus upon instructional and supervisory programs.

41. DEMBOWSKI, F.L., et al. (1979). The Effects of Declining Enrollments on Instructional Progress and Supervisory

Practices in Public Elementary and Secondary Schools. Alexandria, Virginia: Association for Supervision and Curriculum. 127 pp. ED 181 550.

The only nationwide study of the impact of declining enrollments on curriculum. Sample included 320 school districts, stratified according to size and location, and compared according to enrollment: increasing, stable, and decreasing. 95 districts responded, data was for the period 1970-1977.

42. DITZHAZY, H.E.R. (1977). "The Principal and the Law: Suspension and Reductions in Staff." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Association of Secondary School Principals in New Orleans. 12 pp. ED 137 987.

The first part of this two-part paper deals with suspension and dismissal as means to correct teacher behavior. The second part examines the need to cut staff in times of decline and recounts some means districts use to cope with its effect. Running through both topics is the author's belief that teachers ought not to be treated like "commodities."

43. DIVOKY, D. (1979). "Burden of the Seventies: The Management of Decline." Phi Delta Kappan. (October) pp. 87-91.

It has become clear that gearing down is not the reverse of gearing up, Divoky writes. Decline is a lot harder to handle than expansion. Long-term planning is the most important thing needed to meet the problem. The article reviews some of the problems inherent in RIF, closing buildings, and leasing empty space.

44. DOWNEY, G.W. (1976). "What School Boards Do When That Irresistable Force Called RIF Meets That Immovable Object Called Affirmative Action." American School Boards Journal. (October) pp. 35-39.

This article discusses in detail the conflict that occurs between the demands of RIF and the demands of seniority and affirmative action. Downey describes the Bremerton, Washington school district policy of following seniority in RIF until affirmative action will be damaged. At that time, the district constructs affirmative action personnel seniority lists and protects them in any layoff. Local control and initiative should provide the solution to these conflicts, Downey states. The courts and Federal and state government have not helped, leaving local school districts "virtually alone in their search for equitable, impartial solutions."

45. EDLEPSON, C., et al. (1977). Participatory Planning in a School District: A Study Using Three Theoretical Approaches. Palo Alto, California: Palo Alto Unified School District. 285 pp. ED 159 778.

This is the report of an NIE-funded study carried out in an upper middle class suburb (pseudonym "Meadow City") on alternative frameworks for evaluation of a participatory planning project, Project Redesign. Three theoretical frameworks were used.

(1) The "rational evaluation model" judged the quality of the project's decisions and outcomes. Evaluated by this method, "Meadow City's" participatory planning, involving large numbers of parents, teachers and administrators, was not a success.

(2) The "organized anarchy model" which sees planning as a good in itself because of its informational and emotional value for its participants. Viewed in this way, Project Redesign was valuable to the school district.

(3) The "symbolic interaction model" which sees planning as a renegotiation of the unwritten contract between school and community. Viewed in this way, the authors conclude Project Redesign was quite valuable to the District.

46. EDUCATION COMMISSION OF THE STATES. (1977). Retrenchment in Education. The Outlook for Women and Minorities. Report No. F76-9. Denver: Education Commission of the States. 33 pp. ED 141 954.

Reviews the causes and effects of decline and the extent of those effects on women and minorities in education. Although data in this area of inquiry is incomplete for a variety of reasons, the information in this booklet presents a trend in reduction in force, tenure, unemployment, collective bargaining, and employment opportunities for teachers that indicates that retrenchment affects women and minorities more seriously than the general population.

47. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1974). "Closing A School: Some Ways to Ease the Trauma." School Management. (August-September) pp. 33-36.

Eisenberger provides some tactics for dealing with the issues and the community when enrollments drop and a school must be closed. The most critical problems relating to school closings are "people problems" and this article suggests several ways of solving the problem with interpersonal dealings.

48. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1975). "How to Prepare the Public for the Closing of a Neighborhood School." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 42-45.

Eisenberger gives five general techniques for reducing the potential for adverse public reaction to a school closing: (1) channel communication throughout the community and within the school administration; (2) gather ample information within the school district; (3) use varied techniques to ease tension; (4) involve the community directly; and (5) spread the word many ways.

49. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1976). "Enrollment Decline: The Task Force." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Association of School Administrators in Atlantic City, New Jersey. 17 pp. ED 125 129.

Eisenberger describes the factors that determine the success or failure of the school closing task force. Districts just beginning to confront school closings should use extended study committees, which meet once or twice a month for nine months to a year. On the other hand, if decisions are needed quickly, in-depth seminars which meet 9-5 for two successive weekends may be useful. Eisenberger makes the point that in-depth seminars are most successful in highly sophisticated, cosmopolitan communities. Also discussed are the composition, leadership, and charge of the force. Organizational structure, Eisenberger writes, is the most crucial factor and she provides a sketch of a successful task force. As an example of an objective method, Eisenberger describes the use of the KEMEC model.

50. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1977). "Ways of Meeting Decline," in Declining Enrollments and School Closings, edited by J.D. Bailey. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education. pp. 34-38. ED 143 099.

Deals with the processes of school districts' responses to decline with a special focus on community involvement and a discussion of citizens' advisory committees and task forces.

51. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1978). "How to Manage Decline in Your School System." American School Board Journal. (July) pp. 36-38.

Shows that there are three key skills necessary for local school boards' management of decline: decisionmaking, long range planning, and "marshalling support for the implementation of the long range plan."

52. EISENBERGER, K.E. (1979). "Demographic Trends: The Implications and Costs for Public Education." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (May-June) p. 79.

Discusses implications for public schools of three demographic facts: decline in school age pupils, increase in one-parent families and increase in the number of working mothers.

53. EISMANN, D., et al. (1976). Schools and Neighborhoods Research Study: Phase One -- Executive Summary. Seattle, Washington: Seattle Public Schools. 44 pp. ED 133 910.

This report is a summary of the research conducted in Phase One of the Schools and Neighborhoods Research Study. The program's objectives, each of which represents a separate study, are to identify the perceptions and expectations of neighborhood residents and businesses with respect to the school, to identify the services provided by the neighborhood school, and to determine the significance of the neighborhood school to the maintenance and the development of the neighborhood unit. The research approach used a pre- and post-closure comparison of selected variables. Four general questions provide the framework for reporting the findings -- (1) Is the "quality" of a neighborhood changed by school closure? (2) Are residents less satisfied with their neighborhood and schools after school closure? (3) Does school closure affect the quality of education available to students in the closure neighborhood? (4) Does school closure affect school levy support? In the study, each of the four neighborhoods in which an elementary school had been closed was matched with a similar neighborhood in which a school had not been closed.

54. ENGELHARDT, N.L. (1974). "Here's a Five-Year Plan for Forecasting." Nation's Schools. (May) pp. 51, 54.

Provides a four-step procedure for projecting enrollment for five years in advance.

55. ESTES, N. (1977). "Budget and Management in a Period of Declining Enrollments," in Declining Enrollments and School Closings, edited by J.D. Bailey. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education. pp. 24-33. ED 143 099.

School superintendent of Dallas, Texas discusses program budgets, zero-based budgets, and other improvements in management and productivity measures.

56. FOWLER, D.H. (1979). "Declining Enrollments: Staffing for the Eighties." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Association of Secondary School Principals in Houston. 7 pp. ED 172 429.

In this short paper the author outlines the basics of the problem of decline explaining that the school districts that survive will be the ones that recognize decline early and build their programs and plans to meet the problem. It is necessary to secure, as far as possible, information on the fiscal impact on decline and community demography. Administrators should look carefully at tenure, RIF, early retirement, and retirement incentives. In conclusion, the author states, schooling will benefit by the new thinking and creative leadership that decline requires.

57. FOWLER, D.H. (1980). "Effects of Declining Numbers: Poverty? Procrastination? Planning." NASSP Bulletin. (November) pp. 1-6.

Discusses planning issues confronting administrators of districts facing decline including budgets and programs, community demands, and personnel problems.

58. FREDERICKSON, J.H. (1978a). "Must Declining Enrollment Mean Closing Schools?" American School and University. (June) pp. 60-61.

Suggests steps for developing a "master plan" to review the opportunities to improve programs that are presented by pupil enrollment decline.

59. FREDERICKSON, J.H. (1978b). "Must Declining Enrollment Mean Closing Schools?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National School Boards Association in Anaheim, California. 7 pp. ED 149 456.

This paper presents an outline of the steps school districts should follow for effective long-range planning in coping with decline. The steps include: (1) evaluate present programs in light of current legal requirements and educational trends and innovations; (2) appraise structural qualities of existing school facilities; (3) conduct community-wide surveys to assess economic growth potential; (4) carry out annual preschool censuses and districtwide enrollment projections; (5) prepare for possible purchase, lease, or sale of school sites and buildings; (6) investigate architectural innovations; (7) develop educational specifications for further projects; and (8) develop a dissemination procedure to keep public aware of district activities and objectives. Only after these steps have been taken should existing surplus space be considered in terms of how it might be affected by recent Federal

legislation, whether it can be adapted for future educational activities, or finally leased or sold to other agencies.

60. FREDERICKSON, J.H. (1980). "Coping with Declining Enrollment." Middleton, Wisconsin. 8 pp. ED 188 347.

A brief outline of the effects of decline on teachers, curriculum, community relations, administrators, and facilities. Presents a step-by-step process to determine what to do with a partially used or unused school and considers how might present surplus space be: (1) affected by Federal legislation; (2) utilized efficiently for other educationally oriented activities; (3) adapted effectively to suit future needs or clientele; or (4) leased or sold to other educational or non-educational agencies.

61. FREEMAN, J., and HANNAN, M.T. (1981). Effects of Resources and Enrollments on Growth and Decline in School Districts: Evidence from California and New York. Palo Alto, California: Institute for Research on Educational Finance and Governance, Stanford University. 34 pp.

Report of a study conducted to test a model of intra-organizational conflict and politics, in institutions under decline. Used data from 823 school districts in California, and 849 in New York. Comparison was on organizational response in staffing patterns, between declining and growing districts throughout the 1970's.

62. GALLUP, G.H. (1978). "The 10th Annual Gallup Poll of the Public's Attitudes Toward the Public Schools." Phi Delta Kappan. (September) pp. 33-45.

In ascertaining public views on a variety of subjects impacting on the public schools, Gallup reports the ten most popular answers to the free response question: "What suggestions do you have as to how vacant school buildings might be used?"

63. GETZELS, J.N. (1976). Recycling Public Buildings: Report No. 319. Chicago: American Society of Planning Officials.

Contains a chapter dealing with other public and community uses of surplus school buildings.

64. GORES, H.B. (1976). "Declining Enrollments and Options for Unused Space." NASSP Bulletin. (May) pp. 92-97.

Offers suggestions for use of excess space in school buildings.

66. GREEN, A.C. (1974). "Planning for Declining Enrollment." School Review. (August) pp. 595-600.

Deals with effective "space-utilization." Emphasizes the importance of community and inter-agency involvement in decisions about school facilities under conditions of decline.

66. GREEN, R.T. (1980). "Richmond's Progressive Solution to Declining Enrollments." Phi Delta Kappan. (May) pp. 616-617.

Describes how one school district consolidated its seven high schools into three complexes. Outlines student assignment, staffing changes, and the public relations aspects of the consolidation.

67. HAUN, F.R. (1978). "Reduction in Force: Is Your Board Prepared?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National School Boards Association in Anaheim, California. 22 pp. ED 154 524.

Reviews the steps necessary to avoid the adverse effects of RIF. Reduction in force policies should be developed and adopted before you need them, up-to-date enrollment projections and anticipating staffing needs are a must, boards of education should keep the public informed, alternatives to RIF should be exhausted, and evaluation should be part of any selection procedure. Data is also provided on RIF policies in Nebraska and the appendix provides a sample staff evaluation procedure from Wayne, Nebraska.

68. HEISNER, J.D. (1980). "The Upper Merion Strike: Just One Part of the Iceberg." Instructor. (February) pp. 18, 20, 22.

Describes a teachers' strike in Upper Merion, Pennsylvania. At issue was teacher evaluation in times of decline.

69. HENTSCHKE, G. (1977a). "Assessing the Impact of Enrollment Decline on Operating Costs." Educational Economics. pp. 10-15.

Notes that operating costs and the overall picture for educational policymaking in any given school district are shaped by a complex interaction of enrollment trends and a variety of other relevant factors, including: negotiated labor settlements, inflation rates, amounts of state aid, local tax rates and property wealth. Author's "cost/volume" model permits both a projection of school district operating costs and an analysis of the factors interacting with enrollment trends to influence these costs.

70. HENTSCHKE, G. (1977b). "Managing Urban School System Resources: New Procedures, Additional Actors," in The Financing of

Quality Education: Proceedings of a Symposium. Rochester, New York: Rochester University, College of Education. 30 pp. ED 177 673.

In adjusting to the demands of their new economic situations, urban school systems might well seek new ways to reallocate existing resources and enter into cooperative ventures with other organizations to gain additional resources. Hentschke discusses four ways of reallocating existing resources: zero-based budgeting, long-range planning, internal audits, and systems for personnel development. He also describes two ways of generating new instructional resources, one involving career education, the other having to do with an innovative organizational arrangement of the school system.

71. HESS, F., et al. (1979a). Declining Enrollments: National Problem -- Local Response. East Syracuse, New York: East Syracuse-Minoa Central Schools. 50 pp. ED 172 398.

Discusses both national and local aspects of declining enrollments and describes the process of planning and implementing reorganization in the East Syracuse-Minoa school district of New York.

72. HESS, F., et al. (1979b). They Left Their Audience Applauding: How One District's Reorganization Efforts Won Approval -- and Cheers. East Syracuse, N.Y.: East Syracuse-Minoa Central Schools. 16 pp. ED 172 399.

This paper describes the process of appointing a citizen task force to study reorganization, the task force's recommendations and resulting district action and school board work sessions, all resulting in a plan to combine elementary grades, create partnerships, and reduce the number of middle schools which later won public board meeting approval.

73. HICKCOX, E.S., and RYAN, D.W. (1979). "Governance and Administration in a Period of Declining Enrollments." Curriculum Inquiry. (Winter) pp. 305-320.

Discusses the management and governance implications of decline, with a special emphasis on the politics of decision-making and responsiveness to community attitudes regarding program and school closings.

74. HOSLER, A. and WELDY, G.R. (1977). "A Case Study: How One District is Closing a High School." NASSP Bulletin. (March) pp. 35-46.

Authors note that the uprooting of students, staff and community brought about by a closing demands thorough

planning. This necessity is illustrated via a description of how Niles Township (Illinois) closed one of its high schools. Description contains detail about the use of citizens/staff advisory committees. Authors were principals of the schools affected by the closure decision.

75. IANNACONE, L. (1979). "The Management of Decline: Implications of Our Knowledge in the Politics of Education." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 418-430.

Noting that any response to decline is a political process, Iannacone argues that management of decline would be easier if administrators understood, or rather, had access to, an available body of research knowledge about the politics of education. Concludes that school administrators, in dealing with decline, are called upon to be "political conflict managers" rather than technicians.

76. IMHOF, H.E. (1976). Declining Enrollment: A Blessing. n.d. 8 pp. ED 120 913.

Report describes how an Oyster Bay, New York school district took advantage of a decline in elementary school enrollment to restructure the district's educational program, reduce staff requirements, and eliminate double shifting at the district's junior high and high school. The district's plan involved closing one of the three elementary schools and converting the building into a middle school, thereby freeing the former high school/junior high school building for full-time use as a high school. Also describes efforts by the board of education and the district administration to win support for the plan and the bond issue it required among staff members, students and the community.

77. I/D/E/A. (1975). Shrinking Schools: An I/D/E/A Occasional Paper. Dayton, Ohio: Institute for Development of Educational Activities, Inc. 32 pp. ED 116 292.

This report reflects the information gathered by I/D/E/A when they convened a seminar on the problems of the nation's schooling system as a shrinking enterprise. Information is presented on: the extent of decline and its effects; the causes of and detail on the decline in birthrate; the work of Lewis B. Mayhew on the characteristics of management and staff under decline; ways of predicting decline; and "the Salt Lake City approach" which includes open bidding for vacated buildings, working with neighboring districts to find new positions for RIF'd teachers, staffing based on mid-year enrollments, and getting people in the community

to see that when you close a school a part of the program is preserved.

78. IOWA ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOL BOARDS. (1978). Rural Education Study Committee: 1976-78 Report. Des Moines, Iowa: Association of School Boards. 37 pp. ED 168 781.

Report of a two-year study on the problems of small rural school districts faced with enrollment decline and accelerated consolidation. Outlines practitioners' testimony about the benefits of small schools and small school districts and the costs of maintaining them in light of decline. Contains a listing of resource materials for managers of small schools.

79. JASCOURT, H.D. (1978). "The Role of Negotiations in the Equation 'Declining School Enrollment = Layoffs': An Overview." Journal of Law and Education. (April) pp. 239-242.

Provides an overview of the interaction between collective bargaining and RIF procedures.

80. JESS, J.D. (1979). "Revitalizing Rural Education and Small Schools in Iowa." A position paper prepared for the House and Senate Education Committee of the 68th Iowa General Assembly, First Session. 28 pp. ED 165 942.

This report, prepared by the author for People United for Rural Education (PURE), was presented to the House and Senate Education Committee of the Iowa General Assembly as a position paper. It describes both the national and the Iowa situation of rural and small schools and present guidelines and suggests alternatives for legislative action. Also included is information on rural school and district classification, decline in rural schools, Iowa's rural teachers, a list of Iowa's school districts under 650 enrollment, and examples of some other states' policies on districts with small enrollments.

81. KALVELAGE, J. (1978). "Reductions in Force and Affirmative Action." Educational Economics. (January-February) pp. 12-14, 23.

Suggests how, by allowing permanent part-time work, and by creating positions for "job sharers", school districts can redistribute available positions among current staff thereby avoiding RIF and jeopardy to affirmative action goals.

82. KATNER, N.C. (1974). "A Superintendent Looks At Community Education and Facilities." Community Education Journal.

(November-December) pp. 49-50.

Proposes community involvement when deciding whether to close a school building or to use it for other community purposes.

83. KELLEY, E.A. (1978). Reduction in Force: Policies, Practices and Implications for Education. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska at Lincoln, Division of Educational Services, Teachers College and the Division of Continuing Studies. 85 pp.

Good review of the state policies, local practices and trade-offs involved in RIF policies.

84. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1974a). "Early Warning Signs of an Enrollment Drop." School Management. (August-September) pp. 32, 36-37, 42.

Provides a description of indicators which signal a coming decline in enrollments.

85. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1974b). "How To Tell If Your District Is on The Brink of an Enrollment Decline." American School Board Journal. (February) pp. 54-55.

High real estate values will cause suburban populations to become increasingly older, Keough writes, thereby accelerating decline and causing suburban school enrollments to dwindle. Keough goes on to provide a list of seven enrollment indicators that planners may use to predict the occurrence of decline and then provides another list of eight indicators that might show that development of a contingency plan is warranted.

86. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1975). "How To Make The Best of Your School District's Enrollment Slide." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 40-42.

Keough points out that declining enrollments produce a "ripple-in-the-pond" effect: the number of pupils declines, so does need for teachers and classroom space, and as the teaching force is reduced and classrooms are filled to less than capacity, the demand for supervisors narrows. With the tapering need for personnel and space, fewer buildings are required. Keough also states that the upgrading of educational quality should be the first natural result of lowered enrollments. However, staff cutbacks are necessary and Keough lists some options school planners have adopted to accomplish teacher reduction. Also listed are some ways to head off the "job security-RIF hassle."

87. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1978a). Declining Enrollments: A New Dilemma for Educators. A Phi Beta Kappan Fastback No. 116. Bloomington, Indiana: Phi Beta Kappa. 45 pp. ED 165 301.

Overview and analysis of the key issues raised by decline. Reminds readers that declining enrollments will mean higher per-pupil costs despite cost-cutting measures. Talks about "creative" responses to decline such as space-sharing, student regrouping, and early retirement for staff. Urges that school systems engage in long range planning and that there be participation by all affected parties -- staff, students, parents, taxpayers -- in the preparation of such plans.

88. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1978b). "Enrollment Decline: The Dilemma From the Superintendent's Chair," in Declining Enrollment: Challenge of the Coming Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 331-370.

An overview of the many issues faced by managers of school systems in decline, with reference to the experience of Nassau County (Long Island), New York. Topics covered include: RIF, school closure, community involvement, and new administrative practices called for by decline.

89. KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1978c). "Here are the Greatest, Most Up-to-Datest Ways to Project Enrollments." Executive Educator. (October) pp. 42-44.

Brief description of non-demographic signals which alert school managers to coming declines in enrollment.

90. KILLICK, J. (1980). "Coping With Contraction: The Management of Teaching Staff." Education. (Fall) pp. 28-34.

Discussion of the overall problems associated with decline, with a special focus on personnel issues and on the need for inservice education. Also discusses curriculum and warns school managers to expect per-pupil costs to rise in smaller schools.

91. KIRSCHENSTEIN, J (1980). "Planning for Public Schools -- Infrastructure Fee and Developer Responsibilities." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (January-February) pp. 4-5.

Proposition 13 and other legislation have adversely affected finances available for school planning. Suggested solutions included early involvement of development teams with community and district planning staffs and the use of advisory committees and professional private-sector research consulting firms.

92. KLAS, W., et al. (1979). "Survival and Improvement -- Can We Have Both?" Thrust for Educational Leadership. (January) pp. 23-25.

The author suggests that schools facing the challenge of declining enrollment and reduced budgets should seek community involvement in sorting educational priorities.

93. KNAPP, H., and JONES, R.M. (1979). "National Report on School Closing Survey: The Impact on Purchasing Departments." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association of School Business Officials in Denver. 20 pp. ED 177 688.

A brief report on the impact of school closings on purchasing departments. Reviews the basis of decline and explains that the role of purchasing departments will change in three major ways: (1) The budget will be reduced in the areas of personnel, supplies, textbooks, furniture equipment, and services. Since there will be fewer students, less money will be alloted for instructional materials. (2) The purchasing department will be called on to increase its efficiency. (3) The purchasing department will be called on to dispose of property that becomes surplus.

94. LEGGETT, S. (1973). "How to Forecast Enrollments Accurately -- and Years Ahead." American School Board Journal. (January) pp. 25-31.

Advice on how school managers can obtain and use data needed to project local school enrollments.

95. LEGGETT, S. (1977). "You Don't Always Have to Close a School Just Because Enrollment is Dwindling." American School Board Journal. (February) pp. 27-28.

Suggests cost-effective ways of operating small schools so that students will be offered a "superior caliber of enrichment that is achieved only in uncrowded classroom setting."

96. LEGGETT, S. (1978). "Sixteen Questions to Ask -- and Answer Before You Close a Small School." American School Board Journal. (April) pp. 38-39.

Explores the fallacy behind some common assumptions about the inherent inefficiencies of small schools and suggests 16 means for cutting costs that districts should consider before closing schools.

97. LEPPERT, J., and ROUTH, D. (1978). "An Analysis of State School Finance Systems as Related to Declining Enrollments," in Declining Enrollments: Challenge of the Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 187-208.

ED 150 708.

State funding mechanisms developed largely during periods of growth tend to relate state allocations directly or indirectly to student count, and therefore, during periods of declining enrollment, state funds are reduced in proportion to the district's loss of students. This report:

(1) presents figures on state declines between 1970 and 1975;

(2) identifies and summarizes state funding formula mechanisms which serve to soften the blow of decline;

(3) presents a state-by-state analysis of four variables related to state aid distribution and declining enrollments: the primary unit funded, establishment of the value of that unit, extent of funding of categorical programs not tied to enrollment figures, and the significance of the share of state support to districts with declining enrollment.

A concluding section summarizes findings and their significance for state policymakers undertaking the management of decline.

98. LIEBERMAN, M. (1976). "The Future of the Custodial School." Phi Beta Kappan. (September) pp. 122-125.

Lieberman cites four national studies that agree that kids of secondary school age spend too much time in school. Studies have also shown that secondary students learn as much even when attendance in school is reduced. However, Lieberman argues, there is little political or economic support for his idea to reduce the time of school attendance. He does note, however, that one factor could make the "youth protectionist line" vulnerable -- declining enrollments. Decline will bring with it a substantial decrease in the proposition of teenagers in the labor force, severe shortages in youth labor market will result, and will bring pressure to weaken regulations that prohibit employment of youth in their early to middle teens.

99. LITTLE, D.L. (1980). "Demographic Projections and Educational Policy Issues," in Needs of Elementary and Secondary Education in the 1980's: A Compendium of Policy Papers. Washington, D.C.: Congress of the United States, House Committee on Education and Labor, Subcommittee on Elementary, Secondary, and Vocational Education. 25 pp. ED 194 475.

Contains data on changes in demographic patterns in the U.S., including: the declining birth rate; population shifts from "Snow Belt" to "Sun Belt"; population increase in rural areas; changing family structure

(teenagers with children, unmarried parents, single parent families); and changes in the racial and ethnic composition of the population. Little discusses several implications of these changes, including: adjusting national policy to regional trends; developing flexible school plants that can adjust to the impact of demographic trends, and a system with fewer clients with greater needs.

100. MALLOY, L. (1973). Community/Schools: Sharing the Space and the Action. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories.

One of the earliest guides to alternative use of excess space in schools. Deals with the details of multiple occupancy (i.e., schools and other human service agencies) of school facilities.

101. MARCH, J.G. (1974). "Commitment and Competence in Educational Administration," in Educational Leadership and Declining Enrollments, edited by L.B. Mayhew. Berkeley: McCutchan. pp. 131-141.

Comments on the changing role of administrators, as their organizations change from growth to decline. Focus is on new attitudes and role orientations rather than on techniques.

102. MASTORAKI, F. (1978). "Reduction in Force, Bridgeton Public Schools: Options, Opportunities and Fiscal Impacts of Declining Enrollment." n.d. 17 pp. ED 172 418.

As Bridgeton, New Jersey public schools were excluded from a new regional school district in 1976-77, enrollment and income from tuition declined drastically and a reduction in force was necessary. This paper includes a description of the steps taken, a sample policy, descriptions of the changes made in personnel, programs, facilities, and budgets, and a bibliography of references used in the RIF process.

103. MAZZONI, T.L., and MUELLER, V.D. (1980). "School District Planning for Enrollment Decline." Phi Delta Kappan. (February) pp. 406-410.

Describes the policy challenges posed by enrollment decline and then discusses the importance of improving school districts' planning capabilities.

104. KANSAS CITY (MISSOURI) SCHOOLS. (1976). "Proposed Board of Education Policy on School Consolidation," in ERIC Reports (February) p. 19.

Schools are to be ranked each year by a local evaluation committee composed of citizens and administrators.

105. MITCHELL, P., and MILLER, B.P. (1980). "Surplus School Space -- Options and Trends." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (September-October) pp. 21-23.

Reports on a survey of 14 school districts in Arizona responding to a questionnaire concerning disposition of surplus school space.

106. MORGAN, H.M., and WOFFORD, J.W. (1977). Declining Enrollment, Rising School Costs: One School's Response: Identification of Appropriate Models of Cost Reduction (Capital and Manpower) and Specific Application Using a Local Decisionmaking Process. Lincoln-Sudbury, Massachusetts: Lincoln-Sudbury Regional School District. 252 pp.

Report of a project designed to involve elements of the school committee (the two principal investigators were members of the Lincoln-Sudbury, Massachusetts School Committee), administration, faculty, students, and the community at large in a rational planning process attempting to confront the problems of decline before its full impact hit the system. The School Committee applied for and received research funds, managed project, analyzed the data, and developed the findings (also included is a report from an independent evaluator). The study's questions were:

(1) Can a volunteer and part-time elected group lead a process of rational decisionmaking involving broad participation of multiple constituencies?
(2) What kind of support is required for the School Committee to perform in this more pro-active role?
(3) Can an approach be developed that will be useful to other communities facing the same issues?
(4) Can existing models of cost reduction be utilized in this setting?
(5) Given an appropriate format for the presentation of alternative solutions, including advantages and disadvantages, can communities make informed choices about schools and how to pay for them?

Three alternatives were eventually developed ("As Is", a Program of Essentials, and a Three-Year Program with Fourth-Year Options), reactions to alternatives and data about community were generated at a community meeting (questionnaire included in text) and were analyzed. The study also included the development of a model of the variables of the Lincoln-Sudbury High School system by Pugh-Roberts Associates, Cambridge, Massachusetts.

107. MORRIS, A.E. (1977). "Facilities: Options and Opportunities," in Declining Enrollments and School Closings, edited by J.D. Bailey. Topeka, Kansas: University of Kansas, School of Education. pp. 17-23. ED 143 099.

Detailed discussion of "issue areas" which need examination before a decision is made to close schools.

108. MORRISON, P.A. (1976). The Demographic Context of Educational Policy Planning. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Aspen Institute for Humanistic Studies. 32 pp.

This report reviews how demographic projections may impact on educational planning. It outlines the national demographic context and delineates three ways of considering the implication of these trends: the institutional perspective, the local bureaucratic perspective, and the perspective of the individual. Topics reviewed include: the future of the labor market for school teachers, variation in age composition in local populations, mid-life career redirection, a "sibling squeeze" in college attendance and some possible impacts of patterns of migration and settlement. Morrison then briefly outlines how demographic analysis can be used in three "modes" of problem solving: reactive problem solving, active trend modification, and goal orientation. The feasibility of the goal-oriented mode is questionable in a democracy, but Morrison concludes the other two are within reach.

109. MUELLER, V.D. (1977). "The Educational Policy Setting and Fluctuating School Enrollments." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association in New York. 26 pp. ED 137 950.

This paper describes the processes, elements, and attitudes educational policymakers need to meet the demands of decline. Mueller writes that public education is going through a period of change caused by forces in society, rather than forces within the educational system. He also presents the Minnesota State Planning Agency as one type of response to the pressure for orderly change.

110. NASSAU, S.M. (1978a). "Collectively Bargained Approaches to Declining School Enrollment." School Law Update -- 1977. Topeka, Kansas: National Organization on Legal Problems of Education. 10 pp. ED 169 650.

By dealing with this issue together through collective bargaining, administrators and teachers can reduce tensions over RIF and can agree on a process of giving appropriate notice and on a selection procedure. Also discusses affirmative action considerations and alternatives to layoffs.

111. NASSAU, S.M. (1978b). "The Role of Negotiations in the Equation 'Declining Enrollments = Layoffs': A Union Perspective." Journal of Law and Education. (April) pp. 265-278.

Describes possible collective bargaining strategies for dealing with the impact of decline and also discusses NEA proposed language for contract provisions on reduction in force.

112. ———— (1980). "Some Thoughts from Administrators of Small Schools." NASSP Bulletin. (October) pp. 43-50.

Six administrators present varied ideas on the program and operations of small schools. Only one of the six short pieces deals specifically with decline, but all present opinions and suggestions for change that are applicable to small schools.

113. NATIONAL ASSOCIATION OF STATE BOARDS OF EDUCATION. (1976). The Imperative of Leadership: Volume II, Number 1: A Report on Declining Enrollments. Denver: National Association of State Boards of Education. 20 pp.

Booklet presents national data on enrollment decline and its implications for school financing. Focus is on state policy initiatives to alleviate the impact of decline on local districts.

114. NATIONAL SCHOOL BOARDS ASSOCIATION. (1976). Declining Enrollment: Research Report. Evanston, Illinois: National School Boards Association. 30 pp. ED 122 439.

A concise review of the literature and overview of national survey data, circa 1975, offers an analysis of the key policy issues likely to be dealt with by local boards of education, suggestions, and decision-making guidelines. Also includes a 51-item bibliography.

115. NEWITT, J., and KAHN, H. (1977). The Schools' Community Roles in the Next Ten Years. Community Education Advisory Council Report No. 2. Washington, D.C. US/DHEW, Office of Education. 48 pp. ED 151 969.

This report has two major aims: (1) to communicate a sense of the context in which schools will be operating in the next 10 - 12 years and to show how that context differs from that of the past dozen years; and (2) to present two scenarios for the schools' overall community role in the next ten years. One scenario deals with growing communities; the other, declining ones. The report presents a general spectrum of the community roles that the schools can fill.

116. ———— (1978). "RIF"-ing New York City's Schools: Some Afterthoughts." New York University Quarterly (Spring) pp. 22-28.

Representatives from the Board of Education, the United Federation of Teachers, and the Public Education Association probe N.Y.C.'s experience with RIF in the 1975-77 fiscal crisis.

117. NOLTE, M.C. (1976a), "Follow These 'How-to's' When You Must Cut Your Staff." American School Board Journal. (July) pp. 26-27, 45.

RIF policies, Nolte states, are largely dependent on local conditions, but he offers some general guidelines in this article. Some of these recommendations are: develop a RIF policy early, stimulate natural attrition and cut expenses before RIFing, make RIF policies clear to employees and community, follow state and Federal laws concerning employees rights in layoffs, and reach agreement with teacher unions on procedures. Also included is a sample of RIF language in a negotiated contract.

118. NOLTE, M.C. (1976b). "How to Tell Which Teachers to Keep and Which to Lay Off." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 28-30.

RIF can succeed, Nolte writes, if districts avoid arbitrary or unsubstantiated actions, discrimination, and damaging teachers' professional reputations. It is equally important to follow state tenure laws and to support decisions with adequate factual information. Nolte also believes that districts should base reductions on teacher effectiveness determined primarily by student achievement and secondarily by the three criteria of firmness, friendliness, and fairness, which this article describes.

119. NOWAKOWSKI, J.A. (1980). "Hidden Opportunities in Declining Enrollments." American School and University. (April) pp. 40, 42, 44.

Argues that decline presents an opportunity for improvement of school management and shows how two Illinois school districts have developed innovative strategies in response to decline.

120. NUTTALL, R.L. (1976). "Positions on Declining Enrollment Issues and School Values Commitment." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association in San Francisco. 22 pp. ED 122 433.

An analysis of Citizen Advisory Committee on Declining Enrollment (CACDE) decisionmaking in an upper-middle class community of 88,000 . Author was a member of this committee.

121. NYQUIST, E.B. (1977). "Decremental Planning for Maximum Benefits." NASSP Bulletin. (March) pp. 54-58.

The author, Commissioner of Education for the State of New York, describes, in general terms, the assistance New York is providing to administrators involved with decline. He believes that the "hard-won gains" of the past need not be lost if educators take up "decremental planning" -- a term synonymous with the management of decline. Some of the reasoning and expectations secondary school principals should be familiar with are: Given the pressure to scale down quantitatively, which curriculum offerings are truly essential?; What alternatives are available for delivery of instruction in these essential areas?; and, What instructional services beyond the essential are both desirable and feasible?

122. ODDEN, A., and VINCENT, P.B. (1978). "The Fiscal Impacts of Declining Enrollments: A Study of Declining Enrollments in Four States -- Michigan, Missouri, South Dakota and Washington," in Declining Enrollment: The Challenge of the Coming Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 209-256. ED 150 708.

Report on a study of the types of school districts affected by enrollment declines and on the impact of decline on school expenditures. Primary focus is on how state aid policies may affect school districts' ability to deal with decline.

123. PACK, K., and WEISS, E.H. (1975). "And Specifically How to Make Productive Use out of all that Yawning Space." American School Board Journal. (June) pp. 44-45.

An early discussion of alternative uses for excess cla[illegible] rooms and buildings.

124. PARKS, G.A. (1980). "School Closings in a Rural U.S. County: Part II: The Case of Aurora Union Magisterial District, Population 2,030." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Education Research Association in Boston. 17 pp.

This report is an investigation into the impact of school consolidation on high school students who chose not to enroll for their last year of school after the high school in the small, rural community of Aurora (Preston County),

West Virginia had been closed. In-depth interviews were held with 13 young people who dropped out in an attempt to determine: (1) what happened to students who left school early; and (2) which of the many possible factors may have influenced them to leave high school. Reorganization of high schools in Preston County, W.V., caused students in Aurora to be bused to a larger community, Terra Alta. The drop-out rate increased 26% in the two years following consolidation. Students reported a loss of a sense of pride and ownership, a lack of improved instruction, and concern for the future of their community, but did not feel dropping out of high school would have negative consequences in the future. The author concludes that the case might have had a different outcome if investigation and assessment had taken place before consolidation was implemented.

125. PASNICK, M. (1979). "Are You Prepared For Declining Enrollments?" American School and University. (March) p. 65.

Lists items that should be included in a school building inventory. Outlines marketing strategies once a decision has been made to close a building and offer it for sale or lease.

126. PECKENPAUGH, D. (1977). "Closing a School? What the Principal Must Consider." NASSP Bulletin. (March) pp. 20-30.

Lists and discusses 19 tasks required of a principal during school closure. Based on procedures used by Birmingham, Michigan, schools in their closure of a junior high school. Deals with the emotional, political and human relations aspects of school closure as well as with housekeeping details.

127. PHAY, R.E. (1980). Reduction in Force: Legal Issues and Recommended Policy: NOLPE Monograph Series. Topeka, Kansas: National Organization on Legal Problems in Education. 54 pp. ED 195 013.

Briefly explains some of the causes of RIF and how RIF differs from dismissal for cause. Some of the legal issues involved with RIF are discussed, including: the authority of the board to eliminate positions; methods of determining what employees to terminate; allegations of bad faith; consolidating districts; the merger of districts for desegregation; bumping; transfers; the reduction of teachers to part-time status; timely notice; hearings; and burden of proof. A model RIF procedure is included in the appendix.

128. ———— (1978). "Ways of Dealing With Enrollment Decline." Phi Delta Kappan. (September) pp. 20-25.

Consultants and superintendents from Livonia (Michigan), New Orleans, Salt Lake City and Seattle discuss the impact of declining enrollments on their schools and some of the actions those districts are taking to cope with decline.

129. PIATT, R.S. (1975). A Reorganized Elementary School Structure to Accomodate Declining Enrollment. Doctoral dissertation, Nova University. 147 pp. ED 111 111.

A detailed, chronological case study of one district's response (South Allegheny School District in Pennsylvania) to decline. Response included changing the grade configuration in elementary schools from 1-6, to 1-3 and 4-6. This resulted in more balanced class sizes, more opportunities for multi-level instruction in reading and math, and closer professional contact between teachers of the same grade level. Difficulties and extra costs did arise, however, in the area of transportation. More than half of this report contains actual documents used in the planning process, including community survey questionnaire forms. Contains an extensive, albeit un-annotated, bibliography on the benefits of different grade configurations. Author was assistant superintendent in charge of the reorganization.

130. PIELE, P.K. (1979). "Property" in The Yearbook of School Law, 1979, edited by P.K. Piele. Topeka, Kansas: National Organization on Legal Problems of Education. 22 pp. ED 181 610.

The property section of this "Yearbook" describes various attempts by taxpayers to prevent construction or remodeling of public schools. Two cases, one in New York and the other in Wisconsin, are also noted where citizens fought to keep schools from being closed. In both cases, the courts upheld the authority of the school board to close schools and dispose of property. Contract cases dealing with arbitration, awards, breach of contract, recovery for materials and services, and wage rate violations are also discussed.

131. PIELE, P.K., and WRIGHT, D. (1976). Enrollment Forecasting. Educational Facilities Digest No. 1. Columbus, Ohio: Council of Educational Facilities Planners, International. 9 pp. ED 117 782.

The focus of this article is on the state of the art in enrollment forecasting but the authors note that political sensitivity and understanding the effects that social and political pressure groups can have on how facts are interpreted are just as important as knowing the strengths and

weaknesses of different forecasting techniques. Also included is a 28-item annotated bibliography on enrollment forecasting.

132. POUND, J. (1976). "How To Close a School Without Enraging the Public." ERIC Reports. (April) pp. 3-4.

Outlines a six-step procedure to close schools so that public support and understanding is increased.

133. POWELL, J.F., and STEMNOCK, S.K. (1975). Local Policies For Reduction in Force. ERS Information Aid. Arlington, Virginia: Educational Research Services, Inc. 18 pp. ED 105 574.

Concise overview of staff reduction problems, including newly gained job security rights of nontenured teachers and court mandated affirmative action requirements. Overview is of 70 policy questions regarding RIF procedures. Also included are sample RIF policies and contract provisions from 16 school districts.

134. RELIC, P.D. (1980). "Don't Let Quality Fall with Enrollments." American School Board Journal. (August) pp. 29-30.

Warns board members not to get preoccupied with short term responses to decline and neglect issues of quality, especially quality at the secondary level. Suggests criteria for quality and urges readers to consider test scores and other indicators such as percentage of students graduating, attendance statistics, and grade point averages. Noting that decline brings a contraction in, and an aging of, the teaching force, the author stresses the importance of inservice for school staff.

135. RICHARDS, K.N., and COHEN, J.S. (1981). The Closing of Elementary Schools: Impact on Young Children: Final Report. Ithaca, New York: Cornell University, Department of Human Development and Family Studies. 147 pp.

This report of a student-originated study at Cornell University explores the ways in which elementary school children responded to school closings in Ithaca, New York. Three groups of children participated in the study: children anticipating a school closing in the near future; children whose school closed nine months before; and children whose school hosted the students from the school that closed. In all, 143 children from the second through fifth grades were included as subjects. Data were collected using a variety of measures: individual interviews with the children, interviewer ratings, sociometric tests, parent questionnaires, and teacher evaluations. Results indicate

that children do respond to anticipated or actual school closings in a negative fashion. This reaction is related to the immediacy of the situation, that is, children anticipating a merger are most negative (approximately 80% are rated as responding negatively), those who attended the school that hosted the new students are least negative (35% rated as negative), while those children whose school closed nine months earlier fall somewhere in between (70% rated as negative). Although a child's reaction to a school closing seems to be both negative and persistent, it is not significantly related to age, sex, popularity, or to how well the child likes school in general. In addition, a child's reaction is not necessarily related to the reaction of his parents or to how well the child does in school academically, socially, or emotionally. Based on the suggestions of the children and their parents, recommendations were made to the local school district concerning ways in which negative reactions might be tempered and educational transitions facilitated by young children.

136. RINGERS, J. (1980). "Managing Underutilized Facilities During A Period of Declining Pupil Enrollment -- A Descriptive Study of Arlington, Virginia." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (January-February) p. 14.

Abstract of a study to discover the "politics of Arlington's experience with decline and school closure." Investigated "what" was decided, "who" participated in those decisions, and the "satisfaction level" of the participants.

137. ROBSON, D.L., et al. (1979). The Projected Effects of Population Change on Vocational Technical Education. Final Report. Indianapolis, Indiana: Indiana State Board of Vocational and Technical Education. 60 pp. ED 183 758.

This study reviews the literature on the future of both general and vocational education and of the effects of decline on both fields and makes some recommendations and observations regarding the future of vocational/technical education.

138. RODEKOHR, M. (1975). Adjustments of Colorado School Districts to Declining Enrollments. Lincoln, Nebraska: Nebraska Curriculum Development Center. 51 pp. ED 125 156.

Study is organized into three major sections. In the first, data is collected for school districts in the state of Colorado, 73 of which had experienced decline (measured in terms of percent change in average daily attendance 1961-62 to 1969-70) and 108 of which had experienced some growth. Data were analyzed to test hypotheses on effects of decline. Second, a questionnaire was formulated and

sent to superintendents of those school districts experiencing decline. This questionnaire solicited impressions of the extent of and the problems of decline. Third, five districts were chosen (a "typical" district, a high rate of decline district, a low rate of decline district, a non-agricultural, metropolitan declining district, and a district in which the superintendent thought enrollment had stayed the same or increased when they actually declined) for closer examination by interview. Major hypotheses tested were: (1) the pattern of resource allocation is significantly different among the growing and declining enrollment systems; (2) levels of student achievement differ among school systems encountering different growth rates; (3) the level and structure of the staff has a tendency to stabilize in negative growth systems; (4) the rate of innovation is retarded in the systems encountering stable or negative enrollments. Many of the problems this study found to be associated with decline are actually problems associated with decline in rural areas.

139. ROSENBERG, B., and VINCENT, P.B. (1978). "Retrenchment in Education: Outlook for Women and Minorities," in Declining Enrollment: Challenge of the Coming Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 371-404. ED 150 708.

Notes that affirmative action gains are put in jeopardy by decline in enrollments and decline in dollars, summarizes available data on decline and its impact on staffing in elementary/secondary and post-secondary education. Due to a lack of consistent record keeping on the part of LEA's and the lack of comparative data, the authors are forced to rely on spot data, and their conclusions are tentative.

140. ROSENZWEIG, P. (1979). "Marketing Surplus Schools." School Business Affairs. (June). pp. 12-13.

Overview report on a survey of 80 school closures. Discusses reasons for school closure, the new users, and type of reuse. Suggests steps school districts should use in "marketing" surplus facilities.

141. ROSS, V. (1980). "To Achieve the Kind of School Operation You Need, Use This Step-By-Step Goal Setting Plan." American School Board Journal. (September) pp. 30-31.

Describes an annual, five-step cyclical school district planning process. Among its benefits is school closure without what the author calls "emotional backlash."

142. RUBIN, L. ed. (1978). Educational Reform for a Changing Society: Anticipating Tomorrow's Schools. Boston: Allyn and Bacon. 215 pp. ED 169 671.

A collection of essays describing trends that the authors believe will have profound effects on schooling in the future. Topics covered include: declining enrollments and increased costs, the changing role of vocational education, government financing for educational quality, busing, politicking skills for school administrators, and the community-based school. Authors include: Shirley Chisholm, Richard S. Schweiker, Robert G. Scanlon, Ralph W. Tyler, Urie Bronfenbrenner, Elise Boulding, R. Buckminster Fuller, Jonas Salk, and Louis Rubin. Rubin also provides commentary after each essay, highlighting implications and R & D issues.

143. SCHOMP, K.W. (1980). "Close It, Sell It, or Lease It: What to Do with that Old School." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National School Boards Association in San Francisco. 16 pp. ED 192 432.

This paper provides a description of a number of steps the Denver, Colorado board has taken to deal with the problem of surplus space and to avoid closing schools. Some of these options are: refiguring school capacities; providing full-time space for programs that do not run full-time; providing additional space for services like psychology, social work, and nursing; providing extra IMC space; and providing space for neighborhood programs and for PL 94-142 programs. Denver has also been working under a recommendation that the feasibility of multiple use should be examined for schools filled to less than 50 percent of capacity, and has established a joint commission with the city government to provide for more efficient use of shared resources.

144. ———— (1975). Community Programs Occupy Empty School Spaces When Pupil Enrollments Decline." Schoolhouse. (September).

Story of how non-school programs moved into surplus space and justified keeping a school open. Schoolhouse is the newsletter of the Educational Facilities Labs., New York, N.Y.

145. SCOTT, J.G., et al. (1977). "The Shape of Educational Management: The Declining Years of the '70's." Paper presented at the Regional Series of Conferences sponsored by the Ontario School Trustees' Council in cooperation with the Ministry of Education of Ontario. 38 pp. ED 147 982.

This paper emphasizes the need for "a new accomodation" among competing values and objectives in the areas of planning, personnel, participation and politics. The author also says that educational leaders should become increasingly concerned with the allocation of resources in a time of retrenchment, the morale and motivation of teachers, the nature of teachers' work, and changes in the leadership approach taken by administrators and school trustees.

146. SEBULSKY, W.L., et al. (1977). "What Schools Are Doing." NASSP Bulletin. (March) pp. 59-67.

School building managers tell how their schools are coping with enrollment decline.

147. SEIFERT, E.H. (1979). "Declining Enrollments and the New Staffing Patterns for the Eighties." Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Association of Secondary School Principals in Houston. 13 pp. ED 172 406.

Enrollment decline presents new staffing problems that will have to be faced largely by the principal. This paper presents the Keough Indicator Survey Scale as a means of looking at key community characteristics to determine enrollment decline. If reductions in force because of decline proceed on a strict seniority basis they will cause problems such as increasingly high pay scale teachers and an older average age teacher. Alternatives to seniority-based policy include taking into account quality of service, experience in a specific area, district needs, preparation and certification. A point system may be arranged to take some of these characteristics into account. Other alternatives mentioned include: mid-year staffing, an early retirement system, cooperating with other school districts, terminating unsatisfactory teachers and retraining teachers for vacancies that become available.

148. SHANNON, T.A. (1980). "How to Cope with Collective Bargaining in Times of Fiscal Crisis: A Management Perspective." Journal of Law and Education. (April) pp. 243-249.

Provides some guidelines for boards of "broke" districts to follow in collective bargaining.

149. SHAW, R.C. (1980). "Forecasting Enrollment During Periods of Enrollment Decline." North Central Association Quarterly. (Summer) pp. 19-24.

Describes a study to determine the accuracy of the cohort-survival method of enrollment forecasting, based on enrollment data collected over a ten-year period from a random sample of 42 Missouri school districts. Compares accuracy

with enrollment stability and location of each district.

150. SHER, J.P., and TOMPKINS, R.B. (1976). "Economy, Efficiency, and Equality: The Myths of Rural School and District Consolidation." Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. 39 pp.

Sher and Tompkins examine evidence for and against the consolidation of rural schools and school districts. They review economies of scale and non-intuitive "diseconomies" and find that enlarged costs attributable to school consolidation often outweigh its benefits. They also examine the claims of increased economy, efficiency, and equality in district reorganization and improved quality of education in reorganized and consolidated schools and find them to be "myths." Sher and Tompkins find the evidence for consolidation to be either insufficient or incorrect and the benefits of consolidation insufficiently documented. Finally, the authors draw three lessons from their examination of the evidence for and against consolidation:

(1) Small schools deserve more attention
(2) Alternatives to consolidation and reorganization should be seriously considered
(3) Research done to demonstrate the value of proposed reforms should be scrutinized carefully.

151. SIERADSKI, K. (1975). Implications of Declining Enrollments for Schools. NAESP School Leadership Digest, Second Series, Number 4. ERIC/CEM Research Analysis Series, Number 19. Washington, D.C.: National Association of Elementary School Principals. 32 pp. ED 114 906.

Sieradski reviews much of the significant literature on the implications of decline and in so doing formulates a series of imperatives for school administrators and citizens task forces. Administrators must develop accurate enrollment forecasting and detailed planning well in advance of decline and then must communicate with every group affected. Sieradski also reviews some "special interest group" pressures on administrators. A task force should become thoroughly familiar with the means used to predict future enrollments, should visit each school and rate them and should be responsible for establishing criteria for school closing. A brief, lucid survey of the field.

152. SKIERA, L. (1978). "Declining Enrollment: Community Options and Actions." Santa Barbara, California: Citizen Participation Clearinghouse, Santa Barbara Center for Community Education. 16 pp. ED 171 856.

This booklet argues that plans can be developed to keep schools open and operating to the advantage of students, staff, and community. Provides quotes from a University of Washington survey and summary statements from school officials maintaining that school closings have a negative impact. Also provides accounts of schools that have found ways to cope with the problem and stay open. These schools utilized strategies such as a "grandparent in the classroom program", year-round schooling, parental involvement, community education, and sharing the building with various non-school organizations.

153. SPENLA, W.A., et al. (1978). "The Role of Negotiations in the Equation 'Declining School Enrollment = Layoffs': a Management Perspective." Journal of Law and Education. (April) pp. 243-263.

Describes some legal and economic issues associated with RIF cases in New Jersey and Yonkers, New York. Recommends that management not contractually limit their ability to lay off personnel.

154. STEFONEK, T. (1979). Cutback Management in Public Organizations. Information Series, Volume 7, Number 3. Madison, Wisconsin: Wisconsin State Department of Public Instruction, Division of Management and Planning Services. 36 pp. ED 192 441.

Presents a review of the literature on cutback management in public organizations and notes differences between private and public organizations, and between schools and other public agencies. Discusses zero-based budgeting and focuses on RIF issues.

155. TAYLOR, W. (1979). "Managing Contraction." Paper presented at the International Intervisitational Program in Educational Administration, Montreal and Vancouver. 17 pp. ED 194 980.

Decline, according to Taylor, is not simply an economic and technical problem, but a conceptual and political one. He examines the effects of decline or "contraction" on schools, buildings, courses, teachers, the teaching force, teacher recruitment and selection, and educational opportunities for the disadvantaged. The styles of management in growth periods are also re-examined.

156. THOMAS, M.D. (1978). "Declining School Enrollments." School Business Affairs. (January) pp. 6-8.

Overview of the problems and issues faced by districts facing decline.

157. THOMPSON, B. (1979). "Amalgamation." Education (Winter) pp. 13-17.

Discusses problems involved in merging two schools, including which of the two buildings should be closed and how two staffs can be merged. Notes that consolidation may present opportunities for reorganizing space and rethinking curriculum.

158. THOMPSON, S. (1978). Class Size. ACSA School Management Digest, Series 1, No. 12. ERIC/CEM Research Analysis Series, No. 39. San Francisco: Association of California School Administrators. 45 pp. ED 154 471.

Public perceptions and teacher support make the question of class size appear simple. Both groups support the "smaller is better" idea, however, this review of the research finds no evidence of a substantial effect on educational achievement. This is so because educational achievement has so many variables, many of which cannot be measured and, possibly because the benefits of small classes are simply not testable. Research shows that schools have maintained a commitment to lower pupil-teacher ratios and decreased class size with little encouragement from the research in times of both declining and rising enrollment. Smaller classes require more staff, which could help mollify teacher organizations in time of decline, but they also raise costs. A weighting system that accounts for students with special needs is also described. Good, concise review of the literature and research.

159. TREMPER, P. (1978). "Community Education -- a National Perspective." Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal. (September-October) pp. 4-5.

Notes that declining enrollments have contributed to the development of community educators. Space is now available and schools are expanding their clientele to include the general community.

160. TYMKO, J.L. (1978). "A Framework for Policy Making." Paper presented to the CSTA First Congress on Education in Toronto. 27 pp. ED 158 435.

School boards that wish to improve their policy-making should provide themselves with a basic structure to prevent it from being fragmented into a series of unconnected decisions. In this paper, the author views policy-making as "social change occurring through political action" and provides a six-step framework:

(1) What ought to be? (a consideration of values)
(2) What is the current state of affairs?
(3) What is the problem?

(4) What are the alternative solutions?
(5) What shall be the policy?
(6) What are the results of the policy?

161. VALENCIA, R.D. (1980). "The School Closure Issue and the Chicano Community." Urban Review. (Spring) pp. 5-21.

This article considers declining enrollment, white flight, and the fiscal crisis in the California schools as they came to a head in the school closure issue in Santa Barbara, California. The case of Angeles et al. vs. Santa Barbara School District et al. was filed after three of the five predominantly Hispanic schools in Santa Barbara were scheduled to be closed. The author provides a detailed description of the case, in which the judge ruled in favor of the District, and discusses the ruling's impact on urban education in California.

162. VON ANCKEN, E.E. (1980). "A Personal Account of Closing A School Library." School Library Journal. (September) pp. 38-40.

Advice on how to break up an existing elementary school library closed because of enrollment decline.

163. WEGMANN, R.G. (1980). "Educational Challenges of the 1980's," in Needs of Elementary and Secondary Education in the 1980's: A Compendium of Policy Papers. Washington, D.C.: Congress of the United States, House Committee on Education and Labor, Subcommittee on Elementary, Secondary and Vocational Education. 20 pp. ED 194 476.

This paper identifies decline as one of the main challenges of education in the 1980's, since educators will face fewer students and less money. Curriculum will be shaped by technology, computer literacy will become important, and there will be increased emphasis on life-long learning.

164. WELDY, G.R. (1978). "Enrollment Declines and Reductions in Force -- What Can Administrators Do?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the National Association of Secondary School Principals in Anaheim, California. 10 pp. ED 150 731.

The author, a principal in Niles Township (Illinois) Public Schools, discusses what happened when the school board decided to close one of the district's three high schools and examines how board policy dealt with maintaining the quality of programs, retaining tenured faculty, the disposition of surplus property, a faculty without any "new blood", compatability of programs in the merging schools, and faculty concern over job security.

165. WILKEN, W.J., and CALLAHAN, J.J. (1978). "Declining Enrollment: The Cloud and Its Silver Lining," in Declining Enrollment: Challenge of the Coming Decade, edited by S. Abramowitz and S. Rosenfeld. Washington, D.C.: US/DHEW, National Institute of Education. pp. 257-304. ED 150 708.

Survey of the existing data and research evidence on the impact of decline in schools, with a more detailed look at the experience of Iowa. Major emphasis is on finance/costs and their implications for state aid policies. However, program, administration, and personnel issues are also dealt with. Concludes that "declining enrollment has had very mixed effects and, overall, has failed to provoke any major shifts in the quality and character of local school services."

166. WOFFORD, J.W. (1978). "Toughing It Out Through Inservice." National Elementary Principal. (March) pp. 52-55.

Focuses on the principal's role in periods of decline and retrenchment and argues that inservice education should provide schools leaders with the opportunities to adapt to new conditions by confronting and altering obsolete assumptions about effective leadership.

167. YEAGER, R.F. (1979). "Rationality and Retrenchment: Use of a Computer Simulation to Aid Decisionmaking in School Closings." Education and Urban Society. (May) pp. 296-312.

First hand account of the experience of one school district in Champaign, Illinois. Describes the criteria used by the board of education in deciding which schools to close, how some of the more quantifiable criteria were translated into a computer simulation, and how data from that simulation were used. Data helped decisionmakers to see the interactive, counter-intuitive, and secondary effects of decisions taken to close more than one school. Data also set aside conflicts over facts and focused the community debate over values, i.e., the criteria themselves. But the district's final decision on which schools to close "did not appear to be affected by the data generated by the computer simulation."

168. ZAZZARO, J. (1973). "What To Do If Shrinking Enrollment Forces You to Shut a School." Nation's Schools. (February) pp. 12-13.

Describes five ways school administrators in California have either considered or attempted to dispose of a surplus building through leasing or conversion.

169. ZENKE, L.L., and McCLOUD, P.I. (1978). "Can Instructional Quality Be Preserved as Enrollments Decline?" Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development in San Francisco. 22 pp. ED 157 154.

Describes how the Tulsa, Oklahoma, Public Schools organized a 48-member task force of "unbiased but interested" community members to make recommendations on handling the problem of decline. Includes the task force's list of 17 conditions and problems a district is likely to face in decline.

170. ZIRKEL, P.A., and BARGERSTOCK, C.T. (1980). The Law on Reduction in Force: A Summary of Legislation and Litigation. Arlington, Virginia: Educational Research Service, Inc. 74 pp.

Provides an in-depth discussion of the legal issues associated with RIF, including: an overview of RIF statutes, statutory interpretation, just or good cause, order for suspension or dismissal, limitations on bumping, tenure, order for recall, procedural due process for RIF, negotiability, and affirmative action. Also includes a short glossary of legal terms.

171. ZUSMAN, R.S. (1978). "Declining Enrollments and Reduction in Force: A Problem of the 70's." Clearing House. (April) pp. 396-399.

Zusman reviews the extent of decline and contrasts the requirements of decline with those of "the baby-boom years." He then reviews some of the literature in the field and cites various authors' suggestions on dealing with surplus space, closing a school, reducing the size of a staff and Keough's five steps to take when a district's enrollment drastically declines.

B1. RESOURCES: HANDBOOKS AND MANUALS

172. BOOTH, R., et al. (1980). Teacher Benefits: How to Compute Costs, Compare and Evaluate, Plus a Special Section on Negotiating Salaries. Springfield, Illinois: Illinois Association of School Boards. 53 pp. ED 184 242.

A manual intended to aid school boards in determining the costs of their benefit programs and to control expenditures to achieve maximum value for both the employer and employee. Contains step-by-step instructions and several recommendations to improve practice.

173. BORNSTEIN, L. (1978). Before You Close A School: Economic and Political Factors. A Resource Guide on Declining Enrollments. Chelmsford, Massachusetts: Merrimack Education Center. 9 pp. ED 149 448.

Overview of the prescriptive literature on school closing. Special focus on community involvement and rational planning for school closure. Highlighted is a New Jersey State Department of Education system of weighted criteria to enable school districts to establish a school closing order based purely on efficiency factors. Includes a 26-item bibliography on school closings.

174. BUSSARD, E. (1978). A Concerned Citizens Guide to Community School Centers. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories.

Uses a question and answer approach to coordination of community services in surplus school space.

175. BUSSARD, E. (1979a). Community School Centers. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories.

This handbook, primarily for facilities planners and building committees, contains useful suggestions and models for planning community use of excess school space.

176. BUSSARD, E. (1979b). Managing Community School Centers. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories.

Handbook focuses on the management of a school building that also serves other community programs. Good advice on setting up an organizational structure that establishes relationships between the many users of a community school's space.

177. BUSSARD, E. (1979c). Using Surplus School Space for Community School Centers. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories. 30 pp.

Booklet explores the opportunities for reusing surplus school space as community service centers, and the issues and constraints on planning.

178. COUNCIL OF EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES PLANNERS. (1978). Surplus School Space -- The Problem and the Possibilities. Columbus, Ohio: Council of Educational Facilities Planners, International. 77 pp. ED 163 595.

A guide for decisionmaking about surplus space. Part 1 includes explanations of enrollment projections. Part 2 discusses factors inhibiting new uses for surplus school

facilities, and offers suggestions for using school space. Concludes with a description of one school's (Niles East High School in Illinois) conversion into apartments, a community art center, and a community recreation center.

179. EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES LABORATORIES. (1976a). The Secondary School: Reduction, Renewal and Real Estate. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories. 63 pp. ED 131 558.

Updates enrollment projections for high schools and analyzes the special problems they face. Provides suggestions, specifically for high schools, for alternative use of surplus space and for providing educational service to an expanded clientele.

180. EDUCATIONAL FACILITIES LABORATORIES. (1976b). Surplus School Space: Options and Opportunities. A Report. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories. 75 pp. ED 126 614.

Discusses the many factors that influence reuse planning -- population trends, state law, zoning ordinances -- and provides examples of alternative use of surplus school facilities. Specifically addressed to citizen members of facilities planning committees.

181. EDUCATIONAL RESEARCH SERVICE. (1973). Some Local Policies on Reductions in Force for Professional Personnel. ERS Information Aid No. 15. Arlington, Virginia: Educational Research Service, Inc. 18 pp. ED 078 554.

Offers 16 examples of reduction in force policies and provisions that may be of use to school districts developing their own RIF policies.

182. EISENBERGER, K.E., and KEOUGH, W.F., Jr. (1974). Declining Enrollment: What To Do. A Guide for School Administrators to Meet the Challenge of Declining Enrollment and School Closings. AASA Executive Handbook Series, Volume 2. Arlington, Virginia: American Association of School Administrators. 57 pp. ED 111 094.

Described by "The Best of ERIC" as "the major sourcebook on school closing," this report provides information on aspects of school closing beyond the economic, such as: community, staff, and student polls; simulation exercises; and community task forces. Also includes a school closing timeline, a description of criteria for closure, a discussion of alternative use, a school closing checklist, and enrollment forecasting methods. .

183. FONSTAD, C. (1979). Planning for Better Education in Wisconsin. Data Supplement: Declining Enrollments. Bulletin No. 8338. Madison, Wisconsin: Wisconsin State Department of Public

Instruction, Bureau for Administrative Services. 535 pp. ED 168 222.

Part I contains guidelines on using the cohort-survival technique for projecting enrollments.

184. JOHNSON, S.M. (1978). Declining Enrollments in the Massachusetts Public Schools: What It Means and What to Do. Boston, Massachusetts: Massachusetts State Department of Education, Bureau of Education Information Services. 73 pp.

A handbook to assist local school decisionmakers. Part One presents an overview of decline in Massachusetts -- its extent and repercussions. Part Two, of most use to a national audience, outlines procedures used by LEA's as they respond to decline. Features are: suggestions about policy options for facilities, planning, personnel adjustments, and program. Of special interest are the Handbook's guidelines and instruments for: projecting enrollments via cohort-survival ratio techniques, conducting facilities and staff inventories, and planning and involving the community in school closure decisions. Handbook also contains a discussion of court cases, equity considerations, and collective bargaining agreements as they pertain to RIF. A selective 17-item, annotated bibliography is included, organized around: fiscal impact of decline, facilities and staffing, enrollment projections, and school closings and district reorganization.

185. MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). Michigan's School Enrollment Decline: Projections and Implications. Lansing, Michigan: Michigan Department of Education. 95 pp.

Readers outside Michigan will find certain sections of this report useful, including: a section on "school closing guidelines"; a section on enrollment projects including a cohort-survival technique worksheet; and a detailed discussion for assessing and evaluating facilities. Also contains a 27-item annotated bibliography.

186. MINNESOTA STATE PLANNING AGENCY. (1976). Planning Assistance Manual: Managing School Districts with Declining Enrollments. Prepared in cooperation with the Minnesota State Department of Education and the Minnesota Association of of School Administrators. St. Paul, Minnesota: Minnesota State Planning Agency. 79 pp.

A comprehensive planning manual. Aimed at Minnesota school districts, its suggestions and techniques are transferrable. The focus is on how to develop the local data base necessary for rational planning and on reading that data base and

projecting the policy trade-offs of alternative courses of action. Topics include: enrollment projections, budgeting, analyzing staff and facilities, closing a school, referendums, and community involvement.

187. NATIONAL SCHOOL BOARDS ASSOCIATION. (1978). Declining Enrollments: Its Challenge for Urban School Boards. Report of the Committee on Declining Enrollments Council of Big City Boards of Education. Washington, D.C.: National School Boards Association. 26 pp.

A "primer" directed at big city boards of education providing an overview at the key issues involved in responding to decline. Special focus is on finance, school closings, and community involvement.

188. NATIONAL SCHOOL PUBLIC RELATIONS ASSOCIATION. (1976). Declining Enrollment: Current Trends in School Policies and Programs. Arlington, Virginia: National School Public Relations Association. 65 pp. ED 130 450.

Overview of the major issues, techniques, policies, and practices involved in responding to decline. Based on a nationwide survey of school districts, this document includes guidelines for making accurate enrollment projections, for using practices such as magnet schools to defuse community conflict, and for community involvement via advisory committees and task forces. Document concludes with a series of five mini-case studies of promising practices including those in Salt Lake City, Utah; Illinois; Monroe County, Indiana; Great Neck, New York; and Montgomery County, Maryland.

189. NEW ENGLAND SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT COUNCIL. (1972). Enrollment Forecasting Handbook: Introducing Confidence Limit Computation for a Cohort-Survival Technique. Framingham, Massachusetts: New England School Development Council.

Technical manual describing the cohort-survival method of projecting school enrollments. Discusses the factors influencing future enrollments and various problems of data collection and analysis. Also provides sample forms for projecting enrollments and explains the procedure for calculating confidence limits for enrollment estimates.

190. NEW JERSEY SCHOOL BOARDS ASSOCIATION. (1979). School Staff Evaluation in New Jersey. Philadelphia: Research for Better Schools, Inc. 259 pp. ED 185 101.

This handbook recommends and explains processes that will help school districts in complying with New Jersey state regulations for the evaluation of tenured teaching staff. The handbook is in three sections:

(1) the regulations, roles and responsibilities of boards of education and of school administrators, and a management plan.
(2) detailed recommendations on carrying out a staff evaluation program
a) record-keeping
b) indicators of effectiveness
c) reporting
d) development of district policy
(3) information on developing policy guidelines, developing job descriptions, superintendent evaluation, school board evaluation, and legal issues.

The report also provides: examples of district policies, a matrix of staff responsibilities, methods of data collection, job descriptions, and rating scales for evaluating superintendents, school boards, and teachers.

191. NEW YORK STATE EDUCATION DEPARTMENT. (1976). Enrollment Trends: Programs for the Future. A Planning Guide for Districts with Declining Enrollments. Albany, New York: University of the State of New York and the State Education Department, Office of Research, Planning and Evaluation. 68 pp.

Handbook is organized in terms of the major steps which are involved in planning for decline: "collecting demographic data and defining the decline problem; developing and approving strategies to follow to plan solutions; analyzing current and future program needs; analyzing staff needs; projecting future facility needs; and analyzing fiscal implications of future program, staff and facility needs." The book emphasizes the interrelationship of decline issues and stresses the importance of developing local data bases for rational planning. Suggestions are illustrated by references to local district practices. Appendices contain a facilities inventory checklist, a "how to" section on closing down and mothballing a school, and a 20-item annotated bibliography, including 8 references to local district reports documenting responses to decline.

192. PHI DELTA KAPPA, COMMISSION ON DECLINING ENROLLMENTS. (1973). Howard Public Schools, Anywhere, U.S.A. Bloomington, Indiana: Phi Delta Kappa. 42 pp.

A mock task force report for a typical school district facing typical problems of decline. Contains a discussion of the key issues involved in decline, methodologies for resolving those issues, and a detailed section on the policy trade-offs of alternative responses to decline.

193. SARGENT, C.G., and HANDY, J. (1974). Fewer Pupils/Surplus Space: A Report. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories. 55 pp. ED 093 046.

One of the first resource books on surplus space and school closing. Identifies and suggests some rules of thumb based on responses to interviews and questionnaires from 100 randomly selected school districts nationwide. Also, contains a detailed discussion on alternative use of surplus space.

194. WAKEFIELD, H.E., and DONNELLY, R.A. (1978). Declining Enrollments. Winneconne, Wisconsin: Wisconsin Association of School Boards. 95 pp. ED 193 753.

A handbook targeted at members of Wisconsin school boards who require information for decisionmaking. Contains information about: (1) the extent of decline and recent trends in population and enrollment in the country and the state; (2) school closure and planning for closure, comments from school district officials on the impact of closure, and examples of school district criteria for closure decisions; (3) educational alternatives to school closing, including: magnet schools, year-round schools, the campus plan, the Princeton plan, and education parks; (4) community-use alternatives; (5) staff reduction techniques, including early retirement incentives, part-time appointments, and long-term leaves.

195. WENDEL, F.C. (ed.). (1979). Maintaining Quality Education in the Face of Declining Resources. Briefings in Educational Resources Issues Number 2. Lincoln, Nebraska: University of Nebraska. 181 pp. ED 176 366.

Focusing on the management issues created by declining enrollments and resources, this handbook presents an analysis of the problems and suggests possible ways of dealing with them. It includes: cost-benefit models for choosing among alternative courses of action; a rational model for reviewing curriculum offerings, policies and procedures for dealing with RIF, information on the impact of alternative responses to decline on special education, and details on school closings and consolidation. The handbook also contains an extensive 50-page annotated bibliograhy. A series of appendices contain "how-to" material on budgeting.

B2. RESOURCES: BIBLIOGRAPHIES

196. BUSSARD, E. (1979d). A Resource Book on Community School Centers. New York: Educational Facilities Laboratories. 26 pp.

An annotated bibliography and a directory to agencies offering technical assistance for facilities planning.

Pages 9 - 12 deal specifically with declining enrollments.

197. CORMAN, L. (1979). Declining Enrollment -- Issues and Responses. An Annotated Bibliography. Current Bibliography No. 11. Toronto: Ontario Institute for Studies in Education. 82 pp. ED 172 344.

An 82-page annotated bibliography divided into sections treating several different aspects of the problem of decline.

198. ERIC. (1975). "Declining Enrollment," in The Best of ERIC No. 12. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. 5 pp. ED 112 454.

A 14-item annotated bibliography on issues related to declining enrollment, including: closing schools, RIF, maintaining good public relations, utilizing surplus space, and forecasting enrollments.

199. ERIC. (1977). "Declining Enrollments," in The Best of the Best of ERIC. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. 6 pp. ED 136 349.

A chapter of The Best of the Best of ERIC containing 16 annotations of items related to decline: including RIF, school closing, enrollment forecasting, and planning.

200. ERIC. (1978). Reduction in Force. The Best of ERIC, No. 29. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. 4 pp. ED 143 101.

Thirteen-item annotated bibliography contains a representative selection of materials on this topic. Emphasis is on policy guidelines and advice, from the management perspective.

201. ERIC. (1979a). "Declining Enrollments," in The Best of the Best of ERIC, Volume 2. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. pp. 55-59. ED 163 620.

A 15-item annotated bibliography of documents and articles dealing with use of surplus space, procedures for closing a school, the characteristics and accuracy of various enrollment projection techniques, management in times of decline, and other topics.

202. ERIC. (1979b). School Closing. The Best of ERIC No. 46. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. 4 pp. ED 172 319.

This 11-item annotated bibliography includes suggestions for administrators to involve the community in closure decisions, case studies of school closures, and suggestions for alternative use of excess school facilities.

203. ERIC. (1981). Managing Declining Enrollment, The Best of ERIC No. 58. Eugene, Oregon: ERIC Clearinghouse on Educational Management. 4 pp.

Eleven-item annotated bibliography abstracts those works which provide an overview of the management issues implicated in school districts responses to decline.

204. MERRIMACK EDUCATION CENTER. (1977). School Enrollment: A Resource Package. Chelmsford, Massachusetts: Merrimack Education Center. 175 pp.

A "clearinghouse packet" of abstracts, reading lists, and, in some cases, actual documents pertaining to declining enrollments in schools.

205. MOLL, M. (1980). Declining Enrollment. Bibliographies in Education, No. 72. Ottawa: Canadian Teachers Federation. 29 pp. ED 193 804.

59 books and 92 articles covering two years (1978-79) of the Canadian and American experience with enrollment decline. Focus is on the consequences -- implications and repercussions -- of decline. Reviews both technical and popular literature.

C1. STATE REPORTS

206. ALASKA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). A Guide to the Development of Program Statements and Educational Specifications for Small Secondary Schools. Juneau, Alaska: Alaska State Department of Education. 125 pp. ED 144 232.

Designed to provide school districts with guidelines for developing community participation in the planning of educational programs and school facilities for small secondary schools, this report gives a list of certain information that must be compiled to achieve this goal. This information includes:

(1) a prioritized set of the community's educational goals
(2) resources, physical and human, that are available for secondary school use
(3) the number of students that could be enrolled in school next year and in 5 years
(4) a prioritized list of the courses the community wishes to have taught
(5) an "educational specifications document."

207. ARIZONA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). "Declining Enrollment Conference Report." Phoenix, Arizona: Arizona State Department of Education. 38 pp. ED 144 229.

This report of a conference on declining enrollment and its impact, sponsored by the Arizona State Department of Education, discusses implications for school closings, budgets, staffing problems, RIF, board of education and community support, problems of small districts, and alternative uses for school space. Steps that are mandatory for maintaining community support, the Arizona State Department of Education suggests, are: formation of a citizens' committee, dissemination of information, and conducting a needs assessment.

208. BREHMAN, G.E. (1979). Conditions of Education in Pennsylvania: Present, Past and Future. Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania Department of Education. 200 pp.

Data and projections from data concerning the condition of education (elementary, secondary and higher) in the state of Pennsylvania. This report is in three major sections: Demography and Education in Pennsylvania, the Conditions of Basic Education, and the Conditions of Higher Education.

209. CHO, S.H., and SENIER, J. (1977). The Changing Age Structure of Pennsylvania's Population and Its Implications for Educational Planning. Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania Department of Education, Bureau of Information Systems. 15 pp. ED 150 679.

210. DAVIS, B.G., and TRIMBLE, C.S. (1977). "Kentucky's Declining School Population." Frankfort, Kentucky: Kentucky State Department of Education. 19 pp. ED 161 152.

Enrollments in Kentucky have declined since 1971 and this study reports data on this past decline and projects state enrollment up to 1981-82 using a cohort-survival technique. This report provides projected enrollments for grades 1 - 12 and shows that by 1981-82 enrollment will have declined by approximately 7.9 percent. Working on the assumption that one teacher could handle 150 students per day, the authors point out that this decline would result in a loss of 348 teaching jobs by 1981-82.

211. ELLSWORTH, D.F. (1977). Early Retirement: A Proposal For Adjustment to Declining Enrollment. Springfield, Illinois: Illinois State Office of Education. 81 pp. ED 149 435.

This study focuses on the benefits of early retirement as a policy to ease the adjustment process as public school districts encounter the problem of decline. The

introductory section provides background information on declining enrollments in Illinois public schools and briefly describes the policy of early retirement that has been adopted by 36 Illinois public school districts. The remainder of the paper examines the retirement policy which allows members of the Teachers' Pension and Retirement Fund of Chicago and the Teachers' Retirement System of Illinois who have served 20 or more years to retire at age 55 without any discount of their pension annuity.

212. HICKROD, G.A., et al. (1976). Enrollment Change and Educational Personnel Change in the K-12 Schools of Illinois: A Supplement to the Report of the Illinois Task Force on Declining Enrollments in the Public Schools. Springfield, Illinois: Illinois Office of Education. 55 pp. ED 128 917.

A study examining the extent of decline in school districts in the state of Illinois (1969-70 to 1973-74) and analyzing patterns of staff reduction in this light. Data analysis provides a framework for examining several predictors of decline and staff reduction. This study produced strong evidence that shifts in staff composition were generally more favorable to administrators than teachers. The authors also make several recommendations for changes in state policy.

213. ILLINOIS STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION. (1977). Early Retirement: A Proposal for Adjustment to Declining Enrollments. Springfield, Illinois: Illinois State Board of Education. 63 pp.

Focus is on the benefits of early retirement as a policy to ease public schools' adjustment to enrollment decline. Discusses early retirement practices in Illinois public schools, and then proposes a statewide policy allowing teachers with 20 or more years of service to retire at age 55 without loss of pension. Contains a review of of the research evidence on longevity of teaching vis-a-vis effectiveness: data does not support the common sense notion that longevity leads to greater effectiveness. Included is a model early retirement policy from Mt. Prospect, Illinois. Report has a bibliography on early retirement.

214. ILLINOIS STATE OFFICE OF EDUCATION. (1975). Report of the Illinois Task Force on Declining Enrollments in the Public Schools. Springfield, Illinois: Illinois State Office of Education. 94 pp. ED 116 353.

Detailed report discusses enrollment projections, declining enrollment, economies and diseconomies, school closing, staffing and program. Report has three main

foci: the importance of developing local data bases and information management systems for planning; state level action to assist local school districts; and staffing. The section on staffing lists the kind of data necessary for developing staffing patterns, alternatives to reductions in force, and early retirement plans.

215. MICHIGAN STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). Michigan's School Enrollment Decline: Projections and Implications. A Report. Lansing, Michigan: Michigan State Department of Education. 104 pp. ED 145 546.

A report of the Task Force on Declining Enrollment, designed to provide information and recommendations on effective planning to school administrators and local school boards. The report covers four broad topics: school finance, staffing, facilities and projected enrollments.

216. COMMISSION ON MINNESOTA'S FUTURE. (1977). Report of the Commission on Minnesota's Future. St. Paul, Minnesota: Commission on Minnesota's Future. 83 pp.

This report presents a general overview of the future growth and development strategies for the state of Minnesota, and calls for a clarification of state goals. In the field of education, the report takes note of declining enrollments and rising costs, while discussing some of the demographic changes in the state.

217. MINNESOTA ADVISORY COUNCIL ON FLUCTUATING SCHOOL ENROLLMENTS. (1976). A Preliminary Report to the Minnesota State Legislature: The Impact of Fluctuating School Enrollments on Minnesota's Educational System. St. Paul, Minnesota: Advisory Council on Fluctuating School Enrollments. 123 pp.

A report to the Minnesota State Legislature, in which the Advisory Council on Fluctuating School Enrollments reviews the effects of demographic, economic, legal, political and cultural factors interacting with the effects of declining enrollments. The report presents specific problem statements describing decline related effects in the areas of cost, quality, revenue, personnel, facilities, transportation, educational programs, organization/governance and levy limitations. Also, described are a series of alternative solutions to these problem statements. These solutions, however, are not recommendations but more choices for future examination and exploration.

218. MINNESOTA ADVISORY COUNCIL ON FLUCTUATING SCHOOL ENROLLMENTS. (1977). A Final Report: The Impact of Fluctuating School Enrollments

on Minnesota's Educational System: Volume II: A Report to the Minnesota State Legislature. St. Paul, Minnesota: Advisory Council on Fluctuating School Enrollments. 562 pp.

Contains the working papers, special studies, and data analyses done by and for the Advisory Council in its examination of fluctuating school enrollments. The Advisory Council was created by the Minnesota Legislature in 1974 and this material covers their work through publication date. Information in the report guided the Council's recommendations to the legislature, the State Board of Education, local school districts, and the State Teachers Retirement Board. Section A of Volume II contains general background information about the impact of fluctuating school enrollments including recommendations drawn from public meetings, enrollment predictions for the state of Minnesota, and effects on cost, quality and staff. Section B includes that information specifically related to personnel, class size and fluctuating school enrollments. Section C covers the concerns of revenue and fluctuating school enrollments. Section D includes papers and studies on transportation funding. The last section, Section F, includes papers and studies on school buildings and fluctuating school enrollments.

219. NEW JERSEY STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1978). The Declining Enrollment Project. An Anthology of New Jersey State Department of Education Research on Declining Enrollments. Trenton, N.J.: New Jersey State Department of Education. 66 pp. ED 184 219.

An anthology of research-based articles describing and analyzing enrollment-related problems. The four articles included are:

(1) "An Overview of Declining Enrollments in New Jersey" -- Robert E. Weber and Peter J. Walling.
(2) "Patterns of Enrollment Fluctuation and Decline in New Jersey School Districts 1966-1967 to 1976-1977" -- William A. Cozzens.
(3) "Enrollment Decline: State Policy Options and Fiscal Impacts" -- Lia Hirschman.
(4) "Options for Utilization of School in Districts with Declining Enrollments" -- W. Frank Johnson.

220. OREGON STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). Reduction in Force: Suggested Policy Guidelines for School Districts. Salem, Oregon: Division of Administrative Support. 20 pp. ED 137 904.

Provides a planning guide for RIF. Strong emphasis on outlining due-process considerations governed by law, contract, and fairness. Provides staff-inventory procedures and guidelines.

221. SOUTH CAROLINA STATE DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION. (1977). "Declining Enrollment: Implications for South Carolina School Districts." Columbia, South Carolina: South Carolina State Department of Education, Office of Research. 47 pp. ED 144 254.

This booklet emphasizes the importance of demographic forecasting and developing a capacity for detailed analysis of local conditions in order to develop an effective school board policy. Also covers the general array of problems associated with decline, including: staffing, instruction, finance, facilities, school closing, and school-community relations.

222. TRUESDELL, W.F. (1978). "A Study of Iowa's Public Elementary and Secondary Enrollment Trends 1977-78 through 1981-82." Des Moines, Iowa: Iowa State Legislature, House Budget Committee. 68 pp. ED 168 749.

An informational report to the Iowa State Legislature, this study points out that in the six-year period from 1977 to 1982, 120,363 more students will graduate from Iowa public schools than will enter them. A major cause of this enrollment drop is an out-migration of potential parents, ages 20-29. The report presents projections of enrollment to 1982 and 1987 for each Iowa public school. Also includes discussion of such factors as: population growth, out-migration from the state and migration between counties, relative proportions of age groups in the state, trends in fertility and birth rates, geographical trends in enrollment, and enrollment trends by size of school.

C2. SCHOOL DISTRICT REPORTS
a.) Available through ERIC.

223. CHURCH, M.J., et al. (1980). HIGH LONESOME: A School-Community Survey of the Encino Rural Independent School District. Santa Fe, N.M.: New Mexico State Department of Education. 103 pp. ED 188 797.

An assessment of facilities and services and a survey of staff, community and student attitudes produced by members of the New Mexico University - Albuquerque, Bureau of Educational Planning and Development and sponsored by the school district, which has been facing severe decline (moving from 400 to 150 students in 20 years). The study

group made the following recommendations:

(1) add a part-time principal or intern in educational administration to assist principal/superintendent
(2) develop inservice training programs
(3) use PLATO system to expand course offerings
(4) reduce building area and modernize classrooms

The survey also found that faculty, students, and members of the community were concerned about quality of education but had positive feelings about their school.

224. COLLISTER, L. (1979). "Declining Enrollments -- Rising Problems. Report No. 79-10." Seattle, Washington: Seattle Public Schools, Department of Planning. 9 pp. ED 173 904.

This short report reviews the implications of decline in Seattle, noting that the state basic education law mandates the length of the school day and permissible student/teacher ratio and that this fact coupled with demographics and an increase in special programs means that school closures, unpopular though they may be, will be inevitable.

225. HAMDEN (CONNECTICUT) TASK FORCE ON DECLINING ENROLLMENT. (1977a). A System of Criteria for Evaluating Elementary School Buildings. Hamden, Connecticut: Hamden Public Schools. 49 pp. ED 161 144.

A report by the Hamden, Connecticut, Task Force on Declining Enrollment puts forward a list of criteria for evaluating and comparing elementary schools to give an objective system for the Board's decision-making process. The criteria are divided into weighted categories:

Education Criteria	40%
Community Impact	40%
Financial	20%

The report also provides an explanation of how each criterion is to be used, data to be collected, and a scoring procedure.

226. HAMDEN (CONNECTICUT) TASK FORCE ON DECLINING ENROLLMENT. (1977b). Task Force on Declining Enrollment. Final Report. Hamden, Connecticut: Hamden Public Schools. 165 pp. ED 161 145.

The final report of a task force in Hamden, Connecticut, offers its final conclusions and recommendations.

(1) The Task Force will recommend to the Board of Education criteria, procedures, and a timetable for school closure.
(2) Parents should have the option of choosing an open or traditional school.
(3) Redistricting to offer parents pairs of educational alternatives and any necessary closures

can be implemented at the same time, preferably by 1980.
(4) Fewer buildings will be needed on the elementary level and until plans to handle decline are adopted, staffing in low enrollment schools should be increased.
(5) The high school should be grades 9 - 12.
(6) Middle school should house grades 7 - 8.
(7) The Board of Education should re-evaluate all building enrollment capacities.
(8) Consider the impact of any building use changes.

227. FLEMING, M. (1980). School Closing Policy Report. Cleveland, Ohio: Cleveland Public Schools. 34 pp. ED 191 931.

Part 2 contains a detailed, chronological account of Cleveland's procedure to close schools while at the same time following a court mandate to desegregate. Part 1 contains a review of the prescriptive "how-to" literature on school closing.

228. GEIGER, J.O., and TORGE, H. (1977). Bradford School Study. Dayton, Ohio: Dayton University, Office of Educational Services. 62 pp. ED 144 189.

Bradford High School has recently experienced significant decline in grades 11 and 12 as students increasingly attend a nearby joint vocational school. This report examines what draws students to the vocational school and makes recommendations to Bradford school officials to help deal with the problem and with declining enrollment.

229. KUCERA, M.A. (1979). Task Force on Declining Enrollment. Data Review for Cluster V. Cedar Rapids, Iowa: Grant Wood Area Educational Agency. 71 pp. ED 194 238.

Data is presented for 12 school districts in the Grant Wood Area (Iowa) on enrollment, curriculum, personnel, transportation, and cooperative activities.

230. McCLOUD, P.I. (1978). Final Report of the Advisory Task Force on Declining Enrollment. Tulsa, Oklahoma: Tulsa Public Schools. 54 pp. ED 157 153.

This report provides the major points of six subcommittee reports on their fields of study: operational costs per pupil, transportation, standards of quality for buildings and sites, building utilization, alternative use of school buildings, and grade reorganization. The second half of the report makes comments on and recommendations for individual schools. An appendix provides data on enrollment

projections.

231. MAZZARELLA, J.A., and BARBER, L. (1978). Facing Declining Enrollment: Considerations and Procedures. Eugene, Oregon: Eugene Public Schools. 66 pp. ED 158 427.

This report describes the implications of declining enrollment in Eugene Public School District 4J which is suffering from overall decline in enrollment and simultaneously under-capacity schools in some neighborhoods and over-capacity schools in others. The report discusses the implications for: RIF, program and staffing projections, enrollment projections, school costs, public relations, equity, alternative use of schools, land use and development, the neighborhood school concept, busing, inservice, the comprehensive high school, and management information systems.

232. ALBUQUERQUE (NEW MEXICO) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1975). Student Enrollment: History and Forecast 1954-1994. APS Planning Document 1. Albuquerque, New Mexico: Albuquerque Public Schools, Office of Organization, Analysis, and Research. 36 pp. ED 114 907.

A document providing the demographic data base for long-term planning. Forecasts were based on a standard regression formula utilizing average enrollment by grade level for years 1973-74 and 1974-75. District birthrate was predicted on the basis of statistical information furnished by the state as well as census data and natural birthrate statistics.

233. ALBUQUERQUE (NEW MEXICO) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1978). School Size and Pupil Costs Reviewed for 1977-1978. 1978 APS Planning Document No. 2. Albuquerque, New Mexico: Albuquerque Public Schools, Office of Organization, Analysis and Research. 59 pp. ED 153 365.

Designed to aid the Albuquerque, New Mexico school board and district administration in more efficient utilization of school facilities, this report contains data on the per pupil cost of operating the schools, minimum and maximum school sizes based on economic criteria, and Albuquerque's enrollment decline.

234. NOLAN, M. (1978). Portland Public Schools, 1950 to 1977. Portland, Oregon: Portland Public Schools. 93 pp. ED 155 249.

Reviews various aspects of the Portland public school system since 1950. Enrollment trends, decline, and the demographic distribution of that decline are discussed.

Also included are enrollment projections, physical conditions and construction date of each public school building, and a discussion of cooperative programs between city and school system, of the budget and the problem of rising costs, and of a reorganization plan, formed by the school board in 1970, and at publication, partially implemented.

235. OLSEN, S.A. (1980). An Exploration of Inter-District Sharing Alternatives for Belle Plaine and HLV. Final Report. Cedar Rapids, Iowa: Grant Wood Area Education Agency. 90 pp. ED 191 637.

Two small school districts in Iowa (Belle Plaine and HLV) examined 94 alternatives to share programs or staff. The utility of each alternative was rated by the school board, school staff, and a sample from the community by survey. Each alternative was rated in terms of educational quality, cost effectiveness, community acceptance, efficient use of utilities, and staffing implications. Using this process, each district had a means of determining which sharing alternatives would be satisfying or acceptable to the groups affected.

236. EUGENE (OREGON) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1976). Small Schools Task Force. Final Report. Eugene, Oregon: Eugene Public Schools, Office of Media Services. 83 pp. ED 117 804.

Report of a local task force representing parents, citizens, and school staff assigned to study the possible closure of nine small schools out of 31 elementary schools. The report concludes -- after a detailed discussion of the demographic, economic, programmatic and social implications of school closure -- that the smaller schools, even when they operate below capacity, offer benefits that more than make up for the expense of keeping them open. Contains an extensive annotated bibliography.

237. HIGHLINE (WASHINGTON) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1976). Report on the Task Force on Declining Enrollment: Third Revision. Seattle, Washington: Highline Public Schools. 82 pp. ED 126 552.

Staff report on policy options in the district's response to declining enrollments. Special focus was on: (1) the relationship of school size to educational quality and school costs; and (2) community involvement in planning for the district's response to decline.

C2. SCHOOL DISTRICT REPORTS
b.) Available through the IRE Clearinghouse.

238. FREMONT (CALIFORNIA) UNION HIGH SCHOOL DISTRICT. (1981). Task Force Report: Data Bearing on School Site Closure and Consolidation. 174 pp.

A documentary history of one school district's response to decline. Outlines planning processes -- facilities inventories, cohort-survival projection methods, closure criteria, and a community involvement mechanisms. Contains samples of instruments used as well as policy decision documents. The Fremont Union High School District includes the following California communities: Cupertino, Fremont, Sunnyvale, Monta Vista, Homestead, and Lyndbrook.

239. SAN JOSE (CALIFORNIA) UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT. (1979). Final Report of the District Study Committee on Declining Enrollment. 73 pp.

Good example and genre model of a concise and comprehensive citizens task force report. Focus is on school closure and merger and on the trade-offs of alternative policy decisions.

240. SEQUOIA (CALIFORNIA) UNION HIGH SCHOOL DISTRICT. (1981). Report of the Long-Range Planning Committee. 76 pp.

Prepared by a staff-board-citizens' task force, this report contains local data and discusses policy trade-off issues concerning the curricular impact, the financial impact, and the impact on staff, facilities and transportation of enrollment decline at the secondary level. Good example of a thorough discussion of the special problems that decline poses for a high school curriculum. The Sequoia Union High School District includes the following California communities: Atherton, Menlo Park, Ravenswood, Redwood, Serramonte and Woodside.

241. EAST MAINE (ILLINIOIS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1979). East Maine School District Community Survey. Des Plaines, Illinois: East Maine Public Schools, District 63. 115 pp.

After making the first round of cuts and closures due to decline, the school district contracted with a survey firm to conduct a community survey of opinion about further possible responses to continuing decline. A survey questionnaire is attached.

242. NILES (ILLINOIS) TOWNSHIP HIGH SCHOOLS. (1975). Two (2) or Three (3) Schools? Skokie, Illinois: Niles Township High Schools. 55 pp.

Staff report focusing on the impact of decline on the secondary level. Deals with the relationship between school size and quality, enrollments vis-a-vis cost efficiency, impact on staffing, and economic and budget forecasting.

243. SOUTH COLONIE (ILLINOIS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1978). Report of Citizens' Advisory Committee to the Board of Education. 15 pp.

Citizens advisory task force report describes the criteria and the technique (facilities inventory) used in arriving at recommendations for school closure.

244. MONTGOMERY COUNTY (MARYLAND) SCHOOLS. (1976). Advisory Task Force on Secondary Schools. Phase II-Final Report. 123 pp.

Citizens task force report containing specific recommendations on dealing with decline at the secondary level. Special focus was on the relationships of school size, quality, and cost, although the report touched on all aspects of school management. Appendices include: guidelines and by-laws establishing a Community Advisory Task Force, and a facilities inventory questionnaire instrument.

245. BROCKTON (MASSACHUSETTS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1979). School Building/Enrollment Planning. 18 pp.

This Brockton, Massachusetts, planning document is a good example of the kind of local data base necessary to consider alternative responses to decline. Contains worksheets for projecting enrollment, by grade level and classroom.

246. LEXINGTON (MASSACHUSETTS) EDUCATIONAL PROGRAM STUDY COMMITTEE. (1976). The Lexington Elementary Schools: A Report to the Lexington School Committee. 207 pp.

A citizens committee report to the Lexington, Massachusetts School Committee on the elementary program and facilities in that town, this document is designed to:

(1) Describe the major educational curricula in the elementary schools as well as the processes by which they are developed, taught, and monitored.
(2) Describe the strengths and weaknesses of these curricula as perceived by citizens, staff and students.
(3) Describe and survey the educational programs of the 11 elementary schools.
(4) Assess the views of citizens, teachers and students on the effectiveness of these programs as well as priorities in the educational program in general.

(5) Review effectiveness of programs as measured by student performance or tests of basic skills.
(6) Make recommendations and conclusions about priorities and directions of elementary programs for the next decade, taking into account declining enrollments and public concern over the level of school expenditures.

247. LEXINGTON (MASSACHUSETTS) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1977). Analysis of School Closings. 58 pp.

A summation of information compiled on the impact of future school closings in Lexington, Massachusetts. The information contained in this report sought to answer four questions:

(1) How many classrooms and schools will the Lexington school system need to educate the projected 5,500 students beginning in the school year 1980?
(2) What are the grade level organizations or combinations that can be used to determine the number of classrooms and schools needed to house 5,500 students?
(3) What does research conclude about the relative educational advantages and disadvantages of small and large schools?
(4) What savings would result from school closings based upon projected needs?

The report presents data on 6 policy options and presents building enrollment projections by year and grade. Also it presents a summary of a review of the research which "revealed only two studies which attempted to examine the relationships of size of elementary schools to effectiveness" and goes on to summarize the findings of Report of the Small Schools Task Force (Montgomery County, Maryland, 1973) and The Lexington Elementary Schools (1976).

248. BIRMINGHAM (MICHIGAN) DECLINING ENROLLMENT STUDY COMMITTEE. (1979). Report and Recommendations of the Birmingham Public Schools Declining Enrollment Study Committee. 70 pp.

Includes sub-committee reports on enrollment trends, staffing, curriculum and facilities as they are impacted by decline. Concludes that reduction of the average size of elementary or secondary schools to present or projected attendance levels have had or will have negative impact on educational quality, and recommends closing of "more than two schools" with the minimum amount of disruption.

249. BIRMINGHAM (MICHIGAN) SCHOOLS. (1980). Meet the Challenges of the 1980s: A Long Range Plan for the Birmingham School District. A Report to the Community by the Birmingham Board of Education. 35 pp.

Pages 12-13 deal with the impact of declining enrollments on Middle Schools. Pages 19-22 outline the district's criteria for school closings.

250. WESTFIELD (NEW JERSEY) PUBLIC SCHOOLS. (1979). Long Range Study of School Needs. 39 pp.

A district superintendent's policy proposal on school closure offered to the local board of education. The proposal documents the coincidental impacts of enrollment decline and fiscal retrenchment, outlines criteria for school closure, and lays out a schedule for deciding about school closure allowing for due process and community "input."

AUTHOR INDEX

Abramowitz, S. 1, 2
Alaska State Department of Education 206
Amlung, S. 3
Anderson, R.E. 4
Andrews, R. 5
Arizona State Department of Education 207
Arveson, R.G. 6
Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development 7

Bailey, J.D. 8
Barber, L. 231
Bargerstock, C.T. 170
Beck, W.W., Jr. 9
Bellon, J.J. 10
Berman, P. 11
Bernhardt, V.L. 12
Bins, M. 13
Bishop, L. 14
Booth, R. 172
Bornstein, L. 15, 173
Boulding, K.E. 16
Boyd, W.L. 17
Boyer, T.L. 18
Brehman, G.E. 208
Brody, J.A. 19
Brooks, A. 20
Brown, J.W. 21
Brubacher, J.W. 22
Brunetti, F. 23
Bulat, D.D. 24
Burlingame, M. 25
Bussard, E. 174, 175, 176, 177, 196
Byron, R.E. 26

(California) Fremont Union High School District 238
(California) San Jose Unified School District 239
(California) Sequoia Union High School District 240
Callahan, J.J. 165
Carlson, K.E. 27
Carr, M.K. 28
Cho, S.H. 209
Church, M.J. 223
Cohen, J.S. 135

Collister, L. 224
Colton, D. 29
(Connecticut) Hamden Task Force on Declining Enrollment 225, 226
Corman, L. 197
Council of Educational Facilities Planners 178
Council of Educational Facilities Planners Journal 30
Crowe, R.L. 31
Cuban, L. 32
Culbertson, J. 33
Custis, J. 34, 35

Dace, D. 36
Davis, B.G. 210
Davis, R.G. 37, 38
Dembowski, F.L. 39, 40, 41
Ditzhazy, H.E.R. 42
Divoky, D. 43
Donnelly, R.A. 194
Downey, G.W. 44

Edlefson, C. 45
Education Commission of the States 46
Educational Facilities Laboratories 179, 180
Educational Research Service 181
Educational Research Information Center (see ERIC)
Eisenberger, K.E. 47, 48, 49, 50, 51, 52, 182
Eismann, D. 53
Ellsworth, D.F. 211
Engelhardt, N.L. 54
ERIC 198, 199, 200, 201, 202, 203
Estes, N. 55

Fleming, M. 227
Fonstad, C. 183
Fowler, D.H. 56, 57
Frederickson, J.H. 58, 59, 60
Freeman, J. 61
Frelich, A. 29

Gallup, G.H. 62
Gay, G. 40
Geiger, J.O. 228
Getzels, J.N. 63
Gores, H.B. 64
Green, A.C. 65
Green, R.T. 66

Handy, J. 193
Hannan, M.T. 61
Haun, F.R. 67
Heisner, J.D. 68
Hentschke, G. 69, 70
Hess, F. 71, 72
Hickcox, E.S. 73
Hickrod, G.A. 212
Hosler, A. 74

Iannacone, L. 75
Illinois State Board of Educatior 213
Illinois State Office of Education 214
(Illinois) East Maine Public Schools 241
(Illinois) Niles Township High Schools 242
(Illinois) South Colonie Public Schools 243
Imhof, H.E. 76
Institute for Development of Educational Activities (I/D/E/A) 77
Iowa Association of School Boards 78

Jascourt, H.D. 79
Jess, J.D. 80
Johnson, S.M. 184
Jones, R.M. 93

Kahn, H. 115
Kavelage, J. 81
Katner, N.C. 82
Kelley, E.A. 83
Keough, W.F., Jr. 84, 85, 86, 87, 88, 89, 182
Killick, J. 90
Kirschenstein, J. 91
Klas, W. 92
Knapp, H. 93
Kucera, M.A. 229

Leggett, S. 94, 95, 96
Leppert, J. 97
Lewis, G.M. 37, 38
Lieberman, M. 98
Little, D.L. 99

McCloud, P.I. 169, 230
McLaughlin, M.W. 11
Malloy, L. 100
March, J.G. 101

(Maryland) Montgomery County Schools 244
(Massachusetts) Brockton Public Schools 245
(Massachusetts) Lexington Educational Program Study Committee 246
(Massachusetts) Lexington Public Schools 247
Mastoraki, F. 102
Mazzarella, J.A. 231
Mazzoni, T.L. 103
Merrimack Education Center 204
Michigan State Department of Education 185, 215
(Michigan) Birmingham Declining Enrollment Study Committee 248
(Michigan) Birmingham Public Schools 249
Miller, B.P. 105
(Minnesota) Commission on Minnesota's Future 216
(Minnesota) State Advisory Council on Fluctuating School Enrollments 217, 218
Minnesota State Planning Agency 186
(Missouri) Kansas City Public Schools 104
Mitchell, P. 105
Moll, M. 205
Morgan, H.M. 106
Morris, A.E. 107
Morrison, P.A. 108
Mueller, V.D. 103, 109

Nassau, S.M. 18, 110, 111
National Association of Secondary School Principals Bulletin 112
National Association of State Boards of Education 113
National School Boards Association 114,187
National School Public Relations Association 188
New England School Development Council 189
New Jersey School Boards Association 190
New Jersey State Department of Education 219
(New Jersey) Westfield Public Schools 250

(New Mexico) Albuquerque Public Schools 232, 233
Newitt, J. 115
New York State Department of Education 191
New York University Quarterly 116
Nolan, M. 234
Nolte, M.C. 117, 118
Nowakowski, J.A. 119
Nuttall, R.L. 120
Nyquist, E.B. 121

Odden, A. 122
Olsen, S.A. 235
Oregon State Department of Education 220
(Oregon) Eugene Public Schools 236

Pack, K. 123
Parks, G.A. 124
Pasnik, M. 125
Peckenpaugh, D. 126
Phay, R.E. 127
Phi Delta Kappa Commission on Declining Enrollments 192
Phi Delta Kappan 128
Piatt, R.S. 129
Piele, P.K. 130, 131
Pound, J. 132
Powell, J.F. 133

Relic, P.D. 134
Richards, K.N. 135
Ringers, J. 136
Robson, D.L. 137
Rodekohr, M. 138
Rosenberg, B. 139
Rosenfeld, S. 2
Rosenzweig, P. 140
Ross, V. 141
Routh, D. 97
Rubin, L. 142
Ryan, D.W. 73

Sargent, C.G. 193
Schomp, K.W. 143
Schoolhouse 144
Scott, J.G. 145
Sebulsky, W.L. 146
Seifert, E.H. 147
Senier, J. 209

Servile, A.L. 21
Shannon, T.A. 148
Shaw, R.C. 149
Sher, J.P. 150
Shibles, M.R. 22
Sieradski, K. 151
Skiera, L. 152
South Carolina State Department of Education 221
Spenla, W.A. 153
Stefonek, T. 154
Stemnock, S.K. 133

Taylor, W. 155
Thomas, M.D. 156
Thompson, B. 157
Thompson, S. 158
Tompkins, R.B. 150
Torge, H. 228
Townsel, A.H. 13
Tremper, P. 159
Trimble, C.S. 210
Truesdell, W.F. 222
Tymko, J.L. 160

Valencia, R.D. 161
Vincent, P.B. 122, 139
Von Ancken, E.E. 162

Wakefield, H.E. 194
(Washington) Highline Public Schools 237
Wegmann, R.G. 163
Weiss, E.H. 123
Weldy, G.R. 74, 164
Wendel, F.C. 195
Wilken, W.J. 165
Wofford, J.W. 106, 166
Wright, D. 131

Yeager, R.F. 167

Zazzaro, J. 168
Zenke, L.L. 169
Zirkel, P.A. 170
Zusman, R.S. 171

TOPICAL INDEX

Adult education	4
Affirmative action	13, 44, 46, 81, 110, 139, 170, 184, 231
Budgeting	70, 215
Budgeting: cost projection model	69
Budgeting: cost reduction	172
Budgeting: program	55
Budgeting: zero-based	55, 154
Bureaucratic impediments	108
Class size	95, 158
Collective bargaining	68
Community	57
Community, attitudes of	88, 129, 223
Community, impact upon	3, 53
Community, involvement of	11, 14, 25, 32, 34, 45, 51, 65, 82, 87, 88, 91, 92, 106, 120, 126, 151, 167, 169, 173, 174, 180, 184, 186, 187, 192, 193, 198, 202, 206, 236, 237, 238, 241
Community, involvement of, citizens committees	9, 49, 50, 72, 104, 120, 188, 207, 227, 239, 244, 248
Community, values	17, 120
Computer-assisted instruction	223
Computer simulation	167
Consolidation	25, 66, 78, 124, 150, 157
Contraction vs. expansion	1, 8, 10, 22, 33, 75, 77, 88, 101, 109, 121, 138, 145, 154, 155
Cost-benefit analysis	55, 106

Cost-benefit models	11, 186
Curriculum	36, 39, 90, 195
Curriculum: computer literacy	163
Desegregation	13, 61, 227, 240
Due process	18, 28, 42, 79, 127, 170, 184
Early retirement	87, 147, 194, 211, 213, 214
Facilities, general	5, 9, 19, 24, 29, 53, 65, 78, 129, 157, 161, 186, 191, 196, 201, 218, 228, 237
Facilities, alternative use of	5, 20, 30, 43, 60, 62, 63, 64, 77, 100, 105, 123, 125, 140, 141, 143, 144, 152, 159, 168, 174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180, 193, 198, 207, 219, 230, 231
Facilities, inventories	125, 186, 234, 240
Facilities, joint occupancy of	143
Facilities, sharing	244
Finance, general	57, 87, 113, 148, 150, 165, 184, 186, 187, 191, 192, 215, 236, 239, 240, 242
Finance: costs	13, 40, 69, 90, 93, 214, 216, 224, 230, 231, 233
Finance: data	26, 122
Finance: state aid	(see State Aid)
Forecasting enrollments	21, 23, 37, 54, 77, 84, 85, 89, 94, 99, 108, 131, 151, 179, 182, 186, 191, 198, 209, 215, 232, 238, 245
Forecasting enrollments: cohort-survival	149, 183, 184, 188, 189, 199
Grade reorganization	71, 72, 76, 247, (see also Middle Schools)
High schools	4, 98, 124, 134, 179, 228, 231, 240, 242, 244

Information systems	11, 21, 55, 94, 108, 167, 193, 206, 207, 214, 231, 245
Information systems, vis-a-vis bureaucratic impediments	29
Inservice	(see Personnel: inservice)
Interdistrict sharing	185, 235
KEMEC	173
Kindergarten	9
Library, moving a	162
Magnet schools	188
Middle schools	244, 249, (see also Grade reorganization)
Personnel: general	7, 40, 44, 61, 66, 86, 90, 129, 138, 139, 148, 165, 184, 186, 191, 192, 194, 211, 214, 218, 242
Personnel: inservice	134, 166
Personnel: job sharing	81
Personnel: reassignment of	240
Personnel: staff evaluation	67, 68, 190
Personnel: teacher placement	77
Politics	32, 61, 73, 136, 167
Politics: community type	17
Politics and governance	14, 25
Politics and governance: community type; difference between urban and suburban	29
Politics: political vs. technical rationality	8, 10, 11, 15, 17, 45, 75, 131, 151, 160, 167
Program: general	4, 13, 36, 38, 41, 55, 57, 78, 90, 95, 129, 134, 138, 163, 165, 184,

191, 192, 195, 228, 236, 246, 248

Program: community education 159, 163

Program: curriculum 40

Program: gifted 27

Program: vocational education 137, 228

RIF (reduction in force) 18, 28, 35, 42, 43, 44, 46, 56, 77, 79, 81, 83, 86, 88, 102, 110, 111, 116, 117, 118, 127, 133, 139, 153, 154, 164, 170, 171, 181, 184, 186, 194, 195, 198, 199, 200, 207, 210, 212, 214, 215, 220, 231

Regional values 25

Rural schools 25, 80, 124, 150

School closure 3, 6, 9, 19, 31, 32, 34, 43, 47, 48, 49, 58, 59, 74, 76, 77, 82, 88, 93, 95, 96, 104, 107, 125, 126, 130, 136, 140, 151, 152, 161, 164, 167, 182, 185, 186, 187, 193, 194, 195, 199, 202, 207, 214, 221, 226, 227, 235, 236, 238, 239, 242, 243, 247, 248, 249, 250

School closure, criteria for 5, 29, 157, 215, 225

School closure, impact of 5, 53, 124, 135

School closure, procedures 66, 141, 173

School size 78, 96, 112, 150, 218, 233, 236, 237, 242, 247, 248

Small schools 25, 78, 80, 95, 96, 112, 150, 236, 247

Special education 13, 39, 143, 158, 185, 195

Staff development 90

Staff inventories 186

State aid 26, 80, 97, 214, 215, 219

Transportation 218

Vocational education (see Program: vocational education)

GENRE INDEX

Bibliographies: general	22, 131, 154, 184, 185, 191, 195, 197, 198, 199, 201, 203, 204, 205, 213, 236
Bibliographies: facilities	196
Bibliographies: RIF	200
Bibliographies: school closure	173, 202
Data: case studies; analytical, comparative	12, 17, 25
Data: case studies; analytical, single	29, 45, 53, 106, 120, 124, 130, 135
Data: case studies; anecdotal	9, 24, 31, 36, 44, 66, 68, 71, 72, 76, 88, 119, 126, 146, 169, 188
Data: case studies; descriptive	32, 74, 102, 129, 136, 153, 161, 164, 167
Data: surveys; attitudes/opinions	62
Data: surveys; impact of decline	2, 3, 5, 7, 13, 15, 26, 39, 40, 41, 46, 61, 78, 80, 93, 99, 113, 114, 122, 137, 138, 139, 150, 151, 158, 165, 212, 219
Data: surveys; practices/policies	83, 97, 105, 133, 140, 149
Handbooks: general	184, 185, 186, 187, 191, 192, 193, 194, 195
Handbooks: facilities	174, 175, 176, 177, 178, 179, 180
Handbooks: forecasting	189
Handbooks: personnel	172, 190, 220
Handbooks: RIF	181
Handbooks: school closure	173, 182
Handbooks: facilities	100
Reports: LEA	104, 223, 224, 225, 226, 227, 228, 229, 230, 231, 232, 233, 234, 235, 236, 237, 238, 239, 240, 241, 242,

243, 244, 245, 246, 247, 248, 249, 250

Reports: LEA; school closure 247

Reports: state 206, 207, 208, 210, 211, 212, 214, 215, 217, 218, 221, 222

Reports: state; early retirement 211, 213

Tools: cohort-survival technique 184, 185, 189, 238

Tools: community surveys 223

Tools: community survey questionnaires 129, 241

Tools: cost-benefit models 172, 186, 195

Tools: curriculum inventories 195

Tools: facilities inventories 173, 184, 186, 191, 223, 234, 238, 243, 244, 245

Tools: forecasting 186

Tools: Keough Survey Indicator Scale 84, 89, 147

Tools: needs assessment 207

Tools: presenting data to the public 184

Tools: RIF policies/procedures 127, 170

Tools: referendums 186

Tools: staff evaluation 67

Tools: staff inventories 184, 185, 186, 220

Tools: task force guidelines 244

Tools: weighted criteria for school closing 184

PLACE-NAME INDEX

Alaska	206
Arizona	105, 207
Phoenix	28
California	91, 168
Atherton	240
Cupertino	238
Fremont	238
Homestead	238
Lyndbrook	238
Menlo Park	240
Monta Vista	238
Palo Alto	45
Ravenswood	240
Redwood	240
San Jose	239
Santa Barbara	161
Serramonte	240
Sunnyvale	238
Woodside	240
Colorado	
Denver	143
Connecticut	
Hamden	225, 226
District of Columbia	
Washington, D.C.	187
Florida	
Jacksonville	24
Illinois	17, 25, 172, 211, 212, 213, 214
Champaign	167
Chicago (suburbs)	17
Des Plaines	241
East Main District	241
Jacksonville	31
Mt. Prospect	213
Niles Township	74, 164, 178, 242
Quincy	31
Skokie	74, 164, 178, 242
South Colonie	243
Indiana	26, 137
Iowa	78, 80, 165, 222
Belle Plaine	229, 235
Cedar Rapids	229, 235

HLV 235

Kentucky 210

Louisiana
New Orleans 128

Maryland
Montgomery County 244

Massachusetts 184
Brockton 245
Lexington 246, 247
Lincoln 106
Sudbury 106

Michigan 122, 185, 215
Birmingham 126, 248, 249
Livonia 128

Minnesota 186, 216, 217, 218

Missouri 122
Kansas City 104
St. Louis 29

Nebraska 67
Wayne 67

New Jersey 15, 173, 190, 219
Bridgeton 102
Westfield 250

New Mexico
Albuquerque 232, 233
Encino 223

New York 191
East Syracuse 71, 72
Ithaca 135
Minoa 71, 72
Nassau County 88
New York City 3, 116
Oyster Bay 76

Ohio
Bradford 228
Cleveland 227

Oklahoma
- Blackwell 9
- Tulsa 169, 230

Oregon 220
- Eugene 231, 236
- Portland 234

Pennsylvania 208, 209
- South Allegheny School District 129
- Upper Merion 68

South Carolina 221

South Dakota 122

Utah
- Salt Lake City 77, 128

Virginia
- Arlington 32, 136
- Richmond 66

Washington 122
- Bremerton 44
- Seattle 53, 128, 224, 237

West Virginia
- Aurora 124
- Preston County 124

Wisconsin 183, 194

ABOUT THE INSTITUTE FOR RESPONSIVE EDUCATION

The present report is part of the Institute for Responsive Education's (IRE) program of publications on public policy for education. IRE, founded in 1973, is a private non-profit organization housed at Boston University, where its founder and current President, Don Davies, formerly Deputy Commissioner in the United States Office of Education is a Professor in the School of Education. Throughout its history, IRE has chronicled, researched and encouraged civic participation in local school policymaking. In so doing, its work has been premised on the notion that citizen participation is an essential ingredient in school improvement and that citizens' access to information is indispensable for effective participation. Consequently IRE's publications program, of more than 25 reports over the past decade, is devoted to the furtherance of civic competence in education policies. Those reports--including field research monographs, bibliographies and literature reviews, and translations of complex education issues into popular form--all aim at the widest possible dissemination of knowledge about the making of education policy at the Federal, state and local levels. In pursuing these aims, IRE's work has focused on the role of citizen interest groups, on school advisory councils, and on citizens' access to educational collective bargaining. Currently, IRE is engaged in: a Mott Foundation funded project supporting the development of citizens' groups monitoring the implementation of state mandates for school advisory councils in California, Florida and South Carolina; an NIE funded survey and synthesis of the research on school boards' responsiveness and accessibility to community involvement; and a Massachusetts State Department of Education sponsored production of a comprehensive parent/community training packet for Parents Advisory Councils under that state's Bilingual Education Program.

RELATED IRE PUBLICATIONS

RISING ABOVE DECLINE. Betsy Wachtel and Brian Powers. 1979, 198 pp., ($4.50). An unique account of how nine communities across the country are responding to the challenge of declining school enrollment. Describes the typical course of events in communities facing this problem and features an action plan for community participation in the schools' decisions. The case studies discuss issues like desegregation, alternatives to closing and conflicts and cooperation between laypeople and professionals.

LEADING THE WAY: STATE MANDATES FOR SCHOOL ADVISORY COUNCILS IN CALIFORNIA, FLORIDA AND SOUTH CAROLINA. Ross Zerchykov and Don Davies, with Janet Chrispeels. 1980, second printing, 175 pp., ($6.00). This report for policymakers examines the origins and character of state policies mandating school advisory councils in the three states. It assesses the available evidence on the efficacy of councils and suggests which practices are replicable and can "lead the way" for future public policy initiatives fostering citizen participation in the schools.

IRE REPORT NO. 3: COMMUNITY PERSPECTIVES ON THE ROLE OF THE SCHOOL IN THE COMMUNITY. Miriam Clasby. 1981, 34 pp., ($2.75). Through a series of interviews, this report explores various aspects of current educational policy and practice as it influences school-community relations. Topics discussed include new sources of legitimacy for citizen action; coalition building and its impact; the isolation of schools from the community; as well as other issues. Also contains interview abstracts.

IRE REPORT NO. 4: THE LOGIC OF CITIZEN PARTICIPATION IN PUBLIC SCHOOL LABOR RELATIONS. Charles Kerchner, Douglas Mitchell, Gabrielle Pryor and Wayne Erck, 1981, 37 pp., ($2.75). A report on a study of eight school districts in California and Illinois through an entire bargaining cycle - from issue information to settlement. The authors examine where and how citizens choose to participate in school labor negotiations that lead them away from collective bargaining. The report examines parental choice of what decisionmaking arena to enter in order to influence collective bargaining, and discusses models of school democracy and means to achieve equality of interest.

OTHER IRE PUBLICATIONS

CITIZEN ACTION IN EDUCATION. Biannual newsmagazine of the Institute. $5.00 per year journal contribution.

IRE REPORT NO. 1, IMPLEMENTATION OF TITLE I PARENT ADVISORY COUNCILS IN THE RURAL SOUTH. M. Hayes Mizell. 1981, 25 pp., $2.50.

IRE REPORT NO. 2, PROBLEMS IN IMPLEMENTATING STATUTORY REQUIREMENTS FOR TITLE I ESEA PARENT ADVISORY COUNCILS. Linda Brown. 1981, 21 pp., $2.50.

A TWO-WAY STREET: HOME-SCHOOL COOPERATION IN CURRICULUM DECISION-MAKING. Robert Sinclair, editor. 1980, 92 pp., $5.00.

WORKING PAPERS: COMMUNITY COUNCILS. Compiled by Richard Morris and Ross Zerchykov. 1980, 21 pp., $2.50.

NARROWING THE GAP BETWEEN INTENT AND PRACTICE: A REPORT TO POLICY-MAKERS ON COMMUNITY ORGANIZATIONS AND SCHOOL DECISIONMAKING. Kathleen Hugenin, Ross Zerchykov, and Don Davies. 1979, 118 pp., $5.00.

EDUCATION FOR ALL PEOPLE: A GRASSROOTS PRIMER. Ron Walker and IRE staff. 1979, 155 pp., $6.00.

OPENING THE DOOR: CITIZEN ROLES IN EDUCATIONAL COLLECTIVE BARGAINING. Irving Hamer, Charles Cheng, Melanie Barron, editors. 1979, 194 pp., $4.50.

OVERCOMING BARRIERS TO SCHOOL COUNCIL EFFECTIVENESS. Jim Stanton, et. al. 1979, 153 pp., $6.50.

CITIZEN PARTICIPATION IN EDUCATION: ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY. second edition, Don Davies and Ross Zerchykov. 1978, 386 pp., $15.00.

FEDERAL AND STATE IMPACT ON CITIZEN PARTICIPATION IN THE SCHOOLS. Don Davies, James Upton, Miriam Clasby, Felix Baxter, Brian Powers, and Ross Zerchykov. 1978, 147 pp., $5.00.

FACTS FOR A CHANGE: CITIZEN ACTION RESEARCH FOR BETTER SCHOOLS. Bill Burges. 1979, 125 pp., $5.00.

FACTS AND FIGURES: A LAYMAN'S GUIDE TO CONDUCTING SURVEYS. Bill Burges. 1979. 125 pp., $4.25.

WORDS, PICTURES, MEDIA: COMMUNICATION IN EDUCATIONAL POLITICS. Lloyd Prentice. 1979, 91 pp., $4.00.

PATTERNS OF CITIZEN PARTICIPATION IN EDUCATIONAL DECISIONMAKING: GRASSROOTS PERSPECTIVES: DIVERSE FORMS OF PARTICIPATION. Don Davies, et. al. 1979, 95 pp., $6.00.